Comparative Gender Analysis: Women’s Economic and Political Empowerment

Final Report

Submitted To: Hand in Hand Afghanistan (HiH-Afghanistan) and CARE Afghanistan

Submitted By: Global Impact Management Consulting (GIMC)

Submission Date: December 8, 2019
Acknowledgement

I want to express deepest appreciation to all those who provided us the possibility to complete this assignment. I thank the staff of Hand in Hand Afghanistan, CARE Afghanistan, and its implementing partners, namely Human Rights Research and Advocacy Consortium (HRRAC), Afghan Women Resource Center (AWRC), and Women and Children Legal Research Foundation (WCLRF) who shared their views, opinions and ideas about the program. Special thanks to the Village Enterprise Facilitators (VEFs), community leaders, and the project beneficiaries who actively participated in the Key Informant Interviews (KII), Focus Group Discussions (FGD) and answered all the survey questions. Last but not least, special thanks to the HIH-Afghanistan leadership, Mr. Abdul Rahim Nasry, Dr. Ahmad Kamran Hekmati, and Ms. Michelle Gillan who invested their full effort in guiding the team in achieving the goal. I appreciate the guidance given by HIH-Afghanistan, Care Afghanistan as well as all other stakeholders.

Salem Helali
CEO and President

Global Impact Management Consulting (GIMC)
+1 571.550.1198 (USA) | +93 (0) 785.320.320 (AFG)
info@gimcinternational.com | www.gimcinternational.com
4226 Braeburn Dr., Fairfax, 22032, VA, USA
Street #15, Wazir Akbar Khan, Kabul, Afghanistan

Research Core Team:
- Zala Ahmad Lead Consultant
- Farzana Balooch Associate Consultant
- Salem Helali Activity Manager
### Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFN</td>
<td>Afghani/currency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWRC</td>
<td>Afghan Women’s Resource Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDC</td>
<td>Community Development Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoWA</td>
<td>Directorate of Women’s Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoA</td>
<td>Directorate of Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoJ</td>
<td>Directorate of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoRRD</td>
<td>Directorate of Rural Rehabilitation Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoE</td>
<td>Directorate of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoH</td>
<td>Directorate of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDA</td>
<td>District Development Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ET</td>
<td>Enterprise Today</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVC</td>
<td>Every Voice Counts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIMC</td>
<td>Global Impact Management Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HiH</td>
<td>Hand in Hand Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRRAC</td>
<td>Human Rights Research and Consortium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RT</td>
<td>Research Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRS</td>
<td>Simple Random Sampling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHG</td>
<td>Self Help Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMART</td>
<td>Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Realistic,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Timely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ToT</td>
<td>Training of Trainers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VEF</td>
<td>Village Enterprise Facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCLRF</td>
<td>Women and Children Legal Research Foundation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

**EXECTIVE SUMMARY** ........................................................................................................... 4  
**INTRODUCTION** .................................................................................................................. 8  
  - Programme Background ...................................................................................................... 8  
  - Consultancy Deliverables .................................................................................................. 9  
**APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY** ...................................................................................... 10  
  - Primary Data Collection Methods ..................................................................................... 11  
  - Secondary Data Collection ................................................................................................ 15  
  - Data Analysis Approach .................................................................................................... 15  
**ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS** .................................................................................................. 16  
  - Part 1. Gender Dynamics Sensitive Context ....................................................................... 16  
  - Political Context ................................................................................................................ 16  
  - Socio-Economic Context ..................................................................................................... 18  
  - Gender Roles and Responsibilities ...................................................................................... 20  
  - Gender Roles and Responsibilities: Male and Female Daily Activities ................................ 21  
  - Knowledge, Beliefs, and Perception .................................................................................... 22  
  - Confidence/Participation .................................................................................................... 23  
  - Identity Factors ................................................................................................................... 24  
  - Socio-Economic Status ......................................................................................................... 25  
  - Legal Rights and Access ..................................................................................................... 27  
  - Power Dynamics and Decision Making ............................................................................... 28  
  - Decision-Making Power ..................................................................................................... 30  
**BARRIERS** .............................................................................................................................. 31  
  - Part 2. Gender Continuum - Assessment of Programs ........................................................ 36  
**CHLLENGES** ......................................................................................................................... 44  
**RECOMMENDATIONS** .......................................................................................................... 52  
  - Staff Training: Gender Sensitive Case Study ...................................................................... 60  
**Constraints** ............................................................................................................................ 61  
**ANNEXES** ............................................................................................................................ 63  
  - Annex A. Survey Questionnaire: Enterprise Today (ET) Programme .................................. 63  
  - Annex B. Survey Questionnaire: Every Voice Counts (EVC) Programme ........................... 68  
  - Annex C. KII Questionnaire – ET Programme ................................................................... 73  
  - Annex D. KII Questionnaire – EVC Programme .................................................................. 76  
  - Annex E. List of KII Participants ....................................................................................... 79  
  - Annex F. FGD Questionnaire ............................................................................................. 80
EXECTIVE SUMMARY

CARE Afghanistan and Hand in Hand Afghanistan (HiH Afghanistan) contracted Global Impact Management Consulting (GIMC) to conduct a gender analysis of Every Voice Counts (EVC), (2016-2020) and Enterprise Today (ET) (December 2018-December 2020) programmes, focusing on women’s economic and political empowerment. The duration of this consultancy was 42 days, which was carried-out from July 2nd, 2019 – November 12th, 2019. The EVC programme, implemented by CARE Afghanistan in the provinces Kabul, Parwan, Balkh and Khost, focuses on empowering women and girls through capacity building and advocacy to promote meaningful participation in decision-making and problem-solving processes at household, village, district, provincial and national levels. HiH Afghanistan is implementing the ET programme in Balkh, Kabul, and Parwan provinces which aims to reduce poverty through the creation of sustainable enterprises and jobs and to increase women’s economic empowerment. The total number of beneficiaries covered under the EVC program are 1,753, of which 1,312 are women and 441 are men. The ET programme targeted 1,100 rural women of which 140 of those women are participating in both ET and EVC programmes.

The goal of the gender analysis consultancy was to provide baseline data on gender dynamics, and technical advice and recommendations on women’s economic and political empowerment for the CARE & HiH Afghanistan partnership programmes in the target regions.

In order to carry out the gender analysis study, GIMC used a mixed method approach of both quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis, utilizing both primary and secondary data sources. Primary data, both quantitative and qualitative, was collected through a Survey, Key Informant Interviews (KIIs), and Focused Group Discussions (FGDs). Secondary data was collected through a Desk Review. A survey was given to 224 participants, a total of 11 KIIs were conducted with HiH Afghanistan and CARE Afghanistan staff, and 8 FGDs involving 49 direct beneficiaries and 18 influential community leaders were carried out.

Key Findings

The Government of Afghanistan and the international community have made significant advancements toward women’s political and economic empowerment. Even with these efforts, women still strive for gender equality at the family, community and national levels. Afghanistan has a culture that privileges male preference, whereby men command more respect and authority in decision-making processes than their female counterparts. Both EVC and ET have worked to address such challenges. The baseline data collected demonstrated several challenges and foundations (listed below) that the programmes should be addressing in their design and work planning.

With respect to challenges, women in target communities are still perceived to play only a reproductive (rather than a business) role and their labour is not being recognized or paid. Mobility based on security and social norms is a significant challenge concerning women accessing markets and leaving the village. Of the 224 survey participants, 133 indicated mobility and social norms as a top challenge to enterprise development. Women’s mobility is further restricted due to perception
that views women responsible for the family honour. Women face more challenges due to identify factors such as age, socio-economic status, and ethnicity are barriers towards women’s economic empowerment. Moreover, women have limited self-awareness; limited authority and influence in decision-making in family and community; and limited social network.

The analysis also identified foundations that the programme can further build upon such as elderly women having a higher status within the community and family; male family and community members whom currently demonstrate support for women’s empowerment; Community Development Councils (CDCs) being female led and co-led; and male religious and community leaders such as Maliks, Mullah Imams, members of Jirga.

The findings demonstrate that the programmes ability to address key challenges to female empowerment have had some success, thus are evaluated as being gender sensitive along the gender continuum. The analysis of the programmes found them to be mainly categorised as gender sensitive. ‘Gender sensitive’ is being defined as interventions that ensure the different needs, abilities, and opportunities of women and men are identified, considered, and accounted for. Though the programmes are mostly at this level, findings did show areas that were gender unaware. The recommendations provided in this analysis are meant to support the programmes into moving toward a gender transformative reality. ‘Gender transformative’ is being defined as interventions that promote gender equality and work with key stakeholders to identify and address and positively transform the root causes of gender inequality for women and men. Based on a review of the findings and current programme indicators, there is a need for indicators to be developed that will measure this better.

Findings show that women who have been part of both political and economic empowerment programmes demonstrate higher economic and political empowerment compared to women who have been part of either a political empowerment programme or an economic empowerment programme. This analysis found many complementary areas between the programmes that worked toward increasing the impact of both. Findings indicated that many women felt they could be more engaged in the political sector if they have the financial means to do so. The majority participants clearly spoke to gaining knowledge on their civic, legal and political rights through EVC, but always felt due to the lack of money, they were limited in how much they could access and engage in such areas. They felt that participating in such a programme as ET, they have become and will become more economically engaged, ultimately affecting their increased role in decision-making at the family and community levels, to include civic and political participation. Furthermore, ET has increased the participants networking capabilities. Such positive effects in one programme have complemented and supported effects of the other programme, meaning strengthened networks in ET supported the networking requirements needed for success in the EVC programme. Both programmes have individually been able to demonstrate the effects of an increase in self-esteem of female participants, increased awareness of their capabilities, values and rights, and an increase in

1 Self-awareness in terms of females recognizing their value, rights and capabilities

change of mindset as to the expected roles and the value of women in the political and economic sectors. These impacts have been two-fold through implementing the programmes side by side.

**Recommendations**

Below are the key recommendations based on the findings of the gender analysis. These are expanded upon within the body of the report.

A. **ET Programme:**
   - Expansion of mechanisms for economic empowerment such as family approach to business leading to increased acceptance and support by the family and community overall; employability, not only owning a business, and recognition of current labour inputs that not paid or counted.
   - The Associations under ET programme to be formally registered through proper government channels to access to information on the loans, exhibitions and trade shows. Additionally, more of a review needs to be done on how these associations will be sustainable once the programme ends in terms of women’s management ability and mobility.
   - Strengthened monitoring of female time and labour inputs where it could track if programme interventions have affected the women’s expected daily role and has their traditional role changed in any manner.
   - The social integrity of VEFs and field staff is as important as their educational and professional experience. This is crucial to ET’s ability to gain trust and acceptance from the community.
   - Improved work planning to consider gender/social inclusion (GSI) that better consider engagement and impact on beneficiaries based on identity factors as well as sustainability post programme.
   - Increased engagement of influential individual/community leaders in terms of both logistical support as well as consideration for awareness sessions on issues such as women’s empowerment. This will work towards more effective programming, as well as influencing changes in mindset, thus moving in a gender transformative manner.
   - A 5-year timeframe is recommended in order to ensure a livelihood intervention that yield desirable results and have sustained long-term impact.

B. **EVC Recommendations**
   - Guarantee safe and separate training and meeting facilities for female participants at the village level, where they confidently engage in conversations and influence decision-making processes.
   - Increased consideration of existing schedules and commitments of male participants when scheduling meetings/trainings.
   - Provide transportation allowances prior to meeting/training or provide a taxi/bus for female participants as majority of women do not have their own income or have permission from their husbands to use family money.
   - Men engagement – build awareness within Islamic, International and Afghan law and policy context on women’s rights and value.
   - Increase engagement and linkages of government officials and female participants for advocacy efforts. It is recommended to engage government in earlier conversations which will help
communities better understand the budget limitations, as well support government in allocating funds for priority needs identified by the communities.

- Encourage and provide tools for female participants to spread the gained knowledge on rights and advocacy among other communities. Findings demonstrate this is taking place, but there is opportunity to formalize the process. The programme could provide the female participants with tools and strategies for sharing their knowledge on rights and advocacy to a greater extent.
- Advocacy efforts need to be further framed within an Islamic context and to expand outreach of messaging beyond programme participants.
- Economic empowerment of female participants is key to ensure regular and active participation of women in advocacy efforts at district and provincial level and boost their confidence and influence in decisions at household level.

**Gender-sensitive Case Study Development Training**

GIMC designed and delivered a two-day training for nine staff members of HiH Afghanistan and CARE Afghanistan on gender mainstreaming and gender sensitive qualitative data collection, with a focus on how to develop a case study. It is suggested that follow-up to this initial training be planned in order to evaluate and guarantee that the information and approaches learned are being actively applied to programme implementation.
INTRODUCTION

Programme Background

Since 2016, with funding from the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, CARE International has been partnering with the Hague Academy for Local Governance to carry-out Every Voice Counts (EVC), a 5-year programme in Afghanistan, Burundi, Pakistan, Rwanda, Somalia and Sudan. The programme’s objectives are:

- Increased and meaningful participation of women and girls in decision making processes in Kabul, Khost, Parwan and Balkh provinces;
- Inclusive spaces for dialogue and negotiation and create/expand it to local and national level;
- Increased attention of women and girls’ rights and political participation in the national debate among Afghan public and authorities;
- Improved availability, accessibility and quality of girls’ education and health services.

The Afghanistan component of the EVC project focuses on empowering women and girls to input and participate in community, district and provincial level decision-making and problem-solving processes. CARE Afghanistan describes the aims as follows:

"Through the inclusion of women’s voices and advocating for women’s issues it is anticipated that women will improve their access to rights, such as healthcare and education. Overall, the aim is that empowered (through knowledge and skills) women and girls, supported by capable civil society organizations and responsive power holders, will lead to spaces for inclusive dialogue and negotiation as well as inclusive governance processes."

CARE Afghanistan is working with local partners to implement the programme: Women and Children Legal Research Foundation (Charkent and Khulm districts, Balkh province); Afghan Women Resource Center (Jabulsaraj and Bagram districts, Parwan province); and Human Rights Research and Advocacy Consortium (Bagrami and Mirbacha Kot districts, Kabul province; Matoon and Mandozai districts, Khost province). Each district covers 10 communities with a total of 80 communities reached across the four targeted provinces.

In 2018, with funding from Hilti Foundation, CARE Afghanistan partnered with HiH Afghanistan to implement the Enterprise Today (ET) programme, in order to complement the EVC programme. The EVC programme, which had an existing focus on the political and civil empowerment of women, was thus complemented and strengthened through providing women with knowledge and skills in the business sector, as well as life skills.

The ET programme began in December 2018 and will end by November 2020, targeting 1,100 female beneficiaries from poor rural areas in Kabul (Bagrami district), Parwan (Jabulsaraj and Bagram districts) and Balkh (Khulm district), with 500 from Kabul, 200 from Balkh, and 400 from Parwan. Of the 1,100 female beneficiaries, 140 are also enrolled in the EVC programme. The goal of the ET programme is to create 990 long-term jobs, ultimately raising 6,900 women, children and men out of poverty.
The key activities and achievements of the ET programme:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Progress/accomplishments – as of November 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mobilization of 1,100 women into Self-Help Groups</td>
<td>55 Self-Help Groups (SHGs) have been mobilized in Kabul, Balkh and Parwan. Each SHG is comprised of 20 members who have saved approximately 700,000 AFN within 8 months and disbursed 550,000 AFN as micro loans to the group members, fulfilling the criteria for loans.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of 1,100 women on Group Management and Business Development Services</td>
<td>1,100 women have received 660 training sessions (12 sessions per SHG) on Group Management and Business Development Services. The training on Microfinance, Market Linkages and Value Addition will be carried out in 2020.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enterprise Development</td>
<td>1,100 women identified their choice of enterprises based on skill and talent namely poultry, tailoring, beautician, livestock, embroidery, bee keeping, and bakery. Procurement and distribution of 1,100 start-up kits to women are in process; to-date 513 start-up kits have been granted to the 513 female participants (175 in Tailoring, 52 in Beautician, 39 in Embroidery, and 247 in Livestock).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish Associations at district level for Enterprises’ expansion and market linkages.</td>
<td>They will be formed at the beginning of 2020 as a support mechanism for women in the areas of market survey, linkages, and business management.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consultancy Deliverables

The deliverables for this consultancy were:

- Gender analysis inception report
- Gender analysis report (including assessment of the programme on the gender continuum) with SMART recommendations
- Two-day training for staff on gender mainstreaming and gender sensitive qualitative data collection, with focus on how to develop a case study
- Final Presentation of the key findings to HiH Afghanistan, CARE Afghanistan and partners
APPRAOCH AND METHODOLOGY

The purpose of the gender analysis was to understand the social-cultural, economic and political environments, and power dynamics within the regions where the programmes EVC and ET are being implemented. Moreover, the analysis intended to assess the impact of the programmes to date. The gender analysis sought to answer the main research question:

“Do women who have been part of both political and economic empowerment programmes demonstrate higher economic and political empowerment than women who have been part of either a political empowerment programme or an economic empowerment programme?”

This comparative gender analysis focused on four key domains:

1. Knowledge, Beliefs, and Perception
2. Confidence and Participation
3. Legal Rights and Access
4. Power and Decision Making

In order to consider these domains in relation to the main research question, the GIMC Research Team (RT) developed 10 sub-questions. These sub-questions were not asked directly of participants of the study, rather all tools were developed in a manner that addressed each. The sub-questions are:

1. What is the impact of the programme(s) on level of female decision-making participation in household affairs?
2. Has the programme (s) affected the level of female time and labour commitments?
3. Has the programme (s) affected the level of female ownership and control over productive assets?
4. Has the programme (s) affected gender and socio-cultural constraints?
5. Did the programme (s) have an effect on female social mobility?
6. Did the programme (s) impact female agency and efficacy?
7. Has the programme (s) had an impact on attitudes/perceptions toward female engagement in the political and economic sectors?
8. Has the programme (s) had an impact on the level of female awareness of their rights and ability to participate in economic and political spheres of life?
9. What has been the impact of the programme (s) on the level of access for females in the economic and political sectors?
10. Has the programme (s) impacted female leadership and problem-solving skills and participation at community level?

The RT used a mixed method approach of both qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis, utilizing both primary and secondary data sources. Primary data, both quantitative and qualitative, were collected through a Survey, KIIs, and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs). Secondary data was collected through a Desk Review.
The RT began preliminary work on the study just after the signing of the contract on July 2nd, 2019. Tools were developed and shared with HiH Afghanistan for review in August 2019. Data collection took place between 29 August 29th, and September 27th, 2019.

**Primary Data Collection Methods**

**A. Quantitative Data Collection**

**Survey:**
The quantitative data was collected through a written survey (*Annex A & Annex B*) which targeted direct beneficiaries of the EVC and ET programmes. For low-literacy participants, the enumerators read the survey questions to them and recorded their responses in writing.

**Sampling:**
A Simple Random Sampling formula without replacement was used to select participants to take the survey. The total number of beneficiaries covered under the EVC program are 1,753, of which 1,312 are women and 441 are men. The ET programme targeted 1,100 rural women of which 140 of those women are participating in both ET and EVC programmes. The survey was conducted with 224 direct beneficiaries in Kabul, Parwan and Balkh provinces. The sampling of 224 direct beneficiaries was pulled from 3 distinct groups: 75 from ET (33.3%), 75 from EVC (33.3%) and 74 participants of those registered in both the ET and EVC programmes (33.3%).

The average age of the 224 survey participants was 38, with a range of 18 to 63. The average family annual income was 9,403 AFN (approximately 120 USD), with 800 AFN. being the lowest (approximately 10 USD) and 29,000 AFN the highest (approximately 371 USD). The chart below shows the number of survey participants by ethnicity. Table 1 shows the number of survey participants per province, district and village.

![Chart1. Survey Participants by Ethnicity](image-url)
Table I. Number of Survey Participants by Province, District, and Village

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th># of Participants</th>
<th>ET</th>
<th>EVC</th>
<th>ET&amp;EVC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Balkh</td>
<td>Khulm</td>
<td>Hait Qul Bai</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mohammad Ali Bik</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mula Quli</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sayed Motahar Khan</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shorabi</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total of Balkh</strong></td>
<td><strong>75</strong></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kabul</td>
<td>Bagrami</td>
<td>Naw Abad, Qalai-Ahmad</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Khan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bagh e Koti</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bagrami Markaz</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Faqirabad</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kest Aziz Khan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tapa Panjshiryan</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qala Ahmad Khan</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qala Noman</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total of Kabul</strong></td>
<td><strong>75</strong></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parwan</td>
<td>Bagram</td>
<td>Dawlat Shahi</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Deh Mesken</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total of Bagram</strong></td>
<td><strong>39</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jabulsaraj</td>
<td>Borikhail</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hashamkhail</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Isakhail</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total of Jabulsaraj</strong></td>
<td><strong>35</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total of Parwan</strong></td>
<td><strong>74</strong></td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total Survey Participants</strong></td>
<td><strong>224</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Enumerators:

HiH-Afghanistan recruited a total of 12 VEFs to act as enumerators and carry out the survey. All enumerators were female. Deploying female enumerators was more culturally appropriate to engage with female beneficiaries. Moreover, the VEFs were recruited from each targeted village. This was done for two reasons: 1) it avoids security issues for women having to travel across villages, and 2) there is more trust among participants when the enumerators are from the village in which they are working. All enumerators received three hours of training. 10 enumerators from Parwan and Kabul participated in training at the HiH Afghanistan office in Kabul on 27 August 2019. The two enumerators based in Balkh joined the training online via Skype. The training covered:

- Purpose of Gender Analysis
- Research Documentation: Consent Letter, Basic Demographic Form
- Quantitative Data Collection Method
The training provided an opportunity for the enumerators to thoroughly review the survey and provide feedback. Their feedback focused on simplifying the language of the survey to better match the literacy and education levels of the survey participants. The survey was revised based on this feedback.

B. Qualitative Data Collection

Key Informant Interviews (KIIs)

The KIIs, carried out by the Lead Consultant, were utilized to collect qualitative data through one-on-one interviews that lasted from 45 minutes to one hour. A total of 11 KIIs were conducted, three from ET and eight from EVC. These KIIs took place in the offices of HiH Afghanistan, CARE Afghanistan and its implementing partners, namely Human Rights Research and Advocacy Consortium (HRRAC), Afghan Women Resource Center (AWRC), and Women and Children Legal Research Foundation (WCLRF) between 1 and 15 September 2019. The KII tools can be reviewed in (Annex C & Annex D) and list of KII participants in (Annex E).

Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)

The Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) were carried out with 2 main types of participants: 1) influential community leaders, and 2) direct beneficiaries of the ET and EVC programmes. Three (3) FGDs were conducted with the stakeholders, and five (5) FGDs were conducted with the project beneficiaries. In total 67 individuals participated in eight (8) FGDs. The lead consultant facilitated the FGDs on the basis of six (6) key questions (Annex F). The RT kept leading questions for discussion similar between the two target groups to allow for direct comparison of the understanding and views of beneficiaries and influential community leaders. The RT were mindful of the type (beneficiaries vs. influential community leaders) and literacy level of each group, and thus interviewers discussed themes in a manner easily understood by them.

The objectives below were aligned with the sub-questions:

- To understand localised gender roles and responsibilities
- To understand social norms
- To identify barriers created as a result of gender and social norms in relation to women’s economic and political empowerment
- To identify potential influencers/actors (positive or negative) that enforce or shift existing gender and social norms in relation to women’s economic and political empowerment

FGDs with Influential Community Leaders

The three FGDs with stakeholders took place in Kabul and Balkh, at the HiH Afghanistan and AWRC offices as well as at a participant’s home in Khulm district of Balkh. A total of 18 individuals participated in the FGDs and each session lasted 1.5 to 2 hours. The discussion focused on the
prevailing social norms and gender relations and the overall theme of women’s economic and political empowerment through a gender lens.

The participants mainly represented local formal and informal governance institutions such as CDCs, Village Shuras, Mullah Imams, Maliks, Haj & Awqaf Department, and influential community elders. Details of the FGDs are:

- **FGD 1:** Stakeholders of ET programme from Kabul and Parwan
- **FGD 2:** Stakeholders of EVC programme from Kabul and Parwan
- **FGD 3:** Stakeholders of ET and EVC programmes from Balkh

**FGDs with Direct Beneficiaries:**

A total of five FGDs were carried out with 49 direct beneficiaries of ET and EVC programmes in the provinces of Kabul and Balkh. The 49 participants were randomly selected from the initial group of 224 survey participants (ref. Table 2). The FGDs are classified below:

- **FGD 1:** Target Direct Beneficiaries enrolled in EVC - Kabul and Parwan
- **FGD 2:** Target Direct Beneficiaries enrolled in ET - Kabul and Parwan
- **FGD 3:** Target Direct Beneficiaries enrolled in both EVC and ET - Kabul and Parwan
- **FGD 4:** Target Direct Beneficiaries enrolled in EVC - Balkh
- **FGD 5:** Target Direct Beneficiaries enrolled in ET and both ET&EVC - Balkh

The FGDs were formatted as semi-structured discussions among each group. Due to limited time for data collection, the RT carried out the FGDs for beneficiaries of Parwan and Kabul jointly in Kabul. Logistic arrangements including travel costs were provided to the participants from Parwan.

**Table 2. List of Direct Beneficiaries for FGDs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>ET Sample Size</th>
<th>Both EVC &amp; ET Sample Size</th>
<th>EVC Sample Size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parwan</td>
<td>Jabulseraj</td>
<td>Isakhail, Borikhail, Hashamkhail</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bagram</td>
<td>Bagram Markaz, Deh Meskeen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dawlat Shahi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kabul</td>
<td>Bagrami</td>
<td>Bagh e Koti</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qalai Ahmad Khan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qala Noman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tapa Panjshiryan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balkh</td>
<td>Khulm</td>
<td>Mohammad Ali Bik</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Haitqul Bai, Mula Quli, Shorabi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sayed Motahar Khan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The FGDs were unique in that the format used was part FGD and part mini-workshop. This format was selected to allow the participants to have extended time to get to know and trust each other. This arrangement resulted in more information sharing, which related not only to data collection, but also allowed participants to learn from one another. Each FGD lasted from 4 to 5 hours using tools such as the ‘Gender Analysis Timeline’, ‘Gender Analysis Questions’, and ‘Social Norm Diagnostic.’ This approach provided a safe environment for participants to share personal experiences and an opportunity to understand the norms, attitudes and perceptions governing their day-to-day lives in their local context.

Secondary Data Collection

Desk Review

The desk review focused on a detailed analysis of the documents of ET and EVC programmes, such as annual progress reports, midterm-review reports, and outcome harvesting reports. In addition, selected policy papers and evaluation reports on women’s economic and political empowerment in Afghanistan were reviewed. An analysis of these documents contributed to the analysis of the main research and sub-questions. A full list of documents reviewed are included in Annex I.

Data Analysis Approach

Qualitative and quantitative data were collected simultaneously using the methodologies and tools described above. Data analysis employed the Parallel Analytical Method illustrated in figure 1 below. The use of this method was determined to be best by the fact that the RT sought to collect primary and secondary data for different questions and from different sources that required more than one data collection methodology. By comparing both qualitative and quantitative data sets and triangulating them, the analysis was able to identify unanticipated findings.

Figure 1. Parallel Analytical Method

Data was compiled and allowed for analysis in the most effective manner. Additionally, members of the RT were assigned data entry responsibilities guaranteeing that all collected data points were entered in a timely manner. The main analysis and writing of the report were cooperatively carried out by the GIMC RT.
ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

Based on the proposed methodology, the RT conducted desk review, eight focus group discussions (49 direct beneficiaries & 18 influential community leaders), 11 key informant interviews with ET and EVC staff members and surveyed 224 project beneficiaries.

Part 1. Gender Dynamics Sensitive Context

This section of the report provides baseline data on political, economic, and social context in target communities; gender dynamics including gender roles and responsibilities, knowledge, belief and perception, power and decision making, legal rights and access, participation, and key identity factors such as age, ethnicity, socio-economic status. Moreover, it further highlights barriers towards women’s economic and political empowerment as well as influencers at community level that are either promoters or inhibitors to women’s empowerment.

Political Context

Afghanistan is a country whose social, economic, and political advancement has been inhibited due to 40 years of continuous conflict. Although the international community has been collaborating with the Afghan government since the fall of the Taliban regime (2001) to stabilise the country through reconstruction and development, its post-2001 institutions remain weak, imbalanced, and for the most part ineffective. Apart from a few exceptions, the institutions do not meet the needs of the general population due to widespread corruption, which has resulted in patronage systems of professional advancement without regard to merit and competence. As a consequence, there are increased levels of distrust in government causing a decline in social and political engagement. This is evident in the halving of voter turnout rates which decreased from 83.66% in 2004 to 38.9% in 2014 (Election Guide 2019).

Women’s political participation is extremely limited, although they make up 48.84% of the settled population, they comprise only 22.6% of the total number of government employees vs. 77.4% males. 26.25% of government officials are female vs 73.75% male; and, only 8.9% of contractors are female vs 91% male (IRA-NSIA 2017-18). This disproportionate representation exposes the pressing need for women’s active political participation and a positive shift in gender-based power dynamics. Women’s political empowerment is crucial for increasing the influence of women in decision making on all matters, not just limited to women-related issues.

Afghanistan faced a new socio-political landscape with the partial withdrawal of international forces in 2014. Their withdrawal led to a reduction in development aid and a resultant increase in the influence of the Taliban to 70% of rural areas (SIGAR Report). The withdrawal increased unemployment rates which caused increased poverty levels, violence, kidnappings, etc. Although the recent peace talks between the Taliban, USA, and the Afghan government have boosted hopes for intra-Afghan peace negotiations and a peaceful settlement of the long war, they have also instilled uncertainty and fear in most Afghans. Furthermore, this whole process legitimizes the Taliban as a political party and may very well shrink the already limited space that women have for empowerment, creativity, and public participation. This shift in political structure may result in the
regression of 18 years of development gains for women including rights and access to civic and political engagement at the national level.

With the many advances the country has made to restore its place on the world stage since 2001, there are still numerous obstacles facing women’s advancement in the education, economic and public sectors. The conservative and patriarchal nature of Afghanistan’s culture restricts the involvement of females in the public domain. This has impacted their ability to participate in the paid economy and academic sphere.

Another significant factor affecting women engagement in the political sphere is security. With respect to target communities, since 2018, the Taliban presence has increased in districts of Koh-e-Safi, Sayedkhel, Shinwari, Siya Gird Ghorband and Surkh-e-Parsa of Parwan provinces. The Taliban uses these districts to attack on Charikar and Bagram Air Base. On the other hand, Balkh has always been considered a relatively secure and safe province until resignation of Atta Mohammad Noor as governor in 2017. With this change, several security threats and criminal activities such as armed robberies, murder, clashes, and kidnapping have been reported in 2018 and 2019. However, the target districts of Khulm and Charkent are still considered safe areas (European Asylum Support Office 2019).

Kabul’s insecurity is due to suicide bombers and Improvised Explosive Devices (IEDs) that thousands of citizens killed and injured alone in 2018 and 2019 (European Asylum Support Office 2019).

The following two quotations are from the Project Manager of AWRC, a CARE implementing partner in the EVC programme for Parwan, speak directly to the challenges of security and how this has impacted the country’s political sector, specifically, women’s access to engagement in this sector.

“Security concerns, arising from the uncertain political dynamics of the country, disrupt the project implementation, particularly in rural communities. During presidential elections of September 2019, the AWRC was not able to conduct its advocacy sessions and interphase meetings at district and provincial levels. Similarly, the AWRC stopped implementing the EVC programme in 3 villages (Kolola Sang, Kharzar, Chishmai Daraz of Jabulsaraj District) that border the Taliban-controlled Ghorband district to ensure the safety of NGO workers and their families are often targeted for participating in the programmes.”

Security not only limits female access to the political sphere, specifically how it limits mobility; it is also a limiting factor for Afghan government officials. Government officials also are not able to travel to villages owing to security concerns. If they could travel, at least women could have some access to government officials, which would allow them greater influence and participation in decision making processes at community level.

---

Socio-Economic Context

Employment/Labour:

According to the Asian Development Bank, 54.5% of the population lives below the national poverty line and 35% of Afghans are currently unemployed and actively looking for work. More than 70% of Afghans live in rural areas and their median household income is less than 100 USD a month which makes it difficult for families to think beyond their basic dietary needs. With this high national unemployment, families have been selling their young girls into marriage to older men for $12,000-$15,000. Approximately 54% of girls under 18 are married. As an alternative to early marriage, girls earn income for their families by weaving carpets or making handicrafts. The dire poverty in the country creates an economic argument for families to favor employment over schooling for girls.

The combined factors of lack of access to employment and educational opportunities severely restrict people’s ability, particularly women, to actively participate in the nation’s economy. The national labour force participation rate for Afghanistan is only 53.9% in total, of which 80.5% are men and only 26.7% are women. Although there has been an increase in the number of women-owned businesses and entrepreneurs in the fields of IT, accounting, electrical engineering, manufacturing, food processing, and a wide variety of other businesses, their main field of work still remains in handicrafts and they face challenges in finance and markets, with limited knowledge and technical capacity.

The data collected during the survey, KII s and FGDs validates the information presented earlier.

According to the survey data from 224 participants, their average monthly household income is 9,403 AFN (approximately 120 USD). As the chart below shows, of the 224 survey participants, males make up the highest percentage in terms of earning an income for the family: 87% of households have the husband as the primary earner. Only nine women stated they were the main income earner for their household. This was true for widows and educated women being teachers or midwives.

Chart2. Household Income Earner

---


This number can vary depending on the region and sector of employment. According to information collected during the FGDs with women from Parwan, about 90% of the households in Parwan depend on subsistence agriculture. Surplus crops are sold for average annual income of 15,000-20,000 AFN selling crops during harvesting season once a year. Women do contribute to the household income through work in tailoring, poultry, dairy, and handicrafts, but the average amount earned is minimal, averaging around 500 AFN. In agreement with the survey responses, they still stated that men are the main income earners in this region. They also pointed out that this imbalance is not due to women working less than men. Men and women both contribute significantly to on-farm labor, but women’s work is not recognized and is unpaid. For this reason, the men appear to be the main income earners.

According to data collected during the FGDs with formal and informal governance institutions, the most common occupations for men in the target provinces is farming, shop-keeping, carpentry, mechanics, butchery, and chauffeuring, while women are engaged in tailoring, embroidery, poultry, and livestock. Less than 5% of both men and women are teachers and government employees. It was also noted that in subsistence agriculture economies such as Afghanistan, women and men are often expected to perform similar responsibilities when it comes to field work, from seeding to harvesting. However, men are the sole decision makers and have full authority over the money and profits earned from field work.

**Education/Literacy**

Despite education being a constitutional right in Afghanistan, two-thirds of children are not enrolled in school, with 60% of that numbers being girls. The major problem that remains unsolved is ensuring that adolescent girls make the critical transition from primary to secondary and higher education. Adolescent girls are at risk for potential school leaving at any time due to ‘honour’ issues, safety concerns, and mobility. As a result, only 21.86% of government graduates from higher education institutions are female, compared to 78.14% male (IRA-NSIA 2017-2018). Furthermore, even if girls manage to graduate high school and university, social constraints often prevent them from working and applying the skills they developed in school.

The poverty discussed above is a significant reason why families do not to send their girls to school and why there is such a high rate of dropouts among girls at a young age. Families prefer their daughters to help with household chores or to engage in income-generating activities such as carpet weaving and gardening. Poverty also discourages young girls from continuing school. One of the ET participants from Parwan said: "my daughter stopped going to school because she was embarrassed by her old shoes and scarf."

Lack of employment opportunities for boys who are high school, or university graduates is another factor that negatively impacts girls' education. Families would argue that if their sons didn't get a job, then where is the need to send their daughters to school and invest in their education.

The academic institutions, including technical and vocational education, are very far from the residential areas in target communities. Due to insecurity, families fear the possibility of girls and women in the family being physically harmed or harassed on their way to school. Therefore, they
would prefer that the girls and women in the family stay home and not join any projects/activities that require leaving the village. Families cannot afford any risk when it comes to the issue of honour.'

In discussions during the FGDs in Bagrami, Kabul, which included Village Shura, Mullah Imam, Haj & Awqaf staff and religious scholars and teachers, participants said that, for the last decade, the majority of the families learned to understand and appreciate the importance of education for their children, both girls and boys. Even if the parents are not literate, the children tend to have some level of literacy because the parents understand the importance of education. In Bagrami district of Kabul, there are many Madrasas that provide both religious and science education. Darulolum Abu Hanifa is one example that offers classes up to 14th grade for both girls and boys. The Madrassa offers this education at different times for boys and girls so they can be segregated. Many families prefer to send their children to Madrasa and students even come from Kabul neighborhoods such as Karta-e-Naw and Arzan Qimat.

During this same FGD, community leaders emphasized the importance of Islam in day-to-day life affairs and in particular in education. According to them, for a boy and girl to sit together in a classroom is not appropriate from both Islamic and Afghan cultural perspectives. Even though this was considered in the scheduling of classes at the Madrasas, as referenced above, this issue is not considered in all educational settings. FGD participants stated that over 50% of the families in the district wish that their girls could attend higher education, but they refuse to send them to coeducational facilities. They went on to say, “they are afraid that they will fall prey to sexual harassment”. For this reason, families would rather send their girls to the Madrasa Abu Hanifa that is both nearby and offers separate classes for girls and boys.

Participants agreed that insecurity, long distance, poverty and co-education are key barriers to girls’ access to higher education. As stated by a Haj and Awqaf staff from Bagrami district, Kabul province.

“I did not send my daughter to public university in Kabul only because of its coeducation system. Despite my poor economic condition, I enrolled her in a private university named Sayed Jamaludin that offers classes only for girls. For 2 years, my son would drop her off and wait for her until she would finish and then bring her home. In our community, due to ignorance, people easily attack their honour and character if they leave home alone or if a stranger ‘driver’ drops them off. I couldn’t take this risk.”

On the other hand, girls in Balkh enjoy equal educational opportunities up to 12th grade. They all can attend school and there is no restriction.

**Gender Roles and Responsibilities**

In the Afghan context, the gender roles of women are linked to “reproductive” work, cooking, cleaning, and childrearing, while the gender roles for men are related to “productive” work, earning money for the household. Girls and boys are socialized into different gender roles that place them within unequal structures of power. Girls’ roles and responsibilities are usually associated with their future role as wives, mothers, and caregivers, while boys are brought up with the mindset that their future role will be as heads of households and the primary wage earners in their families. Both male and female Afghans are negatively viewed and impacted if they do not appear to fit into the tightly defined gender roles as defined by society and Islam, though often these are based on
misinterpretations. With that said, women and girls experience greater discrimination within this context.

In Afghanistan, including the target communities, gender-based discrimination is transferred from generation to generation. It starts in the home. Girls are raised from a young age with many limitations and expectations. They are required to stay at home, are not allowed to play outside with the boys, are expected to do their brothers’ chores, as well to serve them. They are silenced and not encouraged to express their views and take part in family discussions. Boys often receive opposite treatment. They tend to receive the best food and clothing because they are the representatives of the family’s wellbeing to the outside world. Furthermore, they are expected to study and work hard, in order to become the main income earners for the family in the future. It should be noted that this also is a gender norm for boys that can result in discrimination.

“I used to fly kites with my brother and I was good at it, but my mother would hit me that it is not for you and that the neighbors would make fun of us. She wouldn’t let me ride my brother's bicycle and rather would ask me to help her with cooking and cleaning. Looking back at that time, our talent and ambitions as girls were killed from childhood. Many girls in rural areas are too shy to criticize or have a voice when they face any type of injustice and violence including rape”.

Project Manager of ET programme - Kabul

These responses collected during the FGDs speak to the gender-based disparity in the daily roles and activities of males and females. Rigid gender roles restrict girls' and women's work to household-related work (reproductive work), while boys' and men's work is more focused on education and income-generating activities (productive work), as well as community work and leisure. Rarely is there cross-over in roles, yet it does happen. For example, of the 49 female participants of the FGDs, only 2 women said that their male relatives help with household chores, such as boiling water for breakfast or preparing the bed in the morning.

**Gender Roles and Responsibilities: Male and Female Daily Activities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Female Activities</th>
<th>Male Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4:00am-11:00am</td>
<td>▪ Prayer ▪ Tending to livestock/ Baking Bread ▪ Food preparation and breakfast ▪ Preparing hot water for husband’s shower and ironing clothes ▪ Preparing and taking children to school &amp; Madrasa ▪ Embroidery, tailoring, gardening ▪ Teaching literacy classes (applicable to less than 1%)</td>
<td>▪ Prayer ▪ Go for a walk ▪ Filling up water supply ▪ Having Breakfast ▪ Leaving for work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00am-4:00pm</td>
<td>▪ Household chores (dishes, laundry, general cleaning) ▪ Picking up children from school ▪ Food preparation and lunch</td>
<td>▪ Prayer ▪ At work ▪ Prayer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Knowledge, Beliefs, and Perception

Gender inequality occurs at every stage of life, beginning with childhood or even before birth. It is magnified by other factors including age, ethnicity, socio-economic status, and religious beliefs, just to name a few. Girls are systematically faced with restrictions and excluded from empowering opportunities due to the widespread belief that:

- Girls are someone else’s property as soon as they are placed in an arranged marriage.
- There is no value in educating girls as their primary goal is reproduction and taking care of household chores.
- Families will be dishonoured if they are allowed to study or work with males.

The majority of women and men spoken to by the RT during the KIs and FGDs believed that women are responsible for household chores, and men are responsible for earning the money that allows them to feed their families. Furthermore, it was noted that it is a common perception that an ‘ideal woman’ is one that efficiently manages and supervises household affairs, including chores, the wellbeing of family members, and children's schooling and morals. She has to maintain a good relationship with her husband and maintain a healthy family environment at all times. She is expected to stay at home unless a social event calls for her to attend. Her behaviour needs to be within Islamic principles and her dress code must adhere to Islamic principles when she leaves the home. Similarly, comments showed that the perception of a ‘good girl’ is one that is respectful, submissive, reserved, virtuous, and maintains the family’s honour at all times.

With regards to the perception of an ‘ideal man’, data showed that he is one that is expected to provide for his family and keep the family’s honour intact. He must attend prayers at the mosque, pay attention to his children’s schooling and the household's needs, and practice filial piety. He is expected to be socially informed, actively participate in resolving conflicts and participate in community volunteer work. Males are also exposed to gender discrimination due to perceptions, such as a man without a job, even for a short time, is under increased societal pressure to find work and is viewed as a useless person.
“The only appropriate occupation for a woman is teaching. In our village, a female doctor is being harassed and accused of having a bad character continuously for having overtime night shifts and working with men.”

*ET participant – Bagram District, Parwan*

“One of our relatives is a lawyer, and her entire family is educated, but each time she leaves for work, her brother verbally abuses her. Her brother believes that women should stay at home and don’t work“

*ET participant – Bagrami District, Kabul*

“A housewife is a more culturally acceptable status for a woman. How can a working mother fulfill her responsibilities such as household chores and taking care of children, husband, and older family members?”

*ET&EVC participant – Bagrami district, Kabul*

“A competent woman is the one who is her husband’s confidante in life regardless of any circumstances. She is the protector of her husband’s wealth and honour.”

*Religious scholar/ member of Haj & Awqaf department, Bagram District, Kabul*

“In Afghanistan, boys are preferred over girls in all families regardless of their mindset, education, and wealth. The degree of discrimination varies though. For instance, in an open-minded family if a son is born, then they celebrate the birth and if a girl is born, then the entire family including the mother and even the midwife is sad. The discrimination is obvious from the day a girl is born. Similarly, if a boy chose his life partner, then the parents would go ten times to ask for her hand but if a girl shares her choice, then her choice is not respected and valued. In extreme cases, she will be threatened by her brother and father and even killed as she will bring dishonour to the family.”

*Haj & Awqaf member – Bagrami District, Kabul*

**Confidence/Participation**

The majority of girls, even when they grow into women, cannot speak with confidence in front of their fathers and brothers, and have minimal, if any, participation in family decisions. One reason is that girls are simply not nurtured or encouraged to be active members of society. For example, girls are never asked to come into the room with guests present, while sons are encouraged to come and sit with guests and engage in conversation. This level of confidence and engagement in discussions even affects such significant life events as marriage. A girl has no say in her marriage. The family decides on her behalf and, even if she does not agree, she does not feel confident, or even safe in some situations, to say so. Boys are also pressured into arranged marriages, but they are more engaged in the decision than girls.

This gender-biased attitude against girls curtails their ambitions and instills the idea that participating in economic and political processes is not within their roles and responsibilities. When girls, as children, are silenced and are not given the platform and opportunity for personal and professional growth, they lack confidence and do not believe that they can make the right decisions on their own.
“Like many other women in the village, I initially did not see any value in my work and earned little money through tailoring. I did not believe in myself, my capabilities, and my talent as a tailor. As a woman, I did not feel responsible for the welfare of the family, and I used to think that it is men’s job to earn and take care of the children. My responsibilities were limited to household chores, taking care of children, and cooking.”

ET participant - Deh Meskeen village, Bagram District, Parwan

The female participants in the FGDs did agree that they required permission from their male family members for the majority of situations. For example, any event a woman would want to participate in such as an advocacy campaign would still require permission from a male family member. One specific example provided was during the recent election campaign in Parwan. During the recruitment process for ET, out of 260 families, only 20 women provided their name, whereas the others refused to do so, saying that they needed permission from a male relative. There were also instances where the female participants said that their male family members did not allow them to vote in the elections.

Further, during the FGDs with the EVC staff and direct beneficiaries, there was a consensus that female participation at the sub-national and national levels was mostly symbolic, and their engagement in the decision-making process was generally not valued.

Identity Factors

It is critical that identity factors be considered and understood when discussing gender norms. Identity factors include some of the factors listed below; it must be recognized that each person, male or female, has more than one factor. No one factor fully identifies any one person and the intersectionality of all factors must be considered. The discussion that follows provides a brief explanation of identity factors and an example of how each can be regarded, based on discussions during KII and FGDs.

**Sex:** Sex is defined biologically. The majority of gender roles in Afghan society are defined based on the sex of a person at birth, whether they are born male or female.

**Age:** The roles and responsibilities of males and females change with age. For instance, a young boy is expected to kiss a guest’s hand when they come over to show respect. A male adult is responsible for the safeguarding of the family and the senior male family members are mainly expected to make family decisions and participate and resolve conflicts at the community level.

Neither girls nor boys have authority over capital and decision-making at the household level, but as boys grow into adults, they have an increase in the level of influence and decision making on family matters. As girls grow into adults, their influence tends to decline. Once they are married and living with their in-laws, their position in the household is lowered. Women do not gain authority and respect until much older. For instance, a grandmother has more authority than a new groom in the family.
As pointed out by one female Community Mobilizer of HRRAC, an implementing partner of CARE in EVC, elderly people in the community, men and women, have greater influence and respect based on both cultural and religious values. The Quran states,

“There who do not respect elders and not kind on children, then is not among us.”

This verse is adhered to even by the most educated youth as they seek approval of elder family members for the final decision. Below is a statement by a Malik, who is a leader in the community, yet still looks to his elder sister for guidance.

“My mother passed away and my sister being the first sibling, manages household affairs. She is not married. As the Malik of the village, I always consult with her on how to resolve the issues. She provides advice and I often listen to her. At times, she would go and talk with families that have an issue that I need to resolve since I cannot speak directly with the female relatives. It is her age, experience, and wisdom that I always seek her permission and her advice.”

Malik, Bagram District, Parwan

**Socio-Economic Status**

Women’s role in family and community will vary based on their socio-economic status. One illustrative example is that the wives or female relatives of male influential community leaders, such as a Malik, Mullah Imam, and Village Shura have a significant role in decision-making and problem-solving processes. Women of these positions indirectly influence the decisions of their husbands, and they also offer financial assistance or shelter to other village women who need it. For these reasons, women of a higher social status tend to be listened to and trusted more by the other women in the community. As stated, this is an illustrative example meant to demonstrate the importance of assessing identity factors when designing and implementing a programme and not grouping all females in a homogenous group. It is key that data needs to be disaggregated at this level to allow for more effective programme impact.

“I built a private school and manage it with my daughters with my husband’s financial support. I decide all financial matters of the school and have authority over the profits earned. He never interferes. I am responsible for home expenses, children’s expenses, and etc.”

EVC participant, Bagrami District, Kabul

“A woman earning income always consults with her husband on how to spend the money but she has authority in deciding how to spend it and for what purpose. Around 50% of women have this authority in our community.”

Village Shura Member – Khulm District, Balkh

**Ethnicity**

Within any culture, there are sub-cultures and ethnicity affects this. The majority of direct beneficiaries were of Tajik origin and only one was of Hazara background. For this reason, there was not an adequate sampling to have substantial findings in this area. With this said, we will provide one example based on general knowledge of how ethnicity can impact programme effectiveness.
Generally speaking, Hazara men tend to be more open-minded than other ethnic groups. They tend to provide more equal access to education and other advancement opportunities for both their boys and girls. Hazara females tend to be more involved in decision-making processes at the household level and their opinion and talents are valued and recognized compared to other ethnic groups.

“I am Hazara and my husband and the entire family have always been supportive, but it was me who did not have the confidence to expand my business through customers and markets outside my village.”
*ET participant, Bagram District, Parwan*

The discussions during the focus groups with ET and EVC direct beneficiaries in Parwan and Kabul highlighted the perception that those with Tajik and Pashtun ethnic backgrounds were more controlling of the females in their families and communities. There was consensus that Pashtuns were the most conservative and there was a stronger focus on the issue of family honor when it came to females of the family.

On the other hand, the data collected from FGDs in Balkh showed that families provide equal educational and employment opportunities for boys and girls, though for the later the preference is up to high school.

“The district governor of Charkent is a woman. There are women cooperatives in Balkh where the women run independently and is a platform for socialization to share and learn. One cannot find such a platform for women in Parwan and Kabul.”
*Senior Project Coordinator – CARE/ Kabul*

“A good woman is the one who can both work and fulfill her familial responsibilities, however, it has to be within Afghan and Islamic principles. This value will ensure her family’s trust and acceptance.”
*EVC participant – Khulm District, Balkh*

**Geographic Location**

The geographical location, such as rural vs urban, plays a role in defining the behavior and perspective of families towards social norms and gender relations. For instance, a family might be open-minded in views of women’s roles, but if they are living in a village, they may be more likely to adhere to social customs in fear of social repercussions than if they were living in a city.

**Persons with Disabilities**

A disability can be physical, mental or emotional. A person possessing a disability is a key identity factor and can have a significant impact on gender norms. For example, a male with a physical disability may be limited in his ability to find paid work, which could result in a physically-abled-body female being viewed as having a higher status. Another example, is that the facility being used for a training or meeting needs to consider if a person with a physical disability needs accommodation, such as a ramp. If this is not provided, it can impact the person’s feeling of self-respect and engagement. This was not data collected during the analysis, rather is an illustrative example of how this specific identity factor can impact the programme’s ability to engage effectively a beneficiary,
as well as have the most positive impact on the said beneficiary, meaning this needs to be considered when disaggregated data and in programme design.

Legal Rights and Access

A very high percentage of citizens are not aware of their overall basic rights and have minimal, if any, understanding of how to access civil society and the political sphere. This limited knowledge and skills have severely affected citizens' participation in democratic processes and family and community level development affairs.

Based on the data collected from 49 participants of FGD and 11 KIIs with staff of ET and EVC, women in the target communities are not aware of their basic rights in areas of education, employment, civil, political, and inheritance. Insecurity, poverty, harmful cultural practices, and illiteracy are factors that make it harder for women to access equal opportunities and enjoy their rights.

One example discussed among participants was that of inheritance. The common belief is that when women receive their inheritance, then their husbands will naturally share ownership of the property and land with their wife’s family. In tribal communities, it is considered cowardly if a stranger owns their land, which prevents them from leaving the land to their daughters. According to the EVC participants in FGDs, even women who are aware of their basic right to inheritance will refrain from exercising that right to prevent any violence and the so-called dishonour from falling on their family. There are instances where women claimed their inheritance right and the family stopped communicating with them. ET participants in FGDs felt that claiming your share of inheritance is not culturally 'appropriate' and will bring shame and humiliation to families and were not familiar with the legal aspect.

“I know that I am entitled to receive a share of my father’s inheritance, but my brothers never gave it to me after they distributed among themselves. I chose not to claim it only because my daughter is married to my nephew and I was afraid her life will get in trouble. I knew that my brothers would never give me anything voluntarily.”

ET&EVC participant – Bagram District, Parwan

“If a woman claims her inheritance right and takes it, then she will not be allowed even at her father’s funeral ceremony.”

Mullah Imam - Bagrami District, Kabul

“If my brother and nephews are happy and have a good life, that is everything for me. They are my pride. It would be cruel and shameful if take inheritance from my brother.”

ET participant – Bagrami District, Kabul

In terms of educational access, it is greatly limited for women and girls, whether formal or informal. For example, the majority of FGD participants said most girls are pulled out of school by their family by 6th grade, yet according to Article 43 of the Afghan constitution both women and men have the right to education. “Education is the right of all citizens of Afghanistan, which shall be offered up to the B.A. level in the state educational institutes free of charge by the state. To expand balanced education as well as to provide mandatory intermediate education throughout Afghanistan, the state shall design..."
and implement effective programmes and prepare the ground for teaching mother tongues in areas where they are spoken.”

Regardless of one’s legal right, often cultural perspectives, such as the concept of ‘honour’, limit access to education for females. The families fear that if a woman or girl is engaging with men or boys or if there is potential for sexual harassment, then the family will be dishonoured. The families decide that it is better to limit the girl’s access to education than take such a chance, even though legally she has a right to attend school. Access is also limited by security problems and poverty.

“Majority of girls in Khulm district cannot study beyond 12th grade. Mobility and poverty are barriers towards girls’ access to higher education. Universities are located in Mazar-e-Sharif (provincial Capital) and it is both far and costly. I have two daughters and they are both high school graduates. One is engaged and the other is at home. We couldn’t send them to university for economic reasons.”

Village Shura Member – Khulm District, Balkh

Married women are even more limited in access than single women when it comes to education and employment opportunities. The discussions showed that fathers tend to be more supportive of their daughter's advancement than husbands and mothers-in-law.

"I could not continue school after grade 6. My fiancé told me not to go to school because you are my wife, and I cannot tolerate any men in the village looking at you or gossiping about you. If something were to happen to bring dishonor, then it can't be undone".

ET participant – Bagram District, Parwan

**Power Dynamics and Decision Making**

There are clear distinctions between men and women when it comes to being in positions of power and engaged in decision-making at family and community levels. As discussed earlier, women have more control over household matters, whereas men have more control over financial issues and family assets. This existing division marginalizes women from sources of power, resources, and engagement in decision making on issues that have significant impact on them and their families. Discussions did show that identity factors affect power dynamics. For example, higher-educated women will have more significant opportunity to be in positions of power and decision-making. Similarly, elderly women also would have the same.

As the primary decision makers over finances, fathers favour their sons and spend more money on their education and wellbeing relative to their daughters. This situation further enforces gender inequality. A woman with an income and authority tends to provide equal opportunities for her children and promotes gender equality. Many FGD participants with an income helped pay for their daughters’ schools and other relevant costs.

At the family level. Both girls and boys, as children, do not have authority over capital and are not involved and consulted with any type of decisions made at the household level. As they grow into adults their status changes. As girls get married, they still have limited decision-making power in the family, in their new role as wife and daughter-in-law.
The hierarchical family structure in target communities is such that more than 90% of men are the power holders when it comes to decision-making. This results in the eldest male of a family having the most power in the decision-making process at the household level. If a grandfather passes away and the grandmother is the eldest in the house, then her power position will increase.

“In an Afghan context, as a new bride, we face a lot of restrictions and are not given any choice and right in decision-making processes. As we grow old and have children, then there are fewer restrictions and our opinion is asked. As grandmothers and mothers-in-law, then we have relatively less mobility restrictions and our opinion matters and our sons consult with us on family matters.”

EVC & ET participant – Bagrami District, Parwan

Education and income give women and young men the platform to share valued opinions and influence decisions in a respected manner.

“In a joint family system, a younger brother with a good income, will have the authority over money and influence decisions compared to older brothers and even father. However, for cultural reasons, he will consult and seek approval of the elders.”

Village Shura Member – Bagrami District, Kabul

On the other hand, 49 female participants in the FGDs mentioned that they have authority over the profits earned from small household enterprises, though they will still make sure to consult with their husbands on how to spend it. During the same FGDs, some women spoke to hiding their income so that they have more control on how to spend it.

“I make sure to save part of the money I earn through tailoring. I spend it on my children’s clothing and school fee and other costs. I have given loan to women in the village several times. At times, if he needs money, he asks me for it. Once my husband needed 100,000 AFN for a home mortgage for us and I gave him but I told him that I took it from another woman in the village. I did not want to tell him because he would not give it back to me.”

EVC participant – Bagrami District, Kabul

The power dynamics reinforced by male family members give significant authority and space in decision making to mothers-in-law. This status is given to them on the basis of age, experience and respect, which is embedded in Afghan culture and Islam.

Mothers-in-law seek to maintain their status and position in the family. The less educated they are, the more they rely on violence and abuse to solidify their power. Illiteracy, poor economic conditions, and ignorance contribute to the continuation of the cycle as a new mother-in-law treats her daughter-in-law the same way she was treated. Therefore, they play a significant role in enforcing discriminatory gender relations and perpetuating harmful socio-cultural practices.

According to the 49 FGD participants from ET and EVC programmes, a mother-in-law tends to indirectly influence all the decisions that are made by her son, in particular, issues related to the family and daughter-in-law, such as:
Mobility: In most cases, they won't want their daughter-in-law to leave the house without their permission to keep the ‘family honour.’ She wants to control where she goes, whom she meets, etc.

Education and employment-related opportunities. They often won't permit their daughters-in-law to participate in any educational or employment opportunity. The logic is that: "your responsibility is to take care of your family and the household chores. You are married now, and if you wanted to study, then you should have done it in your parent's house."

"Mothers-in-law have full authority and influence at the family level. During the assessment of ET project, several mothers-in-law did not permit their daughters-in-law to take part and provide information. A few argued that if you want our daughters-in-law to participate in the programme, then you should include us too in the programme."

Village Enterprise Facilitator (VEF) - ET programme

At the community level: With regards to decision making power at the community level among women, identity factors such as age, socio-economic status, and education play a significant role. For instance, elderly women, the wife of a Malik or Mullah Imam are more influential in decision making and problem-solving processes than other women in the village. They are listened to and trusted more by the other women in the community. With that said, overall women have limited space and platform to participate in business and community related matters. Their opinion is not highly valued and influential male community members, such as male Jirgas, have majority control over community decisions.

"Men are wiser and have sound judgment than females. If a father is at home, then a mother can’t have any authority. Even our mothers would tell us to go and ask your father for permission. This is a cultural thing. It is out of respect that we have for our fathers."

ET participant – Bagram District, Parwan

This information summarizes the data collected from 244 survey participants and 49 FGD participants:

**Decision-Making Power**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Decisions</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial Capital &amp; Expenditure</td>
<td>90% of men are the main income earner of their household and have sole authority over finances and expenditures. They tend to spend more on their sons.</td>
<td>Kabul &amp; Parwan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ 50% are consulted on decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Remaining 50% are either informed or no role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Women with an income have relatively more authority over money but seek permission prior to acting on the decision.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Balkh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Majority of women are consulted for all decisions on money and expenses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Land, Property, Inheritance | **Men have full authority over land and inheritance.**  
**A man is given inheritance naturally - even if he does not ask for it.** | **About 85% of women are not consulted on land and property.**  
**Women are not able to exercise any inheritance right. They do not claim it either to avoid conflict.** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children’s wellbeing: Education and Health</td>
<td>Men have final say on decisions related to children’s education, employment and marriage. It is extreme for girls who cannot accept an employment offer until the father approves it.</td>
<td>Women are consulted on all decisions taken for the children. However, they are most influential in decisions on daily schooling and healthcare.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility</td>
<td>Men are the sole decision makers for the family.</td>
<td>Women have restricted mobility with the exception of elderly women (mothers-in-law/grandmothers). For any decision that requires leaving home especially outside the village, they must ask for permission from men.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Type of Meal & Home Decor | Men are not as involved in the specificities but rather the budgeting. | **Women are more involved in how and where the money is spent.**  
**Women with incomes have more influence in both the budgeting and the types of expenditures.** |

**BARRIERS**

**Mobility and Social Norms**

Mobility is still an issue for women to start an enterprise or participate in social and political related events at district and provincial levels. Of the 224 survey participants, a total of 41% named mobility as a barrier towards starting an enterprise or participate in social and political activities at district and provincial levels.

Almost half of the survey participants (49%: 109 out of 223) leave home only 1-3 times a week. About 24% stated that they leave home 4-6 times per week. This indicates that the majority of females do not leave home on a daily basis.

**Chart3. Women Mobility Per Week**
In addition to mobility, the ET & EVC survey participants highlighted social norms/harmful cultural practices, such as the issue of honor, poverty, and other technical and logistic are barriers towards active participation. In the charts below, the total number indicates the total number of responses since one survey participant has marked more than one option as barrier.
EVC staff during KIIs stated that the Quran has been misinterpreted in Afghan society that Islam does not allow women to interact and be seen by men outside the family. This misinterpretation creates a social norm that confines women's roles and responsibilities to the household and limits their mobility and social engagement. It is a famous proverb in target communities that “a woman’s best mosque is her home.”

The gendered division of labor; the ‘issue of honour’; and misinterpretation of Islam jointly restrict women’s mobility and creates barriers towards women’s access to educational, employment, and active civic engagement. Even men who are unemployed or addicts consider their wives’ incomes a sign of ‘dishonour’ and emasculating. Moreover, the male siblings who grew up under the Taliban regime are conservative and don't let their sisters access educational and employment opportunities to safeguard the family’s “honour”.

“My uncle cut off any family relationship with my father after my sister and I went to university in the evenings. He used to say that what is the need for a girl to go to university and that in the evening. My father did not listen to him, but not everyone in the village thinks like my father.

ET&EVC participant – Bagrami District, Kabul

Similarly, my father-in-law influences every single decision about my mobility and access to opportunities. He interferes with the type of clothes I wear and the places and people I may visit and contact. He is concerned about the society and what if someone in the village would point out a finger on me and blame me for not dressing properly or talking with strangers on my way to university. He believes I am his ‘honour’ and if someone takes my name in a wrong way, then it is a ‘dishonour’ for him. He can't afford it.”

ET & EVC participant – Bagrami District, Kabul

Although security concerns are barriers for everyone in the community, it is especially restricting for women as people are afraid of women being identified as a part of the family if they are injured or dead.

“Social norms combined with security issues limits women’s mobility and this directly impact the level of investment on girls. My mother may trust me completely, but I have to be home before dark because I cannot walk alone in my street in the dark and anything can happen to me simply because of my gender.”

M&E officer - EVC/CARE, Kabul

On the other hand, elderly women have more leeway as they do not need a ‘mahram’ and do not face harassment. This also allows them to communicate freely with shopkeepers and other male strangers in the community. On the other hand, a younger girl cannot even go alone to do gardening to avoid societal repercussions.

Based on the KII with WCLRF staff, in Balkh province, women have minimal restrictions in terms of mobility compared to target communities in Kabul and Parwan due to historical context and close proximity to the provincial capital - Mazar-e-Sharif. However, when it comes to permission, women

---

6 A Mahram is a close male relative – that is a husband, father, brother, or son.
are still expected to inform the male family members if they leave the house out of respect to them and the culture. On the other hand, women have relatively limited mobility in Bagrami and Jabulsaraj districts of Kabul and Parwan respectively and are preferred not to engage in activities outside the home.

**Strict Adherence to Social Norms**

Families are cautious of prevailing social norms and perceptions, so they make sure the actions and behavior of female family members are socio-culturally acceptable. Women are judged by both the community and the family members from the minute they leave the house. Due to the fear of social repercussions, most girls drop out of school when they reach adolescence, cannot have jobs that require travel, overtime shifts, and are married off against their will.

“I got an offer for teaching, but I couldn’t do it because my husband asked me to wait until he was employed so that I am not the main breadwinner, which is shameful in our culture and the society will call him a coward.”

*ET&EVC participant – Bagram District, Parwan*

“After a year of studying, my father-in-law requested for me not attend university anymore. The villagers might gossip about me attending university with boys which might morally corrupt me. I was mad and called my fiancé for help. He suggested to attend university but in secret. He was helpless against the societal pressure and respect for his father; he couldn’t defend me.”

*ET participant – Bagrami District, Kabul*

“The female participants of EVC in Parwan face a lot of challenges when traveling to district and provincial level interphase and advocacy cluster meetings. To avoid being harshly judged and accused of loose character, they lie to the relatives and neighbors about the purpose of the trip. They say that they went for medical or shopping.

*EVC/CARE HQ M&E Officer*

“The majority of girls are forced to marry their fiancés even if they turned out to be drug addicts. It is just the societal pressure and the risk of taking the blame as not being a ‘good’ girl. The society never blames the boy, and it is just the girl who is to be blamed.”

*EVC participant – Bagrami District, Kabul*

**Poverty**

Based on the data collected from the FGDs and KIIIs, women’s poor economic condition limits their ability to participate in social, political, and economic activities. As shown in above tables, a total of 177 participants named high transportation cost and technical and logistics as barriers that make up more than half of the survey participants. For ET and both ET&EVC participants, the technical and logistic included high transportation cost, limited access to market information, and limited knowledge and skills on market trends.
Based on the data collected from KIIs with implementing partners of EVC, other social norms such as early and forced marriages, Badal, Walwar (Toyana), and costly weddings are common in target communities, however, it has reduced largely within the last decade and EVC’s advocacy efforts.

**Community Influencers**

In target communities, the influential community leaders such as Village Shura, Malik, and Mullah Imams play an essential role in society. Due to Afghanistan's religious and tribal context, their standpoint and judgment about societal affairs are trusted by many and is seen as the correct path as they are believed to be the representatives of Islam. Even men that support women's participation will turn to religious leaders in their community for the final say. Thus, the mindset and actions of such religious leaders convey an important message to the village people. There are generally two mindsets that religious community leaders adopt: that of promoters and or inhibitors of women's empowerment.

"If the family gives you permission to participate in a programme, then the villagers may not, and if the people in your community are good, then the Malik or Mullah Imam would create a problem."
*ET participant – Bagram District, Parwan*

"People listen and trust Mullah Imam's advice than teachers since Afghanistan is a Muslim society. They believe that they have read the Quran, and they teach us the way of life and morals in light of Islam."
*ET&EVC participant - Bagrami district, Kabul*

Moreover, the significant role of influential community leaders is further enforced by the fact that in rural and insecure areas, the people are alienated by the central government, and they resolve their conflicts through consultative councils of tribal elders (shuras or jirgas). The Malik then represents the village's needs and interests to external parties and also with any internal matters.

"One of the girls from our village opened a tailoring class and also collected ID cards from women as part of the 2019 presidential elections. As soon as Malik was informed of this, he was so mad that he verbally abused the girl and closed her tailoring class. The brother of the girl struck her that she could not leave home for several days."
*ET&EVC participant – Bagram District, Parwan*

The approval and consent of a Malik are crucial to start any economic, political, and social activity. When a Malik is involved throughout the process, then he serves as a supporter and can convince the rest of the community, including religious figures and elders and the family. This is essential, especially considering the fact that there are Mullah Imams that are not well aware of Islam and are not registered with the Haj and Awqaf, and have similar standpoints as Taliban. They preach to men that women leaving home and travelling to the provincial capital and participating in development programmes are infidels and bring dishonour. The majority of men in target communities trust and listen to the Mullah Imam and despite their support for programmes, obey the Imams. On the other hand, if they are registered and educated, they can also serve as promoters of women's rights and gender equality.

A proverb that says:

"If a Mullah would call someone Infidel, then he/she would never become a Muslim again"
ET and EVC Programme Effectiveness

Findings show that in response to the main research question, “Do women who have been part of both political and economic empowerment programmes demonstrate higher economic and political empowerment than women who have been part of either a political empowerment programme or an economic empowerment programme?”, the answer is YES. Women participating in both a political and economic empowerment program demonstrate increased empowerment in both these sectors vs a woman who solely participated in one programme. This analysis found many complementary areas between the programmes that worked toward increasing the impact of both. Findings will show that many females felt they could be more engaged in the political sector if they have the financial means to do so. The participants clearly spoke to gaining knowledge on their civic, legal and political rights through EVC; but, always felt due to the lack of money, they were limited in how much they could access and engage in such areas. They felt that participating in such a programme as ET, they have become and will become more economically engaged, ultimately affecting their increased role in decision-making at the family and community levels, to include civic and political participation. Furthermore, EVC has increased the participants networking capabilities. Such positive effects in one programme have complemented and supported effects of the other programme, meaning strengthened networks in EVC supported the networking requirements needed for success in the ET programme. Both programmes have individually been able to demonstrate the effects of an increase of self-esteem of female participants, increased awareness, and a change in mindset on the expected roles and the value of females in the political and economic sectors.

Below illustrative finding demonstrating how being involved in both programmes versus one can result in greater economic and political empowerment, can be seen in the below charts. These impacts have been two-fold through implementing the programmes side by side. The complementary value of EVC and ET will be demonstrated in the findings laid out in this section.

1. **Leadership skills:** Findings showed that women enrolled in both programmes were more inclined to be in leadership positions (team leader in SHG) compared to those solely participating in one programme. As discussed in the FGDs with participants, the women enrolled in both programmes are relatively more confident and have better communication and problem-solving skills and social networks.
2. **Mobility and family support.** It was noted that women who were already engaged in EVC along with their male family members had an easier time joining and participating in ET in regards to family support and mobility. Of the 75 EVC participants, a total of 87% named family as the source of encouragement compared to 64% ET survey participants. This occurred because the male family members were already part of EVC programme and learning about women’s rights and thus learned to trust and see the value. For this reason, they supported their females joining the ET programme compared to males who had not exposure to EVC or any similar type of programme.

Based on conversations with FGD participants, having a family member as a participant in one of the programmes ensure active participation and less mobility restriction. As shown in the chart below, 49% of women enrolled in both ET&EVC stated that a family member was also participant of the programme. On the other hand, this percentage is only 33% for EVC and 29% for ET.

3. **Increased Social networks.** Social Networks through membership in formal and informal governance institutions – this boost confidence, communication skills, and this eventually help with running and managing an enterprise and market search. Data showed that women who participated in EVC then joined ET had already established strong network and built confidence in her ability to navigate these networks. This skillset and confidence easily transferred to requirements under ET such as marketing search, which allowed them to quickly adapt to ET programme requirements. Moreover, the women joining ET from
EVC demonstrated a higher level of leadership and were able to act as mentors to the other women in the program who had not yet had the experience of EVC.

Based on the survey findings, 35% of EVC survey participants (30 out of 75) stated that they are member of a formal or informal governance institutions such as CDCs, Shuras, and etc. This membership increased after joining the EVC programme (83% became member after joining EVC and 17% were already a member). This figure was 64% for women enrolled in both ET& EVC programmes and only 10% for ET participants (7 out of 75 survey participants). This indicates that EVC participants have established social networks through membership and advocacy efforts involving these institutions at community level.

4. **Decision Making and Influence:** Finding demonstrated that women enrolled in both ET and EVC programmes increased engagement and influence in decision making in family and community.

Based on the survey data from 224 participants, women’s engagement and influence in decision making processes has increased since joining ET and EVC programmes. The below chart shows areas of decision-making (money, land, inheritance, children’s health and education, type of meals) the respondents said they are engaged with. For instance, with respect to control over finances, around 62% women are being consulted with and more than 23% are decision makers.
On the other hand, while comparing the level of authority and influence for the three beneficiary categories (ET, EVC, ET&EVC), on average around 44% women enrolled in both ET and EVC are key decision makers, thus, are economically and politically empowered. This percentage is the lowest for EVC participants and it can be attributed to control over finances and capital assets as they are not key decision makers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Decision Making</th>
<th>EVC (75 participants)</th>
<th>ET (75 participants)</th>
<th>Both ET&amp;EVC (74 participants)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Over financial assets (Money) and how to spend it (Q19A)</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership &amp; control over capital assets (land, animals, inheritance) (Q19B)</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family well-being (children health and education) (Q19C)</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social and political participation (Q19D)</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility (Q19E)</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Meals (Q19F)</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. Percentage in terms of Key Decision Maker</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>38.4%</td>
<td>43.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additionally, the saving and income generation component of ET helps EVC participants to have the source of income to further influence decisions at family level and increase participation at community level. Data shows that women in the ET and EVC program felt they were much more empowered to engage in EVC type activities, such as advocacy and standing for their rights, because the income they earned from ET helped facilitate this. More specifically, the funding earned through their enterprise establishment allowed them to attend meetings which they could not afford to travel to in the past, allowed them to invest in activities that support their family and community development, and guaranteed resources were equally dedicated to their daughters, especially in areas such as education.

“*My sister-in-law took a 5000 AFN loan from SHG and together with her husband’s savings bought a baby cow for 21,000 AFN. After a few months, the cow can be sold for over 40,000 AFN and the family can make a profit of 19,000 AFN My brother did not know what to do with his savings until his wife gave him this idea and she learned through SHG. I have seen him consulting with his wife on when and at what price to sell it.*”

ET&EVC participant – Bagram District of Parwan

“I built a private school and manage it with my daughters with my husband’s financial support. I decide all financial matters of the school and have authority over the profits earned. He never interferes. I am responsible for home expenses, children’s expenses, and etc.”

EVC participant, Bagrami District, Kabul

“Providing the EVC participants with income-generating activities will further build trust of communities on the EVC programme. The majority of EVC participants are poor and they start believing that EVC resolved one of their key challenges. The poor economic condition limits women’s participation and influence in decision-making processes. For instance, several EVC participants cannot send their daughters to school or university only because they cannot afford the stationery and transportation cost.”

Mullah Imam – Bagrami District, Kabul

It should be noted that ET is only one year in to its program; therefore, the full impact of benefits ET and EVC are having on each other have yet to be realized. With that said, finding show significant value already in both being implemented simultaneously due to their complementary fashion.

**Gender Continuum**

With regards to where the programmes fall on the gender continuum, the findings from this analysis do show that the programmes have mostly moved beyond gender exploitative and gender unaware\(^7\), and can be said to be at the level of gender sensitive. Gender sensitive is being defined as: interventions ensure the different needs, abilities, and opportunities of women and men are identified, considered, and accounted for. Though the programmes are mostly at this level, findings

---

7 Interventions are designed without taking the specific needs of women and men into consideration. They may inadvertently reinforce gender inequalities and miss opportunities in program design, implementation and evaluation to achieve sustainable project outcomes. (Central Statistics Organization (2018), Afghanistan Living Conditions Survey 2016-17. Kabul, CSO).
did show areas that were gender unaware. The recommendations provided in this analysis are meant to support the programmes into moving toward a gender transformative reality. Gender transformative is being defined as interventions that promote gender equality and work with key stakeholders to identify and address and positively transform the root causes of gender inequality for women and men. Based on a review of the findings and current programme indicators, there is a need for indicators to be developed that will measure this better.

**Programme Assessment and Defining Empowerment**

It is critical to understand the definition of empowerment as defined below:

*Empowerment is a process of change by which individuals or groups gain power and ability to take control over their lives. It involves access to resources, resulting in increased participation in decision-making and bargaining power and increased control over benefits, resources and own life, increased self-confidence, self-esteem and self-respect.*

- **Economic empowerment:** the ability of women to access, own, and control resources. Indicators such as income generation by women, female ownership of assets and land, expenditure patterns, degree of women participation in paid employment, division of domestic labour across men and women, and control over financial decision making by women.
- **Political empowerment:** the ability to participate in decision making focused on access to resources, rights, and entitlements within communities. Indicators include awareness of rights or laws, political participation such as voting, the ability to own land legally, the ability to inherit property legally, and the ability to gain leadership positions in the government.
- **Social empowerment:** the ability to exert control over decision making within the household. Indicators: women’s mobility or freedom of movement, freedom from violence, negotiations and discussion around sex, women’s control over choosing a spouse, women’s control over age at marriage, women’s control over family size decision making, and women’s access to education.

The conversations that took place with 149 female EVC and ET participants during the FGDs demonstrated that their understanding of empowerment is in line with the formal definition laid out above. Below are quotes from the FGD participants when asked what empowerment meant to them.

> “The feelings that I have the choice to travel outside the village or simply leaving home. That is a feeling of empowerment.”

> “When I feel that I have the power to earn money and then have the authority on how to spend it and for what purpose. The feeling of being valued and the feeling that your work is recognized – that is when I feel empowered.”

> “Have the ability to use available resources to earn an income and have the knowledge and skills to produce something, to start an enterprise”

---

8 The Campbell Collaboration: Brody Review of Self-Help
“I feel empowered when I realized that I can make money, use it economically, and that I can help my family. Start believing in myself and capabilities”

“I feel empowered when I know my worth and value as a human being, as someone who has a family, good health, and beautiful children. This feeling of happiness motivates me to work hard and believe that I can also contribute to the welfare of my family regardless of the minimal amount I may earn.”

The findings will demonstrate how programme interventions have worked toward female empowerment. Furthermore, the recommendations will speak to how this focus on empowerment can be further strengthened. As referenced above, it is critical that as the programme progresses, proper measurement through monitoring, evaluation and learning take place.

**Empowerment Indicators**

ET’s current indicators demonstrate a limited focus on their ability to measure an increase in female empowerment, thus limited ability to measure movement along the gender continuum. For example, it is important to measure the number of women trained or number of female enterprises established, as current indicators measure, but it is critical to look at if these are working toward empowering or disempowering females. If during the process of engaging a woman in a training and managing her own business, has this added an extreme number of hours and labour requirements to her already busy schedule? Has she gone from a 10 hour work day of taking care of the household, children, on-farm labour and so forth, to a 15 hours day, with the addition of training and a new business to manage? This is a simple example to demonstrate the importance of understanding the nuances of programme interventions on true empowerment. Similarly, is her husband only changing his view on accepting that his wife be involved in a business or household decisions because she is bringing in money? If she stops earning this money, will his perception of her value change, and she will no longer be engaged in decision-making and such. Such a situation would not be true empowerment because it was only based on money, not the individual, and also was temporary. These are only illustrative examples of what could happen, but demonstrates the importance of monitoring programme intervention impacts at such a nuanced level. At a basic level it is crucial that all indicators are adequately disaggregated. Disaggregation should include sex, age, and ethnicity, at a minimum. The below table are suggested indicators to add to the existing programme indicators that can better measure the nuances of what female empowerment fully entails.

**Indicators – Women Economic Empowerment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>How to Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Change in daily labour input in terms of hours</td>
<td>Collect data and inputs from the project beneficiaries on daily basis about the time they spend on each activity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2  | Change in perception of expected female roles      | Survey question can be multiple choice and given to female participants, husbands, and community leaders. For example: A female should be involved in the following (check all that apply):  
  ▪ Decision-making in regards to family matters  
  ▪ Taking care of the house in terms of cleaning and preparing meals |
| Change in view of female value to family and community engagement | Survey question can be multiple choice and given to female participants, husbands, and community leaders. For Example:
A female has value for the family because:
- Earns an income
- Support decision-making
- Takes care of the children
- Takes care of the household in terms of cleaning and preparing meals
- Other |

| Change in number of females earning an income | This can easily be collecting by recording what, if any, earnings female participants have at the start of the program vs end |

| Change in female labour being counted and paid | Based on initial data collected from what a woman does on a daily basis and how much time she inputs into each activity, can also ask them to identify which activities they are paid for. |

| Change in female engagement in decision-making at family and community level | Survey question for female participants at start and end of project as to what decisions they are engaged with. For example:
Are you currently involved in decision-making with family and community? If yes, please check the below areas of which you are engaged in decision-making.
- Money management
- Governance
- Childcare and education
- Household maintenance
- Other |

Along with incorporating the recommendations into work planning moving forward, it is critical proper monitoring, evaluation and learning (MEL) plans be established and followed. This will allow the programmes to better assess, learn and adapt their program interventions in addressing key challenges and be able to more effectively move toward being gender transformative.

With regards to EVC programme, the RT does not recommend to revise or develop additional indicators.
CHALLENGES

ET Programme

The baseline data brought to light several challenges that females face in Afghan culture, and more specifically, within the 3 target villages. This section will speak to how ET has thus far impacted such challenges within the context of programme objectives. Moreover, the section will focus on foundations. Foundations are the positive cultural factors that support female empowerment. It is important to note ET activities are still at an early phase of implementation; therefore, this data is only demonstrative of potential final programme impacts. Also, included is a review of the design phase and work planning phases of ET to assess if the identified challenges and foundations were actively considered. Recommendations are then provided as to how the programme can better consider these challenges and foundations moving forward. The below tables layout the most significant challenges and foundations identified during the data collection.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>Women perceived to inhabit only a reproductive role, not a business role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Women's labour not being recognised or paid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Security includes criminal and insurgency activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Women having limited mobility outside of their own house</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Women being viewed as responsible for the family honour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Women overburdened with time and labour commitments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Women facing more challenges due to identity factors such as education level, age, socio-economic level, ethnicity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Women having limited self-awareness, low self-esteem and limited social network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Women have limited engagement in decision-making in family and community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Challenges 1 and 2

Overall, ET being an economic empowerment programme targeting female beneficiaries, it has positively impacted challenges 1 and 2, that is, women being more accepted in a business role and more of their labour being recognised and paid. Based on the survey data from 149 participants, about 91% joined the ET programme for the purpose of earning an income and career development, which demonstrates women’s desire to be in more of a business role and engage in paid and recognised labour.

The business development services training in the ET programme supported 1,100 women in choosing a business focus based on their skills and interest. Other programme interventions, such as the Self-Help Groups (SHGs), provide training twice a month on group management, leadership, and business development. To-date, 1,100 women have been mobilised into groups of 20, for a total of 55 SHGs.

These interventions are having a positive impact. Based on the survey data, 30% (44 out of 149) of the women are earning an income and contributing financially through self-owned enterprises or
working as wage labourers for others. A total of 33 started their enterprises in the areas of tailoring, beautician, poultry, farming, livestock, handicraft, food processing (pickles, jam), and dishwashing liquid (12 businesses). The respondents indicated earnings ranging from 150 to 15,000 AFN monthly. A total of 9 women said that they are earning an income through working for other female-owned businesses in the village.

“I used to give my dairy products such as milk and yoghurt to neighbors for free as I didn't know how to market it inside the village. Now, with the help of the VEF, I made a contract with the two dairy shops in our village.”

ET participant – Bagram District of Parwan

Findings do show a slight change occurring in perception and acceptance of females in a business role as can be noted in the comments below.

“My husband fell short of 1,000 AFN for his Lemon Juice Store. I took a loan and helped him run his business. I paid back within 15 days. I felt happy that I could help him and he also appreciated the help and realised the benefit of SHG.”

ET&EVC participant – Bagram District of Parwan

“After enrollment in the ET project and learning about bookkeeping and the importance of savings, my father gave me the responsibility for our finances. He saw that I become so good at saving and spending money for the right purpose. I am the bookkeeper for the house. I feel responsible now for the expenses and the savings.”

ET Youth Participant

“When we earn money for the family from enterprises and occupations that are culturally acceptable, then it slowly brings a shift in the mindset and attitudes of our families and the community. We gain the trust of the family and community in this process. Our husbands are mainly illiterate, but they see the benefit that our income can contribute to the welfare of the family. At times, we even give loans to our husbands from our savings when they need to buy new equipment or something for their businesses.”

ET participant from Deh Miskeen village, Bagram district of Parwan

FGDs also showed that there was still a view from male family members that if females were not bringing in money actively, then many felt the women should not waste time at trainings or awareness meetings. Such attitudes do need to be considered to a greater extent during programme work planning and this will be discussed in more detail in the recommendations section.

Challenge 3

Security is an issue overall for males and females across the country. Findings show that ET has considered security challenges in their planning in the following ways:

- Staff received regular security updates from community leaders, such as Maliks;
- All meetings and trainings, such as SHGs, were conducted in each village, which limited the need for travel outside the village on insecure roads and across insecure regions;
ET staff did confirm that in the 2nd year of the programme, VEFs will always accompany women during marketing surveys and exploring potential customers outside of the village.

Currently, there is no evidence that shows the programme has planned for security challenges that the female participants will face in terms of mobility once the programme has ended and existing support is withdrawn.

**Challenge 4**

Mobility based on security and social norms is a significant challenge. Findings show some, yet limited, consideration is given to this in programme work planning. A review of programme work plans showed that the following were considered in terms of mobility:

- Conducting trainings and SHG meetings in villages
- Provide transportation for women for meetings and trainings

Findings did not show consideration given to female mobility with regards to access to markets. As shows in chart below, of the 244 survey participants, 133 indicated mobility and social norms as a top challenge to enterprise development. The FGDs pointed to the need for women to be mobile in order to properly develop their business for several reasons.

- Raw materials are not available at the village level, which requires travel to urban areas.
- In order to carry-out a proper market assessment, there is a need to travel to them. If a woman must work through a 3rd party buyer at the village level, often they are given wrong information and are financially exploited.
- At the village level, many markets, such as poultry and dairy, are already saturated, hence a need to travel outside of the village to access new markets to sell products.
“In our community, a total of 500 eggs were distributed to women, so how many eggs one can sell inside the village? There is no market for it.”

Village Shura Member - Khulm District of Balkh

As pointed out in the above section, security is and will continue to be a significant hindrance for female mobility in terms of programme impact and sustainability. Moreover, it was evident that not only was mobility being limited by social norms of women not being able to travel alone, but also their confidence to do so even at times when they are safely allowed to do so.

“I accompanied several women to Lysa Mariam Bazaar to conduct a market survey for their products from the Dowlat Shahi village of Bagram. I am not sure if they would be able to go to Kabul and explore potential clients and customers independently. If we take their hands, they are fine, and the minute we leave it, then they will fall on the ground, and their enterprises will collapse.”

VEF, Parwan Province

“I helped one of the women to secure a deal with a shop in the village to sell her dairy products. Next time, she wanted me to accompany her simply because she could not go alone and that she was too shy to talk with the shopkeeper. That is why I insist on the continuous support for these women for a few more years.”

VEF, Parwan Province

**Challenge 5**

Findings did not show there was a significant focus on the challenge of dealing with the view of females being the holder of family honour in programme design and implementation.

**Challenge 6**

Findings did show some consideration of female time and labour commitments prior to starting the programme, but there is opportunity for a more nuanced focus. Programme staff did coordinate with the women on the scheduling of classes and meetings to determine times that would best fit their existing schedules. Additionally, through time management training, the women learned how to organise their time better so that they could be more productive and did not have to avoid any of their familial responsibilities as their enterprises develops. An ET participant, who worked as a tailor, was asked about time burden, specifically, if she was able to keep up with her current responsibilities, as well as her increased time and labor requirements for her business. She said this was not a problem because she taught herself to manage her time better.

Though these findings point to no significant negative impact on women being over-burdened through the increased time and labour input required from programme participation, there is a need to monitor this more closely moving forward, as well as consider it to a greater extent in programme work planning. This is especially true because the programme is still fairly new and it is expected that the time and labour input of the participants will only increase moving forward. This will be discussed further in the recommendations section.
Challenge 7

Findings showed some, though minimal, focus on identity factors in programme design and implementation. As shown in the baseline data, there are significant differences in identity factors in areas of ethnicity, age, disability and education, just to name a few. For example, literacy and education levels were considered in programming. The majority of female beneficiaries are illiterate, so the training material was developed to be more visual and the facilitation of training sessions was done in a manner that supported the best learning style for low literacy students. Findings did show such a focus to be of value. As spoken to in the baseline and demonstrated in the below quote, the Hazara ethnic group tends to be less conservative and more supportive of females in the family and community. The programme did consider ethnicity in the establishment of SHGs and groups were formed based on ethnic background. This approach proved to support trust-building and community endorsement issues.

With that said, there is opportunity for an increased focus on identity factors within programme planning, which will be discussed further in the recommendation section.

“After enrollment in the ET project, I learned first of all about capabilities and that I can achieve if I believe in myself. This belief helped me travel to Chahrikar and Kabul in search of customers and to assess the clothing market. My brother, who is a judge, introduced me to a clothing company, and that meeting ended up in securing a contract. I have to hire 25 students and produce clothes for the company. It is a big achievement for me. Signing the contract with a clothing company in Kabul was the day I started to believe in myself and the value of my work. I belong to Hazara ethnic group, and my husband and the entire family have always been supportive, but it was me who did not have the confidence to expand my business through customers and markets outside my village."

ET Participant – Bagram District of Parwan

Challenge 8

Findings showed a significant impact on challenge #8, limited self-awareness, low self-esteem and limited social network. Out of 149 survey respondents, 24% named ‘to be able to socialize’ as a key reason for wanting to participate in ET. The SHG platform created a safe and socio-culturally acceptable platform for women to socialize, share and learn from each other. Many participants during the focus groups spoke to how such activities instilled the value of sisterhood and solidarity.

“Our initial understanding was that we couldn't do anything with the little money that we may make from our small home-based businesses, such as tailoring or poultry. Then during business management services and Self-Help Group training, we started learning about our talents and capabilities, and when we applied our learning to practice and actually – selling eggs, yoghurt, milk, etc. we started believing in our skills and that we can also be useful.”

ET Participant, Bagram District, Kabul

A common story heard throughout the FGDs was that before this project, women were mostly depressed, and their mood was always negative about everything as they were confined to their homes and were not in touch with the outside world, which led them to think that they were not doing anything useful. Now, they leave home for the training and SHG meetings twice a month, and
it has changed their way of thinking about themselves and life. They feel happier and satisfied with life and willing to do something using the resources and talent they have. This mindset has positively impacted their behaviour at home with their husbands and children. They believe that their husbands may not even stop them from participating in such programmes even if it there is no financial gain. Many stated they and their families noticed the change in their behaviour and mood, which has resulted in a more pleasant family environment without conflict.

“Our mental condition has improved a lot and we now socialize with our neighbors and learn from one another. As housewives, we were at home all the time and it was very depressing. It has minimized the conflict and violence at home, and we are mostly busy in our classes and our enterprises.”

ET participant – Khulm District, Balkh

**Challenge 9**

Findings demonstrated that ET interventions were beginning to have an impact on challenge #9, females have limited engagement in decision-making in family and community.

“My sister-in-law took a 5000 AFN loan from SHG and together with her husband’s savings bought a baby cow for 21,000 AFN. After a few months, the cow can be sold for over 40,000 AFN and the family can make a profit of 19,000 AFN. My brother did not know what to do with his savings until his wife gave him this idea and she learned through SHG. I have seen him consulting with his wife on when and at what price to sell it.”

ET&EVC participant – Bagram District of Parwan

Based on the survey data from 224 participants, about 62% of women percentage of women being either decision-makers or consulted with has increased since joining the ET programme. For
instance, with respect to control over finances, around 62% women are being consulted with and more than 23% are decision makers. The below chart shows areas of decision-making the respondents said they are engaged with. They said since being involved in ET, they have become more involved in decisions involving money, civic engagement and their children’s health and education. Several women pointed out that now that they were earning their own income, they guaranteed resources were equally dedicated to their daughters, especially in such areas as education.

**Foundations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Elderly women having a higher status within the community and family</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Male family and community members whom currently demonstrate support for female empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>CDCs, or similar type group structures, being female led and co-led</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Male religious and community leaders such as Maliks, Mullah Imams, members of Jirga</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All the foundations speak to recognising and engaging certain groups and individuals that can be influential and support more effective programme interventions. These being elderly women, supportive male family and community members, CDCs, or similar group structures, that are either all female or mixed, and male religious and community leaders (Maliks, Mullah Imams, Jirga members). It should be noted that all these groups can also be defined under challenges, meaning they can work against female empowerment, but are being highlighted as foundations based on their potential to support. Findings did show that efforts were made to engage such groups and individuals, with both positive and negative results, but there is also opportunity for more strategic and intentional engagement in this area. Programme staff did intentionally engage influential community leaders, such as Maliks, Mullah Imams, and Village Shuras during the mobilisation & recruitment of 1,100 women. Most of the influential community leaders were very cooperative in providing security updates and training venues. It was also key that 12 female VEFs were hired from within the village to conduct training. This worked to ensure women’s participation and reduce absences.

The below comments show a level of engagement of men with mixed results, but there was no information found on the intentional engagement of elderly women and such groups as CDCs. This will be spoken to more in the recommendations section.

*"The Malik of Dowlat Shahi village created a scene when we wanted to interview females for teaching enterprises. He called us infidels and did not allow our male colleague to conduct the interviews."
ET Project Manager*

*"We talked with a religious leader, and he was a graduate of Sharia Faculty of Kabul University. He would argue that what is the need to have women and men get together at district and provincial level events. They would argue that according to Islam, it is not allowed for a woman to leave home and travel that far and mangle with men or even sit in the same hall."
CARE staff*
“The Malik of Dowlat Shahi village of Bagram district of Parwan did not allow our male colleague to participate in the recruitment of the women. He blamed us for not acting according to Islam and Afghan culture. The next day, he called me about his niece who was attending our training in Kabul. I politely asked him to allow his niece to participate since our male colleague is the trainer. He smiled and asked to forgive him. Once he realized that his sister’s family would benefit from this programme, then he offered his support. Otherwise, our staff and the women would face a challenge in accessing women, each time we would go to the village.”

ET Project Manager, Kabul

“The men brainstormed on the possibility of creating a similar structure like SHG where men save money for the community-related needs. They have realised that this is a very useful mechanism and can help all families in the village at times of need.”

ET Participant, Bagram District of Parwan

“I always knew the art of basket making from mud but couldn’t sell it in the village for its high price and design. After I learned about the market research, I went to Kartai e now and Shahre e now in Kabul and found several shops that showed interest in my baskets. I also learned about the market’s needs in terms of color and designs. It has been a few months since I regularly supply the baskets to shops in Kabul. As the villagers could not afford to buy the baskets, I rent them for 500 AFN to them. My husband is a driver and makes only 10,000 AFN per month. When my son started university, I had to sell my cooker pressure to pay his transportation cost. Now, I am happy that the money I receive from selling baskets, I pay the transportation cost of my son. My husband and son accompany me when I go to Kabul, and they are a great support.”

42 years old woman from Bagram district of Kabul province.

**Project Sustainability**

Though positive impact is being seen in economic empowerment, findings showed more focus needed on sustainability. Comments such as the ones below were received from several respondents.

“I strongly believe that a 2-year timeframe will not yield the desired result. We leave women on their own at a time they start applying the gained business skills and may face a lot of technical challenges and barriers. Of the 1,100 participants, I think only 200 or so will be able to run their businesses without our support.” Anonymous

“The 20 chickens that are provided in the toolkit require more effort to sustain than the profit they provide. This profitability further decreases if 3 or 4 die which is common. In such cases, the husband may not support since the business is not profitable and thus not worth her abandoning her other responsibilities. Is whether it is worth it given the reality that her responsibilities have increased and disrupted the family responsibility she used to have. If it is not very profitable and does not have the market, then naturally, the family will give up and prefer to at least take care of her children and household chores rather than spend time on a business that is not profitable.”

Shura Member – Khulm district of Balkh

“A woman has a pasta business and it is very tasty and clean. However, my wife makes it too. So here comes the challenge of finding the market. In addition, one has to take care of its color, shape, taste,
based on the needs of the market. Would it be possible for a woman without further technical and financial assistance to continue?”

Influential Community Leader – Khulm District of Balkh

“The tailoring and embroidery enterprises may sustain but not enterprises such as poultry, livestock, and food processing as they may face the issue of market saturation, access to potential markets, technical and financial assistance such as packaging and sanitation and vaccination.”

Shura – Balkh

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

**Recommendation 1 – Expansion of mechanisms for economic empowerment**

Expand the mechanisms being used to support women’s economic empowerment. These include:

1. Family approach to business
2. Employability, not only owning a business
3. Recognition of current labour inputs that are not paid or counted

These recommendations are expanded upon below:

**Family Approach to Business**

When seeking family support, consider opportunities where both a brother/sister, husband/wife, and even a mother-in-law/daughter-in-law team could be beneficiaries, which could lead to increased acceptance and support by the family and community overall.

Data did show three mothers-in-law were participants of the programme, but they joined as individuals, not in a team approach with daughters-in-law. Findings show the significant role mothers-in-law play in household decision-making and management. There are cases of mothers-in-law being abusive to daughters-in-law, especially if they feel their power threatened. Through having them work as a team, a focus can be placed on relationship building that can demonstrate how working together can be of economic and social value for the family unit.

Similarly, teaming with male family members for certain aspects of the programme, can be of great value. For example, similar to how mothers-in-law have more influence and mobility, so do men. Having a focus on brother/sister or husband/wife teams can support increased mobility, specifically with accessing remote markets, as well work toward greater acceptance for females to engage in more business type roles within the society. Such an approach still will need to be designed in a manner that the men and mothers-in-law do not take over in full. This will depend on awareness training and management approaches the programme develops. Having the extended family buy-in, can result in a change in mindset as to defined gender roles, where family members may offer support across expected gender roles to balance time and labour demands of female participants. Furthermore, with the extended family having a better understanding of the aims and benefits of such a programme, this can work to reduce family tension that may have arisen due to the female participant attempting to participate in the program alone. Findings also showed that many teenage
children were knowledgeable of social media and used it on a regular basis, even with the limited technology access in rural areas. Additionally, many of the children had higher literacy levels than their mothers. Recognising this speaks to the potential value of engaging teenage children of female participants to support their mothers in areas requiring language and technology skill sets.

“I get updates about the new trends and designs in clothing from my son’s Facebook. He has a Facebook page and find the info that I need.”

ET participant, Bagram District of Parwan

It must be noted, that there are numerous examples of similar development programmes negatively impacting men, thus negatively impacting women. It is common knowledge that financial opportunity is also limited for men across the country. If a woman within a household is earning more than the man, who may or may not be working, this can result in the male confidence level being deflated and the man feeling disempowered. There have been situations where this has led to domestic violence. Moreover, comments demonstrated that many men felt if the woman was not actively bringing in an income, then it was a waste of her time to participate in any training or advocacy program; therefore, she should be staying home focusing on her household responsibilities. This speaks to the need for awareness and education for both male and female family members. A family approach can work toward preventing such a scenario.

Employability

Findings demonstrated that it is not feasible to expect 1,100 females to establish and have long-term sustainable successful enterprises. For this reason, the programme could also focus on skills and knowledge that will increase female employability. The programme can still work toward economic empowerment for the target beneficiaries in a manner that results in them earning an income through other means than establishing their own business.

Recognition of current labour inputs that are not paid or counted

Findings show that much of the labour women are engaged with, whether it be on-farm labour or household and childcare, it is not counted and is not paid. This has resulted in such work being seen as holding no value. If one looks at the number of hours a man vs a woman contributes to their daily labour, it can be seen that male labour is counted and paid; therefore, a lot more value is placed on his work. For example, women working on the farm have primary responsibility for seedling, harvesting and livestock, yet they are not directly paid for their work. The man of the household tends to be the one taking the products to market to sell, hence receives the money; therefore, he is given recognition for earning the income, not the woman. In some cases, the woman may even spend more time with on-farm labour compared to the man, but still it is the man that receives the title of farmer and the recognition that his work is what led to the financial earnings. It will be impactful if the programme can focus on strategy that works towards having such existing female labour counted and paid.

Recommendation 2 – Formally Register Associations
Associations will be established in 2020 as a mechanism to help women with accessing markets and selling products in bulk. According to the HiH staff, the associations will not be registered with the government, which is problematic as it poses the following challenges:

- If the associations are not registered with the government, then they are limited in the loans they were qualify for. This limits their credibility.
- If the associations are not registered with the government, this will limit access to information on the exhibitions and trade shows because the government will neither inform nor endorse them.

The below comment demonstrates the value in belonging to an association and the above points speak to the importance of properly registering them with the government.

“In Balkh province, we have an enterprise in beekeeping, and it did not have market inside the village/district so they became members of an association that helped them with labelling and packaging. The products are more marketable if they are nicely labelled and packaged. If a woman takes a few bottles of honey to stores, then nobody would take it. But if an association takes 50 bottles to a store with nicely labelled and packaged then, of course, they can trust and sell it.”

Local Shura Member – Khulm District of Balkh

It is recommended that the associations be formally registered through proper government channels to avoid such challenges as stated above. Additionally, more of a review needs to be done on how these associations will be sustainable once the programme ends in terms of management and the mobility required to participate.

**Recommendation 3 – Strengthened monitoring of female time and labour inputs**

Though timing and labour inputs were considered, as referenced above, there is a need to monitor the effects of programme time and labour requirements on female participants to a greater extent moving forward for several reasons. With the increased number of hours and work required for managing a new enterprise, would the women be able to manage this long-term without programme support? Currently, their responses could have been influenced simply by the mindset that they do not want to say anything negative for fear of not being able to participate in the programme. Also, another reason for such a positive response is that the programme is still at the beginning, meaning time and labour requirements will greatly increase as the programme moves forward. If a woman is adding hours to her work schedule and her existing daily responsibilities are staying the same, will this ultimately work toward disempowerment as opposed to empowerment? Monitoring should track if programme interventions have affected the women’s expected daily role and has their traditional daily role changed in any manner. One example would be, has she been freed up from one commitment, such as house cleaning, that could take her a few hours, in order that she can now focus on business development? There is a need to monitor if her health is being ultimately affected by working too much.

It must be recognised that there are situations that have shown that increasing a woman’s current work-day from 10 to 12 hours has led to her being less productive and feeling over-burdened. Also, this increased time away from family activities can lead to resentment from male family members,
which in some circumstances has led to domestic violence. These are possible examples of negative impacts. It is critical that time and labour inputs and impacts be monitored through the life of the programme.

**Recommendation 4 – Social integrity as criteria for hiring of VEFs**

The social integrity of VEFs and field staff is as important as their educational and professional experience. The programme may further focus on hiring trainers from within the community, yet the criteria should not only be based on their educational levels, rather their personal integrity and acceptance among community members must be assessed. This is crucial to ET’s ability to gain trust and acceptance from the community.

**Recommendation 5 – Improved work planning to consider gender/social inclusion (GSI)**

It is highly recommended that the programme conduct a review on their current work planning approach. The consultancy team did not see in the documentation a proper work plan that showed activities linked to log frames, which linked to activities, time frames, responsibilities and GSI analysis. Proper work planning can significantly support the design of programme activities that better consider engagement and impact on beneficiaries based on identity factors. A work planning tool was demonstrated during the Gender Training for the staff, so this may be considered as a tool to utilize and/or adapt moving forward. This work planning also needs to consider programme close-out and transition, as to whether mechanisms have been established that will support the sustainability of programme interventions once close-out has occurred. The analysis spoke to several areas, such as security, that will limit the participants ability to continue their work once the programme ends.

**Recommendation 6 – Increased engagement of influential individuals/groups**

Findings did show engagement of influential community leaders, such as Maliks and Jirgas throughout programme design and implementation. This approach should be continued and built upon. The ‘Family Approach’ speaks to some of this in terms of engaging male family members and mothers-in-law to a greater extent, but also work planning should seek opportunities to engage other influential groups and individuals referenced earlier in the discussion on Foundations. This would not only be engagement in terms of logistical support, but also consideration for awareness sessions that can focus on issues such as women’s rights, as well as some of the other key topics of both programmes whether this be a female’s constitutional rights or her engagement in the economic sector. This will work toward more effective programming, as well as influencing changes in mindset, thus moving in a gender transformative manner.

**Recommendation 7 – Increased programme timeframe and staffing**

A 5-year timeframe is recommended in order to ensure a livelihood intervention that yield desirable results and have sustained long-term impact.

Incorporate a follow-up intervention/mechanism where the 12 VEFs, if not the entire staff, continue working with participants as mentors in the following ways:
Serve as a source of inspiration and hope for women in the village;
Continue mentoring and providing technical advice and hands-on training to women especially in the areas of market linkages and access to information and capacity building opportunities;
Connect them with public institutions such as Women’s Affairs Directorate so that they can participate in exhibitions and trade fairs.
Add additional staff and activities such as the one referenced below.

Recruit two Market Researchers, individuals that can be well-networked with female-owned businesses in Kabul and other urban centers. Such positions could provide the services below:

- Provide updated market information on the selected enterprises;
- Inform women of the potential marketing platforms such as exhibitions and trade fairs: exact venue, sponsorship, and scholarship opportunities;
- Share information on potential shops, vendors that may buy products from the female business owners;
- Support attendance at exhibitions through helping with registration and facilitate the participation of women in the exhibitions through sponsorships;
- Marketing, networking and referring businesses at the national and international levels through identifying brands in Kabul and overseas that could use the services/products of the female business owners;
- Establish and facilitate loan mechanisms;
- Support additional financial and technical support through other development programmes focusing on women-owned businesses such as PROMOTE (Women in Economy).
- Develop and manage a Facebook page.

The 5-year timeframe and the aforementioned recommendations will provide women with the opportunity and space to practice business development skills, build confidence, specifically in the area of communication and negotiation with potential clients and customers; established market connections and ensure family and community endorsement.

Recommendations EVC

The section below provides nine recommendations for the EVC programme to consider during its final year of implementation. Each recommendation is presented first, followed by the findings which led to said recommendation.

1. **Recommendation: Guarantee safe and separate training and meeting facilities for female participants at the village level.**

**Brief description:** Survey data demonstrates that mobility outside of village limits female participation in program activities. 66 out of 75 participants responded to the question: How would you rank your mobility with respect to village, district, provincial and central level? These responses demonstrate that women felt they were most limited in attending provincial and central level meetings due to mobility limitations, which are a result of security concerns, as well as social norms which do not allow women to travel independently.
**Brief description:** 2 FGDs with women enrolled in EVC and both EVC&ET conducted in Parwan and Kabul brought to light that female participants felt more secure and more confident to engage in discussions when meetings were held at the village level and in all-female environments. They pointed to the cluster and interface meetings EVC sponsored at the district and provincial levels as examples of environments they did not feel comfortable in. A few female respondents said they lied to their relatives and neighbors about attending these meetings since it would potentially impact their reputation. Moreover, many said that although they wore burqas to keep their identity anonymous, they were not comfortable speaking up because if the males in the group heard their voice or their situation, they would easily be able to identify who they are. Important to note that this challenge was not raised in discussions with female participants during the FGD conducted in Balkh.

“*The female participants of EVC in Parwan face a lot of challenges when traveling to district and provincial level interphase and advocacy cluster meetings. To avoid being harshly judged and accused of loose character, they lie to the relatives and neighbors about the purpose of the trip. They say that they went for medical or shopping.*

EVC/CARE HQ M&E Officer

**Brief description:** During 3 FGDs in Kabul and Parwan, female participants spoke to how someone from their families, normally their mothers, mothers-in-law or grandmothers, went to inspect the facility prior to giving permission for them to attend an event.

2. **Recommendation:** Increased consideration of existing schedules and commitments of male participants when scheduling meetings/trainings.

**Brief description:** Discussions with EVC implementing partner staff in 2 KIIIs pointed out one main challenge they experienced with male participation is that the meetings and trainings were held during the same hours as the men were working, hence would lose money. They went on to say that the programme provided 150 AFG for each participant to attend, yet husbands were stating their earnings during this time period would be around 300-600 AFG; therefore, it was of more value to work verses attending the meetings. This speaks to timing of meetings/trainings.

3. **Recommendation:** Provide transportation allowances prior to meeting/training or provide a taxi/bus for female participants so no need to pay the participant directly.

**Brief description:** Female participants spoke to the challenge of having to use their own money for transportation to attend the meetings/trainings and although they were reimbursed after the event, it was a challenge for them to either come up with the money on their own or get permission from their husbands to use family money.
4. **Recommendation: Men engagement – build awareness within Islamic, international and Afghan law and policy context on women’s rights and value.**

**Brief description:** To a certain extent, men are engaged in EVC programming, but this is limited. Influential community leaders and CDCs are engaged throughout the programme implementation. The decisions of the Informal customary structures such as Jirgas, which are all male members, are monitored by the CAG members. Though these actions are taken, barriers were identified. 2 FGDs in Parwan and Kabul with EVC participants spoke to how the CAGs had limited communication with Jirgas, who are the main conflict resolution entity within the village, and they felt once EVC is complete, the Jirgas will no longer engage with them. With the Jirgas being a key entity for community decision making, especially in the area of conflict resolution, the female participants felt it is necessary to build a stronger relationship with them and establish mechanisms where they can engage that will be sustainable post EVC.

**Brief description:** Female participants in 2 FGDs in Kabul and Parwan spoke to how they learned of their rights through EVC, but recognition of their rights and values was still limited by their husbands and fathers. They felt that if the male members of their families were engaged in formal presentations through EVC to learn the value and rights of women, that they would understand better. Moreover, the rights of females spoken to in the Quran are often misinterpreted and based on this, females are limited in decision-making in the community and family. Not only do females need to know and understand their rights in a national and Islamic context, but so do the male members of the community.

5. **Increased effort to engage CDCs and other established structures that already have female members.**

**Brief description:** The original program National Solidarity Program (NSP) established 3 types of CDCs: all female, all male, and mixed male and female. Often international and national organizations tended to ignore engagement with the all-female CDCs. In 2016, the World Bank started the implementation of the Citizens Charter project. This was meant to build upon the foundation built under NSP and take more of a system approach, rather than a project approach. EVC will not have control programmatically over such programs, but there are areas they can focus on that will strengthen and support this work:

- Membership is already established for each type of CDC in each district. These lists can be collected from MRRD. EVC can strengthen female-only CDCs by first recognizing their existence. They can make an effort to engage with them, which will provide validation. Moreover, they can sincerely coordinate with them to hear their voices and integrate their views into programming.
- Coordinate with relevant Ministries, such as MRRD, to learn how they can further support the efforts of the Citizens Charter through their role as an international/national organization advocating for community development needs and women’s rights.
- The EVC staff during KIIs confirmed that women will continue advocating and resolving problems at family and village level even after the EVC ends. However, women will face challenges continue advocating at community level due to limited mobility, accessibility to
government and other institutions, and high transportation cost. The ones who are members of CDCs and other formal and informal governance institutions may continue to advocate and have an influential voice. That is why it is important that CAG members are encouraged to seek membership of institutions such as CDCs as it provides a formal and legal space to have a voice and influence decision making and problem-solving processes at community level. On the other hand, EVC can further facilitate this membership through introducing the CAG members to formal and informal governance institutions.

“Through EVC programme, women have the knowledge, skills, and capacity to advocate for their rights and priority needs; however, what completes this process is ensuring a formal and legal space for women. For instance, in the monthly provincial meetings, there is no mandate that calls for women’s participation. Citizens’ charter is another good platform for women that can have a meaningful voice and influence with respect to community development projects.”

Project Manager – CARE, Kabul, Afghanistan

6. **Recommendation:** Increase engagement and linkages of government officials and female participants for advocacy efforts.

**Brief description:** Based on conversations from 8 KIIIs with CARE and its implementing partners for the EVC programme, government officials are engaged during programme activities, but to a limited extent. What tends to happen is that the community develops action plans and then presents to the Government. The Government more often than not claims they do not have the budget to address such needs. One approach that could make this more an effective process for both the community and the government is to start the communication between the two at a much earlier phase. EVC can help facilitate such meetings between community and government. It will be key that the community understands the government’s budget limitations and where they can or cannot allocate funding. It is also critical that the government understands the community priority needs. Through having such an early on understanding prior to budget finalization, there is potential that the available budget and community needs will be better aligned.

* It should be noted that it is key that EVC first set-up an initial meeting with the relevant government Ministries and donor to see how they best can support such efforts referenced in recommendations 5 and 6. These specific actions were outside the scope of work for this specific gender analysis.

7. **Recommendation:** Encourage and provide tools for female participants to spread the gained knowledge on rights and advocacy among other communities. Findings demonstrate this is taking place, but there is opportunity to formalize the process. The programme could provide the female participants with tools and strategies for sharing their knowledge on rights and advocacy to a greater extent.

**Brief description:** During 3 FGDs with EVC participants in Kabul, Parwan and Balkh, women felt they were able to share their newly learned knowledge with their children, husbands and community. This was done simply through everyday conversations. This speaks to greater programme impact that more than direct beneficiaries are gaining value.
8. Advocacy efforts need to be further framed within an Islamic context and expand outreach of messaging beyond programme participants.

Brief description: Conversation in 3 FGDs with EVC participants in Kabul, Parwan and Balkh did agree that advocacy lessons were framed in an Islamic context, but that there exists space to expand this framing and reach of this message. Often Mullah Imams are preaching and making decisions based on misinterpretations of Islam, as well as ignoring national law. Specifically, 2 FGDs with influential community leaders in Balkh and Kabul stated that the programme did a good job of including religions scholars, such as Mullahs, as well as coordinating with the Ministry of Hajj. With that said, they also felt that coordination with Mullahs was limited when engaging with those that are not formally registered with the Ministry of Hajj because there was no authority having oversight on them. They said more often than not, it was the unregistered Mullahs that were not teaching in accordance with Islam, yet spoke to an Islamic principle as reason for not supporting such programmes as EVC.

9. Economic empowerment of female participants is key to ensure regular and active participation of women in advocacy efforts at district and provincial level and boost their confidence and influence in decisions at household level.

### Staff Training: Gender Sensitive Case Study

GIMC designed and delivered a two-day training for nine staff members of HiH Afghanistan and CARE Afghanistan on gender mainstreaming and gender sensitive qualitative data collection, with a focus on how to develop a case study. This took place in Kabul on 15-16 October 2019. The training agenda can be viewed in Annex H. All training material was shared on 21 October with HiH Afghanistan and CARE Afghanistan.

The initial data collection efforts supported the development of the training materials, specifically the KIIs that were done with the CARE and HiH Afghanistan senior level staff. It was noted that though there was a range of understanding as to gender overall, the majority of staff, specifically the M&E and VEFs, had limited knowledge on the focused training topics. Considering that the latter two groups were most involved in data collection, as well as responsible for the writing of case studies and success stories, it was critical the training target their starting level.

As can be noted in the agenda, the training covered a wide range of gender related topics, in the hopes that those in attendance would have a better understanding of how to do their work moving forward through a gender lens. All participants were highly engaged, even to the extent that both sessions went over the end time. Positive comments were received from senior and junior level staff.

After the training, the trainees verbally commented on the following:

- This was the first time they saw the gender continuum and found it very helpful in understanding where their current project fit along this continuum.
The training was practical in that it will help in the future with designing questions for any data collection effort.

They now understood the difference between a case study and a success story.

The exercises were very practical, and they had never done such types of exercises. This really helped with understanding gender and gender mainstreaming.

Here are some recommendations for staff training:

- There was a significant difference in the level of understanding of training topics among the staff. Recommendations for the future would be to divide the groups based on their level, if budget and time allow. If budget and time do not allow, there are a couple of approaches that could be taken to bring more value to the training. A general introduction still will be done to guarantee all participants are at least starting the session with the same knowledge level. The exercises could be varied so that those with greater knowledge are given more challenging exercises. Another approach is to mix the more knowledgeable participants with those who have had less exposure to these topics, so that they can provide support in the facilitation.
- The timing of two days was limiting with the amount of material needing to be covered. If budget and time allows, a five-day training would be better. With that said, if time and budget do not allow, then it is key that a formal plan is agreed upon prior to the completion of the training. This plan would allow each organization to set targets on how they will continue similar training in the future, as well focus on institutionalizing new practices and processes into their day to day work that allow all staff to better be able to consider gender mainstreaming in their project design and implementation roles.
- Based on the above two recommendations, it is strongly suggested that a follow-up session be carried out with the staff to assess how they are incorporating the training into their work moving forward, keeping the focus on the type of position each staff is in and what gender mainstreaming means for that specific position. If they are not doing this, then there should be a staff member appointment to guarantee this takes place, whether it be at the level of work planning, reporting, or simply day-to-day interactions.

**Constraints**

This section explains the constraints experienced by the Research Team (RT) during the consultancy:

**Timeline:** The original deliverable timeline was found to be short and limiting. This challenge was discussed with HiH Afghanistan and the deliverable due date was extended by one-month. Specifically, for data collection, the originally proposed timeline of two weeks was found to be unrealistic, when considering security, geographic target areas and the presidential campaign activities taking place. Data collection required more than a one-month timeframe.

**Literacy/Education Levels:** The literacy level of the survey participants (interviewees) was low. To address this challenge, the enumerators verbalized the survey questions to each participant then recorded their responses in writing. The enumerators recorded exact phrasing and did not
paraphrase. Furthermore, since not all participants spoke the same language, questions were translated into the participants’ native language, which was Dari.

Security: The security situation in Afghanistan is complex and unstable. On 17 September 2019, an explosion took place in President Ashraf Ghani’s campaign in Chahrikar, Parwan, on this same day, the FGD was scheduled with EVC participants. Many of the participants who came from Parwan province were concerned about the safety of their family and friends in the vicinity of the explosion and for this reason, the FGD was interrupted and ended early. There was another FGD planned for the following day, 18 September, in Kabul, with Shura members from Parwan and Kabul provinces in which five Shura members from Parwan province were not able to attend, because they were taking care of those that were injured or had died in the explosion. Moreover, restrictions on movements and security lock-down negatively impact the project implementation.

Potential Bias: The Survey was carried-out by the Village Enterprise Facilitators (VEFs), who were technically HiH staff in the ET programme. The RT trusts that the VEFs accurately captured the responses of the participants, and that they did not provide any input to the survey participants that would have influenced their responses.
# Annexes

Annex A. Survey Questionnaire: Enterprise Today (ET) Programme

Instructions:
- Please put a tick the box next to the answer of your choice or write in the space provided as the case maybe.
- Circle your answers for Multiple Choice Questions.
- Please describe your response in one sentence, if you circle ‘other” option.
- Please enter your responses clean and clear.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Which programme (s) are you a participant of:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. How did you hear about the programme?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Paper Flyer Advertisement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Radio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ TV</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Family member: __________ Relation: __________</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Friend</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Co-Worker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Other (explain):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Did someone encourage you to join the programme?</strong></td>
<td>□ Yes □ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a. If yes, who encouraged you to join (relation to you)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Family member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Friend</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Co-worker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Other (Describe)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. What was the reason you joined the programme?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Career development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ In the hopes of producing an income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ To be able to socialize</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ A family member or friend was joining</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Other (Describe)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Are other family members attendees as well?</strong></td>
<td>□ Yes □ No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5a. If so who:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. What are the barriers and challenges you face as a woman establishing your own business or working?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Mobility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Technical and Logistic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Harmful cultural norms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Are you attending business management training and similar themes as part of any other intervention programme?  □ Yes  □ No

7a. If yes, please share name of the programme and sponsor

8. Type of knowledge and skills gained during training sessions:
   □ Basic numeracy and literacy
   □ Business management
   □ Market linkages and value addition
   □ Micro finance
   □ Basic Bookkeeping
   □ Network building
   □ Leadership
   □ Other (Describe):

9. A. How many training sessions on business management skills did you attend?  ____ (number)

   B. How often did you attend?
   □ Weekly
   □ Bi-weekly
   □ Monthly
   □ Bi-monthly
   □ Quarterly
   □ Other (Describe)

10. A. Are you a member of a self-help group (SHG)?  □ Yes  □ No

    B. What is your position/role in the SHG?
    C. Have you received training in Group Management as a member of the SHG?
    D. How much money have you saved through the SGH since the start of the programme?

11. Are you a member of any other associations?  □ Yes  □ No

    A. If yes, were you a member before or after enrollment in the ET programme(s)?
       □ Before enrollment in ET  □ After enrollment in ET

    B. As a member, have you attended the meetings and events?  □ Yes  □ No
### 12. Who is responsible for earning an income for your household?

### 13. Were you working before attending this programme? If yes, how much did you earn?

### 14. As a result of participating in the ET programme, have you been able to earn an income for your family?  
- [ ] Yes  
- [ ] No

   A. If yes, were you able to establish your own enterprise?  
   - [ ] Yes  
   - [ ] No
   B. Name the type of your enterprise?
   C. How much do you earn as an average monthly enterprise income?
   D. Were you able to work for another enterprise and earn a salary?
   E. How much do you earn as an average monthly salary?
   F. Has this new job (enterprise OR wage labor) changed your level of household responsibility? (such as labor and time commitment, decision making)

### 15. Which of the below difficulties do you face in accessing market and expanding customer base for your products? (you may tick more than one box, if necessary)
- [ ] Limited knowledge about potential markets
- [ ] High transportation cost (outside village/district)
- [ ] Mobility
- [ ] Socio-cultural norms
- [ ] Others (Describe):

### 16. How often do you leave the house per week?
- [ ] None
- [ ] 1-3 times
- [ ] 4-6 times
- [ ] 6 plus

### 17. What are the main reasons for leaving the house?
- [ ] Participation in meetings and events – ET programme
- [ ] Shopping
- [ ] Visiting neighbor
- [ ] Visiting family, friends, neighbor
- [ ] Other (Describe)
18. With respect to mobility, which of the following is more constraining:

- Family member: Husband
- Family member: Mother-in law
- Family member: (other)
- Society
- Other (Explain)

19. Which types and level of decisions are you involved in within your family:

A. Control over financial assets (money) and how it is spent

- Decision Maker
- Consulted With
- Informed of the Decision
- None

B. Ownership and control over capital assets (land, animals, inheritance)

- Decision Maker
- Consulted With
- Informed of the Decision
- None

C. Family wellbeing (in particular children’s education & health)

- Decision Maker
- Consulted With
- Informed of the Decision
- None

D. Participation in social, political and economic events

- Decision Maker
- Consulted With
- Informed of the Decision
- None

E. Locations you travel to when leave the house

- Decision Maker
Gender Analysis Timeline: Fill in the table below listing the daily activities you carry-out during each time span. Also, list the same for the head male in your household.

### Female Daily Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5:00am-11:00am</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00am-4:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00pm-9:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00pm-11:59pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Male Daily Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5:00am-11:00am</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00am-4:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00pm-9:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00pm-11:59pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Annex B. Survey Questionnaire: Every Voice Counts (EVC) Programme

**Instructions:**

- Please put a tick the box next to the answer of your choice or write in the space provided as the case maybe.
- Circle your answers for Multiple Choice Questions.
- Please describe your response in one sentence, if you circle ‘other” option.
- Please enter your responses clean and clear.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20. Which programme(s) are you a participant of:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Did someone encourage you to join the programme? □ Yes □ No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a. If yes, who encouraged you to join (relation to you)?</td>
<td>□ Family member □ Friend □ Co-worker □ Other (Describe)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. What was the reason you joined the programme?</td>
<td>□ Understand about your rights □ Be a voice for women in your community □ Hold accountable government institutions □ To be able to socialize □ A family member or friend was joining □ Other (Describe)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Are other family members attendees as well? □ Yes □ No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5a. If so who:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. What are the barriers and challenges you face as a woman attending human rights and advocacy related meetings and events at village, district and provincial level?</td>
<td>□ Mobility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Options</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Cost</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical and Logistic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social norms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My family doesn’t value my participation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (Describe)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6A. How would you rank your mobility with respect to:

- Village Level
- District Level
- Provincial Level
- Central Level: Kabul

26. Are you attending Human Rights and Women’s Rights trainings as part of any other programme?  □ Yes  □ No

7a. If yes, please share name of the programme and sponsor

27. Type of knowledge and skills gained during training sessions:

- Human Rights
- Human Rights from Islamic Perspective
- Women’s Rights
- Social Advocacy Skills
- Network building
- Leadership
- Other (Describe):

28. A. How many training sessions on Human Rights and Social Advocacy did you attend?  
   ____ (number)

   B. How often did you attend?
   - Weekly
   - Bi-weekly
   - Monthly
   - Bi-monthly
   - Quarterly
   - Other (Describe)

29. A. Are you a member of the Community Advocacy Group (CAG)?  □ Yes  □ No

   B. What is your position/role in the CAG?
   C. Have you received training in advocacy, network building and leadership as a member of CAG?
### D. How many community priority needs did you identify and address through CAG?

### E. How many problems did you resolve or took part in through CAG?

### F. Has this responsibility and participation created a conflict within your family?

### G. Would you continue working and advocating for your community’s problems as a member of CAG once the project ends?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30. Are you a member of community level groups such as Shura, Jirga?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. If yes, were you a member before or after enrollment in the EVC programme(s)?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Before enrollment in EVC</td>
<td>☐ After enrollment in EVC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>31. Have you attended Community Scoring Card?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Was your issue resolved?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Yes</td>
<td>☐ No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Who helped you resolve the issue?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32. Have you attended any Social Audit activity?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. If yes, which was it related to?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Do you see any benefit to you, your family and community?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Yes</td>
<td>☐ No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Would you take part in such activity once the project ends?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Yes</td>
<td>☐ No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>33. With regards to women related issues &amp; conflicts, which of the below institutions play a key role:</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Courts</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Jirgas</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Shuras</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Religious Scholars and Mullahs</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Family</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Others (Describe):</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34. Are you aware of the roles and responsibilities of the below formal and informal governance institutions?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Community Development Councils (CDCs)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. District Development Assemblies (DDAs)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Village Shuras</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>35. How often do you leave the house per week?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ None</td>
<td>☐ 1-3 times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ 4-6 times</td>
<td>☐ 6 plus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>36. What are the main reasons for leaving the house?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Participation in meetings and events – EVC programme</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CAG related advocacy activities</td>
<td>Shopping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

37. With respect to mobility, which of the following is more constraining:

- Family member: Husband
- Family member: Mother-in-law
- Family member: (other)
- Society
- Other (Explain)

38. Which types and level of decisions are you involved in within your family:

A. Control over financial assets (money) and how it is spent
   - Decision Maker
   - Consulted With
   - Informed of the Decision
   - None

B. Ownership and control over capital assets (land, animals, inheritance)
   - Decision Maker
   - Consulted With
   - Informed of the Decision
   - None

C. Family wellbeing (in particular children’s education & health)
   - Decision Maker
   - Consulted With
   - Informed of the Decision
   - None

D. Participation in social, political and economic events
   - Decision Maker
   - Consulted With
   - Informed of the Decision
   - None

E. Locations you travel to when leave the house
   - Decision Maker
   - Consulted With
   - Informed of the Decision
   - None

F. Type of food family eats
   - Decision Maker
Gender Analysis Timeline: Fill in the table below listing the daily activities you carry-out during each time span. Also, list the same for the head male in your household

### Female Daily Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5:00am-11:00am</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00am-4:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00pm-9:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00pm-11:59pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Male Daily Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5:00am-11:00am</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00am-4:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00pm-9:00pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00pm-11:59pm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex C. KII Questionnaire – ET Programme

The questions developed are intended for ET senior staff and stakeholders and are based on below four objectives of KII’s and in line with the research sub-questions:

1. To understand localized gender and social norms
2. To understand social, political and economic conditions of programme target regions
3. To assess the project approaches and mechanisms with relation to gender in order to address whether gender issues and norms are addressed appropriately across all activities
4. Assess knowledge and understanding of staff in terms of gender and gender mainstreaming

General Demographics

- Name:
- Sex:
- Age:
- Ethnicity:
- Languages (mother tongue and other languages spoken):
- Province where you currently live:
- Marital Status?
- Education level:
- Religion:
- Position/ Occupation:

1. How do you define gender?
2. How do you define gender mainstreaming?
3. How do you define social inclusion?
4. What are the key daily responsibilities of females compared to males in the programme target regions? Do identity factors affect these responsibilities? (age, ethnicity, socio-economic status, disability)
5. Within the family unit, who has most control on the following: family finances, children’s health, meal planning, children’s education and etc.
6. Are there significant differences within the programme target provinces in terms of social, political and economic factors? If yes, what are these? If yes, how has the programme considered such differences in their approach?
7. How has project design considered the differing needs of females’ vs males in terms of time, mobility, and education?
8. How do you define social and economic empowerment? Please elaborate on the basis of identify factors such as:
   a. Sex – male vs. female
   b. Education
   c. Socio-economic Status
d. Disability  
e. Ethnicity  
f. Age

9. How would gaining employment and contributing to the family income affect the factors below for both males and females?
   a. Self-confidence  
   b. Participation at village and district level community events  
   c. Control and authority over capital assets (money), productive assets (land, education)  
   d. Decision-making in the family  
   e. Other – Explain

10. Do females and males have equal access to educational, economic, capacity building opportunities? If not, how do they differ? How do identity factors affect this access?

11. In the program target regions, can you rank the list below in order of who has most decision-making power? How does this dynamic impact programme design and implementation?
   a. ----- Husband  
   b. ----- Wife  
   c. ----- Male child  
   d. ----- Female child  
   e. ----- Mother-in-law  
   f. ----- Father-in-law

12. Describe your level of involvement with the Enterprise Today Programme?

13. What is the recruitment process for the self-help and saving groups? Is there anything you would change to improve recruitment based on your experience thus far?

14. What are barriers and challenges women face in your community to start and run an enterprise? How has the programme addressed such challenges in design and implementation? (Q1, 2, 3)

15. With respect to women’s decision to start and manage an enterprise, are they the sole decision maker or do they seek approval from a family member? If so, who do they consult? (Q1)

16. In your view, how do the start-up kits help females successfully start and manage their enterprise? Is there anything you would change about these kits based on your experience thus far? (Q3)

17. Have the following supported opening up economic opportunities for women? If yes, how? If no, what are the main blocks? (Q2)
   a. CDCs and DDAs  
   b. Local Village Shuras  
   c. Government Ministries at district and provincial level
18. How do you assess the performance of relevant public institutions in your community with regards to public service delivery?

19. Do the interventions list below under the ET programme empower women in the areas of leadership, management, confidence building? If yes, why? If not, why?
   a. Self-help and Saving groups
   b. Associations
   c. Enterprise Set up and management

20. What changes have you noticed in the ET programme beneficiaries: within themselves, within their family, at community level?

21. How have women’s time and labor commitments been impacted based on programme interventions?

22. Have family or community dynamics been impacted based on programme interventions?

23. What would you recommend in order to further improve programme activities and ensure its conformity within local context?

24. How do you see the sustainability of the established enterprises and associations beyond programme life? What would you recommend ensuring sustainability?
Annex D. KII Questionnaire – EVC Programme

The questions developed are intended for EVC senior staff and stakeholders and are based on below four objectives of KIIs and in line with the research sub-questions:

1. To understand localized gender and social norms
2. To understand social, political and economic conditions of programme target regions
3. To assess the programme approaches and mechanisms with relation to gender in order to address whether gender issues and norms are addressed appropriately across all activities
4. Assess knowledge and understanding of staff in terms of gender and gender mainstreaming

General Demographics

- Name:
- Sex:
- Age:
- Ethnicity:
- Languages (mother tongue and other languages spoken):
- Province where you currently live:
- Marital Status:
- Education level:
- Religion:
- Position/ Occupation:

1. How do you define gender?
2. How do you define gender mainstreaming?
3. How do you define social inclusion?
4. What are the key daily responsibilities of females compared to males in the programme target regions? Do identity factors affect these responsibilities? (age, ethnicity, socio-economic status, disability)
5. Within the family unit, who has most control on the following: family finances, children’s health, meal planning, children’s education and etc.
6. Are there significant differences within the programme target provinces in terms of social, political and economic factors? If yes, what are these? If yes, how has the programme considered such differences in their approach?
7. How has project design considered the differing needs of females’ vs males in terms of time, mobility, and education?
8. How do you define social and political empowerment? Please elaborate on the basis of identify factors such as:
   a. Sex – male vs. female
   b. Education
   c. Socio-economic Status
d. Disability  
e. Ethnicity  
f. Age

9. How would gaining knowledge and understanding of human rights and advocacy skills affect the factors below for both males and females?
   a. Self-confidence  
   b. Participation at village and district level community events  
   c. Control and authority over capital assets (money), productive assets (land, education)  
   d. Participate in social audit and community score cards activities  
   e. Decision-making in the family  
   f. Other – Explain

10. Do females and males have equal access to educational, economic, capacity building opportunities? If not, how do they differ? How do identity factors affect this access?

11. In the program target regions, can you rank the list below in order of who has most decision-making power? How does this dynamic impact programme design and implementation?
   a. ----- Husband  
   b. ----- Wife  
   c. ----- Male child  
   d. ----- Female child  
   e. ----- Mother-in-law  
   f. ----- Father-in-law

12. Describe your level of involvement with Every Voice Counts Programme?

13. What is the recruitment process for the Advocacy Network group? Is there anything you would change to improve recruitment based on your experience thus far?

14. What are barriers and challenges women face in your community to participate in meetings and events of EVC? How has the project addressed such challenges in design and implementation?

15. With respect to women’s decision to engage in decision making and problem-solving processes at community level, are they the sole decision maker or they seek approval from a family member? If so, who do they consult?

16. In your view, how do the start-up kits help females successfully start and manage their enterprise? Is there anything you would change about these kits based on your experience thus far?

17. Have the following supported Social Audit and Community Score Cards involving women? If yes, how? If no, what are the main blocks?
   a. CDCs and DDAs
b. Local Village Shuras

c. Government Ministries at district and provincial level

18. How do you assess the performance of relevant public institutions in your community with regards to public service delivery?

19. Do the interventions list below under the EVC programme empower women in the areas of leadership, advocacy, confidence building? If yes, why? If not, why?
   a. Human Rights Training Sessions
   b. Community Advocacy Network Groups (CAG)
   c. District & Provincial level Advocacy Clusters
   d. Provincial level cluster events

20. What changes have you noticed in the EVC programme beneficiaries: within themselves, within their family, at community level?

21. How have women’s time and labor commitments been impacted based on programme interventions?

22. Have family or community dynamics been impacted based on programme interventions?

23. What would you recommend in order to further improve programme activities and ensure its conformity within local context?

24. How do you see the sustainability of the established enterprises and associations beyond programme life? What would you recommend ensuring sustainability?
## Annex E. List of KII Participants

### ET Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name of Institution</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date &amp; Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abdul Rahim Nasry</td>
<td>HiH Afghanistan</td>
<td>Country Director</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ahmad Kamran Hekmati</td>
<td>HiH Afghanistan</td>
<td>Program Manager - Balkh</td>
<td>Online - Skype from Balkh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Nasima Sahar</td>
<td>HiH Afghanistan</td>
<td>Project Manager - Kabul</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### EVC Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Name of Institution</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date &amp; Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abdul Wakil Nayeb</td>
<td>CARE Afghanistan</td>
<td>Senior Program Coordinator</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Abdul Ahad Nawabi</td>
<td>CARE Afghanistan</td>
<td>Program Manager</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ezatullah Wadid</td>
<td>CARE Afghanistan</td>
<td>Field Technical Officer</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Samira Aslamzada</td>
<td>AWRC</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sultan Ali Rahimi</td>
<td>WCLRF</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Amanullah Aman</td>
<td>HRRAC</td>
<td>Program Manager</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Shekiba Safi</td>
<td>HRRAC</td>
<td>Community Mobilizer</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Mariam</td>
<td>CARE Afghanistan</td>
<td>M&amp;E Officer</td>
<td>Kabul, Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex F. FGD Questionnaire

The questions below are intended for focused group discussions of both ET and EVC participants and serve as a guide for the discussion. Each participant will be asked to fill out Basic Demographic Form.

1. How do you assess the effectiveness of ET and EVC programmes with regards to the areas below: If yes, why? If not, why? What else needs to be done?
   a. Decision making processes at household level
   b. Leadership and problem-solving opportunities
   c. Legal Rights and Access
   d. Control and ownership over assets (financial, capital, productive)
   e. Participation and Advocacy

We will ask participants a list of questions with regards to each point to initiate discussion. Examples for point a and c are:

Point a. Decision making processes at household level

   a. How many times in the last year have you solely made an economic decision for your household prior to enrollment in this programme? I wanted to start a restaurant
   b. How many times have you made a joint economic household decision in the last year prior to enrollment in this programme?
   c. How many times has your significant other made an economic decision for your household prior to enrollment in this programme?
   d. How has this changed since the programme?

Point c. Legal Rights and Access

   a. What are your rights? Do you know how to get help if your rights have been violated?
   b. If yes, how do you do that and who else supports you?
   c. Are you satisfied with the results? Or is there something you can think to be changed/improved?

2. How were identity factors considered throughout the programme process and how were these made tangible in the programme design, activities and outcomes?
   a. Considering identity factors such as age, ethnicity, disability, or education, is there a variety of women in your program based on these factors? (programme accessibility)
   b. How do you think the benefits of the programme can affect women differently based on these factors? Do you think there would be different challenges in completing the programme considering these factors?
   c. Do you think the programme considered variation of these identity factors when they planned the programme and in how they are conducting the programme? If yes,
how so and if no, how could they have better designed the program to consider such a range of differences?

3. Has the program(s) affected the level of female time and labor commitments?
   a. Before the program, how many hours out of your day were committed to taking care of children, the house, cooking? How many hours did you have to relax? Since starting the program, how many hours have you had to relax? Also, since starting the programme, how many hours are you now putting toward children, the house, cooking, etc.? How many hours are you putting toward programme related activities?
   b. Do you see your daily commitments changing after the programme is complete? If yes, how? If no, why not?
   c. Are you happy about this change? Is your husband happy about this change? Etc. etc.

4. How do you perceive relationship (positive or negative) between gender and social norms and women’s economic and political empowerment?
   a. What are appropriate and socio-culturally accepted gender roles and responsibilities for women and men in your community?
   b. Why do women and men follow these accepted roles and norms? Who says so? What happens if they don’t follow?
   c. What barriers for women are created as a result of these social and gender norms?
   d. Who (individuals, institutions) are enforcing, changing or further promoting these gender inequalities and harmful socio-cultural norms?
   e. What the family and community responses where to these changes/ shifts in attitudes and perceptions?
   f. Did it result in any backlash?
   g. How people in your family and community perceive and understand the benefits and problems as a result of these changes?

For direct beneficiaries, it will be revised, such as:

   a. What are you responsible for at home compared to your husband, children, in-laws?
   b. What are you responsible for in terms of bringing in money for your family compared to others in the family?
   c. Are you involved in community level groups or socio-political groups?
   d. If yes, what do your husband, children, in-laws think of this?
   e. If not, why do you think you are not involved?
   f. What happens if someone in the family gets involved in an activity that is not one they would normally do, like starting an enterprise, become a member of advocacy network and etc.?
5. How do you assess the sustainability of the programme(s) achievements beyond programme life? If yes, how? If not, why?
   a. Do you think this programme will help your life after the training is finished? How it may or may not?
   b. Do you at all feel more confident in running your own business once this programme is complete?
   c. What challenges do you think you may face in managing your own business after the programme is over?
   d. Is there something that could help with these challenges?

6. How do you assess the effectiveness of formal and informal governance institutions with regards to women’s economic and political empowerment?
   a. Do you have a CDC in your community?
   b. Are you involved with this CDC?
   c. How has this CDC helped your life in anyway?
   d. What other institutions are helpful in empowering you?
   e. What would you recommend increasing their effectiveness?
Annex. I List of documents – Desk Review

- “Social Norms Diagnostic Tool”, OXFAM
- Memorandum of Understanding between CARE Afghanistan, HiH-Afghanistan, CARE Netherlands, and HiH International.
- “Empowering Women in Afghanistan”, Concept Note to Hilti Foundation, HiH-Afghanistan
- HiH-Afghanistan documents: Concept Note, Log framework, Grant Agreement, Compliance Procedures, M&E Reports
- “Scoping Study Report of EVC targeted communities in Parwan, Kabul and Balkh for the selecting of communities for livelihood Intervention”, HiH-Afghanistan, November 2018
- 6-months Progress Reports of ET project in Balkh, Kabul and Parwan, 2019 – Dari version
- “Afghanistan Annual Report”, Every Voice Counts (EVC), January 01 – December 31, 2016 (Year 1)
- “Afghanistan Annual Report”, Every Voice Counts (EVC), January 01 – December 31, 2017 (Year 2)
- “Afghanistan Annual Report”, Every Voice Counts (EVC), January 01 – December 31, 2018 (Year 3)
- ”Mid Term Review”, Every Voice Counts (EVC), ASK Training & Consulting, 2018
- Afghanistan EVC MEAL Framework 2019
- WCLRF – Outcome Harvesting for 2018 and 2019 – Balkh Province
- AWRC Outcome Harvesting for 2018 and 2019 – Parwan Province
- “Terms of Reference for the Midterm Review of the ‘Dialogue and Dissent Programme”’, Every Voice Counts, Every Voice Counts Programme, Somalia/ Somaliland, 2018
Annex H. Agenda – Gender Sensitive Case Study Training

Gender Sensitive Case Study Training

Agenda

Date: October 15 & 16, 2019
Venue: House # 367, Lane 6, Left Side, Street # 15 Wazir Akbar Khan, Kabul

Day 1. Tuesday, October 15, 2019, 9:00am – 2:00pm

8:30 am  Registration
9:00 am  Welcome Remarks & Introduction
9:20 am  Gender Terms
10:00 am  Tea Break
10:15 am  Exercises 1 - You, Your Parent, Your Grandparent – Time and Decision-making
11:00 am  Exercise 2 - Scenarios understanding Gender Mainstreaming
11:40 am  Gender and Identity Factors (sex, age, socio-economic status, education, etc.)
12:00 Noon  Lunch and Prayer Break
1:00 pm  Why Gender?
1:15 pm  Exercise 3 - M&E Challenge Question
1:30 pm  Exercises 4 – Your activities, Your role
2:00 pm  Participants’ Feedback

Day 2. Wednesday, October 16, 2019, 9:00am – 2:00pm

8:30 am  Registration
9:00 am  Gender Equality Continuum: Exploitative, Unaware, Sensitive, Transformative
9:30 am  Case Study Guidelines & Checklist
10:00 am  Tea Break
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:15 am</td>
<td>Case Study Sample: Sakeena, a participant of Enterprise Today Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 am</td>
<td>Discussion: What additional areas to consider for building a strong Case Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00 Noon</td>
<td>Lunch and Prayer Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:00 pm</td>
<td>Case Study vs. Success Story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 pm</td>
<td>Data Collection from Gender Perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:30 pm</td>
<td>Exercises 5 – (Issues/challenges faced while collecting data)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00 pm</td>
<td>Participants’ Feedback</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTES
___________________________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________________________
___________________________________________________________________________________