

Documentation Report - Livelihoods and Working Conditions of Women Fish Retailers Improved



Improving Employment and Income through the Development of Egypt's Aquaculture Sector (IEIDEAS) project

18 December 2014



Executive Summary

The Improving Employment and Income through Development of Aquaculture (IEIDEAS) project is a three-year project being implemented by WorldFish in partnership with CARE and funded by the Swiss Development Cooperation. The project was designed based on the findings of an analysis of the aquaculture value chain in Egypt which confirmed the potential of aquaculture for creating employment improving incomes and improving nutrition among the poor and identified a number of key constraints and opportunities relating to the sector. Drawing on this study the project focuses on the two areas of the value chain where employment is highest - production and retailing - and where evidence suggests that targeted investments can increase employment and income. These investments are being pursued through partnerships in the five governorates of Beheira, Kafr El Sheikh, Sharkia, Fayoum and in Minya where aquaculture production remains rudimentary. The project also works on policy development to support the emergence of a more effective enabling environment for efficient and sustainable value chains in the sector. Outcome area 2 focuses on improving livelihoods and working conditions of women fish retailers.

As the project management looks towards 2015, the purpose of this report is to document the project activities, methodologies and approaches tested and rolled out under outcome 2. The objective is to highlight the lessons learned regarding what interventions worked and did not work, where and why and to use this learning to develop recommendations for future interventions with regards to supporting informal fish retailers. The documentation assignment involved the support of an external consultant who supported the project team with the data analysis. The documentation assignment began with a thorough review of the project documents provided by the project staff, capacity assessment exercises as well as focus group discussions held with representatives of all target groups and field visits. An external consultant led interviews with project staff as well as further interviews with CDA and WRC representatives.

The project team invested considerable time and energy in defining the actual interventions of the project under outcome 2 and the methodology to ensure that women retailers received the inputs they need. The methodology and approach were informed by basic principles including:

- Forming groups of women fish retailers (the WRCs) to represent their interests;
- Building local capacities within CDAs and WRCs;
- Participation of project beneficiaries in as many stages of project implementation as possible; and
- Sustainability of interventions beyond the project time frame.

The project team designed interventions following several studies and a rigorous process in which needs assessments were conducted with women retailers in each community (with 50 women as a sample in each community), data was analyzed and then validated through meetings and workshops with women retailers and the CDAs. The interventions therefore are founded on very real needs and priorities of women retailers and attempt to respond to these directly.

The creation and strengthening of WRCs was the backbone of the TOC and the basis from which all other results ensue. However other more tangible interventions had to be implemented in parallel to WRC formation in order to begin gaining the trust of the women retailers and demonstrate a commitment to their needs. Therefore while WRC responsibilities were taken over by the CDA in many instances during IEIDEAS, it is important that the WRCs become enabled in the near future to gradually take over this role effectively and efficiently as this is central to the sustainability of the project's efforts.

There have been several positive outcomes in the project including but not limited to:

- Creation of the market in Shakshouk which has contributed to improving the working conditions and incomes of women retailers in that community.
- The inclusion of women retailers as members in the Fishermen Union in Fayoum which has contributed to their ability to receive official recognition and access insurance.
- The creation of IDs for women retailers in Deyaba as a step towards their formalization. More importantly, this step has proved to women retailers in that community that they are able, if they

organize themselves, to secure their rights as happened with the literacy classes and with the complaint filed against the local health clinic on behalf of all community members.

- The VSLA groups have been appreciated by almost all members across the three communities where they have been applied. The other communities are also demanding that VSLA be introduced to them in the coming phase.
- Anecdotal evidence of improvement of women retailer working conditions across all communities (however more thorough evidence is required to confirm to what extent this has been achieved).
- Anecdotal evidence of increase in the income of women retailers across all communities (again, more thorough evidence is required to confirm to what extent this has been achieved).

However, the project team faced several considerable challenges during the initial phase of implementation. Most of these contributed to delays, minimizing the time needed to build capacities at the level of CDAs and WRCs in particular. This in turn had a direct effect on the level of progress that the project could achieve in the time remaining for implementation. These challenges include:

- CARE entered new governorates (in the Delta region) and partnered with new CDAs. This required building trust and also a common understanding of operations, objectives and approaches.
- The project team began to work with a new target group and sector. There were therefore many lessons to be learned and challenges to be faced and the learning curve rose sharply. This was expected and recognized during the design phase, and outcome 2 was indeed a pilot for later scale up.
- The unstable political context and security problems caused serious obstruction to the smooth implementation of work in the field. This includes both the lack of trust communities had towards international organisations during the early stages of project implementation and the unsuitable security context.
- Delays in MOSS approvals had consequences on the CDA budgets and on the relations of trust with the women retailers.
- The lack of a strong M&E system in part due to the changing logframe and TOCs did not enable the project team to track their progress in a timely and quality manner and affected documentation.

The main lessons learned from this phase can be summarized as:

- The formalisation of retailers and their ability to bring their rights has proved to be more important and effective than the provision of material interventions and requires more attention.
- Getting women retailers to work together and cooperate requires changing behaviours which they have been practicing for years. The fierce competitiveness that is found between the retailers is considered good business sense and necessary for the retailers' survival. In order to persuade them to think completely differently and trust each other, the women are not yet ready to take this step because they see it as a major potential risk to their livelihoods. It will require time and creative ways of working with them.
- While all women retailers cited very similar if not identical problems and constraints across the six target communities, this similarity does not necessarily mean that the same solutions being applicable for all. Solutions in future interventions will need to be led by women retailers and WRCs to ensure relevance and ownership.
- CDAs need greater technical support in project design to ensure that subgrants have realistic budgets and targets. Specifically, sufficient budget should be allocated for staffing of CDAs to guarantee accountability for performance. Also important is to ensure that the targets CDAs set for themselves are achievable within the financial and other resources at their disposal.
- CDAs need greater technical assistance and support to understand the sector and how to manage a business. Good quality feasibility studies should have been prepared prior to the creation of distribution centres to avoid possible losses.
- Joint ownership models, while good in theory, needed more guarantees and technical support to work in practice. The project team should attempt to either create systems to better monitor jointly owned assets or find alternative solutions such as WRC management.
- The good relations between CDAs and local government representatives has been key in supporting the achievement of the market in Fayoum and the ID cards for women retailers in Deyaba. In both cases, the CDAs had good relations with local government representatives at a high level. It is worth nothing that the same applied in Kafr El Sheikh where the CDA also managed through personal contacts to persuade the local government of establishing a market although it was not achieved in

the end due to other challenges. This is an important point to keep in mind during the selection of CDAs in the future (and naturally also the WRCs since they should eventually lead such processes) and where it is not present, would require capacity building.

- There needs to be more attention and focus on raising the awareness of consumers about the types of fish, dispelling misconceptions about farmed fish and addressing the preference for live fish. Only when consumers are well informed will they accept the role of the fish retailers.

Recommendations:

1. The gender study and other studies have already recommended the **inclusion of men retailers** as part of the target group provided that women retailers be given an equal voice and gender considerations be taken into account. There is sufficient development research that supports the gender approach as opposed to working exclusively with women.
2. In the next phase, the project team could benefit from **re prioritizing interventions to be more in line with the TOC**. Creating and strengthening WRC, while a lengthy and challenging process in itself, has the potential to achieve all the project targets and even go beyond them. The material incentives that were given to women retailers to introduce them to the project are no longer necessary in a second phase. Rather it is the WRCs that need to have the knowledge and skills to be able to prioritize women retailer needs and to identify the solutions that are most appropriate for the retailers in their respective communities (be they ice boxes, tricycles or other solutions). A list of criteria for the CDAs can be developed. The criteria could include: level of commitment to the objectives of the project; quality of technical reports; quality of financial reports; improved performance based on capacity building; number of women retailers served, etc.
3. The project team may wish to consider a gradual **transferring of the responsibility for implementation from CDAs to WRCs**. This hand over will begin slowly, ensuring that WRCs have the necessary capacity to carry out the tasks required of them until they eventually move from working under the guidance and supervision of the CDA to becoming independent. The project team might consider the possibility of eventually providing WRCs financial support in the form of an independent fund which they can manage on behalf of retailers to conduct activities, promote rights, etc.
4. The project team should consider the **involvement of women retailers in all phases of the project, including the evaluation of past interventions and the design of the new interventions** in the future. This was not possible in the IEIDEAS project although women were involved in the needs assessment, validation and some aspects of the implementation which were led by the WRCs.
5. The project team should **plan for appropriate human and financial resources to set up an M&E system** that traces project outputs, processes and outcomes, across the different actor groups. It will be especially important to **carefully define be able to trace indicators such as increase in women retailer working conditions, income, their changing gender roles and responsibilities, decision making**, etc. It will be critical to **build capacities of CDAs in M&E** and provide them with the technical assistance required for them to be able to fulfil the M&E tasks effectively and in a timely manner.

This report further recommends the following with regards to project design:

1. The project team should **continue to support the WRCs and to build their capacities** and ensuring their 'representativeness'. It is only expected that the WRCs require a long time to reach the levels of efficiency and effectiveness that will allow women retailers to be lifted out of poverty. The plans that the WRCs have developed and the activation of their role
2. It is strongly recommended that the second phase of the project start with **conducting a participatory assessment of the outcomes and results of the project through the WRCs**. The participatory approach will allow WRC members to understand the project cycle in a practical manner and see the link between design, implementation, evaluation and re design. It will also allow them to decide which interventions were successful and which were less so, and to reflect on the reasons certain interventions were more successful than others. The learning that will come out of such an exercise will become a point of reference for both the design of future interventions and for the capacity of the WRCs.
3. The project team must ensure that distribution centres **operate with the same business and economic principles as regular private sector enterprises** and that they be self sustaining and make a profit meaning that the CDAs should not provide an unfair competition. It is also vital that the CDAs be able to properly manage them and have the capacity to do so and to compete with wholesalers who are more experienced and who are ready to take greater risks in order to preserve their share of the

market. Ideally, the WRCs would be empowered enough and have sufficient managerial and leadership capacity to manage the distribution centres (or to set up another system to provide women retailers with a steady supply of quality fish at affordable prices). To that end, the project team should support the CDAs in implementing the plans developed during IEIDEAS to put the distribution centres on the right track.

4. **VSLA groups could be continued and replicated in other communities** as a way of strengthening solidarity among women retailers and should not necessarily be a replacement option for those communities where the WRCs are weak. In all communities retailers can benefit from the solidarity that comes from the groups as well as from the source of credit that they provide. Additional training and support could be provided such as financial literacy to help women make correct financial decisions. Having emphasized the potential of the VSLA groups, the project team would benefit from creating a **clear system and indicators to monitor the result of the VSLA groups on WRC performance and retailer unity**.
5. The project team may wish to consider **providing women retailers with financial literacy training** to support their ability to manage their business. This is a skill that they can use for their own personal development as well as directly contributing to their ability to improve their income.
6. The project team should look seriously into supporting the **formalization of WRCs and of women retailers**. This was a clear need that arose in various studies and it was not clearly addressed in the IEIDEAS project due to time constraints although certain CDAs and WRCs made attempts in this regard (Shakshouk with the inclusion of retailers in the Fayoum Fishermen Union, in Deyaba with the IDs for retailers). These options can be studied and replicated or other options be pursued in the form of creating independent CDAs for retailers, supporting retailers joining unions, etc.
7. IEIDEAS had identified that consumer preferences were a major reason behind women retailers insisting on selling live fish. This affects their ability to use the ice boxes. The second phase may look into **addressing consumer awareness** to support women retailers.
8. Should the project team choose to continue and expand on the small scale fish farming, they would need to include more financial resources in the budget for research and for technical assistance. This intervention would continue to be on a small scale due to the considerable technical and financial needs related to it.
9. It would be important to study the possibility of linking between the fish farming in Minya and retailers both in Minya and in other governorates.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	i
Table of Contents	v
Acronyms	vi
Acronyms	vi
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 The IEIDEAS project.....	1
1.2 General Description of the Outcome and its Theory of Change	2
1.3 Purpose, Objectives and Expected Outputs of the Documentation Exercise	3
1.4 Documentation Methodology.....	3
1.5 Limitations of the Study	4
1.6 Structure of this Report	4
2 Description of Methodology, Activities and Outputs	5
2.1 The Project’s Methodology	5
2.2 Activities Implemented and Outputs	12
2.3 Challenges in Implementation	19
3. Analysis of Outcomes	21
3.1 Outcomes at the Level of CDAs	21
3.2 Outcomes at the Level of WRCs	31
3.3 Outcomes at the Level of Individual Women Fish Retailers.....	34
4. Conclusions and Recommendations	39
4.1 Conclusions.....	39
4.2 Recommendations	41
Annex A – Project Impact Pathway and Logical Framework.....	43
Annex B - Research Tools	44
Annex C – CDA Assessment Results	45
Annex D – Summary of Interventions by Community.....	46

List of Tables

Table 1 Number of FGDs held and participants	3
Table 2 Increase in income resulting from ice box in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week)	6
Table 3 Increase in income resulting from distribution centre in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week) ...	8
Table 4 Increase in income resulting from tricycle in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week)	9
Table 5 Selected CDAs.....	13
Table 6 CDA capacity building topics	14
Table 7 Summary of subgrants proposed by CDAs	16
Table 8 Comparison of WRC Status in the six communities	17
Table 9 Capacity building interventions held for WRCs	17
Table 10 Statistics on VSLAs in the three target communities	19
Table 11 Summary of VSLA groups in Deyaba, Deir Abu Hennes and Kafr El Sheikh	37

Acronyms

BOD	Board of directors
CDA	Community development association
DCED	Donor Committee for Enterprise Development
FGD	Focus group discussion
IEIDEAS	Improving Employment and Income through the Development of Egypt's Aquaculture Sector project
JBAD	Jesuits and Brothers' Association for Development
M4P	Making markets work for the poor
MOALR	Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation
MOSS	Ministry of Social Solidarity
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
TOC	Theory of change
VCA	Value chain analysis
VSLA	Village Savings and Loans Associations
WRC	Women's retailer committee

1 Introduction

1.1 The IEIDEAS project

Egyptian aquaculture has seen steady growth over the last 20 years and provides around 65% of the fish eaten by Egyptians. Aquaculture-derived fish is by far the cheapest farmed animal protein source, making the sector particularly important for the poor people in the country. Sustainable growth of aquaculture has the potential to lift people out of poverty and to improve poor people's food and nutrition security. Out of the recognition of the potential of the sector comes the Improving Employment and Income through Development of Aquaculture project (IEIDEAS), a three-year project implemented by the WorldFish Centre in partnership with CARE and funded by the Swiss Development Cooperation. The project was designed based on the findings of a value chain analysis (VCA) which identified a number of key constraints facing the sector and opportunities for addressing these. Drawing on this study the project focuses on the two areas of the value chain where employment is highest - production and retail - and where targeted investments can increase employment and income. The project is being implemented in the governorates that currently lead aquaculture production (Beheira, Kafr El Sheikh and Sharkia) and where there is the greatest potential for growth in production and employment through strategic support targeting key sectoral constraints, in El Fayoum where there is a strong producer association that can also provide good opportunities for growth in production that benefits poor producers and in Minya where the project provides more targeted inputs to support the emergence of the rudimentary aquaculture sector that currently exists there. Finally, the project also works on policy development to support the emergence of a more effective enabling environment for efficient and sustainable value chains in the sector.

The project has undergone several stages of evolution since it was first conceived in 2011. The goal of the project as originally described in the project document is to increase employment in Egypt's aquaculture sector. Four outcome areas would together contribute to the achievement of the objectives, including outcome area 2 'increased employment for women through fish retailing'¹ which is the focus of this report. The original proposal focused on improving employment of women retailers through development of fish retailing and by working through producer organizations in to strengthen direct connections between these women retailers and fish farmers and traders. The project also initially envisioned to assess opportunities for creation of jobs in processing.

As the project implementation advanced however, the project team found it necessary to develop a clear theory of change (TOC) for outcome areas, including outcome 2. They also found it necessary to render the original logframe more operational by formulating outcomes and indicators for greater precision and closer project attribution. An internal review took place in November 2012, inspired by the Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED) results measurement principles as well as making markets work for the poor (M4P) and gender transformative approaches. Further revision of the TOC and results chains was done during a workshop in June 2013 the project team was supported in both cases by WorldFish gender experts. The overall project impact pathway and logical framework can be found in Annex A.

As a result of these processes, the revised overall goal is to create 10,000 jobs in the Egyptian aquaculture value chain through support for the sector in 5 governorates benefiting 50,000 household members; to build a more secure future for the sector; and, to contribute to the nutritional health of low-income consumers (for a complete logframe with goal, objectives and outcomes please refer to Annex A). The outcome subject of this report is that

Livelihoods and working conditions of women fish retailers improved through pilot-scale interventions in Sharkia, Kafr El Sheikh, Beheira, Fayoum and El Minya.

Outcome level indicators are as follows:

¹ Retailing is the section in the value chain where the VCA demonstrated the vast majority of women are employed.

- 5 sustainable fish retailer organizations established
- Working conditions improved for 900 fish retailers
- Approaches developed for scaling out to other markets and governorates

The output is that Fish retailing organizations established and functioning in 5 governorates
Output level indicators are as follows:

- Retailer committees formed and members trained
- Retailer committees supported to deliver interventions/services
- Results from pilot-scale trials assessed and communicated

The continuous development of the results chains, logframe and indicators has meant that the creation of a project monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework has not been possible.

1.2 General Description of the Outcome and its Theory of Change

Outcome 2 specifically focuses on improving the employment and working conditions of women retailers and is being led by CARE. The VCA has shown that the retail segment of the aquaculture value chain is the second most important for employment and that 31% of these jobs are occupied by women (as compared to 0% in the production segment). At the same time, poor rural consumers benefit from the aquaculture sector through access to smaller-sized farmed tilapia sold by informal fish retailers, many of whom are women. In fact, informal fish retail is the main, if not only, segment of the farmed fish value chain where women are found.² Street vendors make their living through trading goods or services in public. Trading locations vary and include sidewalks, roadsides as well as formal or informal marketplaces. Traders may sell from kiosks, semi-fixed stalls or less permanent structures such as moveable crates, plastic sheets or mobile pushcarts. The work itself can be highly insecure due to the lack of guaranteed places to vend and irregular supply of products to sell. Lack of legal status amplifies insecurities while achieving recognition is an important means to reduce them. Women fish retailers in rural Egypt operate under difficult conditions that make the job one of last resort. The project aims to support women to form groups and work together to increase their solidarity, voice, identifying shared interests and ability to work together to improve their working conditions and profitability.

The project impact pathway links the results chains, making a clear division between the activities that are being implemented at scale which will result directly in increased production, productivity, quality, flexibility in harvesting strategies and the pilot-scale activities which will require to be scaled up before they will result in significant development impacts; increased employment, increased incomes and improved nutrition. Outcome 2 is a pilot-scale activity, testing out methodologies for enhancing their livelihoods, which will only result in significant contributions towards poverty reduction goals if it is scaled up after the current 3-year project. The targets are to have sustainable retailer groups operating in all 5 project governorates. Afterwards, these approaches could be extended to other parts of the country and to other markets in the 5 governorates covered by the project. Initial project activities worked through existing community development associations (CDAs) because it was felt that it would be too difficult to register new retailer organizations. Obviously there is an assumption that the interests of the CDAs coincide with those of the project and the retailers. In some CDAs (Shakshouk) this is clear, whereas in others the sustainability of this approach could be questioned; assessing the pros and cons of this approach is part of the learning from the pilot phase that will feed into the development of models for providing support to informal fish retailers. The main interventions that have been requested by the retailers so far are improvements in storage and handling of fish through using ice boxes, better transport and dedicated spaces to be used as markets. These should result in improved fish quality. However, this can only be guaranteed if the fish is delivered to retailers in good condition (clean, chilled or live), which is only possible in areas close to the main supply routes.

The outcome's TOC is described as follows. Improved quality should result in reduced losses and increased sales. Links between this and higher profits and/or increased incomes are starting to become apparent. Whether this will lead to increased consumption and improved nutrition have yet to be demonstrated.

² Macfadyen, G. et al. 2011. Value-chain analysis of Egyptian aquaculture. Project report 2011- 54. The WorldFish Centre: Penang, Malaysia.

The TOC for this outcome states that once retailer committees are formed and strengthened, they will be able to represent the interests of retailers which will in turn lead to improved government relations, improved working conditions, improved quality of fish (and thereby increased sales, and higher profits) and value addition. Interventions with CDAs in this framework (situational analysis and capacity development) are specifically designed to support the formation and strengthening of the retailer committees. A diagram describing the TOC can be found in Annex A.

1.3 Purpose, Objectives and Expected Outputs of the Documentation Exercise

As the project management looks towards 2015 and possibly a second phase for the IEIDEAS project beyond that, the purpose of the exercise is to document the project activities, methodologies and approaches tested and rolled out under outcome 2. The objective is to highlight the lessons learned regarding which interventions and approaches worked and which were less successful, where and why and to use this learning to develop recommendations for future interventions with regards to supporting informal fish retailers. The documentation exercise is particularly important given that this is the first experience for the project partners in working with the target group and that the outcome was designed as a pilot. Specifically, the outputs of this exercise include:

- A review of the hypotheses and theories that have informed the outcome’s interventions
- A review of the activities implemented to date and to what extent these activities succeeded to achieve the set objectives.
- A review of the approaches and processes by which these activities were implemented.
- Documenting any modifications in the approaches and/or activities made over the project lifetime and the reasons for these changes.
- Documenting the planned and unplanned results achieved at different levels (outputs – outcomes-impact).
- Documenting any challenges that faced the project and opportunities which appeared through the project life time.
- Gaps in the documentation framework at the project and CDA levels.
- Lessons learned (comparative analysis across governorates of what worked, why and how).
- Recommendations of models to take forward to refine further in preparation for scaling.

1.4 Documentation Methodology

The documentation process involved the participation of an external consultant who supported the project team with the task and the analysis. This report is based on a review of the following key project documents provided by the project staff: the original project proposal and the final project TOC and logframe; situational analysis on women retailers; gender analysis; annual reports; and the mid term review report among others. The project team designed data collection tools which were reviewed by the consultant. The tools were meant to collect inputs and feedback from project beneficiaries regarding the project interventions, the relevance and quality and its impact on their lives. The tools can be found in Annex C. The project team also re applied the capacity assessment tool with the CDAs with the participation of 28 CDA representatives. The project team also conducted FGDs with CDA staff, members of WRCs as well as women retailers from the community in each of the target governorates. The following table summarizes the number of FGDs and participants per category and governorate.

Table 1 Number of FGDs held and participants

Community	CDAs		WRCs		Retailers FGD (participants)	Visits (participants)
	Capacity assessment (participants)	FGD (participants)	Capacity assessment (participants)	FGD (participants)		
Shakshouk	1 (8)	1 (8)	1 (7)	1(11)	2 (20)	3
Abu Hennes	1 (1)	1 (4)	1 (7)	1(7)	1 (10)	4
Deyaba	1 (8)	1 (8)	1 (13)	1(12)	2 (6)	0
Kafr El Sheikh	1 (6)	1 (5)	1 (13)	1(13)	2 (12)	7

Beheira	1 (5)	1(5)	1(8)	1(8)	1(15)	1
Abu Hammad	1 (5)	1 (6)	1 (9)	1(10)	1 (15)	3
Total	6 (33)	6 (36)	6 (57)	6(61)	9 (78)	18

In addition to the FGDs and interviews above, the consultant met with the representatives of the CDAs and WRCs during a meeting held in Cairo. This provided an opportunity to clarify information and close the data collection cycle. Finally, the consultant also held several meetings with all of the following: the IEIDEAS Project Manager, the ANR Program Director, the CARE Initiatives Manager, CARE field level staff as well as former Capacity Building Supervisors who provided insights into field level work in the earlier stages of implementation.

1.4.1 Levels of Analysis

There are multiple levels through which the project works to improve employment quality and outcomes of women fish retailers. The primary organization through which the project will achieve its outcomes is women retailer committees (WRC); these are not independent organizations but are situated within community development associations (CDAs). Therefore, these are two levels of analysis at which to document and assess the project's process, outputs and outcomes. Finally, individual women retailers are the third level of analysis. This report attempts to document processes, outputs and outcomes at all three levels.

1.4.2 Comparative Analysis

A cross site comparison was conducted to understand how variations across CDAs and WRCs affect outputs and outcomes for women fish retailers. This has allowed the drawing out of lessons learned for working with retailers in other sites for improving the working conditions and income.

1.5 Limitations of the Study

As with any study, this assessment has also had its challenges and limitations. The lack of a proper M&E system within the project as mentioned above, has meant that data on activity progress, outputs and outcomes has not been consistently collected throughout project implementation. There has also been several changes in the staffing within the CARE project team, with the Initiative Manager changing several times and both Capacity Building Supervisors changed over half way through implementation. This somewhat affected the institutional memory of the project but it was partly compensated by good documentation at the level of CARE and by meetings held with the two former Capacity Building Supervisors. The inability of the consultant to travel and visit the locations and CDAs and WRCs in person was another significant limitation. It was compensated by the fieldwork done by the project team and by individual interviews held by the consultant with the chairpersons of CDAs and representatives WRCs in parallel to a workshop in which they participated in Cairo.

1.6 Structure of this Report

Given the interconnectedness of various levels, activities and outcomes and that the conceptual differentiation between CDAs, WRCs and women retailers does not reflect the complexity of the interrelation between activities, outputs and outcomes, it is necessary to describe in brief the structure of this report. Chapter 2 describes in detail the methodology adopted by the project explaining the methodologies used and providing justifications why these specific courses of action were taken essentially answering questions around 'how' things were done and the reasons 'why' these approaches were selected as opposed to others. This is followed by a summary of interventions that have taken place across all communities with tables summarizing the number and type of training provided for example to allow for concise, factual and easy comparison. This section is therefore organised in chronological order. In Chapter 3 the report describes the outcomes of these implemented activities and is organized under subheadings each related to one of the different levels of analysis (CDAs, WRCs, women retailers). Under each subheading, each target community is described separately with reflection and analysis. Each subsection closes with general conclusions for each level of analysis. Chapter 4 provides conclusions and recommendations for future programming into 2015.

2 Description of Methodology, Activities and Outputs

2.1 The Project's Methodology

The broad methodological decisions and approaches that have been implemented under outcome 2 have had clear consequences for the way in which the project implementation was carried out and on the outcome of the activities on women retailers. The project team had thought out each intervention in detail, selecting the options with the greatest possible contribution to sustainability and empowerment of women retailers. Although the design of the interventions gradually evolved over time and were concretized following back and forth debates, there are some general methodological principles that have informed the design of the outcome. These general principles include:

- **Building local capacities.** In strengthening CDAs as the local organisations responsible for the development of their respective communities, the outcome seeks to create local ownership of the project objectives, better ensure sustainability and creating wider social change.
- **Participation.** Women retailers were encouraged throughout the design process to voice their needs and to participate in identifying appropriate solutions. The principle being that they need to own their own development process and eventually be able to lead themselves. The needs assessments conducted in each community with a sample of 50 women retailers were a clear instance where women retailers could participate in shaping and guiding the project. The validation workshops also held following the analysis of the needs assessment fieldwork was also done with the active participation of women retailers to ensure that the information and conclusions regarding their needs was correct and that they participate in setting the priorities for project interventions.
- **Creating a voice for women retailers.** By bringing women retailers together and building their capacity to identify their needs and their ability to advocate for their interests. This is essentially the purpose of the WRCs.
- **Sustainability.** By choosing to implement specific approaches and interventions, the project team was working towards longer term sustainability of the project outcomes and objectives. These choices include the CDA capacity building, the creation and capacity building of the WRCs and the provision of technologies which enable women retailers to increase their income and enhance their working conditions in the long term.

The following describes the specific approaches adopted under each of the interventions and the justifications for these.

2.1.1 Providing Technologies to Facilitate the Transport, Preservation and Hygiene of Fish

These technologies – namely, ice boxes and freezers – address an immediate need that women retailers were almost unanimous in mentioning across all communities during needs assessments and meetings. The problem that women retailers mentioned included:

- The deterioration in the quality of the fish throughout the day due to lack of proper storage;
- Their inability to store leftover fish overnight, which meant that they are forced to sell fish at a loss at the end of the day;
- Their inability to sell larger quantities of fish for the same reasons above; and
- The cumbersome traditional wares used to transport fish often created problems for them in using public transportation

These findings were echoed in the VCA which stated that the retail segment was poor in transportation, storage and therefore also the spoilage was high and the fish quality was low forcing retailers to sell at very low prices at the end of the day. Informal fish retailers have no proper means for displaying and storing the fish are particularly in need of technologies to improve the fish and therefore also profits. A key intervention for women retailers identified from the very start therefore was to improve these practices and provide women with resources and technologies to do so.

The idea of the ice boxes as a solution to the above was discussed with women retailers during needs assessments and during meetings to identify solutions to their needs. It thereby in theory directly contributes to improving fish preservation and reducing losses in fish and income. Part of the work done by the CARE Capacity Building Supervisors was to support the CDAs in discussing and studying the intervention in detail with women retailers in order to calculate the average amount of increase in income that may result from using ice boxes. Also, during the mid term evaluation, the project team compiled tables similar to table 2 below to assess the extent to which ice boxes are able to reduce the losses due to spoilage (thereby increasing income) as well as allow women to buy and sell larger quantities of fish. All the information in the table below which belongs to Shakshouk, was collected with the women’s participation and their inputs as to the price of fish, quantities sold, spoilage, etc. It confirmed earlier pre implementation discussions (although not as thoroughly documented) that supported the ice boxes as a suitable intervention for the women retailers. As demonstrated, the ice boxes alone could in theory help retailers increase their net profit per month from 800 EGP to 1,680 EGP (note that most of the increase in income derives from an increase in quantities of fish being traded).

Table 2 Increase in income resulting from ice box in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week)

	Quantity sold/day in Kg	Average net profit per Kg	Average total income / day	Total profit per day	Spoilage in Kg per day	net profit per day	Net profit per Month
Before the project	40	1.5	460	60	1 Kg (cost 10 EGP)	50	800
Effect of using ice box	70	1.5	805	105	0 Kg	105	
Total profit after project	70	1.5	805	105	0	105	1680
Increase in income							880

Similar exercises were done in the other communities with similar results although they vary slightly in terms of the profit made per kilo, number of kilo of fish sold, etc. (these tables are available in the project documents). However, it remains unclear to what extent the retailers who participated in such meetings were actually convinced of the idea, what if any solutions did they proposed and how many once they purchased the ice boxes found them convenient (refer to section 3.3 for an evaluation of the ice boxes). The success of the ice boxes has varied in relation to the type of community, consumer preference and the sources and types of fish as will be demonstrated in that section. It is also worth noting that due to delays in implementation (as will be mentioned below), in many of the communities, the women who had participated in the needs assessment were not the same as those who received the technologies.

The project facilitated women retailers’ subsidized purchase of the ice boxes. The reason the project decided that retailers should pay a part of the cost of the ice boxes is to ensure a level of commitment on the part of retailers to actually use the ice box. While there was flexibility in the rate that the CDAs set for the ice boxes, the project paid for approximately 75% of the cost of the ice boxes and the remaining 25% was paid as a contribution from the women retailers. The subsidization rate for the deep freezer and the tricycle (see below) was lower at 50%. At first, the CDAs were not accepting of the idea that women should pay a share in the technologies. This is due to a number of factors:

- Some CDAs are used to the charity approach and did not readily accept the concept that the retailers should pay for part of what they will use;
- There was a resistance from women retailers and the community in general to pay given that they are used to the charity approach;
- Some CDAs saw that the women are really unable to pay and that therefore some of the most needy would lose out.

Following much debate with the CDAs, the project proceeded with the concept of women retailers contributing to the cost of the technologies. The justification used was that these community contributions would go back and serve the interests of the retailers by covering the cost of other activities. While this was indeed implemented, in some communities the CDAs further helped retailers by allowing them pay their share in instalments. In other cases where the CDA saw that the retailers really could not afford even this method of payment, they opted to pay for the contribution in whole or in part from their charity fund (this was the case in

Sharkeya where they paid for part of the share and in Beheira where it was waived completely for the poorest ones). When questioned about the reasons for this, the CDAs mentioned that it was due to the very poor conditions of the retailers. It remains unclear whether there is a link between the subsidization approach, women's payment of their share (or lack thereof in some communities) and their actual use of the ice boxes for their intended purpose. This could be a question to investigate further during the final evaluation.

The provision of deep freezers was conceived for similar purposes as the ice boxes, although the reasons why some women received ice boxes and others freezers and on what basis they were chosen is not clear. Women retailers who were given freezers were organized into groups of 4 and as mentioned above, were requested to contribute up to 50% of the total price of the freezer. In addition to the issues around women's contribution, problems around the joint management of this relatively more valuable asset appeared immediately (as will be discussed under section 2.1.3 below).

There is another school of thought which argues that the women retailers should not have received any subsidies at all and that they would either have been able to purchase the technologies if they really needed them or they would have found themselves cheaper or more convenient alternatives. It also would have prioritized searching for market actors and exploring whether developing a value chain for the technology at the right cost could be done. It is worth noting however that due to the conditions in which the project operates (both community conditions and those of the individual women), it would have not been possible for the project to persuade the CDAs or the retailers with this approach. **There remains a large gap in the communities' understanding of development approaches on the one hand and also there is an extreme level of poverty of the women retailers on the other. The level of poverty is such that it renders their ability to think of possible benefits beyond the immediate income they can gain almost impossible. This is because they are depending on their daily income for their daily survival. The main concern with the technology transfer is not the subsidy but the type of technologies and the retailers' conviction that they need it.**

2.1.2 Distribution Centres to Facilitate Access to a Constant Supply of Quality Fish at Affordable Prices

This intervention was conceived to provide a solution to the control of prices by wholesalers. Wholesalers control the price of fish in their respective areas and women retailers, given their informality and fragmentation, are forced to purchase fish from them at the price they set, which allows them to have only minimal profit. Initially, the distribution centres were not the main intervention. However, the idea was welcomed by the CDAs who could see the possible benefits that they could have from it. Five distribution centres have been set up, the only exception being Kafr El Sheikh where the abundance of sources of farmed fish would have rendered the creation of a distribution centre redundant. The capital for the set up of the distribution centres and for the purchase of the fish as well as the running costs for the first three months (rent and salary of one employee) were covered by the subgrants and the actual amount for all of these items was determined by the CDAs in cooperation with CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor who supported them in the proposal development process. The premise was that the distribution centre would after the first three months become self sustaining and operate as an independent enterprise.

There does not seem to have been a proper business plan and feasibility study completed for each community in which a distribution centre was set up. In addition, the CDAs' capacities in running businesses was and remains weak and it seems that they had overestimated their ability to understand the market, their ability to compete with the wholesalers and the number of retailers that would use the centres. This has had a direct effect on the ability of the distribution centres to operate effectively and efficiently and has caused major challenges in CDAs such as the one in Beheira (see section 3.1). The overestimation of the number of women who would use the centre has also meant that many CDAs have not been able to reach their target as is the case in Beheira for example. Much more technical assistance was required in this regard, both prior to the decision of creating the centres (during the planning and feasibility study phase) and during the operation of these centres. To add even more complexity to this intervention, each CDA implemented the distribution centre in its own way with various levels of success.

In order to address these issues, the project team brought the CDAs together in a capacity building exercise led by a business development expert. The exercise involved visits to the various distribution centres, a training workshop which covered feasibility studies, business planning, financial projections, cash flows, risk assessments, etc. (the full report is available with the project team for reference). Each CDA has created its

own plan for its distribution centre consisting of a mission statement, a market study, a sales plan, executive decisions, an administrative structure, a risk analysis and a cash flow analysis.

In a similar way as with the ice boxes, the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor supported the CDAs in discussing and studying the intervention in detail with women retailers in order to calculate the average amount of increase in income that may result from creating distribution centres. The table below is an example from Shakshouk which demonstrates that the distribution centre would reduce the cost of fish as well as allow women to buy and sell larger quantities of fish (from 40 kg/day to 70 kg/day) thereby significantly boosting their income. All the figures in the table were calculated with the women’s participation and their inputs as to the price of fish, quantities sold, spoilage, etc. As demonstrated, in theory the distribution centre alone could help retailers increase their net profit per month from 800 EGP to 1,240 EGP.

Table 3 Increase in income resulting from distribution centre in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week)

	Quantity sold/day in Kg	Average net profit / Kg	Average total income / day	Total profit / day	Spoilage / day	net profit / day	Net profit / Month
Before the project	40	1.5	460	60	1 Kg (cost 10 EGP)	50	800
Effect of distribution centre	70	0.25		17.5	1 Kg		
Total profit after project	70	1.75	822.5	77.5	1 Kg	77.5 ³	1240
Increase in income							440

The project’s mid term evaluation has questioned the distribution centre as an intervention given that it has been perceived as distorting the market. The argument is that existing market players, including wholesalers have an important role in the value chain, albeit they are often extortionate. Wholesalers not only provide retailers with fish on credit but they also support the other side of the value chain by providing fish farmers with credit at the start of the season to enable them to operate. The introduction of a new player in the market in this light is seen as detrimental to the whole system. Further, the project team did not make serious attempts to test the possibility of supporting women retailers in buying fish collectively rather than individually to enhance their negotiating power as a step prior to creating these centres. Another solution would have been to link women fish retailers to alternative sources of credit to enable them to buy from different suppliers (wholesalers, farmers) and increase competition between them. Another point of view however sees the introduction of the distribution centres as a healthy competition for wholesalers and other traders who over price their fish. **In future phases and projects, this hypothesis can be tested through trying different approaches and learning what works in different contexts. It is imperative that distribution centres operate with the same business and economic principles and be self sustaining and make a profit meaning that the CDAs should not provide an unfair competition. It is also vital that the CDAs be able to properly manage them and have the capacity to do so and to compete with wholesalers who are more experienced and who are ready to take greater risks in order to preserve their share of the market.** Ideally, the WRCs would be empowered enough and have sufficient managerial and leadership capacity to manage the distribution centres (or to set up another system to provide women retailers with a steady supply of quality fish at affordable prices). However this stage is very far into the future and the CDAs seemed to be better placed to lead this intervention. Finally, to be realistic, the CDAs had very little to gain from the project, given that the subgrants were very small (ranging from 34,000 EGP to just over 100,000 EGP each). The creation of the distribution centres was a way to create a win-win situation for CDAs and retailers. Having said that, **the project needs to ensure that there are clear systems in place so that the potential exploitation of the wholesaler is not simply replaced by the CDAs.**

2.1.3 Providing Tricycles to Transport Fish and Spaces for Marketing of Fish

³ There is a miscalculation in the table and it should read 67.50 EGP per day for a total profit of 1080 EGP per month.

This intervention directly addresses the concern of women retailers with transportation and by extension the amounts of fish they are able to sell and the markets they are able to reach. Women in all communities mentioned that one of the major challenges that face them is transportation since:

- Women retailers need to reach often distant suppliers at appropriate times in the early morning when transportation is infrequent;
- Women retailers often face the risk of sexual harassment in public transportation, particularly since they leave their homes very early in the morning, and even at dawn in some cases;
- Existing means of transportation are not welcoming of the retailers and their wares given the complaints of other passengers;
- Drivers may request them to pay extra amounts to cover the cost of the space taken up in the vehicle by their wares, to take advantage of their need for transportation and/or to discourage them from using their services;
- By the time that means of transportation begin to welcome women (after the morning rush hour), it is too late to start trading in fish.

To address this challenge, the project team discussed possible solutions with the women retailers in the various communities and with the CDAs. Possible options that were discussed included the purchasing of pick up trucks and motorized tricycles. For clear budgetary reasons, the idea of the pick up truck was discarded. Also rejected was the option to give tricycles to individual women.

At first, the project team considered giving the tricycles to the CDA to manage. This was the experience of CARE with similar projects in the past where equipment were given to farmer associations or cooperatives to manage on behalf of their members and in exchange for a nominal fee which would cover the running costs and maintenance. However the project team decided to put the ownership of the tricycles firmly in the hands of the women retailers for empowerment purposes. Following lengthy debates with the CDAs who refused at first the possibility of the ownership of the vehicles being in the hands of women retailers, groups of women were formed and a percentage of contribution to the tricycle was requested of these groups. The project team was persuaded about the joint management of the tricycles (as with other assets such as the deep freezers) for several reasons including:

- The budget for subgrants was limited and the project sought to reach the greatest possible number of beneficiaries. In fact, some CDAs such as the one in Kafr El Sheikh described how they had initially planned that tricycles be shared between 4 retailers (which they already considered to high) and were requested to raise the number to 6.
- It was an attempt to put retailers in a practical situation where they had to work together and build trust. The concept was that by having joint interests, retailers would be forced to work together and eventually experience the advantages of sharing costs and working more as a team rather than as competitors.
- The project preferred that the ownership of the tricycle be given to women rather than CDAs to empower women through the ownership of an asset and improving their management skills, decision making and understanding of how to make a profit.
- For the CDA to manage an asset such as the tricycles, they will be governed by their own administrative and financial rules which may ultimately prevent the operation of the tricycle (for example rules that require three offers, lack of budget, etc.).

Conditions were set for the groups of women to come together and be qualified for a tricycle. These conditions include that the women work in the same market, that they choose each other and they choose the driver, and that they need public transportation to either sell or purchase their fish. The following table summarizes the amount of savings and the increase in income that women retailers make out of the tricycle ownership. According to this information (which was collected during the mid term evaluation from the women retailers themselves), the tricycle allows women to make a daily net profit of about 10 EGP and an increase in monthly income of 160 EGP.

Table 4 Increase in income resulting from tricycle in Shakshouk (based on a 4 day working week)

	Quantity sold/day in Kg	Average net profit / Kg	Average total income / day	Total profit / day	Spoilage / day	net profit / day	Net profit / Month

Before the project	40	1.5	460	60	1 Kg (cost 10 EGP)	50	800
Effect of tricycle	40	10 EGP per day (saving transportation cost and Tricycle work for others)		10		10	
Total profit after project	40			70	0	60	960
Increase in income							160

Groups of women retailers paid their contribution and the tricycle was registered under the name of the driver, normally a male member of the family of at least one member of the group. The involvement of the male member of the family is due to women's inability to drive as well as provides an extra income / employment opportunity for the driver. Arrangements are made so that the driver may use the tricycle to transport other goods and persons during the day and pay the group a rental fee in exchange. CDAs have signed contracts with the beneficiaries that stipulate they may only sell the tricycle after two years as a guarantee that they will be used.

While it is not easy to monitor the use of the tricycle, it seems that the CDAs' concerns that women retailers would not be able to manage the joint ownership and that in the end either some within the group would benefit at the expense of others or the management would fail and none would make use of it (such as failing to agree on fuel expenses, spare parts, maintenance costs, etc.) was not unfounded (refer to section 3.3). **In this case also as with the distribution centre, ideally the WRCs would be strong enough to manage the tricycles themselves against a nominal fee which they could use to cover the running costs as well as pay for initiatives to support retailers. Given the weakness of the WRCs, in principle creating win-win situations to the advantage of both the CDAs and the retailers is acceptable provided there are strong systems in place to ensure that the retailers have equal and uninterrupted access to the tricycles and any other assets managed by the CDA. In future phases and projects, it would be important to test another approach such as contracting existing tricycle owners for transport services and compare learning from the two approaches to determine what works best in different contexts.**

2.1.4 Building Women Retailer Committees' Capacities and that of CDAs

From the very design phase of the IEIDEAS project, it was clear that to best support an informal, fragmented and disempowered group such as women fish retailers, it was first necessary to organise them into groups. The realisation of this necessity was based on the literature on women's empowerment and the role of groups in the informal economy and the need to organise women in some way to help them organise and mobilize for their rights. It was also confirmed by CARE's experience of organising smallholder farmers into farmer associations and producer groups and the benefits that this had on their ability to market their products for a better price and for also purchasing supplies and inputs in bulk, thereby reducing their input costs. Organising retailers into groups therefore was confirmed would be a cornerstone of any work to support women fish retailers. This was meant to a) organise them to work together; b) support communication and outreach to the widest possible audience; c) create strength in working together in unison. The project partners also agreed early on that in order to be effective, these WRCs needed to be formalized so that they may be recognized as representing the needs and interests of their constituency, that they may be able to put pressure on other stakeholders and that they may be able to receive the technical and financial support of the project.

Having agreed on these two principles, an internal debate ensued between the project partners regarding the most suitable form for the WRCs. The options were to either create independent women retailer organisations or to integrate women retailers as committees within existing organisations. The type of organisation was also in question with the two options of CDAs (which fall under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MOSS) and by the Law of Associations, Law 84/2002) and local fishermen and/or aquaculture associations (governed by the Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MOALR) and by Cooperatives Law 122/1980). Following deliberation, the project team opted for creating committees within existing organisations as the registration process required to formalize any type of new organisation (be it CDA or cooperative) given that the bureaucratic process and extensive time required would incur significant delays and complications. This

decision was confirmed within the political context at the time which would have delayed already lengthy process further. Rather than undertake a process of forming and formalizing new retailer associations the project team decided instead to form women fish retailer committees under the umbrella of existing organisations in the communities in which the project activities are implemented. The expectation was that these committees would benefit from a formal structure through which they could receive and disburse funds and assets such as the ice boxes, etc. They would be able to benefit from the technical and administrative support of the organisations and their board of directors (BOD).

CARE conducted a comparative review of the policies of cooperatives and CDAs to determine which type of structure would best suit the needs of women retailers and fulfil the needs of the project. CARE also hired an external consultant in 2013 to conduct an assessment of civil society organisations in Egypt in general and of fishermen cooperatives in particular. In the end the project team settled for working with CDAs for at least two major reasons: a) in order to become members in cooperatives, women fish retailers would have to be formally registered while in reality these women are informal and therefore have no legal status; and b) in order to avoid potential conflicts between fish farmers, fishermen, traders and wholesalers members in cooperatives and the relatively smaller and more vulnerable women retailers.

Following these key decisions, the project team began implementation of activities with the selection of CDAs, capacity assessment and capacity building of CDAs, formation and capacity building of WRCs, etc. (described in detail in chronological order in section 2.2). As the progress of implementation took place, the project team tried to respond as best as possible to the new and changing capacity building needs that emerged from the women retailers and the members of the WRCs in particular. In order to do so, the team introduced two approaches to support capacity building and meetings as described below.

a. Village Savings and Loans Associations as a Means to Strengthen WRCs

VSLA was introduced in three communities where the project team felt that the CDA or WRC was weak and unable to lead the retailers. These communities are Deyaba, Abu Hennes and Kafr El Sheikh. The idea was suggested by the WorldFish Gender Advisor during a review meeting in January 2014 in which the project team was discussing how to strengthen the role and capacity of WRCs.

VSLA is a best practice developed and tested and refined over time and across many contexts by international development agencies. It has been particularly widespread and successful in Africa but it has also been implemented widely in Asia and Latin America. The VSLA methodology allows marginalized groups to access entry level microfinance services otherwise unavailable to the poorest of groups, thereby opening up livelihood opportunities. In Egypt, it has only recently been formally introduced by Plan International starting in 2008 and later also by CARE through its Women's Rights Programme. The model is based on strengthening the traditional informal practice of Rotating Savings and Credit Associations, where 10-20 people pool an agreed amount of funds each week, and one member takes the whole amount, rotating the group fund each week. Through weekly trainings, members gain understanding and confidence in managing their group fund. The group discusses money management and offers advice on income generating activities, strengthening both financial and social capital. Member ownership is one of the most important concepts of the model and helps ensure sustainability. In time, members are empowered to take responsibility for their group management. The model has the potential to:

- Increase unison between women and help them discuss and solve their problems
- Increase access to sources of finance other than credit provided by wholesalers
- Increase in assets controlled by women
- Increase their ability to expand their business or add value to their retailing business or diversify their business (seasonality of fish).

The primary reason for introducing the VSLA methodology in the project was to strengthen the WRCs and create a sense of unity and teamwork between retailers. In practice, the VSLA coordinators in Deyaba and Kafr El Sheikh are themselves retailers and they coordinate between the VSLA groups they supervise and the WRC. The VSLA was introduced in February 2014 with the training of the coordinators. The formation of the groups began in April.

The groups in the target communities have been able to better voice their concerns and needs to the WRC as in the case of Deyaba where they demanded a solution to the problems they faced in the market (see section 3.2.5 for details). **However while there are clear systems in place to measure the financial performance of these groups, the project has yet to develop indicators and systematic methods to monitor the result of the VSLA groups on WRC performance and retailer unity.**

b. Community Theatre as an Alternative to Traditional Training Workshops

The project team was faced with another challenge with regards to the effectiveness of the training and capacity building that targeted members of the WRC and women retailers more generally. Traditional training methods that involve theoretical discussions and examples were not successful in influencing the thinking and behaviour of the participants from these groups. This was evident by the fact that during monitoring visits, meetings and discussions, participants were not able to recall the topics and the content of trainings they had attended only a few weeks earlier. The objective of using community theatre in capacity building is to positively impact their skills and therefore impact their social and economic lives and reduce their poverty. The project team agreed with the Jesuits and Brothers' Association for Development (JBAD), a long time partner of CARE in Minya through other programs and who have lengthy experience with this form of training.

Community theatre is used as a tool which mirrors real life to help women retailers think about their problems and challenges and find solutions or alternatives. The methodology involves several steps as follows:

- The JBAD team met with retailers to understand their main problems, and developed topics and scenarios based on the findings.
- JBAD trained all WRC members on topics that concern retailers through the use of the community theatre methodology. A group of actors from JBAD acted out situations which retailers face in their daily lives and retailers are asked to participate in the situation in front of them and suggest solutions. The JBAD team repeated these steps with several topics until the group came out with lessons, recommendations, etc. for each situation. The JBAD team conclude each session with important awareness messages, skills and/or concepts that were raised in the exercise in a theoretical discussion in order to emphasize learning.
- JBAD selected a group from the trained WRC members to be trained as trainers. Selection criteria included: active participation in the training; ability to read and write; strong personality and well respected among her peers; ability to influence others; creativity and ability to think out of the box; have initiative and ability to manage training sessions.
- The JBAD team trained the selected WRC members in the community theatre methodology and develop a plan for implementation.
- The trained WRC members implement the plan with the wider retailer community.

In informal discussions as well as during the documentation exercise, all retailers mentioned that they found the community theatre methodology empowering and enlightening. **Given that the community theatre methodology was only introduced in January 2014, the trained members of the retailer committees have yet to lead performances within the community. The project team would benefit from setting up a solid monitoring system to gauge the effectiveness of this form of training on retailers in the coming period.**

Overall, the ordering of the interventions is not in line with the outcome's TOC. The TOC mentions that the WRC comes first and that once it is created and strengthened, it would then lead the design and implementation of activities that support women retailers. It seems therefore that intervention 4 should have preceded and led all other interventions and that perhaps some of the other interventions may have been sidelined altogether by the WRCs or postponed to a later date in the future. In order to provide women retailers with incentives, the project sought to provide them with immediate benefits such as the ice boxes, tricycles, etc. This was an important step in order to build confidence of the retailers in the project and in the CDAs, however in a second phase, it would be worth exploring a reduction of such interventions and an increased focus on the WRCs themselves.

2.2 Activities Implemented and Outputs

This section summarizes the activities that were implemented by the CARE project team under outcome 2. The presentation is in chronological order and attempts to describe in detail the steps taken at each phase of implementation.

2.2.1 Identification, Selection and Capacity Assessment of CDAs

The sub-agreement between WorldFish and CARE was signed in early March 2012, and an internal inception workshop was held for field staff in Fayoum in April 2012 with the objective of orienting staff to the details of the project and their tasks and of CARE and WorldFish to jointly revise the sub-activity plans. The CARE Capacity Building Supervisors identified a number of CDAs which were already operating in the villages and districts in which retailers were concentrated. They developed a shortlist of 15 CDAs based on an initial CDA assessment form which narrowed down the pool of candidate CDAs based on basic criteria including the size of the CDA portfolio, the presence of staff and BOD, their community credibility and trust, etc. The shortlist was further narrowed down based on the implementation of a second form. The project settled for the following CDAs:

Table 5 Selected CDAs

Governorate	Community	Organisation Selected	Reasons
Sharqeya	Abu Hammad District	Abu Hammad Community Development Association	An old and well established CDA – wide outreach (5,000 households registered in its records) - community trust
Beheira	Abu Hommos District	Al Sabeel Community Development Association	Youth leadership – largest CDA in the area – wide outreach (800 households)
Kafr El Sheikh	El Reyad District	Community Development Association in El Riyadh	An old and well established CDA – Large portfolio – community trust
Fayoum	Shakshouk	Association for the Development of the Community, Family and Environment in Shakshouk	Previous experience of working with fishermen – large portfolio – community trust
Minya	Deyaba	Al Amal Fishermen and Community Development Association	Specialised in working with fishermen as a target group
	Deir Abu Hennes	Abu Hennes Community Development Association	Specialised in working with fishermen as a target group

It is worth noting that only 3 of the CDAs had previous working experience with the fishermen communities despite the fact that they are located all in well fishing and/or aquaculture communities. None of the selected CDAs however had previous experience of working with women fish retailers as a specific target group. It is also worth noting that CARE had not worked with any of the CDAs before. This fact is both positive since it meant that all organisations were starting from the same ground, and negative since there was no solid partnership to build on. This was particularly challenging in the Delta region where CARE has less experience and therefore there is less knowledge and understanding of who CARE is and what it represents. The CARE Capacity Building Supervisor in the region was challenged to find CDAs and to gain their trust, particularly since during this period there was a large public and media debate that was hostile to NGOs in general and to international organisations in particular.

CARE discussed the project objectives, approaches, activities and interventions with the CDAs at length, and there were often disagreements regarding the appropriate approach (charity vs. development ; subsidization) and the role of the CDA (where ownership of technologies and assets should lie). The CARE Capacity Building Supervisors supported the CDAs in conducting a comprehensive capacity assessment to gauge the structure, management and capacity of the CDAs and from there developed capacity building plans.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis of Women retailers

This rapid assessment - conducted from April to July 2012 - was meant to identify the main problems and constraints facing women retailers in the target governorates. The study was carried out as a community-based field survey and data collection was led by CARE's Capacity Building Supervisors with the assistance of the CDAs in their respective communities. The objectives of the study were to:

- Gather information on retailers and identify which markets they work in;

- Identify possibilities for adding jobs in this segment and/or improving current conditions of employment;
- Identify the major problems facing the fish retail saleswomen; and
- Identify organizations which address retailers' needs and the extent to which such organizations are needed.

CARE developed the research tools and trained CDA staff on data collection. The CDA staff applied the tools in the field thereby acquiring first hand knowledge of the challenges of women retailers and contact with them. A total of 278 structured interviews with women fish retailers in the five project governorates (50 in each of the 3 Delta governorates, 58 in Fayoum and 70 in Minya) were done although there was no proper sample taken. Data analysis was done in participation with the CDA. The survey identified their main problems as follows:

- The irregular availability of fish throughout the year due to seasonality
- Quality of fish, particularly as relates to storage and preservation
- Access to capital and credit
- Market infrastructure
- Problems related to transportation
- Price-setting
- Laws and policies which affect women fish retailers
- The role of the wholesaler

It recommended three important strategies to improve the employment conditions of women retailers:

- 1) Strengthening their voice in all levels of policy making;
- 2) Strengthening their voice in relation to other key actors affecting their work (e.g. family members, wholesalers, input suppliers); and
- 3) Improving their validity through gaining some form of legal status.

2.2.3 Capacity Building of CDAs

CARE began to implement the capacity building plans for CDAs to address their institutional capacity building needs as well as the technical training they required in order to be able to fulfil their role in the project. CDAs received training in strategic planning, grant management, financial management, proposal writing and gender among other topics (refer to table 3 below). In addition to workshop style training sessions, CARE organized cross visits to Shakshouk CDA in Fayoum to have a better understanding of Shakshouk experience in working with women retailers and grant management procedures. On the job training was also provided by CARE staff through daily work and monitoring. The following table summarizes the capacity building interventions for CDAs.

Table 6 CDA capacity building topics

Training topic	Community						Total Participants
	Beheira	Kafr El Sheikh	Sharkeya	Deyaba	Deir Abu Hennes	Shakshouk	
Grant management	x	x	x	x	X	X	42
Strategic planning				x	x	x	44
M&E				x	x	X	22
Proposal writing	x	x	x	x	x	X	34
Communication skills	x	x	x				27
Financial management	x	x	x	x	x	x	39
Effective management		x					12
Negotiation skills	x	X	x				26
Planning				x	x	x	23
Gender	X	x	x	x	x	X	
Internal governance	X	X	x	x	x	X	35
Documentation and report writing	X	X	x	x	x	x	32
M&E	X	X	x	x	x	x	34
On the job financial management support					x	x	6
Cross visit on project	X		x				11

management (to Kafr El Sheikh)							
Cross visit to Fayoum		x			x	x	

Most of the training sessions were traditional workshop type trainings. During some topics such as gender and governance CDAs developed plans to implement or transfer their training into the CDA. Participants developed the plans in the last session of these workshops and these plans are being followed up on a regular basis by the Capacity Building Supervisors.

2.2.4 Community Based Needs Assessments of Women Retailers

The Capacity Building Supervisors supported CDAs in conducting needs assessments of women retailers in their respective communities in a second round of studies following the situational analysis. The amount of technical assistance and support provided to CDAs varied from one CDA to another depending on their needs and their abilities to lead on specific tasks and subtasks. The Capacity Building Supervisors guided the development of the research tools, at a minimum supervised the implementation of the data collection through participation in meetings and market or house to house visits (in those communities where these were implemented), ensured the quality of data collected and supported the CDAs in analyzing the data and reporting. A sample of 50 women retailers from each community was interviewed using standardized research tools. Both individual in depth interviews and FGDs were conducted with the participants.

The results of the needs assessments (separate reports were done for each community) found that women retailers' challenges and needs can be classified into several clusters. These are the 'floor fees' and lack of appropriate markets; the irregular supply of fish and consequently the price of fish; poor transportation and storage facilities and means which is particularly important during the summer and in the warmer weather; lack of financial resources and services; lack of institutions and organisations that provide women retailers with support; and an absence of added value.

2.2.5 Validation Workshops

Capacity Building Supervisors supported CDAs in leading validation workshops in which women retailers were presented with the findings of the needs assessments to validate and ensure that they were in line with women's perceptions. These workshops also served to prioritize the needs in each community, and while there was a great level of similarity there were also differences appearing across communities. The validation workshops were held in Fayoum (July and September 2012) and Minya (August/September 2012) and similar ones were held in the other communities.

2.2.6 Proposals and Subgrants

CDAs developed proposals based on the findings of the needs of women retailers and the workshops and meetings held with retailers in this regard. While ideally according to the outcome's TOC, it would have been the WRCs to lead the design process (as well as the needs assessment process), for all practical purposes it was not possible to delay the disbursement of grants until the WRCs were formed and strengthened. The CDAs therefore took over this role and by extension, led the management of the interventions with some support from the WRCs when they were eventually created. The Capacity Building Supervisors supported the CDAs in the design process given the weak capacity of the CDAs in this regard. It is worth noting that not all the interventions proposed by the CDAs were accepted for funding. For example, in response to the need that had arisen during the studies for financial support, CDAs had suggested providing soft loans. However given that this was out of the scope of the original project approach and plan, and given the complexity of managing a revolving loan fund, CARE encouraged CDAs to support women retailers indirectly in this regard by linking them with existing providers.

Lessons learned and ideas were taken from Shakshouk CDA which was the first CDA to design, submit and begin the implementation of interventions (implementation in Fayoum preceded other governorates by at least 6 months). It is important to note that while inspiration was indeed taken from the example set by Shakshouk, there are important differences also due to context. For example, fish grills were not introduced in Shakshouk because there are already several fish restaurants in the area and would therefore not add any value. On the other hand, there are no deep freezers in Minya or Fayoum due to consumer preference in those governorates for fresh fish, unlike the Delta governorates where frozen fish is an acceptable part of consumers' diet. Having said that, there seems to be a need to revise subgrants for relevance of some of the proposed

interventions. In other words, while the needs that women retailers raised were the same across all communities, it is not necessarily the case that the solutions proposed for one community are suitable for the others (most notably as with the ice boxes, refer to section 3.3). Table 5 below summarizes the main interventions proposed by CDAs for their respective communities.

Table 7 Summary of subgrants proposed by CDAs

No.	CDA name & location	Beneficiaries	Grant amount (EGP)	Main activities funded by the grant
1-	Abu Hammad CDA, Sharkia	200	93,900	50 ice boxes; 2 tricycles; 2 deep freezers; 1 fish grill; establish small-scale rearing system; establish distribution centre
2-	Al Sabeel CDA, Beheira	300	100,200	50 ice boxes; 3 tricycles; 3 fish grills; establish fish distribution centre; furnishing the CDA; establish and develop small-scale fish rearing system.
3-	Al Reyad CDA, Kafr el sheikh	200	80,400	50 ice boxes; 4 tricycles; 4 deep freezers; 2 fish grills; establish small-scale rearing system.
4-	Shakshouk CDA, Fayoum	300 actual 357	86,800 + 74,900	120 ice boxes, 1 tricycle, 1 distribution centre, establish marketplace, 10 awareness seminars, develop 3 hygiene posters, deep freezer, furnish CDA, establish fish supply to the centre; Purchasing ducks & duck food for 150 women retailers, purchasing cleaning tools for 100 women retailers
5-	Al Amal CDA, Deyaba	75	51,000	50 ice boxes; 1 tricycle; 1 distribution centre; 10 awareness seminars; establish small-scale rearing system; furnish CDA
6-	Deir Abu Hennes	50	34,150	30 ice boxes; 1 restaurant with grill; 1 distribution centre; furnish CDA
Total		1125	521,350 LE	
Planned		900		

Once proposals were submitted to CARE and approved, the CDAs waited for MOSS approval before subgrants could be disbursed for the implementation of their activities.

2.2.7 Implementation of the Subgrants

Once CDAs signed agreements with CARE and received the approval of the MOSS to begin operations (a process which was often very lengthy and caused challenges for CDAs as described in section 3.1), the implementation of the interventions began. Each CDA was responsible for implementing the activities according to their project, and the outcomes of these will be described in section 3.1 below.

2.2.8 Training/Raising Awareness of Women Retailers

Several sessions were held with women retailers in all communities regarding awareness topics important to them. These included training on the different types of fresh water fish, how to identify fresh fish, nutritional facts, how to improve sales and customer service and teamwork. These sessions were held both formally and in informal settings such as during needs assessment and validation meetings, etc.

2.2.9 Formation of WRCs

CDAs supported the establishment of WRCs in each of the six target communities comprising an average of 10 members each (in Fayoum the number of members reached 15). In the first instance, members of WRCs were selected by the CDAs from among the women fish retailers who attended the trainings. There are no written or unified criteria for selection of WRC members and this is an issue that may be taken into consideration in the future in order to ensure that there are fair selection and membership processes. CDAs claim that the members were selected based on their commitment to attendance of meetings and their active participation in the trainings. Once members were selected, they were trained on several topics. They also began creating internal structures by selecting a head of the WRC and a deputy. Not all of these processes were 'democratic' in the sense that at times CDAs appointed the head and in other cases, the head was simply the member with the highest education. Some of WRCs such as those in Fayoum, Abu Hennes and Deyaba created their own internal systems through the trainings provided by JBAD (see section 3.2 for more details). However it became clear during the FGDs that members in some WRCs such as in Deyaba were not aware of these internal systems,

indicating that they were not used. The project team began in October to refresh the internal systems with the participation of the WRCs. As of the date of this report, the WRCs status was as follows:

Table 8 Comparison of WRC Status in the six communities

Community	No. of members	No. of WRC meetings held	Priority Subjects/Issues	Highlights/achievements
Abu Hammad	10	None	Price of the fish in the distribution centre	NA
Abu Hommos	13	None	NA	NA
Kafr El Sheikh	16	In VSLAs	IDs for retailers – Improvement of the infrastructure of the fish market in El Riyad	NA
Shakshouk	15	5	Providing ice for preservation of fish; market	Creation of market in Shakshouk
Deyaba	10	In VSLAs	Harassment of retailers for floor fees; performance of the local health unit	IDs for women retailers, creation of literacy classes, complaint to the head of the local unit regarding the performance of the local health clinic
Deir Abu Hennes	10	In VSLAs	NA	NA

2.2.10 Capacity Building for WRCs (including community theatre)

It is worth noting that although CDA capacity assessments were completed, there was no similar baseline done prior to interventions with WRCs since it was assumed that the WRCs would be starting from a very weak point. This has meant that the project team has attempted to compensate for this by attempting to do a comparison between before and after in the questions directed at WRCs during the documentation exercise. However it is strongly recommended that the project team develop a better way to monitor and evaluate project outcomes. The following table summarizes the capacity building interventions with WRCs:

Table 9 Capacity building interventions held for WRCs

Training topic	Community					
	Beheira	Kafr El Sheikh	Sharkeya	Deyaba	Deir Abu Hennes	Shakshouk
Communication skills	x	x	x	x	x	x
Teamwork	x	x	x	x	x	X
Roles and responsibilities	x	x	x			x
Marketing	x	x	x	X	x	x
Hygiene skills	x	x	x			
Negotiation skills	x	x	x			
Problem solving	x	x	x	x	x	x
TOT		x	x	x	x	x
Developing internal bylaw (on the job)		x	x	x	x	x
Advocacy skills	x	x	x	x	x	x
Awareness raising		x	x	x	x	
Exchange visits (to Fayoum)				x	x	
Meeting management and planning skills	x	x	x	x	x	X
Gender principles	x	x	x	x	x	x

As mentioned in section 2.1, the project team contracted JBAD to provide community theatre as an alternative and more effective form of training for the target group. The idea was based both on the need to include more experiential learning for adult learners as well as more practical and less theoretical training for the target group who are often illiterate. WRC members would then be responsible for cascading the same methodology onto their peers. WRC members were trained on the following topics using this methodology:

- Planning and managing meetings
- Gender
- Negotiation skills
- Problem solving
- Advocacy

The WRCs in Deyaba and Deir Abu Hennes held their first cascading performance with the support of the JBAD team in July and the remainder of the cascade training plan is to be carried out in the near future. The teams are ready to perform up to 5 scenarios (one focusing on each of the training topics) and JBAD has also developed a trainer and trainee manual for replication in future phases and with new communities and groups.

2.2.11 External Review of Outcome 2

A review of outcome 2 was commissioned to assess the progress of the project at the level of outcome and the related output: 'Fish retailing organizations established and functioning in 5 governorates'. The objectives of the gender evaluations were to assess the contribution of current and planned project activities towards achieving project outputs and outcomes, recommend corrective action, assess whether the documentation plan will capture sufficient information on project processes and outcomes, and contribute to learning and make recommendations on gender-focused activity areas and objectives for a phase two IEIDEAS project proposal. The evaluation was carried out in February 2014 and its recommendations include: addressing gender issues rather than women only and improvements in the documentation plan with specific suggestions on areas to focus on for learning as well as other recommendations for a second phase of the project.

2.2.12 Fish Retailer Gender Study

A study was carried out to assess how gender and informality intersect to affect the conditions and outcomes of work for women and men fish retailers. The study was done through a quantitative survey where a structured questionnaire including questions on household characteristics, household members and housing and economic conditions was administered with a total of 748 respondents with a roughly equal number of women and men. Qualitative interview guides with open-ended and semi-structured questions were also used in conducting in-depth interviews and focus group discussions with the women beneficiaries and in-depth interviews with traders. The questions in the focus group discussion guidelines explored participants' perceptions related to fish retailing activities, obstacles faced and benefits gained by participating in the project activities.

The study found that while women have unique gender constraints in comparison to men, most other characteristics of male and female retailers are similar. This is due to the fact that the paramount challenge is their informality. Although women's roles in child care and homemaking continue to be viewed as primary, economic need pushes women into markets, loosening mobility constraints. Yet norms about women's role in caring for the family continue to present the largest gender-based constraint that women face. Women work on average fewer hours per day in fish retail than men, work more hours in domestic labour, and are more likely to report a conflict between fish retail work and domestic responsibilities. Women's fish retail enterprises tend to be of smaller scale and they tend to sell a narrower range of fish species and often buy lower volumes, leading to lower profits. Exceptions to this were found in Kafr El Sheikh where women were earning profits on a similar scale as their male counterparts.

The study recommended working with both women and men fish retailers in gender responsive ways in addition to focusing on:

- Enhancing fish retailer voice and recognition;
- Addressing domestic responsibilities and time constraints;
- Engaging with market systems to improve the provision of transport and cold storage services; and
- Conducting further research to better understand certain aspects of women and men fish retailers' relationships, particularly on the relationships between fish retailers and traders to understand their characteristics, whether and how gender affects the quality and characteristics of these relationships, and how to go about enhancing the bargaining position of women and men retailers in trader relations and on how the household roles and relationships of women and men fish retailers influence their work life, and vice versa.

2.2.13 VSLAs

The introduction of VSLA has already been discussed in section 2.1. CARE trained a group of community members on the methodology and identified VSLA coordinators from the three communities in which it is implemented (Kafr El Sheikh, Deyaba, Deir Abu Hennes) in February 2014. There are 3 coordinators in Kafr El Sheikh and one each in Deyaba and Deir Abu Hennes due to the large discrepancy between the number of retailers targeted. The salary of the coordinators is covered outside of the subgrant. Follow up reports are submitted to CARE and the BOD for revision. The training was completed in March and coordinators began to form groups in April. The VSLA groups meet on a weekly basis and are supervised and supported by the VSLA coordinators. At the time of the report, there were a total of 22 VSLAs across the three communities, with a total membership of 353 members (both male and female). The largest number of VSLA groups was in Kafr El Sheikh (16 groups) while Deyaba and Abu Hennes had notably more modest numbers (4 and 2 respectively). The breakdown is shown in the table below.

Table 10 Statistics on VSLAs in the three target communities

No	Group Name	Number of groups	Total number	Gender		Female		Number of loans	Total amount of loans (EGP)
				Male	Female	Retailers	Others		
1	Deyaba	4	60	6	54	45	9	24	9,150
2	Deir Abu Hennes	2	38	0	38	36	2	9	3,600
3	Al Reyad	16	255	53	202	172	30	71	15,285
Total		22	353	59	294	253	41	104	28,035

Members have also begun to take out loans to support their income generating activities, and a full list of projects and further analysis is found in section 3.3. The VSLA has been so popular that the CDA staff and BOD have begun joining the groups. Other communities have also questioned the reasons why they have been excluded from the methodology.

2.3 Challenges in Implementation

- **New target group and sector** – CARE had not worked with the target group in the past or in fish retailing. There were therefore many lessons to be learned and challenges to be faced. This was expected and recognized during the design phase, and outcome 2 was indeed a pilot for later scale up, however the consequences have been trial and error.
- **Security problems** - Fieldwork began in May 2012 at a time when security problems and political instability made meetings extremely challenging to organize. Community members were unwilling to attend and when they did it was risky. For example, only two days following one meeting led by CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor in Belbes (Sharkeya), a woman fish retailer and her daughter who had been filed a case of obstructing traffic happened to be arrested. The retailers assumed that CARE was responsible for this and following this incident, the Capacity Building Supervisor's credibility in the district was damaged and he had to find a new district to work in (hence, Abu Hammad).
- **New governorates and CDAs** – Through this project CARE began operations in three new governorates in which it had no previous track record. CARE's concentration of its development work in Upper Egypt has meant that it is little known in the Delta region. Combined with the widespread public suspicion of international organisations operating in Egypt at the time, the task of gaining the trust of CDAs and of communities was particularly formidable and took considerable time and effort that would have otherwise been spent on working towards the objectives of the outcome. In Kafr El Sheikh for example, the Capacity Building Supervisor recounted how during one of the meetings with retailers, a representative of the State Security appeared at the meeting to monitor what the meeting was about, clearly having been tipped by someone in the community. Having said that, the IEIDEAS project has been able to overcome this initial fear and resistance and it is expected that future phases and projects in these communities will not undergo similar difficulties. In the Upper Egypt communities where CARE is better known, there was still a challenge that CARE had not worked with the CDAs before, meaning that there were no ground rules and common ground to build on.
- **The lack of a strong M&E system** – The project team has been unable to properly track and document the outcomes and results of the interventions on women retailers due to a very weak M&E system.

While some M&E activities such as a baseline for CDAs (in the form of the pre capacity assessment) were conducted and also for women retailers, there was other important M&E work to be done, particularly since this was a pilot from which CARE and partners would learn and build on. In coming phases as interventions are scaled up and new communities join the project, a focus on M&E will become a priority.

3. Analysis of Outcomes

3.1 Outcomes at the Level of CDAs

3.1.1 Abu Hammad Community Development Association, Sharqeya

The CDA (established in 1982) was selected out of 3 potential CDAs based on its outreach and reputation as a sound and well renowned organisation. It had no previous experience of working with women retailers or with fishermen or fish farmers. It manages a bread distribution centre which covers around 5,000 families therefore there enjoys a level of trust and renown within the community.

As a first step in introducing the project to women retailers the CDA held field visits to the places where women retailers are located with the purpose of explaining to them the objectives of the project. At first the retailers requested financial support and the CDA attempted to persuade them through several meetings and discussions that this was not the objective and to convince them that there are other more sustainable types of inputs and support the project can provide to improve their working conditions and/or increase their profits. The CDA participated in conducting a survey on the needs of women retailers by bringing women together in meetings, leading brainstorming sessions, supporting identification of needs and prioritization. The process was led by the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor due to the lack of experience on the part of the CDA in doing similar exercises, and they were given tasks and led on sub tasks whenever possible. Based on the findings of the needs assessment, and with the technical support of CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor, the CDA developed and submitted a proposal for a subgrant to respond to the needs of retailers with a total budget of 113,525 EGP with an additional 19,625 EGP to be contributed by the community (retailer contributions to technology transfers). Many interventions drew from the experience of the pilot in Shakshouk given that the problems and needs that women emphasized during the needs assessment were very similar. The main interventions proposed by the CDA were as follows: distribution of 50 ice boxes, 2 tricycles (to be jointly owned by 6 women for a total of 12 beneficiaries), 2 deep freezers (to be jointly owned by four women for a total of 8 beneficiaries), 1 fish grill (for two beneficiaries), the set up of a distribution centre and the creation of a small scale aquaculture farm as an experiment to test the possibility of introducing fish farming at the household level. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 200.

With the first payment of funds, the CDA purchased the ice boxes, tricycles, deep freezers and fish grill. Women retailers contributed 25% of the cost of ice boxes and 50% of the cost of the other items. However, due to the delay in MOSS approval, the CDA had lost the trust of the retailers who had participated in the needs assessment and who had confirmed their willingness to purchase these items. The CDA had to start searching for a new group of retailers and they cite this as a major reason why the technology transfer did not have the desired outcome.

As for the distribution centre, the CDA had budgeted 12,000 EGP, part of which was used to purchase crates and barrels, a deep freezer and scales. It deposited EGP 8,000 of the amount with the WorldFish Centre as a first payment to purchase fish. According to available financial records, the distribution centre purchased around 6,500 kg of fish from the WorldFish Centre between 21 May 2014 to 30 September 2014 with a profit margin that does not exceed 1 EGP per kg for a total profit of 8,500 EGP. The distribution centre is managed by two women retailers and by an accountant and the tricycle driver and under the supervision of the CDA's director. There is a loss of – 17 EGP this probably means that there is a loss in the fish and the running cost. The CDA reported that only 15 women currently make use of the distribution centre, the majority of whom are members of the WRC. This brings to question how they will be able to reach their target number of beneficiaries and one of the primary reasons for the small number of women who make use of the distribution center is due to the fact that it sells fish to both retailers and the public at the same price. The CDA participated in the business plan training held in mid October 2014. The recommendations can be found the report developed by the consultant.

Finally, the CDA's subgrant planned on testing the feasibility and profitability of small scale fish farming for women for possible replication and scale up. The CDA had identified a woman retailer whose husband had

experience working in fish hatcheries and who had built two cement tanks by their home. The CDA helped improve the conditions of the tanks and contributed with fry and feed for an entire farming cycle with 3,000 EGP. This initiative also benefited from technical assistance by fish farming experts from Kafr El Sheikh and Sharkeya paid for by funds outside the subgrant. The tanks were constructed out of concrete and combined with the frequent power cuts over the summer which affected the operation of the water pump, there were losses in the fish. While normally every 2 kg of feed produce 1 kg of fish, the project brought 66 kg of fish for 100 kg of feed. While this is a higher yield than standard, the difficulties faced by the retailer including the lack of availability of technical assistance on a daily basis and the exposure of the pond to birds has led the beneficiary of the farm to plan to raise fry into fingerlings since it has a quicker turnaround and may prove to be more profitable.

Apart from the training workshops (summarized in table 6), the CDA benefited from exchange visits to Kafr El Sheikh and Shakshouk as well as the field visits to the local markets. The CDA representatives at the FGD confirmed that CARE supported the organisation in developing a vision and mission and that they were not aware of the importance of having these in the past. They also confirmed that the training on evaluation and management supported them in better managing the distribution centre and in calculating to what extent it is successful and in calculating the profit and expenses. The delay in receiving MOSS approval led to a lack of trust on the part of the women retailers who began to drop out and lose interest in the project and to lose credibility of the CDA. "For this reason, we were forced to search for new retailers which in its turn led to a delay on our side in delivering the inputs and delay in settling the advance from CARE. They mentioned that the CDA could have done a better job of identifying the women retailers most in need and that given that the BOD works on a voluntary basis and therefore there is limited time. In future projects, progress will be faster since they will have already gained experience of how such projects work.

While the CDA's overall score in the initial capacity assessment was 1.6, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 1.7. The CDA has confirmed its willingness to continue working with women retailers despite the challenges they had at the beginning in establishing a relationship of trust with them due to the retailers' competitive and at times fierce behaviour. However the CDA requires a lot of monitoring and follow up and close monitoring and systems for the distribution centre. If the project is to consider working with the CDA in the future, it needs to address the weak staffing and the reliance of the CDA on its BOD to implement the project.

3.1.2 Al Sabeel Community Development Association in Abu Hommos, Beheira

The CDA, while only created in 2012, has a very active BOD and its staff is mainly composed of youth committed to supporting their community. Its current programming supports over 800 households which makes them the largest CDA in the area. However the CDA has two main weaknesses. The first is that they operate as a charity organisation as opposed to adopting a development approach which meant that much time has been spent on discussions around development concepts and how they are more sustainable. The second is that they hold conservative gender attitudes, a fact which affects their ability to work with women. Meetings held in CDA premises which require the presence of both men and women are segregated, bringing into question the effectiveness of their ability to work with the target group.

The CDA conducted a needs assessment on women retailers with heavy support from the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor. The assessments were conducted in more than one village and involved both visits to markets and home visits. While the research tools were developed by CARE, the CDA also added questions itself. Based on the findings of the needs assessment, and with the technical support of CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor, the CDA developed and submitted a proposal for a subgrant to respond to the needs of retailers with a total budget of 100,200 EGP with an additional 22,150 EGP to be contributed by the community. Again, many interventions drew from the experience of the pilot in Shakshouk given that the problems and needs that women retailers emphasized during the needs assessment were very similar. In hindsight, the Chairman of the CDA commented on this saying that while "The problems are similar in all the governorates, the mechanisms for solutions were not necessarily appropriate for them in the same way" (refer to sections 2.2.4 to 2.2.7 and to the recommendations section). The main interventions proposed by the CDA were as follows: distribution of 50 ice boxes, 3 tricycles, 3 fish grills, the set up of a distribution centre and the creation of a small scale aquaculture farm as an experiment to test the possibility of introducing fish farming at the household level. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 300.

Up to the time of this report, the CDA had not been able to distribute all of the 50 ice boxes, with around 15 ice boxes remaining in storage. This has happened despite the fact that the CDA has helped women retailers who are not able to pay their share of the contribution by accepting payments in instalments and for the more severe cases by waiving their contribution and covering it from the CDA charity fund. The CDA's justification for this inability to distribute the ice boxes is that this intervention is not as relevant as others (in particular, the distribution centre). The Chairman clearly stated during both the FGDs and the interview that in his opinion, the design of the outcome had emphasized the transfer of technologies at the expense of the distribution centre which he saw as being of much higher priority for the women retailers. In his view, if the price of fish was dealt with as a priority, women retailers would be able to overcome their biggest challenge.

The CDA met many challenges with the distribution centre given their poor experience in the sector. Operations began in June 2014 after the CDA identified a suitable location, selecting independent premises which are more accessible to retailers, purchased the assets to establish the centre as well as conducted an extensive survey to identify the most suitable and affordable supplier of quality fish. The main problem facing the CDA is to find a supplier of fish at an appropriate price to counterbalance the transportation cost. The Chairman explained that the CDA had expected that WorldFish would supply fish for a lower price in order to support the project, but in fact provided them with fish at the same price as traders. Given that women retailers in their community have always obtained their fish from Trombat Barseem at the same price as the price most suppliers would give the distribution centre, finding cheaper fish was a real challenge. Currently, the centre deals with suppliers in Kafr El Sheikh, Eclu and Tolombat Berseek. In order to overcome the high transportation cost, the CDA thought of various solutions and decided on building a tank on Mahmoudeya Lake in order to store live fish for one or two days thereby reducing the need for daily transportation. In addition to the cost of building the tank (which they incurred twice since it was not built correctly the first time and had to be rebuilt), the CDA had to cover the cost of a pump to raise groundwater. The CDA obtained a letter from the MOSS supporting this initiative and requesting the MOWRI to expedite the registration process so the necessary paperwork is underway. It also purchased oxygen tanks to keep the fish alive during transportation. The total cost of these additional inputs amounted to 12,000 EGP. However given that there were no funds for this through the subgrant, the CDA had to modify the subgrant by cancelling the small scale fish farm initiative and had to raise funds from other places. The distribution centre has still been unable to cover all these extra expenses and it still owes the CDA over 10,000 EGP.

In order to create the required demand for fish from the distribution centre, the CDA agreed to supply large traders who are willing to purchase up to 500 kg of fish per day. The CDA found this to be a win-win situation that would support the sustainability of the centre as women retailers purchase fish on credit and pay back over several days. The CDA is considering relocating the distribution centre in order to be closer to the city centre to be able to sell remaining fish to the public to avoid losses without significantly affecting fish retailers. Finally, the CDA is looking into finding a partner from private sector to support. Despite all these efforts, so far only 39 women use the distribution centre, 30 of whom have entered the fish retailing business recently as a result of the CDA's encouragement to start up their own income generating project. It is worth noting that the distribution centre is staffed by three persons from the CDA: one responsible for sales; one responsible for purchasing and marketing and the accountant. The CDA has complained of the lack of sufficient budget for staff in the distribution centre, which has meant that they worked on a volunteer basis given that the CDA is not able to sustain a salary from its own funds.

Overall, the CDA has not managed to meet its target and has only been able to reach 96 beneficiaries as of the date of the data collection. On the other hand, the CDA has attempted to create new employment opportunities by introducing fish retail to the beneficiaries of their charity work by giving them fish from the distribution centre for the same amount and allowed them to work (their target in the subgrant was 250 existing women retailers + 50 new entrants as employment creation). They also demonstrated a commitment to support retailers often at the expense of the CDA as with the new interventions they introduced in order to render the distribution centre sustainable. Although some of these interventions may be questionable, the CDA took the risk in order to allow the centre to function. The BOD approached the head of the City Council to create a market for retailers and did the same when he was replaced a year later. The Chairman of the CDA however stated during the interview that during this time "there was an inability to make decisions due to the continuous political changes and uncertain landscape". The reply to his requests was that there was a space made for fish retailers in the existing market and that it was the retailers who refused to use it (the reason being the distance of this market from the fish market). The head of the City Council even refused the CDA's

offer to cover the expenses of improving the fish market by putting drainage and umbrellas in exchange for identifying a space for women retailers.

Given that the CDA worked in mainly charity work, the project has been able to build their understanding and capacity of development work and more sustainable approaches. The CDA members who participated in the FGD confirmed that the capacity building assisted them in improving the project design and proposal writing skills. They also confirmed that they have improved planning and communication and this was reflected with the women retailers and their relations with them. The CDA already has one member of the BOD is a woman. However they have much to work on regarding integrating gender into their work, given their conservative attitudes. While the CDA's overall score in initial capacity assessment was 2.0, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 2.6 which is a significant increase in this short period of time. The BOD has 2 women who sometimes join training.

The CDA has confirmed its willingness to continue working with women retailers despite all the difficulties they have faced in the project because they have recognized their needs. This commitment to the target group is the reason that has driven the organisation to take such risks with the distribution centre. Given that the CDA operates at the district level, there is the potential to expand to other villages in the Abu Hommos district. However should work continue with this CDA, the project team will have to provide closer guidance and technical support in order to help them make investment decisions informed by risks, costs and benefits particularly to women fish retailers.

3.1.3 Community Development Association in El Riyadh, Kafr El Sheikh

Given that the majority of aquaculture production comes from Kafr El Sheikh, the governorate is a well established producer of fish. The CDA was established in 1968 however they had never directly targeted fishermen, fish farmers, or retailers in the past. In fact they only added fishermen communities to their internal bylaws once the project began (this change was approved by the MOSS in April 2013).

The CDA conducted a needs assessment on women retailers with heavy support from the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor. Based on the findings of the needs assessment, and with the technical support of CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor, the CDA developed and submitted a proposal for a subgrant with a total budget of 80,400 EGP with an additional 30,500 EGP to be contributed by the community. The main interventions proposed by the CDA were as follows: distribution of 50 ice boxes, 4 tricycles, 4 deep freezers, 2 fish grills and the set up of a small scale aquaculture farm as an experiment to test the possibility of introducing fish farming at the household level. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 200.

During the interview, the member of the board emphasized his reservations regarding the joint management approach for the tricycles and deep freezers. He recounted how the CDA had initially planned for 4 women to share the tricycle and 2 women to share the deep freezer. Although even then the CDA considered that it would be a challenge to have the women retailers working together, they understood that there was not budget for individually owned assets. They were then asked to increase the number of women to 6 per tricycle and 3 per deep freezer which they found unrealistic. They have been unable to properly trace these technologies since there are no monitoring systems in place or means of corroborating the statements made by women retailers during followup meetings.

As for the small scale fish farm, the CDA supported one farm with fry and feed while CARE provided technical assistance in the form of experts. Several challenges were met during the implementation of this activity, and these were addressed by the technical expertise provided for by CARE.⁴ By July, the fish had reached 800 g – 1 kg each. According to the CDA, several women have requested support to set up their own small scale fish farms and the CDA is looking forward to be able to create about 10 more in the near future. Finally, the high price of feed meant that the budget in the grant was not sufficient to cover more than 3 or 4 months' expenses. The beneficiary of the fish farm tried to find cheaper, home based alternatives to the feed. In the future, this could be an opportunity for participatory action research to experiment with lower cost feeds to enhance profitability.

⁴ It is worth noting that the pond is an earthen pond and therefore had different challenges than the one in Sharkeya.

Finally, VSLA has been introduced in the community and the CDA has been committed to their creation and strengthening, seeing that they are an important intervention for the target group. The CDA decided early on to include both men and non retailers in the groups in order to benefit the largest number of beneficiaries. This is something that can be studied in more depth during the impact assessment to enhance learning.

Beyond the activities in the subgrant, the CDA has attempted to support the retailers by striving to push the local authorities to set up a market.⁵ An ad hoc market exists in El Reyad town, however the Head of the City refused to give it proper registration. The same happened with the new Head of the City one year later, the reason being that this market is located in a street and therefore does not meet the criteria of a market. The CDA also attempted to persuade the head of Raghama village to create a small market for up to 8 retailers. While he agreed in principle, he requested the CDA to obtain the written approval of residents in the designated area before formalizing the registration process. The CDA explored a third location for the market, however the land belonged to the MOWRI. Since the market would be the most important intervention that women retailers can benefit from, the Chairman emphasized that he would like to see the project support the CDA on this issue as a priority.

Up to the time of this report, the CDA had only reached 90 of the planned 200 women retailers. This brings into question the initial proposal submitted by the CDA for funding and how realistic the targets the CDA set for itself were. The CDA has requested permission from CARE to disburse loans from the community contribution to members of VSLAs in order to benefit a larger number of retailers. This suggestion was welcomed however the CDA is still preparing the necessary guarantees and systems to ensure that the funds will be managed well.

While the Chairperson of the CDA is a woman, it is interesting to note that her husband was the former chairman (and current board member) and in fact continues to take all critical decisions for the CDA. The younger staff have complained that he is not trusting them and not letting people work. Apart from the regular capacity building trainings, the CDA participated in a visit to the CDA in Shakshouk. The CDA had a vision and mission and although they were not written down or formalized, they claim that most staff knew them (the exception being new staff members). The project helped review them and announce them make them known and properly documented. The CDA's overall score in initial capacity assessment was 2.0, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 2.3 which demonstrates that they have made good progress during this period. A CDA such as this one had the potential to perform better if they were followed up better and clear agreements on roles and responsibilities.

3.1.4 Association for the Development of the Community, Family and Environment in Shakshouk, Fayoum

Shakshouk has the largest concentration of fishermen, fish farmers and fish retailers in Fayoum governorate. While the Field Supervisors visited five potential CDAs to explore potential partnership on the project, the CDA was selected based on its wider geographical outreach, greater number of beneficiaries and its previous experience in working with fishermen communities. In fact, the CDA has worked on projects to support the improvement of fishermen's socio economic situation and that of their families. It was responsible for the establishment of the Fishermen Union and for introducing a shrimp peeling factory for fishermen's wives and women retailers through two of its past projects.

The trust that the CDA has within the fishermen and fish retailer community was an important factor which facilitated the entry point of the project. The CDA participated in conducting a needs assessment of women retailers and in some cases led the process by bringing women together in meetings, leading brainstorming sessions, supporting identification of needs and prioritization with the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor providing technical support and quality control. The needs assessment also involved the participation of the retailers in identifying the appropriate solutions for their problems. For example, women confirmed the usefulness of ice boxes and their willingness to use them. Similarly, they welcomed the idea of a distribution centre. Based on the findings of the needs assessment, and with the support of CARE's Capacity Building Supervisor, the CDA developed and submitted a proposal for a subgrant to respond to the needs of retailers

⁵ While according to the impact pathway this role should have been led by the WRC, it was still too weak at this stage to take such action. In future phases, it will be important to strengthen the WRCs in order to enable them to be self reliant.

with a total budget of 86,800 EGP and then took an additional 74,900 EGP in addition to an amount to be contributed by the community (retailer contributions to technology transfers). The main interventions proposed by the CDA were as follows: distribution of 120 ice boxes, 2 tricycles (to be jointly owned by 6 women for a total of 12 beneficiaries), 1 deep freezer, 10 awareness sessions, posters, the creation of a market, purchasing ducks and duck feed for 150 women, providing cleaning tools for 100 women. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 300 and the CDA is the only one to have exceeded its target and reached 357 retailers. It is important to note however that the CDA did not have a way of tracking the beneficiaries at first, so some women retailers received more than one intervention (for example: ice box + tricycle). In order to avoid duplication, the CDA requested that the WRC revise the list of retailers and beneficiaries and requested more funds to introduce duck raising and fish cleaning for additional women.

The CDA has demonstrated a commitment to the project's objectives and beyond that to supporting the interest of the women retailers. They were able to support the WRC by helping it to contact the Local Council and the Directorate of the Environment Ministry in order to establish a market for retailers (for more information, see WRC section below). The CDA participated in the process of identifying an appropriate location for the market place, including facilitating negotiations between the head of the school which was adjacent to the land identified for the market, the Head of the Local Unit as well as the City Council. The CDA also faced a problem with the budget and were able to mobilize local resources to cover the cost of the market. While they had budgeted for 17,500 EGP for the creation of the market based on the estimation made (mo2aysa) with the Local Unit, by the time the land was identified and following a 3 month delay in the payment of the funds, there had been in the meantime an unprecedented sharp increase in the price of cement and steel. This meant that the CDA and the BOD had to find a way to cover the difference. The BOD discussed the possibility of doing away with contractors in order to save money to cover the increase in the price of building materials. Even this solution was not enough to cover the gap. Therefore some members of the BOD suggested to reach out to the local private sector firm EMISAL. The BOD contacted and negotiated with them to supply workers as volunteers as part of the company's corporate social responsibility towards the local community. With the same arrangement, the CDA was later able to cover the costs of a roofing (cover) to protect retailers using the market from the sun. The CDA was therefore able to build the market just a little above the budgeted amount.

Apart from being able to go beyond the target, the CDA also supported women retailers in becoming members of the Fishermen's Union. According to the latest records available, 150 women retailers have been registered as members in the Union. While the membership of some retailers was paid through a donation, all 150 members renewed their membership the following year at their own expense, an indicator that they have benefited from the membership. The membership has guaranteed health insurance for these women and social insurance for 29 women to be increased in the near future. It is also worth noting that one of the WRC members has become a member of BOD of the Fishermen Union.

The CDA has a relatively strong internal structure and monitoring systems. While it already had a written vision and mission prior to the project, as a result of the strategic planning training they were able to revise them to better reflect what the organisation actually does and how it goes about it. Following the gender training, the CDA committed itself to increase the membership of women in its structure. The BOD has 15 members of which 4 are women and they meet every 15 days. There are no policies or mechanisms to ensure diversity in the board as this is not specified in the internal bylaws and this has changed. In practical terms, the CDA has already worked on increasing women's membership in its general assembly. The CDA has also confirmed its plan to increase membership of women in its BOD in future elections. Also following the training, the CDA representatives who participated in the FGD confirmed that they were able to develop a plan for each project, quality assurance of the plan for each project, monitoring systems of projects. They have also cited the benefits of the accountability training and had a practical example when applied it. In a solid waste collection project While the CDA's overall score in initial capacity assessment was 2.4, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 2.7 which reflects good progress.

During the interview, the Chairman of the CDA justified the relatively greater success of the project in Shakshouk is due to the community's greater need for the project, and in particular to the market and the ice boxes. He also mentioned that whereas in terms of the size of the subgrant, it is the smallest project that the CDA is working on in terms of budget, its direct impact on women retailers is what renders it so successful. He also mentioned that the active participation of the CDA in the priorities of the WRC and retailers has had a

positive impact on the retailers themselves. In his view, this has been reflected in women's increased willingness to volunteer in the work of the CDA, their participation in greater numbers and with higher commitment in attending meetings and workshops and their greater confidence in the CDA (in comparison to the start of the project).

The first subgrant was signed in October 2012 and the MOSS approval was only received in March 2013. The CDA reported that the delays have led to a lack of trust from the retailers due to inability to keep to promises, and provide deliverables on schedule. As mentioned above, the delays have also meant that there have been increases in prices and costs from the time of the writing of the proposals to the time of implementing the initiatives.

The CDA will almost certainly continue working with retailers given that they are a primary group of the community. This is evidenced by their striving to go beyond the project tasks. It is also clear in their commitment to the wider fishermen and aquaculture community. They have recently for example signed a project contract funded by Drosos to establish an ice making factory to help the preservation of fish. In a possible second phase of the IEIDEAS project, the CDA envisions the possibility of working with retailers in other villages and in of creating markets in Sanhour and Ibshaway. The CDA could work on improving its M&E system in order to put in place clear roles and responsibilities and steps/activities. Rather, staff on projects present reports every two weeks to the BOD with status, progress and challenges if any. Recommendations to the CDA include the revision of the by laws to include diversity in general and not only gender representation.

3.1.5 Al Amal Fishermen and Community Development Association, Deyaba, Minya

Deyaba is a fishermen community. Although it was only recently established (in 2010), the CDA was created to provide services to and improve the living and working conditions of fishermen. While they had no previous experience of working with fish retailers in marketing but there is previous experience in working with fishermen to improve their socio economic level and to improve their working conditions including supporting them in extracting fishing permits, cleaning drainage channels and removing infringements on the Nile. They also trained them on making fishing boats out of fibre glass in cooperation with Better Life Association in Minya. With fishermen's wives the CDA has worked on income generating projects such as raising poultry and making liquid soap and fishing nets. The CDA (as with the CDA in Deir Abu Hennes) is a founding member of the Fishermen Union in Minya.

Given the CDA's weak capacity and lack of experience, the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor supported the CDA during field visits to the places where women retailers are located and with the needs assessment. This learning by doing exercise took place over several weeks and was meant to be led by the CDA in future assessments. The CARE Capacity Building Supervisor also supported the CDA in designing the project interventions based on the findings of the needs assessment. The CDA submitted a proposal for a subgrant with a total budget of 51,000 EGP in addition to the community contribution. Many interventions drew from the experience of the pilot in Shakshouk given that the problems and needs that women emphasized during the needs assessment were very similar. The main interventions proposed by the CDA were as follows: distribution of 50 ice boxes, 1 tricycle, the set up of a distribution centre and the creation of a small scale aquaculture farm as an experiment to test the possibility of introducing fish farming at the household level and 10 awareness seminars. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 75 which is one of the smallest target groups among the rest of the CDAs. This is due to the relatively smaller number of women retailers in the community.

The CDA set up the distribution centre from September-November 2013 by purchasing scales, refrigerators crates, 4 desks and chairs. The capital set aside for purchasing fish was 6,000 EGP. Operations began on 30 November 2013 with 250 kg of fish purchased for 1687 EGP and sold for 1812 EGP. The number of women who purchased fish on the first sale was 11 women. By the end of the first month of operation, two new women began to use the centre (they were not retailers in the past). The centre was managed by one employee who was selected from outside the CDA and for a monthly salary of 300 EGP. The space of the distribution centre was rented for 300 EGP per month. The distribution centre purchased fish from Mallawi District and Assiut and often times Aswani fish was not available in Mallawi and when it is available it is not of good quality. This means that there is a large amount of loss and at the same time the prices are too high for the women retailers. Total monthly sales in the distribution centre reached 3,000 - 3,500 EGP according to the CDA records and up to 42 women accessed the distribution centre 15-20 of which used it for their supply of fish on a regular basis.

However at the end of March 2014 the CDA made a decision to suspend the distribution centre operations due to several reasons including: Poor capital and lack of availability of good quality Aswani fish in Mallawi and Assiut. The CDA sees that the centre can start operations once again when there is an increase in capital to allow it to purchase the fish from its source (Aswan Lake) to better guarantee the quality and better price. It is important to note that since Deyaba is a fishermen community and women retailers do not sell outside the community. Consumer preferences do not encourage frozen fish at all. This means that the distribution centre does not work at its full capacity of 50 women (target). This issue has been addressed through the business planning training and capacity building advisor in November 2014 and the CDA has developed a plan to reach its targets.

As for the small scale fish farm, the CDA has not established it yet despite a large amount of effort having been invested in locating a suitable location for the farm (around 10 different locations were visited to assess them for the creation of the fish farm). The season begins in the month of March and given that they have missed this year's season they will have to wait to the following year (however the project will have ended by then). The awareness raising training was not applied properly. While the CDA has printed the posters, they have not been well distributed. VSLAs have been created in the community, and they have supported the communication of women retailers needs to the CDA through the VSLA coordinators.

Despite the above drawbacks, the CDA has tried to provide women retailers with other services. One of the members of the BOD also works in the Local Unit and was able to create two literacy classes for retailers. The CDA also managed to agree with JBAD on the provision of more classes for retailers and other members of the community. The result is that out of 12 women members of the WRC, now 11 are able to sign their names. The BOD also supported the WRC in addressing the challenge of the 'floor fees' that women retailers are required to pay by extortionate government representatives. The BOD arranged for a meeting between the head of the unit and the women retailers in the CDA premises to discuss and find solutions for this problem as well as the problem with the local Health Unit (for more information on both these issues, please refer to section 3.2.5 below).

As for the results of the capacity building, the CDA was able to take important steps in developing a vision and mission and to include retailers as a target group. The CDA was in particular need of financial management training as they had virtually no financial system in place. The project supported the Deyaba staff with both training and technical assistance to develop the financial system, resulting in improved financial reports and smoother financial settlement processes as evidenced by the feedback of CARE's Accountant. While the community did not allow women to travel and attend training but now have representation of women after the gender training and seeing the other CDAs and gain trust of the project. One of the representatives of the CDA mentioned that "This project is a precedent for the CDA in this field and we have earned a greater reputation in the community as a result of it." The CDA does not currently have female members in its BOD and due to the BOD elections timing, no new members are expected to be introduced before two years at the earliest. It has however made an effort to increase female membership in the general assembly. They also have a women's committee; most members of the WRC are members in the women's committee and they take rights training with Better Life (same as Deir Abu Hennes). While the CDA's overall score in initial capacity assessment was 1.6, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 1.8. This is good progress for such a young organisation.

The CDA has confirmed its willingness to continue working with women retailers and given that they are a fishermen association, it is very likely that they will continue to do so. Yet the CDA requires a lot of technical support in order to be able to continue with the project in a second phase. The CDA could work on improving its business management skills as this is the first time that it operates a business; it is used to charity work. They were not able to find solutions for example for the distribution centre and suspended its operations when it incurred losses. They have a very weak staffing structure and require more staff and less reliance on the BOD for the day to day operations. They are also challenged with the relation with local government officials which is not always a smooth one.

3.1.6 Deir Abu Hennes Community Development Association, Minya

Although it is a relatively new organisation having been created in 2012, Deir Abu Hennes CDA was selected given that there are a considerable number of fish retailers in the community and due to the CDA's previous experience in working with fishermen. Although the IEIDEAS project is only the second project it works in, the

CDA was a founding member of the Fishermen Union in Minya (as with the Deyaba CDA) and two of the Union's BOD members are from the CDA.

The CDA was heavily supported by the CARE Capacity Building Supervisor in identifying and assessing the needs of women retailers. Having said that, the BOD members themselves led house to house visits to women retailers at the start of the project to better understand the target group and their needs and to support the credibility of the project and create trust with the CDA. They were also supported in the subgrant design process given their weak capacity in this area. The subgrant, which covers the distribution of 30 ice boxes, 1 restaurant with grill and the set up of a distribution centre has a total budget of 34,150 EGP in addition to the retailer contributions. The total number of beneficiaries that the CDA aimed to target was 50. This is the smallest target groups among the rest of the CDAs, preceded only by Deyaba. This is due to the relatively smaller number of women retailers in the community.

The set up of the distribution centre which is based in the CDA premises, was completed with the purchasing of a deep freezer, crates, barrels, scales, computer, cupboards. A capital of 5,000 EGP was set aside for purchasing fish from suppliers. In theory, there is budget for two employees to manage the centre and are paid monthly salaries. However given that the budgeted salary (300 EGP) is too low, the CDA could not find willing candidates and the BOD members do the work themselves. Fish is purchased from Mallawi District the amount purchased depends on several factors including fasting, and it can reach from one to three tonnes per month. All retailers sell within the village only and do not sell outside it. Since the village depends on fresh caught fish from the Nile, it was difficult for consumers to accept farmed fish and the CDA was not sure that the consumers and the retailer will be able to purchase and sell the fish. For this reason when the distribution centre began operations, it started only with 4 boxes (100 kg). By the end of the month it had managed to sell 3 tons (the distribution centre operates 4 days a week). Some months there is plentiful fresh fish from fishing September to November which affects the distribution centre. The distribution centre gives women the fish on credit. There are from 15 to 17 women who are regularly purchasing from the distribution centre. Three non retailers joined and started in this line of work following the creation of the centre. The subgrant did not include a tricycle however the CDA feels it should purchase one to save on the transportation costs which reach 50 EGP per day however much the quantity of fish.

The Chairman of the CDA felt that the best intervention introduced by the project is the distribution centre since its impact is "felt directly by the women" who did not have a steady supply of fish throughout the year and who are unable due to customs and traditions to go out of town to sell and buy (supply). The Chairman also confirmed that the VSLA groups made a difference among their members by enabling them to learn how to save, and how to be self dependent. The WRC is also an important bridge between the women retailers and the mainly male BOD. The Chairman felt that it allowed women to talk more freely of their problems. The CDA has been able to achieve its target (50 women retailers) through the distribution of ice boxes, the grill and the users of the distribution centre although it is important to check for duplication in numbers. The CDA has also suggested that in future projects, there be a greater focus on services that retailers require such as medical services and support for retailers and their families. This is a need that the retailers have identified (refer to section 3.2.6 below).

Given that it is such a new organisation, the CDA had not developed its vision and mission prior to the project interventions but developed them as an output of the training. It has a very weak staffing structure with BOD members doing almost all the work. They have follow up systems in place although they are very basic and can be developed further for effectiveness and efficiency. Most members of the WRC are relatives of the BOD because they are also retailers. The CDA representatives who participated in the FGD stated that the credibility of the organisation among the community increased when they demonstrated the list of persons who received ice boxes. There were rumours that the CDA was benefiting some persons and not others based on nepotism and as a result of the governance training the CDA was able to accept the community's right to information and the need for the CDA to be transparent and accountable. The CDA also found the training on proposal writing, planning, documentation and reporting very important as they addressed critical needs and gaps. They reported that these trainings helped them support retailers better through improved monitoring of activities. As with Deyaba, the CDA required additional support with financial management and the project provided technical assistance to develop the financial system. This resulted in improved financial reports with less errors. The CDA has demonstrated a commitment to improve its capacities. They have requested CARE to learn how to use computers to improve their performance. CDA members attend daily training at their own expense to

improve their skills in this area. The CDA does not currently have female members in its BOD and due to the elections timing, it has however made an effort to increase female membership in the GA. While the CDA's overall score in initial capacity assessment was 1.6, in the post capacity assessment, the CDA's overall score was 1.9 which is considered good progress for an organisation as new as this CDA.

The CDA almost certainly will continue working with women retailers beyond the project timeframe given that it was founded as an association to serve the fishermen community.

3.1.7 Challenges with CDAs

- **Delays in MoSS approvals.** Although the creation of WRCs as committees within CDAs was chosen as a way to circumvent the delays and challenges in creating independent organisations for women retailers, a general challenge that met the work of all CDAs was the protracted delay in receiving approvals from the MOSS and security clearance in order to begin operations. The expected lengthy approval processes became even longer due to the political and security instability and the lack of willingness of the government to issue any approvals to NGOs during this time. For example while the Shakshouk CDA submitted its application to the Directorate of the MOSS in Fayoum in April 2011 upon signing the agreement with CARE, the approval only arrived in September 2012. In the case of the Beheira CDA, the approval was delayed from the day it was submitted in March 2013 to January 2014 when the approval was finally received. In order to compensate and avoid long setbacks to the project, needs assessments, training and capacity building activities were carried out through CARE and not the CDAs. While this did not affect the size of the subgrants, it did put additional pressure on CARE staff and transferred responsibility for project performance in communities outside of the CDA scope of work. A suggestion is to create a service centre in CDAs will allow them to participating in bidding processes which do not require MoSS approvals and this will speed up the process and reduce delays.
- **Relatively new, small or weak organisations** - The associations in Deyaba and Abu Hennes are both still new having been established in 2010 and 2012 respectively. This means that they share common challenges including the lack of a strong organisational structure and internal systems and this affects their work with the retailers. Other CDAs had poor staffing structures not due to their recent establishment but to their weakness as organisations.
- **Charity approach.** As is the case with the vast majority of Egyptian CDAs, many CDAs including Deir Abu Hennes and Beheira are used to the charity approach. In turn, community expectations are such that they are deserving of charity and donations and the concept of development is new and not always readily accepted. With the exception of Shakshouk, the lack of development approach meant that it was difficult for the CDAs to understand and/or be convinced of the importance and potential of the WRCs for the retailers and therefore also of the type of support that the CDAs could provide them with in order to better fulfil their roles in representing the interests of women retailers. It also resulted at times in a 'what's in it for me' attitude on the part of the CDAs.
- **Sufficient staff should be accounted for in the subgrants.** In hindsight it seems clear that CDAs did not have the capacity to assess how much time they required for the different tasks and therefore in many cases had only budgeted for a staff in the distribution centre for the first 3 months until it became independent. This does not account for the rest of the tasks in the project and has meant that members of the BODs have had to step in and volunteer their time in order to complete required tasks. This is not ideal given that in some CDAs, BODs are more active than others. In the future, it is recommended to ensure that there is sufficient budget to allow CDAs to operate effectively and therefore also to allow CARE to hold them accountable for their performance against workplans and targets.
- **Sufficient correlation between budgets and targets for each CDA.** In a similar way, the design of the subgrants needs to be reviewed with a particular emphasis on how realistic were the target number of retailers was in comparison to the budget and to the proposed interventions.
- **Better tailoring of interventions to suit the needs of each community.** While the needs of women retailers appeared to be the same across all communities, it was not necessarily the case that the same solutions were equally welcomed by all and/or had the expected results among women retailers from different communities (a table summarizing all interventions per community can be found in Annex D). Further study is required to understand how the differences between communities have led to varying levels of success of interventions (refer to section 3.3.1 below for some preliminary findings around ice boxes). Further investigation around this question can be pursued during the final

evaluation. In future projects, there should be more attention given to the particularities of each community (number of wholesalers, fish farmers and other suppliers, consumer preference, number of retailers and competition between them, distance to closest markets and/or suppliers, etc.) to understand how they influence which interventions would work and which would not be effective.

- **Better tailoring of interventions to suit the needs of each community.** While the needs of women retailers appeared to be the same across all communities, it was not necessarily the case that the same solutions were welcomed by all and/or had the expected results. In future projects, there should be more attention given to the particularities of each community (number of wholesalers, fish farmers and other suppliers, consumer preference, number of retailers and competition between them, distance to closest markets and/or suppliers, etc.) to understand how they influence which interventions would work and which would not be effective.
- **More technical assistance in business and management for distribution centres.** It seems that the feasibility and business planning prior to the design of subgrants was very poor. There is a clear need to focus on this in order to avoid risks, be efficient in spending the project's resources and better manage CDA and women retailer expectations.

3.2 Outcomes at the Level of WRCs

3.2.1 Abu Hammad WRC

The members of the WRC present at the FGD confirmed that the WRC was formed by identifying the women retailers who attended the trainings regularly. The WRC does not meet regularly but rather only when the CDA calls for meetings for specific events or tasks. One of the main issues that the WRC discussed was the problem with the price of fish in the distribution centre since it sold fish at the same price as the market. This problem was discussed and presented to the CDA's BOD however they did not take any action. The members are active and need some guidance and support. The WRC has developed a plan for its operations in 2015 which includes specific steps to strengthen the WRC itself (finalization of the bylaws, internal elections, teamwork training) and activities for women retailers including spreading awareness about the WRC and its purpose, conducting a needs assessment and focusing with the CDA on finding a solution for a market.

3.2.2 Abu Hommos WRC

In the CDA's view, the project has invested a lot of resources on training and building the capacity of the WRC with little return. This is due to the capacities of the individual members and the weak cohesion of the group. According to the CDA Chairman there are only 2 or 3 active members and the rest of the WRC only meets when there are specific project activities to be done and when there is a guaranteed incentive. During the FGD, the WRC was unable to provide any concrete ideas or vision for its own role in the future or for women retailers. The only issue they mentioned was to provide women retailers with fish at a better price.

3.2.3 Kafr El Sheikh WRC

The CDA is responsible for creating the WRC and selecting the members. The selection/candidate criteria were announced to all the fish retailers in the markets. The representation of various villages was also taken into account in the formation of the WRC with representatives from El Riyad, Raghama and Abu Mostafa. The majority of the members are literate, with commercial secondary school degrees yet further research is required to demonstrate whether this has had an effect on the outcomes of the WRC.

While the WRC members claimed that they have forwarded retailer concerns to the BOD, there does not seem to have been any progress with these or followup on the part of the WRC. They claim that they discussed the need for IDs for retailers and for the construction of a toilet in the El Reyad Fish Market. According to the member of the BOD interviewed, the WRC members are mostly ineffective and do not participate unless there is a material incentive for them to do so. He estimated that there are 4 or 5 effective members but the rest need to be changed.

In order to strengthen the role of the WRCs, the project team introduced VSLAs in Kafr El Sheikh. There has been much progress with the formation of VSLAs in terms of members, savings and loans, however the effect of these groups on cohesion, solidarity and working together has still to be seen and measured properly.

The WRC has expressed their satisfaction with the community theatre training which they consider is very effective because the plays are simple and they easily get the message through. WRC members who participated in the FGD reported that as a result of the capacity building, they were able to better express themselves and better able to handle problems whenever necessary.

Finally, while during the FGD the members of the WRC were unable to provide a clear vision or concrete actions for the future, they have since been supported by the CARE staff to develop a vision and plan for the future. This includes a plan to transfer the community theatre training to women retailers, follow up of the VSLA groups, working with the CDA on the establishment of a market, providing ID cards for retailers and finding health insurance for retailers.

3.2.4 Shakshouk WRC

The representatives of the WRC in the FGDs confirmed that the CDA along with three women retailers were responsible for the selection of WRC members from the pool of women retailers who were most regular in attendance in training and who demonstrated the most commitment, responsibility and reliability. The criteria used to select members also took into consideration leadership qualities, ability to speak in public, good relations within the community, ability to travel and geographical distribution (albeit without strict ratio) with one representative from Ibsaway, three from Selen, 6 from Fedemen, 4 from Fayoum and the rest from Sanhour.⁶ WRC members were able to clearly state their roles and responsibilities which they cited as raising awareness of retailers, communicating their problems and needs to the committee and attempting to find solutions to these. When asked about the role of the WRC for retailers they stated that the WRC was important “so that we may have a voice and be able to make our needs and demands known” and they also mentioned that through the WRC “we can gather the rest of the retailers”. The WRC members confirmed that they had agreed upon a head of the committee and a deputy and that this was done through agreement between the members. The WRC meets on a weekly basis (Thursdays) and this was attended regularly until Ramadan. Up to the time of the FGD, the WRC had met 5 times although they had not documented the discussions and outcomes. They reported that differences of opinion have arisen between WRC members and that these were addressed by resorting to the CDA as a mediator in the discussions and reached a majority vote.

The WRC has been in contact with the wider retailer community by facilitating their access to the services provided by the project, but they have not led any meetings to discuss specific needs of women. When asked how they are able to identify and prioritize the needs and problems of retailers they responded that “we are part of the retailers so we have common problems that all retailers suffer from”. They also cited walking through the markets with retailers and selling with them in markets.

In addition to facilitating the access of women retailers to project services, the WRC has supported the CDA in determining the number of female retailers, clarify any duplications and setting up and maintaining an updated database of retailers. This was particularly important at the start of the duck raising initiative. The most important achievement of the WRC has been its participation in the process of creating the market. The WRC participated in meetings with local government officials at least three times during the process and it is something that they are proud of.

The WRC reported positive relations between the WRC and the CDA as they share a “common objective” of improving livelihoods and working conditions of retailers. They reported that the CDA addresses the WRC needs in terms of capacity building to enable it to take on its role effectively. The CDA also supports the WRC in solving problems that face it and those that necessitate a higher decision are presented to the BOD. They also confirmed that the BOD is supportive of the WRC and has on occasion provided ideas and solutions and supported the implementation. In turn, the WRC supports the CDA in reaching a greater number of retailers, in understanding the constraints and needs of retailers and in identifying those who deserve the services.

As a result of their membership in the WRC, members reported an increase in self confidence and sense of purpose. The women are quoted to have stated: “I am proud of myself” I feel like I am responsible and have responsibilities I feel as if I earned a diploma (making reference to a high educational certificate) I speak in lieu of a group and not as an individual. When asked how retailers viewed the WRC, they answered that the

⁶ Given that the CDA operates at the district level, the WRC needed to ensure representation of most villages.

retailers see them as there to help and support them and that they are responsible for them, they come to us for help. CDA are helpful and are proud of us encourage us see us as capable of transferring training to others. They reported that their husbands were surprised that they could take on all these new tasks effectively – treat them better – allow them to travel for training purposes which was not something acceptable in the household in the past.

The WRC in Shakshouk seemed to have the widest variety of ideas. These included: to create a fund that supports those women retailers in need; to transfer the training to a wider group of women retailers; to replicate the creation of a market in other villages; to repeat some of the activities, particularly the distribution of ice boxes and the duck raising and expand in new communities and villages; working on getting women retailers an official status and legal status and join them to the Union. They also requested that there be literacy classes for retailers and their family members. Since the FGD was conducted, the WRC in Shakshouk has developed a plan into 2015 involving two objectives. The first objective is to strengthen the committee itself and it plans to do so by conducting elections with the participation of at least 50% of women retailers in the community; from there redrafting the internal structure (head and deputy); and coordinating with the CDA and CARE to build WRC capacity in holding meetings with government representatives and improving documentation of meetings and followup on decisions. The second objective is to provide services and address the priorities of retailers and to do this they have included the following in their plan:

- Transfer of the community theatre training to the widest possible number of retailers
- Include new retailers in the Fishermen Union
- Update the database of women retailers – with more complete information and updated names and contact details
- Identify and pursue advocacy issues (examples: transfer of the bus stop to be closer to the market – provision of insurance for all retailers – stop wastewater drainage from the fish farms).

3.2.5 Deyaba WRC

The WRC in Deyaba was formed through the CDA's selection of members from the participants who attended retailers' training. The members elected the current head of the committee based on a majority vote given her ability to read and write. The WRC developed bylaws, which include clauses on the mission and objectives of the WRC, the roles and responsibilities of the various members, how it operates and internal regulations and reporting. While they were supposed to have regular fortnightly meetings, they have not held any to date. The project team responded to this by introducing VSLA to encourage women retailers to discuss their problems and work together. For example, the WRC discussed the problem of floor fees and disrespectful behaviour from wholesalers towards retailers in the market with the local government unit. The local government unit suggested the creation of ID cards for retailers.

The most notable achievement that the WRC claims part of is the creation of IDs for women retailers. Until recently, retailers in the market used to be forced to pay more than the required local tax as floor fees. The issue was discussed in VSLA groups and was carried forward by the WRC to the CDA. The CDA and more specifically, the BOD supported the WRC by communicating this concern to the Local Unit. A meeting was arranged in the village between the head of the local unit and representatives of the WRC and other retailers in which they discussed the problem. The head of the local unit agreed to find a solution by providing women ID cards to allow them to operate in the market with the normal fees and in exchange for official receipts. While the ID cards had not been completed yet at the time of the data collection for the documentation assignment, the retailers reported that they were no longer being harassed and that clearly instructions had been given. Similarly, the WRC communicated retailers' concern with the local health unit and its dispensing of medication to the BOD. Again the head of the local unit met with the WRC representatives and other retailers to discuss the issue and the local unit is trying to address the problem.

The WRC members reported a positive working relationship with the CDA's BOD since they are able to put forward their challenges to the BOD and the BOD in turn takes the opinion of the WRC in the distribution of services to retailers. The WRC feels that it has a positive role and voice with the BOD as evidenced by the work done with the IDs and the health unit.

When asked about their vision for women retailers, most across all the WRCs had the same general responses regarding increasing incomes and livelihoods. In Deyaba, one of the members stated "that there to be a better

future for women retailers because when incomes increase we will be able to send our children to school". However, since the FGD, the WRC has worked on developing a proper plan for itself in the coming months and into 2015. The plan includes:

1. Transfer community theatre training to women retailers
2. Hold meetings with retailer to explain role of the WRC and listen to their needs
3. Hold meetings with local government, the Fishermen's Union and local council
4. Support as many retailers as possible in improving their income
5. Address at least two advocacy issues with a focus on IDs and inclusion of retailers in the Union (as with Shakshouk)
6. Supervision of the documentation of the VSLA groups and success stories
7. Meetings with the BOD to solve the problems of the distribution centre

3.2.6 Deir Abu Hennes WRC

As with the other communities, the WRC in Deir Abu Hennes was formed through the CDA's selection of members from the participants who attended retailers' training. The WRC developed bylaws, which include clauses on the mission and objectives of the WRC, the roles and responsibilities of the various members, how it operates and internal regulations and reporting however it seems that they are in need of revision since the WRC representatives in the FGDs were not able to identify what the bylaws consisted of. The WRC members reported changes in membership due to the family commitments of some of the former members. Others were replaced because they were children of retailers but not retailers themselves. While they were supposed to have regular fortnightly meetings, they have only met once to date the project introduced VSLA to encourage women retailers to discuss their problems and work together. Many WRC members are also members or leaders within the VSLAs.

While the WRC could not mention any concrete actions they have taken to represent women retailer interests during this period, the members reported during the FGD that "we have become important people and we have an opinion and a role to play. We are a group and we work together and have increased our self confidence". Another reported that her husband has increasingly appreciated her role since her income has increased and her participation in the VSLA groups. The WRC in Deir Abu Hennes has worked on a plan for the future in a very similar way as the Deyaba WRC. However it will require a lot of support and follow up in order to being working as a team and serve the needs and interests of the retailers in their community.

3.2.7 Challenges with WRCs

- **General** – until recently there was no strategy to build capacities. There was no needs assessment done at the start and no training plan. The responsibility of the CDA. Training methods were not appropriate for the target group. They require more than theoretical training and that imparts a skill. This is the reason for interactive theatre. Women retailer cantered approach. Done in all five target communities starting in March 2014. before there were individual efforts and there was no coordination and comprehensive approach. Took new approach due to the lack of impact on the group (roles and responsibilities, teamwork). Capacity building plan done by CARE employees
- **Capacities of individual members** – Women retailers in many communities are illiterate (thereby contributing to their status as informal vendors). With the exception of Sharqeya and Kafr El Sheikh where some WRC members hold technical diplomas (the equivalent of secondary school), the rest have limited education and limited empowerment. This meant that traditional training methods did not suit this group of women. Affects the training impact
- **There is little volunteerism** – WRC members are retailers themselves and need to work to make a living. In order to leave work and attend trainings, they require incentives which are not always available particularly if training activities and meetings take place within the village.

3.3 Outcomes at the Level of Individual Women Fish Retailers

3.3.1 Ice boxes

To date, a total of 355 ice boxes have been distributed to retailers across the six target communities. The subsidization of ice boxes has already been discussed above. The project distributes the boxes based on the payment of a small contribution by retailers. This was not welcomed by some communities and the CDAs paid

their contribution through their own funds, thereby effectively distributing the ice boxes for free. However it seems that this is not the only factor that affects retailers' decision to use the ice boxes, considering that in Beheira, there are still 15 ice boxes that have not been distributed. The outcomes of the ice boxes has been the most varied across the target communities. Overall indicators demonstrate that the ice boxes have been most useful in Shakshouk where women retailers alternatively use them to store fish throughout the day (although they continue to display smaller amounts in traditional wares in the market) and to store leftover fish to the next day. The ice boxes in Shakshouk have also had a relatively greater success than in other communities as a result of the husbands of retailers (the vast majority of whom are fishermen) relying on the ice boxes to store and transport their catch. Ice boxes have been used in Shakshouk as a practice in the past although not all women were able to afford purchasing one. They were therefore very keen that IEIDEAS provides them with the opportunity to purchase subsidized boxes. Out of 12 members of the Shakshouk WRC interviewed, 7 claim they use it on a regular basis albeit more frequently in the summer than in the winter months (the remaining 5 had not received one). Key questions that can be further explored during the final evaluation include the factors that led to the ice boxes being more successful in some communities and the direct benefits of the ice boxes across communities.

In other communities such as Deyaba and Abu Hennes where consumers are used to fresh fish, the ice boxes have had less appeal to the women retailers. While they confirm that the ice boxes are indeed providing solutions to the problems of storage, spoilage and transportation, the consumers are left with the impression that the fish is not fresh if it is stored in such containers, thereby reducing the amount of fish being sold. Also in Deir Abu Hennes in particular where women sell fish from street to street, the ice boxes prove to be heavy and cumbersome. In Deyaba, the retailers have confirmed that when the ice boxes are used, it is mainly to store leftover fish to the following day. Out of the 6 members of the WRC in Deyaba present for the meeting, 5 confirmed that they use the ice box, particularly in the summer (1 had not received the ice box; 4 members were absent from the meeting). In Abu Hennes, all 11 WRC members claimed that they use the ice box however they do not think that it will not be necessary to distribute new ice boxes to other retailers. They claimed that they use them primarily for storage of fish at home. During the FGDs in Abu Hommos the women claimed that many did not use the ice boxes because when the ice melts it leads to the decomposition of the fish at the bottom of the box. One retailer in Abu Hommos explained how she uses the ice box to keep the fish alive by putting enough water for consumers to see that the fish is in good condition. Others use it for storage of remaining fish for sale the following day. In Abu Hammad also the participants agreed that they are mainly used for storage and not during sale at the markets. Women retailers from all communities and regardless of their other justification and reasons for using the ice boxes have confirmed that their usage increases with the warm weather and in the summer months in particular. However there is a need to study this further during the final evaluation to assess whether the ice boxes were a suitable intervention for all communities. Further, it is important to take into consideration addressing consumer attitudes and preferences as a major factor that conditions retailer practices.

3.3.2 Tricycles

The introduction of motorized modes of transportation was identified early on as an important factor for women who find challenges in transporting their fish from suppliers to markets. The tricycles were distributed to groups of 5 women with joint ownership. A total of 11 tricycles have been distributed in this manner for a total of 55 beneficiaries.

Despite the clear difficulties that groups of women have faced in jointly managing the tricycle, it has had an important outcome which is that women retailers can now access safe modes of transportation that avoids the sexual harassment and attacks from thieves that they used to face, especially since many of them travel for long distances during the early hours of the morning. It is also doubtless that the tricycles helps them save time as they used to wait for transportation willing to take them, which usually meant that they missed early morning opportunities. In Fayoum and Kafr el Sheikh where there are long distances, the tricycles are especially useful. In Sharkeya they allow retailers to reach more markets and places and also to purchase fish from far away places by reaching there in the early morning.

In future phases, it will be important to support retailers by building their capacity to work together and jointly manage assets for their own benefit as a group. It will also be necessary to study the contractual and administrative options available to guarantee the rights of all members of the group. It will also be important to support women in conducting a feasibility study on the tricycle so that they may understand how much income

they can expect from the renting of the tricycle and how much the expenses can amount to thereby avoiding being taken advantage of by the driver. As recommended already above, it would be worth exploring in future phases alternative models of transportation such as contracting existing tricycle owners, to test which model works best.

3.3.3 Distribution centres

The project's mid term evaluation has questioned the distribution centre as an intervention given that it has been perceived as distorting the market. There are equal arguments to support the distribution centres in principle. These include that they provide a healthy competition to wholesalers who over price their fish and they release women retailers from their dependency on the wholesaler for credit. Having said that, the project could have benefited from exploring other ways to address the challenges with wholesalers and this is something that the project team can take into consideration in future phases. It is also clear that the distribution centres were set up without a proper feasibility study for each individual community that takes into consideration the number of potential retailers, existing suppliers and traders, the market, etc. This has meant that distribution centres have not operated successfully (some suspending operations such as in Shakshouk and Deyaba) while others have struggled to find alternative solutions to remain in operation with varying degrees of success (Abu Hommos). This has had varying effects on women retailers with retailers in some communities complaining that the distribution centre sold fish at the same price to them as to other members of the community and in other cases

3.3.4 Fish Grills and Cleaning Tools

In Kafr El Sheikh grills were distributed to two groups of women retailers. One member of the first group already had a fish grilling business and was able to expand her activities and even to purchase fish for sale along with grilling. She has partnered with one of her relatives who is also a retailer and together they are able to manage orders, grill, etc. While this group have stated that their income has increased since the expansion of the grill, they are not able to calculate the exact increase. The second grill was given to a group of two women but it is managed by their husbands while the women continue to sell fish. It will be worth exploring in the future how interventions with women retailers affect family livelihoods and gender relations in the household. This will require not only specific research questions around the issue of gender but also a conscious effort to design interventions in specific ways, setting indicators and measuring regularly through M&E work. In Abu Hammad, one grill was purchased and given to one woman. She reportedly gains 2 EGP per kilo of grilled fish. In Abu Hennes the CDA purchased one grill and distributed it to 3 women retailers inside the village who jointly manage it. They have rented a small shop and take the fish from the distribution centre to sell and also provide cleaning and grilling services for those customers who request it. They thereby add value in more than one way and report that they make up to 7 EGP per kilo through the distribution centre, cleaning and grilling services.

In Shakshouk where grills were not considered a viable option, the CDA opted for distributing cleaning tools instead. Women who sell farmed fish have larger fish and therefore are given cleaning tools since the fish are larger. Women retailers in Shakshouk have reported that being able to clean fish for their customers give them a competitive edge and they are able to charge more per kilo of fish sold.

3.3.5 Deep freezers

Deep freezers have been purchased in the three Delta governorates where consumers are used to purchasing frozen fish. Apart from the challenges related to the joint management system as already discussed above, the deep freezers also provide another challenge which is deciding on the most appropriate location. It is not clear to what extent the groups of women retailers who received the deep freezer have been able to use them as planned. This will require further investigation in the final evaluation.

3.3.6 Establishing a marketplace in Ibshaway village, Shakshouk

As a result of the WRC and CDA working together, a fixed marketplace for women fish retailers was established in Shakshouk. Women retailers had identified this as a priority and the CDA included the creation of the market in its subgrant. Once it was set up, the WRC also took over this issue as a priority and met with the CDA on several occasions to discuss in detail what the market should include. The CDA then supported the WRC by coordinating and meeting with the local government unit (with the presence of WRC representatives) and negotiated the selection of the area for the market, etc. The CDA and women retailers asked to choose

between two central sites. The CDA also supported the creation of the market by coordinating with a local business to cover the extra expenses that resulted from the sudden increase in building material costs.

The selected site is close to where the women used to sit on the roadsides to sell their fish. The new market provides a concrete base and good drainage, meaning it is easy to keep the market clean. It also keeps the women and the fish from the dirt on the street, removes the risk of harassment by police and shopkeepers, and the potential confiscation of their fish. The market structure also has a roof so the women and fish are protected from the hot sun and a water tap was recently installed. The market provides consumers with a clean and central place to buy fish and the women retailers report selling their fish more quickly each day, giving them more time to take care of their other responsibilities. The WRC is keen on creating similar markets for retailers in other communities in Fayoum. Other communities in the project have also strived to various degrees to establish their own markets but have had more modest success. This is clearly an intervention that all retailers find a priority.

3.3.7 Small Scale Fish Farming

While four small scale fish farms were planned to be implemented (Abu Hammad, Abu Hommos, El Riyad and Deyaba), only 2 in the end were actually completed as a result of financial difficulties in one case (Abu Hommos) and other reasons (Deyaba). It is therefore difficult to draw conclusions on the outcomes that small scale fish farming can have on women retailers. In order to understand however whether small scale fish farming has the potential to lift women retailers out of the constraints of the retailing section of the value chain, a proper system needs to be identified and tested at scale. However there are also important technical challenges that need to be addressed and they will require much training and technical support.

3.3.8 Duck Rearing

The Shakshouk CDA found that not all women retailers were receiving benefits and that a small number had received two interventions (ice box and tricycle). This was due to a lack of proper documentation system and monitoring system at the start. Since this discovery was made, the CDA asked for the WRC's support in updating the database of retailers, reviewing the names and ensuring that they are indeed retailers from Shakshouk and setting criteria for beneficiaries of the ducks with the participation of CARE and the CDA. The idea for the duck raising was suggested by the CDA who saw an opportunity for women since they feed on the remains of fish and shrimps which are peeled by women.⁷ Retailers receive 30 ducklings and they raise them on the remains of fish and shrimps as well as on household leftovers. Once they grow to the appropriate size, they can sell them and purchase more ducklings (often a greater number). Often households also benefit from including duck in their diet. Since duck rearing is an ordinary part of rural life in Egypt and in Fayoum in particular, it is easily practiced alongside other household chores.

3.3.9 VSLAs

VSLAs were introduced with the purpose for women to meet on a regular basis to discuss their problems and find solutions and promote working together as a team. It was also introduced in order to free women from their dependence on the wholesaler for credit by allowing them to have an alternative source of credit. VSLAs have been introduced in Kafr El Sheikh and in the two communities in Minya starting in March 2014. At the time of the study there were 16 VSLA groups in Kafr El Sheikh, 4 in Deyaba and 2 in Deir Abu Hennes. The discrepancy in the number is primarily due to the number of retailers in the communities. Another important difference between Kafr El Sheikh and Minya is that in the former governorate, the groups are mixed with women and their husbands or male relatives being part of the same group. This is not the case in Minya. The following tables summarize the number of groups per community, the number of members per group, the total loan portfolio and the number of loans.

Table 11 Summary of VSLA groups in Deyaba, Deir Abu Hennes and Kafr El Sheikh

Deyaba								
No	Group Name	Total number	Gender		Female		Number of loans	Total loan portfolio
			Male	Female	Retailers	Non retailers		
1	El Taawon	15	0	15	15	0	6	2600

⁷ Fayoum is a centre for shrimp peeling with shrimp brought in from all governorates.

2	Al Amal	15	0	15	14	1	10	4050
3	Al Mostaqbal	15	5	10	9	1	4	1300
4	Al Nour	15	1	14	7	7	4	1200
Total		60	6	54	45	9	24	9150

Deir Abu Hennes

	Group Name	Total Number	Gender		Female		Number of loans	Total loan portfolio
			Male	Female	Retailers	Non retailers		
1	Ensna	18	0	18	16	2	4	1600
2	Al Mahaba	20	0	20	20	0	5	2000
Total		38	0	38	36	2	9	3600

Al Riyad Community - Kafr El Sheikh

No	Group Name	Total number	Gender		Female		Number of loans	Total loan portfolio
			Male	Female	Retailers	Non retailers		
1	Al Amal 1	18	5	13	13	0	11	2100
2	Al Amal 2	19	3	16	13	3	13	2535
3	Al Ekhlas	15	3	12	9	3	7	1090
4	Al Borsa	17	5	12	12	0	6	1300
5	Al Horrya	15	4	11	8	3	3	1800
6	Al Ahlam 1	19	3	16	10	6	6	1310
7	Al Ahlam 2	15	2	13	13	0	2	1500
8	Al Salam	15	2	13	13	0	4	660
9	Al Ward	15	1	14	14	0	9	2190
10	Al Khair	15	4	11	11	0	10	800
11	Al Nada	15	2	13	7	6	0	0
12	Al Zohoor	17	4	13	13	0	0	0
13	Al Tolombat	15	5	10	10	0	0	0
14	Raslan	15	3	12	9	3	0	0
15	El Wezaria	15	4	11	9	2	0	0
16	Al Zawy	15	3	12	8	4	0	0
Total		255	53	202	172	30	71	15285

Also interesting to note is the types of activities that the members of VSLA groups have done with their loans. In Deir Abu Hennes for example, out of 9 loans, 3 were used to purchase more fish, one was used to purchase fishing nets for the husband while the remaining five loans were used for various income generating activities such as: purchasing fruits and vegetables to sell next to fish, rental of farming land, purchasing of equipment for sewing activity, purchasing of stock for grocery store. In Deyaba, out of 24 loans, 5 were used to purchase fish in cash (rather than on credit from the wholesaler), one was used to complete the sum of money required for a fish grill, 2 were for purchasing a fishing net and one contributing to renewing a fishing boat.

Women retailers (as well as male members and non retailers in some communities) are almost unanimous as to their support for the idea of the VSLAs. Communities where VSLAs have not been implemented have requested that they be introduced there too in the future. As for the outcomes of the VSLA on women's lives, it will become clearer once the project team implements the management information system which the field officers have recently become trained in.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

The project team invested considerable time and energy in defining the actual interventions of the project under outcome 2 and the methodology to ensure that women retailers received the inputs they need. The methodology and approach were informed by basic principles including:

- Forming groups of women fish retailers (the WRCs) to represent their interests;
- Building local capacities within CDAs and WRCs;
- Participation of project beneficiaries in as many stages of project implementation as possible; and
- Sustainability of interventions beyond the project time frame.

The project team designed interventions following several studies and a rigorous process in which needs assessments were conducted with women retailers in each community (with 50 women as a sample in each community), data was analyzed and then validated through meetings and workshops with women retailers and the CDAs. The interventions therefore are founded on very real needs and priorities of women retailers and attempt to respond to these directly.

The creation and strengthening of WRCs was the backbone of the TOC and the basis from which all other results ensue. However other more tangible interventions had to be implemented in parallel to WRC formation in order to begin gaining the trust of the women retailers and demonstrate a commitment to their needs. Therefore while WRC responsibilities were taken over by the CDA in many instances during IEIDEAS, it is important that the WRCs become enabled in the near future to gradually take over this role effectively and efficiently and it is recommended that this be a focus of phase 2.

One of these tangible interventions has been the transfer of technologies at a subsidized price, an issue that has been raised by other studies conducted throughout the IEIDEAS implementation period. Given the extreme level of poverty of the women retailers, where they depend on their day to day income for survival, it is very difficult to expect them to make such an upfront investment and take such risks. However it is worth exploring in phase 2 a market system approach to reach more women retailers in a more sustainable way by finding ways of making the market work in their favour.

Some technologies such as the tricycles and deep freezers have been accompanied not only by subsidies but also by joint management systems. These have proved challenging for women retailers to manage given that they are used to compete against each other. More support is required for retailers as well as more time to enable them to start seeing the benefits of teamwork.

Another tangible intervention has been the creation of distribution centres. While the distribution centres have been questioned, they respond to a very real and critical need of retailers to find a steady supply of quality fish at a good price. It is critical however that the distribution centres be created following a sound feasibility and market study and that the necessary business and managerial capacities and skills be present in the CDAs. While steps have already been taken in this regard, it is critical to follow up on this closely in the future for the distribution centres to be able to operate at full capacity and fulfil their purpose. Finally, it is important to ensure that the WRC would eventually manage the distribution centres themselves in order to ensure that the exploitative relationship with the wholesaler is not simply replaced by a similarly exploitative relationship with the CDA.

There have been several positive outcomes in the project including but not limited to:

- Creation of the market in Shakshouk which has contributed to improving the working conditions and incomes of women retailers in that community.
- The inclusion of women retailers as members in the Fishermen Union in Fayoum which has contributed to their ability to receive official recognition and access insurance.

- The creation of IDs for women retailers in Deyaba as a step towards their formalization. More importantly, this step has proved to women retailers in that community that they are able, if they organize themselves, to secure their rights as happened with the literacy classes and with the complaint filed against the local health clinic on behalf of all community members.
- The VSLA groups have been appreciated by almost all members across the three communities where they have been applied. The other communities are also demanding that VSLA be introduced to them in the coming phase.
- Anecdotal evidence of improvement of women retailer working conditions across all communities (however more thorough evidence is required to confirm to what extent this has been achieved).
- Anecdotal evidence of increase in the income of women retailers across all communities (again, more thorough evidence is required to confirm to what extent this has been achieved).

However, the project team faced several considerable challenges during the initial phase of implementation. Most of these contributed to delays, minimizing the time needed to build capacities at the level of CDAs and WRCs in particular. This in turn had a direct effect on the level of progress that the project could achieve in the time remaining for implementation. These challenges include:

- CARE entered new governorates (in the Delta region) and partnered with new CDAs. This required building trust and also a common understanding of operations, objectives and approaches.
- The project team began to work with a new target group and sector. There were therefore many lessons to be learned and challenges to be faced and the learning curve rose sharply. This was expected and recognized during the design phase, and outcome 2 was indeed a pilot for later scale up.
- The unstable political context and security problems caused serious obstruction to the smooth implementation of work in the field. This includes both the lack of trust communities had towards international organisations during the early stages of project implementation and the unsuitable security context.
- Delays in MOSS approvals had consequences on the CDA budgets and on the relations of trust with the women retailers.
- The lack of a strong M&E system in part due to the changing logframe and TOCs did not enable the project team to track their progress in a timely and quality manner and affected documentation.

The main lessons learned from this phase can be summarized as:

- The formalisation of retailers and their ability to bring their rights has proved to be more important and effective than the provision of material interventions and requires more attention.
- Getting women retailers to work together and cooperate requires changing behaviours which they have been practicing for years. The fierce competitiveness that is found between the retailers is considered good business sense and necessary for the retailers' survival. In order to persuade them to think completely differently and trust each other, the women are not yet ready to take this step because they see it as a major potential risk to their livelihoods. It will require time and creative ways of working with them.
- While all women retailers cited very similar if not identical problems and constraints across the six target communities, this similarity does not necessarily mean that the same solutions being applicable for all. Solutions in future interventions will need to be led by women retailers and WRCs to ensure relevance and ownership.
- CDAs need greater technical support in project design to ensure that subgrants have realistic budgets and targets. Specifically, sufficient budget should be allocated for staffing of CDAs to guarantee accountability for performance. Also important is to ensure that the targets CDAs set for themselves are achievable within the financial and other resources at their disposal.
- CDAs need greater technical assistance and support to understand the sector and how to manage a business. Good quality feasibility studies should have been prepared prior to the creation of distribution centres to avoid possible losses.
- Joint ownership models, while good in theory, needed more guarantees and technical support to work in practice. The project team should attempt to either create systems to better monitor jointly owned assets or find alternative solutions such as WRC management.
- The good relations between CDAs and local government representatives has been key in supporting the achievement of the market in Fayoum and the ID cards for women retailers in Deyaba. In both cases, the CDAs had good relations with local government representatives at a high level. It is worth

nothing that the same applied in Kafr El Sheikh where the CDA also managed through personal contacts to persuade the local government of establishing a market although it was not achieved in the end due to other challenges. This is an important point to keep in mind during the selection of CDAs in the future (and naturally also the WRCs since they should eventually lead such processes) and where it is not present, would require capacity building.

- There needs to be more attention and focus on raising the awareness of consumers about the types of fish, dispelling misconceptions about farmed fish and addressing the preference for live fish. Only when consumers are well informed will they accept the role of the fish retailers.

4.2 Recommendations

In the future, the project team might consider a **combination of maintaining the present project** with minor modifications in the communities where there has been little progress with the WRCs and/or where the CDAs have demonstrated weaknesses **while expanding into new communities** in Fayoum for example by supporting the CDA in Shakshouk document models and lead capacity building of other CDAs in neighboring villages. This will allow for learning on how a 'peer learning' approach to scaling works and to what extent it is effective.

4.2.1 General recommendations

1. The gender study and other studies have already recommended the **inclusion of men retailers** as part of the target group provided that women retailers be given an equal voice and gender considerations be taken into account. There is sufficient development research that supports the gender approach as opposed to working exclusively with women.
2. In the next phase, the project team could benefit from **re prioritizing interventions to be more in line with the TOC**. Creating and strengthening WRC, while a lengthy and challenging process in itself, has the potential to achieve all the project targets and even go beyond them. The material incentives that were given to women retailers to introduce them to the project are no longer necessary in a second phase. Rather it is the WRCs that need to have the knowledge and skills to be able to prioritize women retailer needs and to identify the solutions that are most appropriate for the retailers in their respective communities (be they ice boxes, tricycles or other solutions). A list of criteria for the CDAs can be developed based on learning from phase 1. The criteria could include: level of commitment to the objectives of the project; quality of technical reports; quality of financial reports; improved performance based on capacity building; number of women retailers served, etc.
3. The project team may wish to consider a gradual **transferring of the responsibility for implementation from CDAs to WRCs**. This hand over will begin slowly, ensuring that WRCs have the necessary capacity to carry out the tasks required of them until they eventually move from working under the guidance and supervision of the CDA to becoming independent. The project team might consider the possibly of eventually providing WRCs financial support in the form of an independent fund which they can manage on behalf of retailers to conduct activities, promote rights, etc.
4. The project team should consider the **involvement of women retailers in all phases of the project, including the evaluation of past interventions and the design of the new interventions** in the future. This was not possible in the IEIDEAS project although women were involved in the needs assessment, validation and some aspects of the implementation which were led by the WRCs.
5. The project team should **plan for appropriate human and financial resources to set up an M&E system** that traces project outputs, processes and outcomes, across the different actor groups, and for different implementation models/packages (action research). It will be especially important to **carefully define be able to trace indicators such as increase in women retailer working conditions, income, their changing gender roles and responsibilities, decision making**, etc. It will be critical to **build capacities of CDAs in M&E** and provide them with the technical assistance required for them to be able to fulfil the M&E tasks effectively and in a timely manner.

4.2.2 Recommendations on project design

1. The project team should **continue to support the WRCs and to build their capacities** and ensuring their 'representativeness'. It is only expected that the WRCs require a long time to reach the levels of efficiency and effectiveness that will allow women retailers to be lifted out of poverty. The plans that the WRCs have developed during November 2014 focusing around the activation of their role and services to women retailers will require follow up and technical support.

2. It is strongly recommended that the second phase of the project start with **conducting a participatory assessment of the outcomes and results of the project through the WRCs**. The participatory approach will allow WRC members to understand the project cycle in a practical manner and see the link between design, implementation, evaluation and re design. It will also allow them to decide which interventions were successful and which were less so, and to reflect on the reasons certain interventions were more successful than others providing therefore a window for participatory action research. The learning that will come out of such an exercise will become a point of reference for both the design of future interventions and for the capacity of the WRCs.
3. The project team must ensure that distribution centres **operate with the same business and economic principles as regular private sector enterprises** and that they be self sustaining and make a profit meaning that the CDAs should not provide an unfair competition. It is also vital that the CDAs be able to properly manage them and have the capacity to do so and to compete with wholesalers who are more experienced and who are ready to take greater risks in order to preserve their share of the market. Ideally, the WRCs would be empowered enough and have sufficient managerial and leadership capacity to manage the distribution centres (or to set up another system to provide women retailers with a steady supply of quality fish at affordable prices). To that end, the project team should support the CDAs in implementing the plans developed during IEIDEAS to put the distribution centres on the right track.
4. **VSLA groups could be continued and replicated in other communities** as a way of strengthening solidarity among women retailers and should not necessarily be a replacement option for those communities where the WRCs are weak. In all communities retailers can benefit from the solidarity that comes from the groups as well as from the source of credit that they provide. Additional training and support could be provided such as financial literacy to help women make correct financial decisions. Having emphasized the potential of the VSLA groups, the project team would benefit from creating a **clear system and indicators to monitor the result of the VSLA groups on WRC performance and retailer unity; reliance on wholesaler credit; use of loans, etc.**
5. The project team may wish to consider **providing women retailers with financial literacy training** to support their ability to manage their business. This is a skill that they can use for their own personal development as well as directly contributing to their ability to improve their income.
6. The project team should look seriously into supporting the **formalization of WRCs and of women retailers**. This was a clear need that arose in various studies and it was not clearly addressed in the IEIDEAS project due to time constraints although certain CDAs and WRCs made attempts in this regard (Shakshouk with the inclusion of retailers in the Fayoum Fishermen Union, in Deyaba with the IDs for retailers). These options can be studied and replicated or other options be pursued in the form of creating independent CDAs for retailers, supporting retailers joining unions, etc.
7. IEIDEAS had identified that consumer preferences were a major reason behind women retailers insisting on selling live fish. This affects their ability to use the ice boxes. The second phase may look into **addressing consumer awareness** to support women retailers.
8. Should the project team choose to continue and expand on the small scale fish farming, they would need to include more financial resources in the budget for research and for technical assistance. This intervention would continue to be on a small scale due to the considerable technical and financial needs related to it.
9. It would be important to study the possibility of linking between the fish farming in Minya and retailers both in Minya and in other governorates.

Annex A – Project Impact Pathway and Logical Framework

Annex B - Research Tools

Annex C – CDA Assessment Results

	Abu Hammad		Abu Hommos		Kafr El Sheikh		Shakshouk		Deyaba		Deir Abu Hennes	
	before	after	before	after	before	after	before	after	before	after	before	after
Governance	1.6	2.1	2.1	3.2	2.2	2.9	2.6	2.8	1.9	2.1	1.9	2.1
Management	2.1	2.1	2.9	1.9	2.1	2.9	2.4	2.6	1.5	1.1	1.5	2.1
Project design and management	1.7	1.7	1.4	2.1	1.9	1.7	2.7	2.7	1.4	2.3	1.4	2.0
External relations	1.5	1.4	1.8	2.8	2	2.3	2.8	2.9	1.4	2.0	1.4	1.8
Documentation	1.4	1	3	2.8	2.6	2.4	3.0	3.8	1.6	1.2	1.6	1.6
MIS	1	1	1	1.3	1	1	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0
Service delivery	1	1.8	1	2.3	1	1.5	1.0	2.5	1.0	1.5	1.0	2.0

Annex D – Summary of Interventions by Community

	CDA capacity building	WRC capacity building	Community theatre	VSLAs	Ice boxes	Tricycle	Distribution center	Grill	Deep freezer	Cleaning tools	Small scale fish farming	Duck rearing	Market	IDs for women	Membership of Union
Abu Hammad	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	50	2	1	1	2	-	1	-	No	No	No
Abu Hommos	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	50	3	1	3	-	-	1	-	No	No	No
Kafr el sheikh	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	50	4	-	2	4	-	1	-	Attempt	No	No
Shakshouk	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	120	2	1		-	100	-	150	Yes	No	Yes
Deyaba	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	50	1	1		-	-	1	-	No	Yes	Planned
Deir Abu Hennes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	30		1	1	-	-	-	-	No	No	Planned