FINAL EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT

“Sports for Social Change and Inclusion”

(01st of May 2016 – 14th of July 2019)

The goal of the consultancy was to prepare and implement the final evaluation of the project “Sports for Social Change and Inclusion”. The overall target of the project was the improvement of the living conditions of Roma children in Bijeljina.

The overall objective of the final evaluation was to assess the results achieved based on the set targets. The specific objectives of the evaluation were to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and (the road to) impact of the project in relation to the stated objective and expected results, target groups/partners, beneficiaries and other affected parties.

The results of final evaluation will be used to inform the implementers, the donor and the involved stakeholders about the final findings and recommendations of the project and to enable learning, improved planning and implementation of future CARE Balkans projects/programs in the region.

Special thanks for the support to Sumka Bučan, CARE Balkan Director; Satko Halkić, CARE Support Staff; Dragan Joković, Otaharin Director; Jovana Milanovic, Social Worker in Otaharin (and for the project); Fatima Dzanic, Field Officer; Pantić Jovan and Milan Ilić, Coaches; Snežana Antunović, Coordinator of Sport Activities and Radmila Tubić, Psychologist.
Contents

Executive summary ........................................................................................................... 3

1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 5
   1.1 About the project ........................................................................................................ 5
   1.2 Working methodology .............................................................................................. 6

2. Results assessment ...................................................................................................... 7
   2.1 Results ..................................................................................................................... 7
   2.2 Relevance ................................................................................................................ 13
   2.3 Effectiveness .......................................................................................................... 14
   2.4 Efficiency .............................................................................................................. 15
   2.5 Impact ..................................................................................................................... 16
   2.6 Sustainability ......................................................................................................... 17

3. Conclusion with recommendations .............................................................................. 18
Executive summary

“When I got involved, I haven’t had a clue about football. But ever since I started training, football has been everything to me …. We eagerly wait for the football trainings, for Mondays and Wednesdays. Sometimes we even get up at 6 am and prepare ourselves for the training”. This is a statement of 13 years old Roma child who was given the opportunity to participate at sport activities (football trainings) organized by the project “Sports for Social Change and Inclusion”. The project is implemented from May 2016 until July 2019 by CARE International in partnership with the Association Otaharin from Bijeljina. This report presents the final evaluation of the project.

The overall target of the project was the improvement of the living conditions of Roma children in Bijeljina. The project focused on improvement of the school education of Roma children and their living conditions through sport and art activities, combined with youth and parent group work and school support. The core activity of the project was to organize a football team and football school Otaharin. Playing football should have been the main motive for children (but also parents) to improve their attendance at school, hygiene, increase self-confidence and social behaviour. Beside playing football, the other activities of the project were financing meals for a public kitchen, provision and awarding of school material for poorer children of primary school age, provision of football playground by signing a contract with professional football teams and coaches, awarding of school scholarships for poorer children of primary school age, providing healthy food and drinks at trainings, organizing mandatory workshops for children and parents in order to increase their various social capacities.

Thanks to the support from German Sport University, curriculum for work with marginalised children and their inclusion was adapted to local situation and implemented in the sport school. Children were not only playing football, but also learning and acquiring social skills.

The target group was 84 Roma children (70%) and 36 (30%) non-Roma children (age 6 – 18) who are in social need (social welfare beneficiaries). Three groups of children were involved in the school years 2016/2017, 2017/2018 and 2018/2019. The project managed to directly target 76 Roma children (90% of the planned target) and total number of non-Roma children involved was 35 (97% of the target). For all of them, playing football and participating in the school of sport was enormous motivation to participate in other project activities. Beside those children, many other got the school material, and meals in Otaharin Day Care Centre.

The project was supposed to reach about 80 parents of direct beneficiaries (children), and 90 was reached. The work with parents was demanding and only partially successful.

In order to play football and get (financial) assistance from the project, children and their parents had to participate in the workshops and attend school regularly. Thanks to this motivation (conditioning) the dropout rate of the Roma and other poor children involved in school was reduced. Although the data for the school year 2018/2019 are still being summarised by the schools, first evidence shows that the reduced dropout trend recorded in the period 2016-2018 will continue. Beside the reduction of the dropout rate, the project successfully worked on rising school attendance in classes to at least 70%. The measuring attendance was done in close cooperation with three primary schools that regularly submit the attendance lists at the end of each school semester. Besides their
results in schools, the work with children was also done to improve their social behavior and hygiene. Over 100 workshops were implemented in order to make children more aware of the importance of school education. The average participation was 15-20 children per workshop. Children were less interested to participate at workshops about hygiene but due to mandatory rules, around 70% of them participated in at least 2 workshops per month. The project management noticed that children who participated in the hygiene workshops are more regularly vaccinated.

One of the most challenging tasks was to make parents to take their educational responsibility seriously. Over 80 workshops for parents were organized and they were supposed to participate in 2 workshops monthly. However, the actual level of participation was lower, and it is estimated by the evaluator to around 50% of the planned participation.

Regular football practice with professional coaches as well as intensive work with social workers or educationist led to development of team spirit, increased self-confidence, self-esteem of the children, reduction of health risks and improved social behavior. The professional football coaches worked with this target group for the first time. The Roma and other involved children behave as all the other children and there was nothing specific regarding the development of team spirit and other factors. The level of tolerance among children evidently increased at every training. Children had a chance to participate in “regular” football competitions and tournaments. Some of them were noticed by football professionals and there is evidence that 6 of them (5 girls and 1 boy) continue training at the official local football club.

The design of the project was good. Further improvements are possible when it comes to defining indicators. Qualitative indicators related to children or parents behavior are difficult to measure and their number should be decreased. Cooperation with schools, local police and social welfare institutions should be further strengthened and they could be more involved in measuring the success indicators (at least one joint measurement should be done). The reports (created and presented by Otaharin) need improvements. They are not user friendly (indicators cannot be read easily) and sometimes lack consistency when it comes to dates and figures. The evaluator was informed that the project management was changing, so that might be the reason. The sustainability should also be improved. The duration of the project might have been too short to achieve a significant level of sustainability. It should be ensured that children have long term support for getting involved in sport activities. Once they get involved, they also get disappointed if this opportunity is interrupted. There are a couple of ideas for improving sustainability presented in this report (conclusions) such as development of individual sport inclusion plans (by Otaharin), stronger involvement of schools (involving children in school sport groups) and stronger involvement of sport clubs (creating long term partnerships that would make clubs more sensitive and inclusive).

For more than 90% of the children who got the opportunity to participate in the sport activities, it was the first time to be part of professionally organised sports (organized football trainings). For all of them, playing football and participating in the official sport trainings was an enormous motivation to improve their attendance at school, improve personal hygiene, increase self-confidence and have a dream about better life. The project has a positive impact on Roma and children in social needs and communities where they live in. If only one child continues with regular sport activities in local sport clubs, it would be an important motive for other children but parents as well.
1. Introduction

1.1 About the project

Objectives and results
The overall objective of the project was to improve the living conditions of Roma children in Bijeljina. In order to achieve it, the project focused on improvement of the school education of Roma children and their living conditions through sport and art activities, combined with youth and parent group work and school support (specific objective). The targets for the specific objective were to reduce dropout rate in school to a minimum, rise school attendance to at least 70% attendance in class, make parents more responsible and improve children social behavior and hygiene. The project has three related outputs that are presented in the table in the section Indicators.

Indicators
After first year of implementation, the indicators for measuring success of the outputs were adapted and improved at the joint workshop held from 16 to 18 of August 2017 in Bijeljina. The improvements are presented in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Output</th>
<th>Original indicators</th>
<th>Improved indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vulnerable Roma children (70%) and non-Roma children (30%) regularly attend school, increasing their chances of secondary education.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 intervention children attend school regularly (70% of school days) and improve their grades by 0.3.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 children of the intervention group attend school regularly (70% of school days). The participating children are aware of the importance of school education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through regular participation in sports activities, children learn to take responsibility, to behave socially and to concentrate.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 children change their attitudes towards other ethnicities in a positive way.</td>
<td>The participating children increasingly ensure that everyone is involved in football training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 out of 30 intervention children attend school regularly: attending 70% of the offered soccer sessions as well as attending 2 workshops a month in the Day Care Center.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 participating children attend at least 70% of the football training.</td>
<td>The participating children show a shift social behaviour on the field regarding teamwork and the participating children show a significant improvement in social behavior in the field (respectful)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
20 out of 30 intervention children are more self-confident than before.

Participating children increasingly show self-confident behavior.

The education (knowledge) about health risks and hygiene will be improved and expanded.

20 out of 30 intervention children have increased their knowledge about health risks and hygiene by attending 2 workshops a month in the Day Care Center.

20 of 30 children attend at least 2 workshops per month (health education).

Participating children have a better understanding of health and hygiene.

The children show a positive change in their behavior in terms of hygiene.

Target group
The plan of the project was to reach directly 84 Roma children (70%) and 36 (30%) non-Roma children (age 6 – 18) who are in social need and/or are beneficiaries of Day care centre for children who are living or working in the street or are in risk of becoming ones. Roma children are coming from Roma settlements, while targeted non-Roma children are living in their vicinity and thus they are identified (by Otaharin staff) as a suitable target group.

The project was supposed to reach about 80 parents of direct beneficiaries (children), at least one parent from each child included in the project, taking into consideration that there are a lot of parents with more than one child included in the project activities. Out of that number there should have approximately been 30% of non-Roma parents.

1.2 Working methodology

The evaluation was done according to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards. According to the standards, the purpose of the evaluation was defined first and that is “to assess the results achieved based on the set targets”. Then, the specific objective of the evaluation was set and that is “to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and (the road to) impact of the project”. The evaluation objectives are translated into relevant and specific evaluation questions.

In order to get the answers, desk research (quantitative research) and field visits (interviews) / qualitative research were done. So, the selected methodology answers the evaluation questions using credible evidence. A clear distinction was made between the different result levels.

A Desk review of available project documentation, project proposal set, project reports, monitoring reports, partners’ reports was done first. As a result of the desk review, the first draft of the evaluation report was produced. Based on the first draft, an outline of the report’s structure was agreed upon with CARE Balkans. Outline is structured according to the expected results indicated in the logical framework and assessment of the relationship between measures and impact. Analysis of the final project results and effects against the criteria set up within the project log frame was done and it clearly presents these findings in the log frame format. The specific evaluation questions covered are:
1. Relevance - To what extent are the objectives of the project still valid for the beneficiaries? Are the expected results/outputs of the project consistent with the outcome, immediate impact and overall goal/impact (as part of the analysis of the log frame matrix/programme theory and the presentation of the theory of change and its underlying assumptions)?

2. Effectiveness - To what extent has the project achieved its outcome(s), expected results/outputs? What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the outcome(s)/expected results/outputs? (Also considering any which were possibly beyond the control of the project); Was the project managed as planned? If not, what issues occurred and why?; To what extent have all project stakeholders collaborated as planned? Did the project contribute to capacity building as planned? To what extent was gender mainstreaming included in the project.

3. Efficiency - Has the project time framework been enough for achieving outcomes and the intervention impacts?

4. Impact - How many boys and girls in total have already benefited from the project (immediate impact)? What exactly has already changed in the lives of children and their families (immediate impact)? Which positive and/or negative effects/impacts in terms of gender can be possibly be attributed to the project? Which institutions have already benefitted from the project and how? What has changed for whom (immediate impact)? Are there any other important aspects regarding impact?

5. Sustainability - To what extent will the benefits of the project continue after the end of the project/donor? What were the major factors which influenced the achievement or non-achievement of sustainability of the project? If applicable, what needs to be done and/or improved to ensure sustainability?

During the field visit, interviews with the project management, beneficiaries and the main stakeholders were done, and the questions were discussed.

Data analysis (data collected in the field, from main project stakeholders, project actors and beneficiaries) were done at the end and draft final evaluation report prepared for comments. After the comments were collected from CARE and project management staff (Otaharin), the report was finalised.

2. Results assessment

2.1 Results

This part of the report includes a thorough analysis of the final project results and effects against the criteria set up within the project log frame. At the end, findings in the log frame format are presented.

The overall objective of the project was to improve the living conditions of Roma children in Bijeljina. The living conditions of the Roma are well below those of the rest of the population. "Living conditions" refers to the circumstances of a person's life—shelter, food, clothing, safety, access to clean water, segregation, healthiness of the environment etc. For children, the behaviour of parents is a factor that determine living conditions too. The indicators for measuring overall objective were not defined in the project proposal.
The general conclusion of the evaluator is that many aspects of the living conditions of Roma children were improved. Thanks to implementation of the project, segregation is decreased and that could be proven by facts that several girls and one boy participate in the sport school of the strongest football club in the area (“Radnik”). Healthiness of the environment is also improved thanks to continued education about the importance of hygiene. There is evidence from the outside sources (e.g. interview with the coaches) that the hygiene is improved. The behaviour of parents has also improved thanks to work that was done with them during implementation.

The specific objective of the project was to contribute to the improvement of the school education of Roma children and their living conditions through sport and art activities, combined with youth and parent group work and school support. The indicators that were set to measure achievement of the result are reduction of the dropout rate in school to a minimum, school attendance rate (rises) to at least 70% in class, educational responsibility of the parents and improvement of social behavior and hygiene of children. The first two indicators are quantitative and easily measurable, the 3rd and 4th indicators are qualitative ones and more difficult to measure. However, monitoring and evaluation procedures were set for measuring qualitative indicators. German Sport University provided support to the project staff to properly plan and implement pre-testing of beneficiaries and control group. Pre-testing was done in October/November 2016 for the first group of 40 children and parents and in September 2017 for the second group. Observations on the training sessions were done by psychologists and social worker, at least twice a month. After each month the data were sent to GSU for analysis.

Otaharin regularly measures the dropout rate in schools of Roma children at the end of school semester and at the end of school year. Dropout rate is the percentage of the students failing to complete a particular school course. The measurement is done by research of attendance lists that are delivered to Otaharin by the schools (that children attend). During the evaluation (desk research), an insight was made into some attendance lists. During the 2017/2018 school year, 3 students out of 37 examined (8,1%) failed to complete the school year. During the 2018/2019, all the students (out of 29 examined) completed the school year.

The second indicator is that school attendance rises to at least 70% attendance in class. During evaluation, attendances of 29 children was examined in 3 primary schools for the school year 2018/2019. Only 2 children did not attend 70% of the classes. For the school year 2017/2018, attendances of 37 children were examined in 3 primary schools and 11 children did not attend 70% of the classes. So, during 2017/2018 there were 29,7% of children that did not attend the classes and during 2018/2019 only 6,9% of children did not attend the classes.

The third indicator is “parents take their educational responsibility seriously”. Over 80 workshops for parents were organized during the implementation of the project (2016-2019). There were over 80 parents involved. Workshops were organized every Wednesday and every parent was obliged to participate a workshop at least twice a month. The attendance lists were examined for period February – June and October - December 2018.

In the period February – June 2018, there were 38 parents in the list. In February, 10 parents (or 26,3%) participated 2 or more times. In March, 17 (or 44,7%) participated 2 or more times. In April, 14 (or 36,8 %) participated 2 or more times. In May, 10 (or 26,3%)
participated and in June, only 4 (or 10.5%) participated 2 or more times. The average participation was 27.4% and minimum expected was around 50% (2 workshops per month).

In the period October – December 2018, there were 21 parents involved. In October, 14 out of 21 (or 66.6%) attended 2 or more workshops and 2 did not come at all. In November, 15 (or 71.4%) attended and 2 did not come at all. And in December, 12 (57%) attended 2 or more workshops, while 7 (or 33.3%) did not attend at all. The average participation was 56.4%.

The participation of parents was not as expected, and it was underlined by Otaharin staff as well. It is also clear tendency that participation is the highest in the second month of implementation and then decreasing. The attendance is the highest in the first monthly workshops and this could be related to monthly scholarships. This might indicate that parents are interested (at the beginning) but than their motivation decrease.

The fourth indicator for measuring specific objective is “Children improve their social behavior and hygiene”. By examining couple of individual cases, considering information gathered from the interviews, and examining notes from post testing workshop, it could be confirmed that children improved their social behavior. When it comes to hygiene, the coaches were interviewed about the hygiene and their impression. Children also participated workshop dedicated to hygiene improvement. It could be noted that these workshops were not attended as much as educational workshops. The examination of the attendance lists was done as well as discussion with the coaches. It could be confirmed that children improved their hygiene.

The project had three related outputs that are presented in the table above. Indicators for measuring each output are precisely defined and further improved (adapted) during the implementation as also presented in the table above.

The first output is that “Vulnerable Roma children (70%) and non-Roma children (30%) regularly attend school, increasing their chances of secondary education”. There are four indicators set to measure the output. The first indicator is that 20 out of 30 children (66.6%) of the intervention group attend school regularly (70 % of school days). The indicator was clearly measured by the project management by getting attendance lists directly from the schools. During the evaluation, attendance of 66 children was examined and 13 (19.6%) did not attend 70% of school classes. According to the interim reports, 11 out of 40 children were attending school more regularly than earlier in 2016 and 11 out of 40 in 2017.

The second indicator was that “the participating children are aware of the importance of school education”. Educational workshops were held four times a week (September/October – June). There were 48 children participating in 2016, no precise data for 2017 were found ( interim report for 2017 was examined), and there were 68 workshops in 2018 with 15-20 participants per workshop.

The third indicator is that “20 out of 30 participating parents attend at least 2 workshops per month”. The workshops were organized every Wednesday and 35 parents participated in 2016, 35 in 2017, and 25 in 2018. According to the attendance lists for the period February – June and October – December 2018, the level of satisfactory participation was 46.6%.

The fourth indicator is that “Participating parents show positive behavioral changes related to responsible parenting”. The behavioral changes were measured during the workshop sessions held with parents and post testing was done as well. The achievement of the indicator is partially successful. Four parents of six present parents at
the post testing suggested that they could not remember the specific situations or stories they could associate with the program. Although, during the post testing parents expressed satisfaction about the program, they agreed that positive behavioral changes still depends on the circumstances that currently affect the given situation which sometimes prevent the learned to be applied.

The second output of the project was that “children learn to take responsibility, to behave socially and to concentrate through regular participation in sports activities”. It was measured by five indicators.

Children (20 out of 30 or 66,6%) were supposed to attend at least 70% of the football training sessions. Total number of training sessions conducted in 2016 (per group) was 27. 170 sessions were held in 2017 (85 until June and 85 until December) and 120 in 2018. In order to assess level of participation, the attendance list for 2017/2018 group was examined. There are 41 children on the list. Total number of trainings held was 173 (85 in 2017 and 88 in 2018). Total number of participations was 1105 for the first and 1005 for the second group (2110 in total). The maximum participation number is 41 children x 173 : 2 groups = 3546. So, the level of participation was 2110 : 3546 x 100 = 59,5 %. If 4 children from the list are excluded (two of them did not participate at all and two rarely participated) then the percentage is 65,9%.

Children (20 out of 30 or 66,6%) were also supposed to attend at least 2 educational workshops per month. And there were 71 children involved in 2018 (40 at the beginning of the year and 31 in period September – December). They were supposed to participate minimum 2 workshops x 9 months x 71 children = 1.278 participations. There were 68 workshops reported in 2018. The reported average participation at the workshops was 17,5 participants (1.190 participations in total = 17,5 x 68). So, 93% of children participated in at least 2 educational workshops per month in 2018.

The third indicator is that the participating children increasingly ensure that everyone is involved in football training. It is one of the indicators that are extremely difficult to measure. However, due to lack of complaints from children (or minor complaints) recorded in the post testing events, as well as low number of children who have dropped out from trainings, it could be concluded that everyone was involved in the training.

The fourth and fifth indicators are “the participating children show a significant improvement in social behavior in the field (respectful interaction, teamwork)” and “participating children increasingly show self-confident behavior” are difficult to measure in the short period of time and without involvement of staff from schools (where children spend much more time). It could be concluded from interviews, joint events as well as persistent participation of children that the teamwork grew up in time and social interaction has been constantly increasing.

And the third output was that “the education (knowledge) about health risks and hygiene will be improved and expanded”. There are 3 indicators set to measure the output.

The first indicator is that 20 of 30 children (66,6%) attend at least 2 workshops per month (health education). The total number of children involved was 40 in 2016, 40 in 2017 and 31 in 2018/2019. The workshops were organized 4 times per month for each group and 24 were conducted in 2016, 96 in 2017 (approximately 48 until June and 48 until December), and 35 in 2018. According to the attendance lists for 2018, 29 children participated at 42 workshops in October, 46 in November and 45 in December. So, generally looking 20 of 30 participated at least in 2 workshops. It is also clear that the level of participation was rather low.
The second and the third indicators are qualitative ones and they are “participating children have a better understanding of health and hygiene” and “the children show a positive change in their behavior in terms of hygiene”. Children statements during the post term testing clear show that they do understand importance of hygiene. At the same time, the coaches claim that the hygiene situation was continually improving as trainings were progressing. Again, the information from schools would be valuable source of information for properly evaluating this indicator.

The table below, presents the elaborated findings of the final project results and effects against the criteria set up within the project log frame in the log frame format. The first column presents the objectives and expected results (outputs), the second column present target indicators and the third column presents the level of achievement of the indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specific objective</th>
<th>Target indicators</th>
<th>Level of achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To contribute to the improvement of the school education of Roma children and their living conditions through sport and art activities, combined with youth and parent group work and school support.</td>
<td>Dropout rate in school is reduced to a minimum.</td>
<td>There is clear evidence that the dropout rate is reduced from 8,1% for the school year 2017/2018 to 0% for 2018/2019.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School attendance rises to at least 70% attendance in class.</td>
<td>There is clear evidence that attendance rises from 70,3% in 2017/2018 to 93,1 % in 2018/2019. Some children participated trainings in both school years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parents take their educational responsibility seriously</td>
<td>It could be estimated that achievement is around 50%. Namely, 46,6% of parents participated activities as planned.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Children improve their social behavior and hygiene</td>
<td>There is clear evidence that children improved both of those.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results (outputs)</td>
<td>Target indicators</td>
<td>Level of achievement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Vulnerable Roma children (70%) and non-Roma children (30%) regularly attend school, increasing their chances of secondary education.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 children of the intervention group attend school regularly (70 % of school days)</td>
<td>There is clear evidence that attendance rises from 70,3% in 2017/2018 to 93,1 % in 2018/2019. So, it is much more that expected 66,6% (20 out of 30).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The participating children are aware of the importance of school education</td>
<td>Over 100 workshops implemented with average participation of 15-20 children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20 out of 30 participating parents attend at least 2 workshops per month.</td>
<td>The level of parents’ involvement was not 66,6% as planned but around 46,6%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participating parents show positive behavioral changes related to responsible parenting</td>
<td>The changes are positive, but limited due to limited participation at the workshops as well as post testing results.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Through regular participation in sports activities, children learn to take responsibility, to behave socially and to concentrate.</td>
<td>20 out of 30 participating children attend at least 70% of the football training.</td>
<td>The total participation rate is around 60% but most of the children did participate more than 70%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20 out of 30 participating children attend at least 2 educational workshops per month.</td>
<td>93% of children participated least 2 educational workshops every month in 2018.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CARE Australia ● CARE Canada ● CARE Danmark ● CARE Deutschland-Luxemburg ● CARE France ● CARE International Japan ● CARE Nederland ● CARE Norge ● CARE Österreich ● Raks Thai Foundation ● CARE International UK ● CARE USA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The participating children increasingly ensure that everyone is involved in football training.</th>
<th>Children expressed satisfaction and gave up rate among children was very low.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The participating children show a significant improvement in social behavior in the field (respectful interaction, teamwork).</td>
<td>The teamwork grew up in time and social interaction has been constantly increasing. However, there is a lack of info about their behaviour outside Day Care Centre and trainings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participating children increasingly show self-confident behavior</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>20 of 30 children attend at least 2 workshops per month (health education)</th>
<th>Generally looking 20 out of 30 children participated in at least 2 workshops per month and indicator is achieved. It could be noted that participation at these workshops was lower than participation at educational workshops.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participating children have a better understanding of health and hygiene</td>
<td>Children statements during the post term testing clear show that they do understand importance of hygiene. The coaches claim that the hygiene situation was continually improving as trainings were progressing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The children show a positive change in their behavior in terms of hygiene.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. The education (knowledge) about health risks and hygiene will be improved and expanded.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Besides the above elaborated indicators, the project implemented a number of other activities that contributed to improving overall living condition of Roma children such as:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Delivery of school material in September to a total of 36 beneficiaries in 2016, 30 in 2017 and 125 in 2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The meals for the children attending workshops and trainings were regularly available at the Day Care Centre. During the first evaluation visit, there were 3 children in the Centre getting warm meals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the end of December 2016, 2017 and 2018, New Year’s party was organized where children had to show their parents all the things they have learned on the workshops (singing, reciting, acting). A total of 119 children received presents (40 of them were financed from the project) in 2016, 167 in 2017 and 135 in 2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On 12th April 2018, 7 boys and 2 girls participated at the tournament organised by HCA “Zemlja djece BaH” in Tuzla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On 14th July 2018, group of 8 girls have chance to participate in the UEFA tournament for female football players in Sarajevo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On 15th September 2018 sport event at the field of the FC “Radnik” (BiH Premier League) was organised. Female young selection of the FC “Radnik” and representatives from HUG “Zemlja djece BaH” from Tuzla participated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On 25th September 2018, in cooperation with CARE International from Sarajevo, field trip and conference on sport project was organised. The material on the sport project is deliver to ten relevant embassies in BiH and other donors. The short documentary is filmed (<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y_zFSliknxM&amp;l=4s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y_zFSliknxM&amp;l=4s</a>) – the film was accessed on 13th July 2019 and it had 85 views.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On 02nd December 2018 ORPHAN Cup (football tournament) was organised in Bijeljina. The tournament gathered teams of marginalised and underprivileged children and have competitive character.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Relevance

It is estimated that there are between 10-12 million Roma living in Europe, six million of whom live in the EU. According to the available data, there are around 3,795,500 Roma living in the South East Europe. It is also estimated that up to 2% population of Bosnia and Herzegovina (around 70,000) are Roma people. Roma still face social exclusion and discrimination all over Europe, leading to lack of education, chronic unemployment, limited access to healthcare, rudimental housing, limited access to essential services and widespread poverty. This is due to fragmented and scarce interventions aimed at the Roma population resulting in isolating the issues of Roma from the mainstream public policies, public budgeting, public service institutions and administration. Roma children are in especially difficult situation and subject of violence, trafficking, segregation... The area of Bijeljina (BiH) is well known for its Roma population. Their living conditions are still hard. Their unemployment rate is two times higher than unemployment rate of their no Roma neighbours. Therefore, the overall objective of the project (improving living conditions of Roma) is still relevant.

The main lack of the project is that big majority of the children did not continue with sport activities after the end of implementation. Playing football for them was the main motive to attend school regularly and it was a tool for changing their social behaviour, their partners behaviour as well as (negative) attitude of the environment toward them. The sport activities (playing football) has really made changes in their life more than any other event or activity recently. All the planned improvements related to school education of Roma children were achieved by the project and there is a clear need for the project to be continued and clear need to use sport as an instrument to attract and motivate the children that gather around Otaharin Day Care Center.

The target group could be expanded to Roma children as well as none-Roma vulnerable children that do not attend the school at all. Therefore, one of the outputs could be dedicated to a number of children (that do not attend the school) attracted back to school. It is estimated by Otaharin that there are up to 20 children in Bijeljina area that do not attend primary school (that is legally obliged for all children). This should be done in close cooperation with schools and centre for social welfare who are legally obliged to force parents to send children to schools.

The attitude of parents remains the main challenge. Their role was mostly limited to participation at workshops that was not regular, and it was below expected ones. Many of them did not participate at all (they were obliged to come twice a month).

When it comes to consistency of expected results/outputs with the outcome and immediate impact, they are consistent. Additional improvements could have been made regarding the indicators. Number of qualitative indicators (9 out of 16) should have been less. It is very difficult to measure them. It is especially difficult to measure indicators related to children opinion and behaviour such as “the participating children increasingly ensure that everyone is involved in football training” or “participating children increasingly show self-confident behavior”. The first indicator of the output one and second indicator of the specific objective are practically the same and this should have been avoided.

The other related institutions and especially schools and social welfare center might have had bigger role in implementation and could have made project more relevant.
2.3 Effectiveness

The project was managed as planned and mostly produced planned effects. Project positively influenced living conditions of Roma children in Bijeljina. Segregation of Roma children is decreased, and they had a chance to participate in “regular” tournaments and interact with other children. During those events, there were not any case of segregation but there were positive reactions and interactions. Participating children also improved healthiness of the environment they live in thanks to the improvement of behaviour toward hygiene.

The project also opened some new perspectives for them. At least 6 of them continue with sport activities in local football club that participate in the Premier League of Bosnia and Herzegovina. It is especially interesting to notice that the girls are mostly welcomed to the football club. The Club is obliged to have female team, and thanks to the project, these girls were recognised as the ones with potential to further develop and they are accepted to the club.

It is also clear that the project contributed to the improvement of the school education of Roma children. Number of Roma children failing to complete a particular school course decreased. School attendance rose and no doubt that social behavior and hygiene of the children improved. School attendance was controlled by the project management that beside attendance lists, used to do field (school) visits and check if children attend school classes. The condition for attending trainings (to play football) was to attend school regularly, participate at the education workshops and take care of personal hygiene.

The parents remain the weakest point and the smallest effects were in the work with them. However, this could have been expected due to difficult and complex situation that they live in. They are the poorest members of the community and many struggle to survive.

The major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the outcome(s)/expected results/outputs were:

- Duration of the project (might have been too short)
- Lack of creative solutions for make activities more sustainable
- Investment in sport remains low in Bosnia and Herzegovina and Bijeljina as well.
- Roma people are generally poor and parents lack time to get involved in the workshops and activities

It should be noted that the developed curricula and methodology for work with children was very much appreciated by the professionals. Collaboration with schools could have been better and curricula further disseminated.

Collaboration with the strongest football club in Bijeljina was achieved with concrete results. Beside exchange of coaches, children had opportunity to visit the city stadium, participate official football games and become members of the Football Club (as elaborated earlier).

Collaboration with the Centre for Social Welfare was established. The Centre participated in the selection of non-Roma children in social need who participated in the program. The Centre could have been more involved in the evaluation of effects (e.g. measuring changes in children behaviour).
Gender mainstreaming was very much considered. In the Otaharin reports, number of participating girls and boys as well as mothers and fathers are clearly presented. During the trainings, girls and boys played football together and due to very good experience with such “mixed” teams, the coaches proposed that this practice continue.

2.4 Efficiency

The project time framework has been enough for achieving outcomes and the intervention impacts. However, the methodology could have been better in a sense that children should have been given be involved in sport activities longer time. The project was set in such a way that a child who participated at one training round that coincided with the school year (from September to June), could not participate in implementation of the project furthermore. So, the child who participated the trainings in 2016/2017 could not participate the trainings in 2017/2018. Such approach undermined effects but also efficiency of working with children. However, in 2018/2019 the same children (from previous years) were allowed to participate and it is clear from attendance lists that some of them did.

The project team also adapted schedules and training groups to the needs and situation in the field. At the beginning, children of all ages (6-15) worked together. Due to age difference, but also different school shifts, children were (later) divided into two groups and such system of work remained until the end of implementation.

Efficiency of Otaharin Day Care Centre was also significantly improved. The Centre managed to attract new beneficiaries but also strengthened relationship with the existing ones. It introduced new service (sport activities) and adopted new methodologies of work.

In order to control how the scholarships are being spent and whether the children are benefiting from the scholarships, outreach workers went to the field and communicated with parents daily. Since most of the children come from troubled families where their parents exploit them, forbid them to go to school and some of them even suffer domestic violence - field work was essential for ensuring that they truly benefit from scholarships. The scholarships were not strictly controlled (in a sense that each expense is justified), but situation in families is monitored. It is also clear that level of parents' involvement as well as involvement of children in other (e.g. educational and hygiene) activities is higher thanks to the scholarships. Scholarships are important motivation and positively influence the efficiency. The participation of parents at the workshops is higher at the beginning of the months and it coincides with deliver of scholarships. Most of the parents are not employed and fighting to survive, so this income matters a lot for them.

Several activities for children were organized (sport activities, workshops, public events) and they were very well organized and coordinated allowing the children to participate without high pressure.

Regular school attendance was a condition for the participation in the football practice. This led to improvement of the school performance. In order to get scholarships, parents had to participate the workshops (twice a month) and this condition also had positive impact on efficiency.
2.5 Impact

The plan was to reach directly 84 Roma children (70%) and 36 (30%) non-Roma children (age 6 – 18) and about 80 parents. During the first year of implementation (2016), there were 40 children included in the program (25 Roma or 62.5 % and 15 non-Roma or 37.5%). The work with them was done from October 2016 until June 2017. During the second year (2017), there were 40 children involved (29 or 72.5% Roma and 11 or 27.5% non-Roma). The work with them was done from September 2017 until June 2018. During the third year (2019), there were 31 children involved out of whom 22 or 70.9% Roma and 9 or 29% non-Roma children. The work with them was done from September 2018 until June 2019.

The total number of Roma children involved was 76 (90% of the target) and total number of non-Roma children involved was 35 (97% of the target). These are children directly involved in the training (sport) activities and many other children were involved in other activities of the project such as New Years joint celebrations and delivery of school material at the beginning of school years.

The total number of involved parents was 90. The level of their involvement (number of workshops that were supposed to participate at) was rather low and it is estimated by the valuators to be around 50% from the plan.

Immediate impact of the project was that children who participated did show concrete improvements in school and social behaviour. The dropout rate decreased and the attendance at school classes increased. Mixed gender football teams were established, and such practices produced positive results. Boys became more tolerant and girls more self-confident. An individual but concrete example of their self-confidence is a fact that children independently (from the project) organize and participate at local football tournaments (e.g. humanitarian tournament “Za Boska Vukovića” where the children won 2nd place).

The impact on development of talents was limited but a fact that 6 boys and girls got the opportunity for further work is promising. The project did not have special influence on reduction of Roma discrimination. Roma children played mostly with the children in social needs that are generally discriminated too. It could be positive for impacting discrimination to include more other children to play sport with Roma and children in social needs.

The coaches claim that after one-year work with children, many of them get enough football and social skill to get involved in work of other sport clubs. Children have difficulties to understand training process at the beginning, but after few trainings most of the start advancing and understand the training process. Their attitude toward the trainers is also very positive.

The target groups are mostly very poor or poor families. During 2018, 1700 families from Bijeljina with 2.900 children were registered beneficiaries of Center for Social Welfare. Any additional income for them matters a lot. B.O has 7 members of family and his parents are unemployed. Obtaining the scholarship enabled him to continue his education (and he was about to quit). This was the most “extreme” case in which getting a scholarship meant continuing education. There are also cases where parents were not allowing children to play sport and get involved into other activities because they wanted their children “to work”. However, the scholarship was motivating enough for them to let...
the children play sport, participate the activities and make them participate workshops too. In some cases children are in foster care families (has legal guardians) and getting scholarship is not only about getting additional means to survive for them, but also important for their self-confidence and respect within those families.

2.6 Sustainability

If only one child continues with regular sport activities in local sport clubs, it would be important motive for other children but parents as well. It would also have positive impact on the community and their attitude toward Roma.

So far there is evidence that 5 girls continue trainings with local sport club and one boy. It should be aware that the girls do not necessary train because they are good, but because of requirement (from football authorities) to the local football club “Radnik” to have women football selection as well. “Radnik” participates in the Premier League of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

The major factors which influenced the achievement of sustainability of the project are stability and level of development of Otaharin (as organization) and new working methodologies (capacity building) that is mostly related to creation and implementation of training curricula. The coaches underlined that the children got good training habits and that they try to apply and join other football clubs in the neighbourhood. It is very positive that there is local knowledge and readiness to further develop and apply acquired knowledge and methodologies of work.

The major factor which influenced the non-achievement of sustainability of the project was first duration and lack of proper sustainability plan. Duration of the project was too short to achieve significant level of sustainability.

In order to improve sustainability, clear sustainability plan should be created, and enough time is needed for implementing the plan. So, if there is extension of the project, the sustainability plan should be created in the first months of implementation. Currently, project management do have ideas on how to achieve sustainability but do not have clear plan. The involvement of children in sport activities (playing football) proved to be good way to motivate them to work more on their education as well as to improve their skills. The challenge is to define future role of Otaharin in these activities and role of other institutions. The key institutions are schools and sport clubs. There is a possibility to involve children in the sport groups in schools. There is also possibility to make the sport clubs more available to them (especially talented children). Beside football, there might be interest of children for other sports but also of other sport clubs to involve these children. Closer cooperation should be created with sport associations and especially with the football association that is the richest association in the country and controlled by FIFA and UEFA (that promote inclusion and women football). The most sustainable (or the most practical) option for some children could be to provide them with scholarship to participate at other summer or winter or regular sport camps/activities.

There are also some ideas to establish “Otaharin sports club”. Having a sport club is expensive. The current system of funding local and youth sport clubs in Bosnia and Herzegovina is from membership fees. “Otaharin” target groups are poor children that cannot afford to pay membership fees. Therefore, this idea should be very carefully examined and elaborated.
3. Conclusion with recommendations

The project brought joy and happiness to poor settlements of Bijeljina area. Children used to come to play football with professional coaches with a glow. The project was successful and there is a very good base for continuing the work. The Project excellently fits into the overall work of Otaharin and CARE with Roma community in Bijeljina. Day Care Center is in the heart of Roma settlements and its services are very much appreciated (not only by Roma but local institutions as well).

Regarding the objectives and outputs, they are achieved as planned. Majority of quantitative indicators are reached. There is clear evidence that qualitative indicators are reached as well. There is only one indicator related to participation of parents to the workshop that is not fully reached. However, this indicator does not influence the overall impression of the project success and relevance. The recommendations for improvements are related to project design, implementation and sustainability.

1. Indicators should be improved. A) More quantitative indicators should be introduced, and they should be clearer. For example, “20 of 30 children” should be replaced with clear percentage or clear number in order to enable clear comparison. Duplication of indicators should also be avoided as well as indicators that are too difficult to measure. Indicators “parents take their educational responsibility seriously” and “participating parents show positive behavioral changes related to responsible parenting” are too similar (for this target group). B) Cooperation with schools, local police (e.g. measuring level of petty crime) and social welfare institutions should be strengthened, and they could be more involved measuring the success indicators. At least one joint indicator should be defined, and joint measurement should be done. C) It is recommended that educational responsibility of the parents and improvement of social behavior and hygiene of children is measured in cooperation with the schoolteachers or pedagogues. D) The indicator related to improving grades (overall children success in school) should be re-introduced. The grade is an excellent overall indicator of change of a child behaviour, motivation, knowledge, social skills. It is strong quantitative indicator that will also demonstrate (if positive) that there is good cooperation among institutions. Teachers should be involved from the beginning of implementation and be aware of the children that attend the sport activities and what is expected from them.

2. Regarding implementation, more stable project management is recommended, and reporting should be improved. There are too many “small” inconsistencies in the reports. The reports are also not complete and data presentation is sometimes done differently in the reports for different years. Reporting should also more consistently follow the indicators for measuring the success of implementation. Presented data in the interim reports are not user friendly and there are often mistakes with the year and too much copy paste (without proper corrections).

3. Motivation of parents to participate in implementation remains a challenge. The project management underline this as an issue in all the reports but could not find a good solution to motivate parents for involvement. It is clear (from attendance lists) that intensity of parents’ participation at the events is higher at the beginning
of the school year (autumn – October/December) and drop down during the spring months.

4. Involvement of children in other sport activities (other than football) could be piloted. The interest in football is probably the highest, but other sport clubs and associations might provide better conditions and perspectives for cooperation.

5. Other children (not only Roma and none-Roma in social need) should be involved in regular sport activities of the project in order to further remove barriers and contribute to fight against discrimination in Bijeljina area. It could also be considered that in the future some children are supported to play sport within Otaharin school but some (as many as possible) in other sport schools in the city (to provide them scholarship and monitor their progress). Making the sport school exclusively for Roma and non-Roma children who are social welfare beneficiaries could also sound and look discriminatory. There are around 70 registered football clubs in Bijeljina area and 20 sport schools. Those clubs and schools are available only for children who can afford it. But with proper scholarship and support, number of Roma children in this clubs and sport schools could be increased.

6. Participation of children in as many tournaments and public events should be supported due to positive influence on development of social skills of children as well as communication with the “outside” world. Children are motivated by rewards but also conditions and those should remain and even strengthened.

7. The sustainability should also be improved. Duration of the project might have been too short to achieve significant level of sustainability or the plan was not properly developed/implemented. Children need long term support for getting involved in sport activities. Many children were disappointed when they lost further opportunity to play sport. Sustainability plan should be clearer. The basis for creating sustainability plan could be:
   - development of individual sport inclusion plans (by Otaharin) – For most of the children playing sport is just a simple social game, but for some it means much more. There is not a lot of children and there is capacity within Otaharin to create individual approaches (in cooperation with coaches) for each child.
   - stronger involvement of schools is needed – Schools have sport groups that very often meet 2 or more times per week. Cooperation with school sport teachers could contribute to finding good solutions for achieving sustainability.
   - stronger involvement of sport clubs - Creating long term partnerships that would make clubs more sensitive and inclusive but also that would enable Otaharin to assist children to get involved in professional sport clubs.
   - Establishing cooperation with National Football Association of Bosnia and Herzegovina – The Association is financially stable and works in line with FIFA and UEFA guidelines, so it could be wiling to support more inclusion, fight against discrimination and women football.
   - developed and tested curricula should be disseminated – All the staff that was interviewed rated the curricula as excellent, so the schools and institutions should be aware of it and additional effort should be invested into it.