



FINAL PROJECT EVALUATION REPORT

Nâng Quyền- Women's Empowerment

Commissioned by
CARE International in Viet Nam
June 2017

Table of Content

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	I
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....	II
LIST OF TABLES	IV
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
2. INTRODUCTION.....	10
2.1 BACKGROUND AND PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION	10
2.2. REVIEW PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES	12
2.3. EVALUATION FRAMEWORK	12
2.4. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	13
2.5 POTENTIAL RISKS AND LIMITATIONS	18
3. FINDINGS	19
3.1 EFFECTIVENESS	19
3.2 RELEVANCE	39
3.3 EFFICIENCY	41
3.4 IMPACT	43
3.5 SUSTAINABILITY.....	44
4. CONCLUSION.....	47
5. LESSONS LEARNED	50
6. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	50
6.1 GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS.....	50
6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GOVERNMENT	51
6.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CARE	51
7. REFERENCES	53
ANNEX: GUIDELINES	54

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The consultants would like to express our thanks to the many project beneficiaries and stakeholders in the three implementation sites and in Ha Noi who contributed their time and shared their knowledge, opinions and suggestions. We also acknowledge the excellent support provided by Care International in Viet Nam in making travel and meeting arrangements, and ensuring that the assignment went according to plan. In particular we would like to thank Ms. Pham Kim Ngan, Program Officer and Ms. Nguyen Yen Thanh, Communications staff, for their wonderful assistance during the field visits to HCMC, Can Tho and Quang Ninh.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
ARV	Anti-retroviral drugs
CBO	Community-based organization
CSO	Community service organization
DOLISA	Department of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs
DSVP	Department of Social Vices Prevention and Combat
DV	Domestic violence
FGD	Focus group discussion
FSW	Female sex worker
GBV	Gender-based violence
HCMC	Ho Chi Minh City
HIV	Human immunodeficiency virus
HR	Harm reduction
IBBS	Integrated Biological and Behavioural Surveillance
ID	Identity card
IDI	In-depth interview
ILO	International Labour Organization of the United Nations
IT	Information technology
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOJ	Ministry of Justice
MOLISA	Ministry of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs
MOPS	Ministry of Public Security
NGO	Non-government organisation
NIHE	National Institute of Hygiene and Epidemiology
NQ	Nâng Quyền project
PAC	Provincial AIDS Committee
SCDI	Centre for Supporting Community Development Initiatives
SMP	Socially Marginalised People program
SOP	Standard operating procedure
SRH	Sexual and reproductive health

STI	Sexually transmitted infections
SW	Sex worker
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
USD	United States Dollars
VBSP	Viet Nam Bank of Social Policies
VCT	Voluntary counseling and testing for HIV
VNSW	Viet Nam Network of Sex Workers

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Sampling frames	16
Table 2: Summary Information of FSW workers interviewed in course of the study.....	17
Table 3: Total direct beneficiaries.....	23
Table 4: FSW disaggregated by types of project focus	23
Table 5: Comparison of number of WrW clubs and membership January 2014- April 2017	24
Table 6: Comparison between WrW clubs in 3 sites.....	25
Table 7: NQ project annual expenditure	43

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report summarizes the findings of a final evaluation made of the *Nâng Quyền* (“Women’s Empowerment”) (NQ) project, a 4-year project with the goal of empowering female sex workers (FSW) in Viet Nam to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable access to opportunities and services. The executing agency for the project is CARE Australia, under a grant of AUD \$1,566,779 from the Government of Australia, and implemented from July 2013 until June 2017, by CARE International in Viet Nam (CVN) in partnership with the Department of Social Vices Prevention and Combat (DSVP) of the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MOLISA). **The three key outcomes of the project were:**

- **Female sex workers have a strong platform for collective voice, through establishment of We are Women (WrW) clubs;**
- **DSVP recognises, utilises and supports female sex worker collective voice and action; and**
- **Police, local authorities, legal service providers at national and local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards female sex workers.**

An external evaluation team, comprising an international consultant and a national consultant, supported by CVN staff, undertook the review during the period April-May 2017. The main goal of the evaluation is to assess the effectiveness, relevance, of the NQ project and generate lessons learnt and recommendations for future projects targeting FSW, and programming under CARE’s *Socially Marginalized People* (SMP) program.

The evaluation employed a mixed-methods approach combining quantitative data from project monitoring reports with qualitative data collected by the evaluation team from interviews, focus groups and observations. Qualitative data was collected using in-depth interviews, focus groups and observation during field visits to the three project implementation sites, Can Tho, Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC) and Quang Ninh, and among key stakeholders in Ha Noi. In all, the evaluation team met with a total of 57 FSW, of whom 17 gave in-depth interviews, and 40 participated in focus group discussions. Stakeholders met through interviews and focus group discussions included over 35 personnel from the provincial sub-office of the Department of Social Vices Prevention and Combat (sub-DSVP), legal aid representatives, police, health sector representatives, and representatives of other organizations involved in project activities. Owing to the highly sensitive situation of sex workers in regard to the law and social stigma in Viet Nam, confidentiality and maintaining ethical research practices were a high priority in conducting the evaluation.

The project model comprised three components, consisting of establishment of self-help groups for FSW (“WrW clubs”), which was complemented by capacity building for DSVP personnel to provide support for WrW clubs, and awareness-raising for

police and legal aid providers. Core activities of WrW clubs include: outreach to FSW (harm reduction, GBV protection, health and work rights); personal financial management (savings and loan scheme); referrals to health services, financial services and vocational training; access to GBV protection; networking and participation in various forums for information, advocacy, and dialogues with local authorities and police.

“What I like most about the club is that it protects women’s rights, it’s comfortable and friendly. I don’t feel like an outsider, and there are good things around to learn. We can’t stay in this underground world forever,” Street-based FSW, HCMC

Overall, the review found that the NQ project successfully achieved its main objective; over 2,421 women directly involved in the NQ project gained increased self-esteem, confidence, awareness of rights and laws, including especially gender-based violence (GBV): FSW involved in project activities also benefited from increased access to health, legal, and vocational services: It is likely that many more FSW have already benefited indirectly from the project, as a result of capacity building and changed attitudes within DSVP, sharing of the NQ model through study visits, such as the one made to Hue, and sharing of experiences by WrW through various networks, especially the Viet Nam Network of Sex Workers (VNSW), which is already drawing on NQ experience in supporting sex workers groups in other provinces. However, the most important contribution of the NQ project to increased recognition, utilization and support by DSVP of FSW collective voice and action may well be the incorporation by MOLISA (DSVP) of the NQ project as one of three key reference models in the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020. Under this plan there will be future replication of the model in an initial 25 additional provinces under DSVP support, resulting, if the plan is successful, in a steady increase in the number of FSW benefiting from activities.

“WrW has reduced my stress, and given me more knowledge about the law and GBV. I’m happy to be able to help other women,” Street-based FSW, Can Tho

To date, however, the FSW who have benefited directly from the project are largely limited to the 3 implementation sites, and tend to be FSW who are already seeking to leave the profession, such as older women and street-based sex workers, and represent only a relatively small proportion of the total number of women estimated to be engaged in sex work. Benefits for younger, venue-based FSW in the project sites were narrower, and mainly related to human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) and sexually transmitted infection (STI) prevention.

“I’m happy with the WrW club. It provides emotional support, and I’m happy to have human warmth. If I had the opportunity I would change my life. But our lives can’t change too much because we need money. It’s hard for us to switch jobs. We need vocational training,” Street-based FSW HCMC

The NQ project contributed to important changes within DSVP, including a major shift of attitude among sub-DSVP staff towards FSW, greater awareness of FSW needs, and adoption of a more supportive approach. DSVP staff gained increased technical knowledge and understanding of key issues, such as GBV, and skills in participatory approaches and facilitation skills, and are now taking an increased role in linkage and referral of FSW to various services. The partnership with DSVP, as the key government agency responsible for the issue of sex work, strengthened the sustainability of the institutional changes that were the objectives of this project. The partnership coincided with the important changes that occurred in relation to the legal situation concerning sex workers, with a shift from punitive to administrative sanctions under the 2012 Law on the Handling of Administrative Sanctions. This meant that the project provided DSVP with a concrete approach for managing the subsequent important institutional changes and practices.

“One important benefit of the NQ project has been capacity building of staff in the system. This was essential, as without the necessary knowledge, including human rights and various agreements, staff would not be able to understand their [new] role. Also staff gained skills in the approaches to management of FSWs and those at risk of becoming sex workers,” Mr. Nguyen Xuan Lap, President

DSVP

Attitudes of individual police involved directly in project activities have changed considerably, however this does not yet extend to the institutional level. Based on the reports of FSW, the face-to-face contact between police and FSW in neutral settings made possible by activities such as quarterly dialogues, had a significant impact in changing police attitudes. Changes in attitudes of police in project sites who were not directly involved in activities vary: while there are still reports from FSW of discrimination, in general treatment of FSW seems to have improved. Whether this is due to project activities or simply the change in the law, closing 05 Centers and replacing punitive action with administrative sanctions, is difficult to determine. Legal services in all 3 implementation sites are supportive of FSW involved in WrW clubs, or those introduced by them, however it is difficult to assess the extent to which this support extends to other FSW outside the project. Greater investment in capacity building of the police and legal services agencies, including

involvement of the Ministry of Public Security (MOPS) and Ministry of Justice (MOJ) as key partners in the project, would have helped address these issues.

“There is a big improvement now due to the use of administrative sanctions. In the past the police were rude and disrespectful to FSW. When we were taken to police stations they made us clean the toilets. It still happens, but less often,” FSW Quang Ninh

Lack of personal identification (ID) or household registration documents emerged in the course of the project as a key factor in preventing access of FSW and their families to a range of important services. Solutions to this problem must be sought at the national level, and involve the MOPS, MOJ, and possibly other government agencies. Again, based on the successful engagement with DSVP, involvement of the MOPS and MOJ should be considered in future projects of this kind.

In retrospect, more consideration could also have been given to greater involvement of the VNSW in the project, possibly in the form of membership of a project steering committee. This would have enhanced oversight, as well as the effectiveness and efficiency of the project in achieving its objectives, and further strengthened the sustainability of the model as well as strengthening VNSW.

Some concerns remain regarding the sustainability of WrW clubs following the end of CVN support. While DSVP is committed to the model, and funding is available to support core activities, there is a risk that dependence on sub-DSVP support, and lack of strong internal management within the clubs, will weaken the autonomy of the clubs and possibly lead to decreased support from members. On-going mentoring support from VNSW would help reduce this risk.

Key lessons learned from the NQ project include:

- Partnership with DSVP, as the key government duty-bearer for FSW, has paid significant dividends in regard to the magnitude of the impact of activities and sustainability of outcomes;
- Increased awareness and understanding amongst FSW and duty-bearers of the needs of FSW, available services and their rights to access them, is not, in itself sufficient to increase their utilization of those services;
- One size doesn't fit all: the situation regarding FSW differs in every province, and is also changing constantly; while the basic NQ project model is sound, an important feature is its flexibility. In future replication of the NQ model, care needs to be taken to ensure that it is not implemented in a formulaic way, but can be adapted to fit the needs of each specific situation.

The following recommendations are made:

General recommendations

- In addition to MOLISA's DSVP, as well as VNSW, future projects of this type should involve as partners other key agencies, in particular the MOPS and MOJ. At the local level, involvement of People's Committees is also needed.
- Oversight for project implementation should be provided through a project steering committee comprising representatives of all partners;
- It is important to consider the diversity among how different sex workers operate, for example, exploration is needed of ways in which to approach younger, venue-based FSW, as well as the rapidly expanding group of mobile phone, internet and social media-based FSW, who are difficult to access through conventional outreach approaches.

Recommendations for Government

- MOLISA (DSVP) should consider working more closely at the national level with the MOPS and MOJ in order to address the problems related to issue of replacement ID cards and household registration documents, and generally reduce the administrative barriers that prevent access of socially marginalized populations to services;
- DSVP should follow up or reinforce the adoption of guidelines developed by the project for police and for legal aid providers. Given the little remaining time of the NQ project it will not be possible to implement the capacity building activities that would ensure that all police and legal aid providers in the project sites are fully aware of these tools and familiar with their contents. For this reason DSVP needs to provide on-going support for this important part of the process;
- DSVP should consider organization of specific events under their annual workplan and budget that include opportunities, at national and provincial level, for public consultation and dialogues on the rights of FSW and issues related to them.

Recommendations for CARE

- CVN should consider ways in which it can continue to play a role at the national level in advocacy with MOLISA (DSVP), MOPS, MOJ and other key agencies in order to address the problems faced by FSW and other socially marginalized groups related to ID cards and household registration documents;
- CVN should explore avenues for providing on-going support to sustaining and replication of the NQ model, through serving as a capacity-building resource for DSVP and VNSW, as well as support for implementation of the UNFPA-led Advocacy Strategy;

- In the remaining time of the project, CVN staff should work closely with sub-DSVP and WrW clubs in all 3 provinces to ensure that each site has a clear plan for continuation of activities;
- In feasibility studies and planning for future projects with FSW, CVN should explore ways to work more closely with the MOH in order to access reliable estimates of the number of FSW, disaggregated by province, and also the forms of sex work they are engaged in.

2. INTRODUCTION

2.1 Background and programme description

This report presents the findings from the Final Evaluation of the *Nâng Quyền* (“Women’s Empowerment”) (NQ) project implemented by CARE International in Viet Nam (CVN), under CARE’s Socially Marginalised People (SMP) program. The evaluation was undertaken in April-May 2017 by a team of consultants engaged by Care Viet Nam, consisting of an international consultant and a Vietnamese national consultant, with support from CVN staff.

On 20 June 2012, Vietnam abolished compulsory rehabilitation for sex workers, with passage of a new Law on the Handling of Administrative Sanctions¹ that will be formalized in a new ordinance to be presented to the National Assembly (NA) in 2019. Sex work is considered as illegal in Vietnam, and prior to the 2012 change sex workers were subject to harsh treatment through compulsory incarceration in provincial detention centres (“05 Centres”), managed by the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MOLISA). In addition to detention, sex workers were frequently subject to physical and mental abuse and often humiliating and degrading treatment by law enforcement authorities. Sex workers were also subject to social stigma and discrimination, as well as self-stigmatization. As a result sex workers faced greatly increased risk of HIV and other STIs, gender-based violence, and other threats to their physical and psychological well-being, and they and their families suffered loss of their rights to access a range of services including health, education and legal services. Under the new law sex work continues to be illegal, but it is now subject to the much more lenient administrative sanctions, with a maximum penalty of 500,000 VND for individuals accused of selling sex. Nevertheless, sex workers and their families continue to face important challenges regarding access to essential services, and social stigma and discrimination.

¹ The Law on Handling Administrative Sanctions 2012 does not include specific provisions on sex work: the reference to sex work is indirect, in Article 24(1)(b), which refers to the maximum fine level for violations in the field of social evil prevention and control. However, the Law’s implementing Decree No. 167/2013 on the Provisions of Administrative Sanction in Security and Order, the Social Security, the Prevention of Social Evils [...] stipulates the administrative sanctions for different activities related to sex work (see UNFPA 2016).

The change in the law on sex work represents a major shift in social policy, and has sparked debate on whether Viet Nam should go a further step and legalize sex work. The change has also profoundly affected the operations of the Department of Social Vices Prevention and Combat (DSVP) under MOLISA, the agency tasked with responsibility of managing the issue of sex work. In place of an approach that sought to abolish sex work, the DSVP has adopted one of harm reduction (HR). While still encouraging sex workers to cease this work and engage in other occupations, the role of sub-DSVP offices (the provincial level of the DSVP) has now shifted to a supportive role. DSVP is not the only Government agency affected, and the change in the law also means that other agencies, such as the MOPS and MOJ will have to adapt to the new situation.

In this context, the NQ project was initiated, with the aim of fostering positive, sustainable results in the empowerment of female sex workers (FSW). The initiative addresses the underlying causes of exclusion, and aims to strengthen FSW's voice in decision-making and improve access to protection from gender-based violence (GBV) and encourage policy makers to be more responsive to FSW rights. The overarching strategy of NQ is to work in close cooperation with the DSVP to support a paradigm shift away from punitive approaches to controlling sex work. Capitalising on recent legislative changes, and drawing on established relationships and previous programming experience, NQ developed an empowering model of engagement with FSW (under the WrW clubs), and advocated for replication at scale by the Government of Vietnam and other stakeholders. The approach of the project integrates a range of components designed to support a stronger voice of FSW, and improve capacities to lead actions to improve access to services, protections and other benefits. This is linked with interventions which address deeply rooted stigma affecting FSWs and promote a more positive engagement of men and key duty bearers in realising their responsibilities.

Accordingly, the overall NQ project goal is that “socially marginalised women equitably benefit from development, are resilient to changing circumstances and have a legitimate voice” and the end of project outcome for NQ is that “FSW are empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable access to opportunities and services”.

The NQ Project commenced on 1st July 2013 and is due to end on 30th June 2017. The executing agency for the project is CARE Australia, under a grant of AUD\$ 1,566,779 from the Australian Government. The Government Strategic Partner is DSVP of MOLISA, with key implementing partners comprising Provincial DOLISA/DSVP of Can Tho, Quang Ninh, and HCMC and We Are Women (WrW) Clubs in these provinces. Project sites consist of Can Tho City, Ha Long City in Quang Ninh, and Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC).

The direct beneficiaries of the project were intended to be 2,244 female FSW in Can Tho, HCMC, and Quang Ninh, together with a total of 840 duty bearers (including local authorities, police and policy makers) in these sites. The indirect beneficiaries of the project are FSW throughout Viet Nam, through replication of the model.

The NQ project has three main Outcomes as follows:

Outcome 1

Female sex workers have a strong platform for collective voice (*through We are Women – “WrW” clubs*).

Outcome 2

DSVP recognises, utilises and supports female sex worker collective voice and action.

Outcome 3

Police, local authorities, legal service providers at national and local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards female sex workers.

2. 2. Review purpose and objectives

Full details of the final evaluation are outlined in the terms of reference (TORs), attached as Annex 1. The main goal of the evaluation is to assess the effectiveness, relevance, of the NQ project and generate lessons learnt and recommendations for future projects targeting FSW, and programming under CARE’s *Socially Marginalized People* (SMP) program. An external evaluation team, comprising an international consultant and a national consultant, supported by CVN staff, undertook the final evaluation, in order to ensure an independent, objective assessment of the project’s achievements.

The evaluation was conducted against the revised version of the NQ Project M&E Plan, dated August 2015. This plan reflects the actual implementation of the project and differs from the original project documents completed prior to the start of the project in 2013.

2.3. Evaluation framework

Evaluation questions

As stated in the TOR, the evaluation aimed to answer the following overarching questions:

- 1) *To what extent have the project strategies and approaches achieved the outcomes of the NQ project?*
- 2) *What are the key lessons learnt which should inform the work of CARE and others?*

In answering these questions, the evaluation applied OECD/DAC’s five criteria: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, (emerging) impacts, and sustainability. As

foreshadowed in the TOR, “impact” may be more difficult to trace and document, and for this reason the main focus of the evaluation was on the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of the project. The key evaluation issues and questions, main data sources and data collection methods, were set out against the respective OECD criteria in the form of an Evaluation Planning Matrix together with Overall Objective and Outcome-Specific Questions (see Annex 2). Based on these research questions, the team developed specific guidelines for interviews with key informants and focus group discussions (see Annex 3).

2.4. Evaluation methodology

The evaluation employed a mixed-methods approach, which combined quantitative data from project monitoring reports with qualitative data collected by the evaluation team from interviews, focus groups and observations. Based on data obtained, the team drew overall conclusions about the achievement of outcomes, identified key lessons learnt, and developed recommendations.

Documentary data

A list of available reference documents is included below in Section 6. Key existing documentary data related to the *Nâng Quyền* project includes: the original project concept note, proposals, and design documents; regular annual reports submitted to CARE Australia; baseline surveys, consisting the EMERGE study, and the *Nâng Quyền* baseline survey undertaken by the project; mid-term review report; monitoring data table; NQ Exit Strategy document; and the Advocacy Strategy facilitated by UNFPA (2016) and other background documents.

Qualitative data

Qualitative data was collected using in-depth interviews, focus groups and observation during field visits to the three project implementation sites (Can Tho, HCMC and Quang Ninh), and among key stakeholders in Ha Noi (see Annex 4: Tentative Detailed Workplan). Because of the limited timeframe, informants and participants in group discussions were purposively selected to include people with a range of experiences of the project, as well as those who have either left the project or not participated fully in activities. Efforts were made to obtain the views of duty bearers who are familiar with the project, in order to provide different perspectives on activities and results. Documentary material was used to complement information obtained from other sources.

In-depth Interviews (IDI)

Selection of participants for key informant interviews and focus group discussions with FSWs was made in consultation with project staff, and local stakeholders, to identify women who have participated in a representative range of project activities, and reflect key differences among beneficiaries. In addition, interviews were conducted with key stakeholders in each site, the number being determined according to people and organizations identified by CVN, as well as their availability.

Focus Group Discussions (FGD)

Two FGD were conducted in each implementation site: one with FSW and one with other stakeholders. These FGD provided additional information and perspectives on activities implemented, achievements and views in relation to the key evaluation questions. This information complements that obtained in individual interviews with FSW and stakeholders.

Observation

Where possible, the team undertook observations in each site related to the relevant evaluation questions. This included the setting and working environment of FSW, presence and behaviour of police, media such as posters or signs and body language. Information obtained complemented that obtained in individual interviews and FGD with FSW and stakeholders.

Quantitative data

Qualitative data was supplemented by quantitative data obtained from project monitoring reports and CVN staff. Owing to time constraints, a strategic decision was made by CVN not to conduct an endline survey prior to the evaluation, as originally intended, nor was it possible to include a survey questionnaire in the evaluation fieldwork. The possible implications of this for the validity of the evaluation findings are discussed later in this report (see Section 2.5 below).

Sampling

As reported by MOLISA, based on police records there are currently over 11,000 sex workers in Viet Nam. However, this figure is probably very conservative, as the Ministry of Health (MOH) estimates that there are about 87,000 female sex workers². Other sources give figures of as many as 300,000 FSW.³ Estimates of the number of FSW in the three NQ implementation sites are more difficult to obtain; in the EMERGE study that, together with the NQ Project Synthesis Report, constitute the baseline for the project, no figures are provided because “country offices were unable to establish lists of the population to be sampled”. According to Le *et al* there are around 80,000 FSW working in HCMC.⁴ No estimates are available for the number of FSW in either Can Tho or Quang Ninh. For this reason, the sampling approach used here, as with the baseline studies, is “beneficiary-based”, that is, based on the population of FSW who are directly or indirectly involved in project activities.

Based on information provided by CVN on numbers and types of beneficiaries and stakeholders in the various implementation sites, together with consideration of the

² Ministry of Health, 2007-12 Estimates and Projections, cited in Meeting Report: Information Sharing on Sex Work in Viet Nam, Green One UN House, 17 March 2016.

³ Le *et al.* 2010, cited in NQ Project Synthesis Report, 2016.

⁴ Le *et al.* 2010, cited in NQ Project Synthesis Report, 2016.

time available, the evaluation team developed a sampling frame for participants in interviews and focus groups (see Table 1).

In all, the evaluation team met with a total of 57 FSW, of whom 17 gave in-depth interviews, and 40 participated in focus group discussions. Brief details of FSW who participated in in-depth interviews are given in Table 2. Of the women interviewed, 3 were street-based SW, 4 were venue-based, 6 were phone-based, and 4 had retired from sex work. Among focus group participants, 14 were street-based, and 26 were either venue-based, worked by phone contact, or had retired. In HCMC separate FGDs were organized for street-based and venue-based sex workers; the venue-based discussion was conducted in a karaoke bar and most participants had not been involved directly in project activities including attendance at WrW club meetings.

Table 1: Sampling frames (information provided by CVN)

i) FSW

Location	FSW						
	Total involved in WrW activities	Interviews		Focus group participants			
		Planned	Actual	Planned		Actual	
				Street-based	Venue-based or other	Street-based	Venue-based or other
HCMC	228	8	7	8	8	14	9
Can Tho	58	5	7	-	8	-	8
Quang Ninh	32	4	3	-	8	-	9
Total	318	17	17	8	24	14	26

ii) Other stakeholders

Location	Other Stakeholders			
	Interviews		Focus group participants	
	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual
HCMC	7	5	8	4
Can Tho	5	3	8	7
Quang Ninh	5	2	8	8
Ha Noi	5	7	-	-

In all three sites interviews and FGDs were held with other stakeholders, consisting of sub-DSVP personnel, legal aid representatives, police, health sector representatives, and other people or organizations involved in project activities. In HCMC a representative of the L’Oréal Foundation⁵, which provides vocational support for marginalized women, participated in the FGD, and the team also met with Ms. Thuy, the former CVN project manager. In Ha Noi, in addition to meetings with CVN staff, interviews were held with two senior DSVP managers, and representatives of VNSW, ILO, and UNFPA, however no representative of Plan International was available for interview. The international consultant also met informally with the Ms. Khat Thi Hai Oanh, Executive Director of the Center for Supporting Community Development Initiatives (SCDI). A full list of people met is included as Annex 5.

Table 2: Summary Information of FSW workers interviewed in course of the study

No	Age	Place of birth	Education	Type of SW	Experience of GBV in last 3 years	Involvement in WrW club activities ⁶
HCMC						
1	50	Dong Thap	Grade 9	Street-based	Yes, former partner	Member
2	n/a	n/a	n/a	Retired	n/a	Management Board
3	31	HCMC	Grade 7	Venue-based	Yes. Verbal abuse	Non-member
4	25	An Giang	Grade 12	Venue-based	Yes. Conflict with FSW who is working with same venue	Member
5	51	HCMC	Grade 6	Street-based	Yes. Verbal abuse	Core member
6	23	Dong Nai	Grade 10	Venue-based	No	Non-member
7	22	HCMC	Grade 9	Venue-based	No	Non member
Can Tho						
8	32	Can Tho	Grade 3	Retired	n/a	Management Board member, outreach worker

⁵ <http://fondationloreal.com/en>

⁶ Club members generally consist of ordinary members, core members, who not only attend regularly, but also engage in outreach activities, and leaders, who are part of the management board (see Section 3.1.1 and Table 3).

9	38	Can Tho	Grade 11	Street-based	Yes. Former partner	Outreach worker
10	55	Can Tho	Grade 6	Phone/ regulars	No	Member
11	31	Can Tho	Grade 3	Phone/ regulars	Yes. Client hit her	Member (irregular attendance as far from home)
12	45	Can Tho	Grade 4	Phone Not regular	Yes. Suspects HIV infection from regular partner	Member
13	30	Can Tho	Grade 9	Phone	No	Member
14	35	Can Tho	Grade 10	Phone	Yes. Partner threatened to hit her	Leader
Quang Ninh						
15	40	Quang Ninh	n/a	Retired	n/a	Leader/ Management Board
16	29	Bac Giang	Grade 12	Phone/ regulars	No.	Management Board/outreach
17	40	Quang Ninh	Grade 12	Retired	n/a	Outreach worker

Analysis of findings

Analysis of qualitative information collected from the various sources was based on the evaluation criteria, using standard techniques, including content analysis, identification of commonalities and disparities, and selection of illustrative quotes from beneficiaries and other stakeholders. Qualitative data from different sources was triangulated, and cross-checked with available quantitative data. Owing to time constraints, there was no opportunity to validate findings through consultations with stakeholders, and due to unforeseen circumstances, a planned debriefing meeting with CVN did not go ahead as planned. However the consultants shared with CVN a detailed PowerPoint presentation containing key preliminary findings, and feedback provided by CVN and CARE Australia was incorporated into the final report.

The final report will be circulated among CVN and Care Australia staff, and among key stakeholders, and this process will provide an opportunity for further validation of the results of the evaluation, as well as comprising an important step in the dissemination of the results. The consultants hope that, once the final evaluation

report is approved, the Executive Summary of the report will be translated into Vietnamese for wider distribution among stakeholders.

Confidentiality and ethical considerations

Owing to the highly sensitive situation of sex workers in regard to the law and social stigma in Viet Nam, confidentiality and maintaining ethical research practices were a priority in conducting this evaluation. For this reason the methodology was formulated on the principles of “do-no-harm” and informed consent, in keeping with CARE’s “Ethical & Moral Work Standards and Practices”, the Australian Council for International Development (ACFID) *Principles and Guidelines for ethical research and evaluation in development* and other accepted international standards.

In conducting interviews and FGDs with FSW, informed consent was sought from all informants. In the introduction to interviews and FGDs, the evaluation team outlined the purpose of the assignment, described how information provided will be used, that individual informants will not be identified by name or through disclosure of other personal details, and information collected will be disposed of on completion of the final report. The evaluation team explicitly requested permission from informants to make an audio recording of interviews and FGDs, and explained that it would be used solely for the purpose of accurately recording responses, not be shared outside the evaluation team. The team informed participants that they were free to choose not to answer questions with which they feel uncomfortable, and they could withdraw from the interview or FGD at any time. No photographs or videos were taken of informants. In addition, the team advised informants that should they need counseling support following the interviews or FGD, that they could inform CVN staff, who had prepared a list of local service providers in each location.

Care was taken in storage to safeguard information obtained, and during analysis interview and FGD data was coded, using assumed names in order to prevent identification of individual informants. Records of interviews and FGDs with FSW, together with audio recordings and any other identifying information collected in the course of the final evaluation assignment will be destroyed on completion of the assignment.

2.5 Potential risks and limitations

The main risks related to this final evaluation concern the accuracy of measurement of changes that have resulted, assessment of their significance, and attribution to project activities. As mentioned above, it was not possible to conduct an endline survey to complement the baseline survey undertaken at the commencement of the project. This reduced considerably the power of the methodology, as changes resulting from project activities could not be accurately measured, and correlations between changes and key variables such as age, education, socio-economic status, and ethnicity were not able to be made. The evaluation relied on qualitative data to identify significant changes, issues and challenges faced.

To be fair, however, the situation of sex workers in regard to the law and social stigma in Viet Nam means that even had an endline survey been possible it still would have been very difficult to establish the size of the study population and select a significantly representative sample. This was already the case with the baseline study for the project. So even if changes were found to have taken place it would have been difficult to assess their significance, let alone attribute them to project activities.

These considerations aside, using the methodology described above, the evaluation team managed to obtain data that is sufficient, in both quantity and quality, to answer the key evaluation questions. This was achieved by careful selection of informants to include a wide range of perspectives, inclusion of questions in the interview and FGD guidelines that will provide clear answers to the key questions, attention to setting and approach in conducting interviews and focus groups, and triangulation of findings, using information from informants in different sectors, and within the same sector, obtained using different techniques, as well as observation, to cross-check and verify findings. These methods also reduced any possible risk to validity due to differences between the interviewers and the informants, such as age, gender, education, or ethnicity.

3. FINDINGS

Findings are presented here in two stages: the first looks closely at the results of the project in terms of whether, and to what extent, the activities were implemented as planned and achieved the intended outputs and outcomes, and any challenges that may have been encountered. This stage corresponds, in the main, to the “effectiveness” aspect of the OECD criteria. The second stage involves an assessment of the broader issues under the OECD criteria: was the project relevant, was it efficient in terms of use of financial and human resources, did it have an impact on the issue of the empowerment of female sex workers, and is the approach, and the impact, sustainable in the long term?

3.1 Effectiveness

This section looks at the effectiveness of each of the three key outcomes of the NQ project, before considering two overarching issues: i) how and why project strategies and tools have influenced the achievement of results; and ii) how effective NQ has been in supporting changes against the three domains of CARE’s Women’s Empowerment Framework.

Outcome 1: Female sex workers have a strong platform for collective voice (through WrW clubs)

Outputs under Outcome 1 are intended to empower FSW community-based organizations (CBOs) to actively participate in joint efforts of civil society on equitable access to services, safe sex work, and reduce stigma and violence. CVN

previously supported the development of three FSW self-help groups called “We are Women” (WrW) Clubs in Can Tho, bringing together FSW for mutual support and action. Under NQ the scope and capacities of WrW Clubs was extended; in addition to continued support for one club in Can Tho, clubs were established in two additional provinces, HCMC and Quang Ninh, with the aim of being a model that would enable FSW to communicate with duty bearers, gain equitable access to services, and influence policies and decisions that affect their lives.

WrW activities and membership

Core activities of WrW clubs include: outreach to FSW (HR, legal literacy on GBV protection, health and work rights); personal financial management (savings and loan scheme); referrals to health services (ARV, methadone, STIs, reproductive health), financial services (rehabilitation fund of DOLISA, VBSP) and vocational training; access to GBV protection; networking and participation in various forums for information, advocacy, and dialogues with local authorities and police.

WrW clubs are currently active in three provinces, Can Tho, HCMC and Quang Ninh, under CVN support, with an additional 2 clubs established under support of sub-DSVP in Quang Ninh, at Uong Bi and Cam Pha. Each club has a management board, comprising 3-5 FSW

“WrW clubs appeal more to lower income-earning FSW. If you want to meet higher income FSW then you have to go out and approach them; we are interested in them, but they are not interested in us. They just want health information from us, but don’t want to reveal their identity. They don’t give us their names, or attend club meetings. This is not just for WrW but for all clubs; it’s common for all younger FSW, some of whom are students, not to want to reveal their identity.”

Ms. Hue, Head 05 Section, sub-DSVP, Quang Ninh

members, which receives administrative support from sub-DSVP, for example in financial management and reporting. Meetings are held once or twice per month. The number of members of each club is difficult to estimate, owing to varying regularity in attendance at monthly meetings, and differences in definition among informants. Each club has a number of regular attendees, as well as additional members whose attendance is irregular. Some regular attendees, including club leaders, also engage in outreach work, and these appear to correspond to “core members” mentioned in project documents.

“We’ve learned about using condoms, prevention of STIs and other diseases, GBV, the L’Oreal hairdressing courses and other things. The information is necessary, and easy to understand. It’s the first time I’ve ever learned about these things,”

Venue-based FSW in FGD, HCMC

The format and function of WrW clubs differs; in HCMC the membership of the club consists largely of street-based FSW, for whom the club serves as a casual drop-in

centre, in addition to a place for more formal meetings. In general, venue-based FSW don't attend club meetings, although they do benefit from outreach activities conducted by the club. In Can Tho members are mainly venue-based and the number regularly attending meetings is relatively low, possibly related, at least in part, to the location of the club, which is some distance from the work venues and homes of members. Members appear to be more actively engaged in outreach work than in HCMC. In Quang Ninh, the WrW club consists of around 20 core members, who are actively engaged in outreach work. According to management committee members the club is not seeking to increase its membership, as this would create challenges in regard to its role in conducting outreach activities.

"WrW has reduced my stress, and given me more knowledge about the law and GBV. I'm happy to be able to help other women."

FSW Can Tho

In general members are highly appreciative of the WrW clubs and the knowledge and skills obtained from training.

The main benefits derived include peer support, information related to HIV and STI prevention and treatment, and other health issues, increased knowledge of rights to access health and legal services, contact information for legal aid and

police, health insurance, and access to vocational support in the form of training and small start-up loans for those sex workers who wish to engage in other income-generating activities. Several informants cited information on prevention of GBV as a key benefit, in particular reduction of risks and strategies to deal with violence. Much of the information on dealing with GBV came from facilitated group discussion among fellow club members. Street-based FSW appear to derive greater benefit from attendance at WrW meetings and club activities than venue-based FSW, who are generally younger, better educated, and earn considerably more money. While venue-based FSW appreciate outreach visits and condom distribution, they see little additional benefit to be gained from sacrificing the time to attend WrW meetings.

Total numbers of direct beneficiaries from NQ activities are given in Table 3, and the number of FSW beneficiaries disaggregated by project focus is provided in Table 4. As can be seen, the total number of direct FSW beneficiaries was 2,421; with over 4,000 indirect beneficiaries

"I'm happy with the WrW club. It provides emotional support, and I'm happy to have human warmth. If I had the opportunity I would change my life. But our lives can't change too much because we need money. It's hard for us to switch jobs. We need vocational training."

FSW, HCMC

consisting of family or dependents. On the whole, the figures achieved for FSW exceed both the expected and target numbers of FSW direct beneficiaries, which were 561 and 2,244 respectively (see NQ Design Narrative Document). All three clubs report good retainment of membership. As can be seen from Table 5, which compares baseline survey data on membership from the January 2016 report with figures from April 2017, there has been slow growth in the membership of the three clubs, with an estimated increase in the total number of core members from 50 to

100, and extended members from 230-240 to 632. The Can Tho club reported that previously there were well over 200 members, but the number has fallen recently as members left sex work and the club.

Table 3: Total direct beneficiaries (source: CVN)

Year	FSW	Stakeholders		Total
		Male	Female	
2015	546	24	5	575
2016	567	17	38	622
2017	1210	179	143	1532
Total	2323	220	186	2729

Table 4: FSW disaggregated by types of project focus

Year	Participate in dialogs	Support from local authorities and SPs	Club meetings	VNSW beneficiaries
2015	0	N/A	60	0
2016	68	171	367	29
2017	72	86	299	307
Total	140	257	726	336

Clubs pay members an allowance of 50,000 VND to cover transport costs to and from meetings. Club members contribute 5,000 VND of this amount towards a savings fund that is intended to provide small loans to members, and serve as an emergency fund for those in need. In HCMC all the accumulated savings have been distributed, however in Can Tho, the fund has saved an amount of 2 million VND since it started in October 2016. These funds will be used to contribute to the continuation of activities after the project ends in June 2017.

Table 5: Comparison of number of WrW clubs and membership January 2014-April 2017 (Source: NQ Baseline survey, 2014 – in NQ Baseline Synthesis Report FINAL Jan. 2016; CVN and field visit data)

Target province	# WrW clubs		# management board members		Est. # core members		Est. # of club extended members	
	Jan 2016	Apr 2017	Jan 2016	Apr 2017	Jan 2016	Apr 2017	Jan 2016	Apr 2017
Can Tho	1	1	3	4	20	30	170	228
HCMC	1	1	2	5	20	50	30 – 40	382 ^o
Quang Ninh	1	1	3	3	10	20	30	32
Total	3	3	8	12	50	100	230-40	632

All 3 WrW clubs engage in outreach activities, supported through small grants, in order to provide FSW with knowledge about health, GBV, HIV prevention, and legal support. In Can Tho the WrW club conducts outreach activities without any other support, whereas in HCMC and Quang Ninh outreach activities are linked with and supported by other projects and organizations. For example, in HCMC the PAC provides outreach workers with condoms and lubricant gel. The WrW clubs in HCMC and Can Tho appear to consider their primary role as self-help groups, however the Quang Ninh WrW has a different focus, with outreach as its primary role. Quang Ninh WrW club leaders explained that monthly meetings involve a group of 20 core members who are all involved in outreach work, and the club does not encourage regular attendance by other FSW at meetings. This role may stem from the sex work situation in Quang Ninh, which, in contrast to HCMC and Can Tho, is predominately venue-based, with few street-based FSW. A brief comparison of the WrW clubs in the 3 sites is included as Table 6.

“One result of the project activities is that owners [of venues] are now more supportive of the women. As employers they benefit, and they protect the rights of the women,” FSW Quang Ninh

Table 6: Comparison between WrW clubs in 3 sites

Site	# Members	Member profile	Main Activities	
			Club Meetings	Outreach activities
Can Tho	30	Street-based and venue-based	☑	☑
HCMC	50	Mainly street-based	✓	✓
Quang Ninh	20 [†]	Core members engaged in outreach activities	Mainly limited to core members	✓

The number of FSW accessed through outreach differs according to location. Outreach workers from HCMC visit as many as 70 establishments a month, while in Quang Ninh the number is

“The [WrW] Club is very helpful; the women do not judge us, and they give us guidance and [take us for] health check-ups... Everything we share with them is kept confidential.”

Venue-based FSW, HCMC

lower, around 30-40. This is largely due to the size of venues, which varies considerably, with the number of workers in each ranging from as few as 1 or 2 women to over 30, although this varies considerably from month to month. The venue in HCMC visited by the evaluation team had 20-25 workers. Without reliable estimates of the number of FSW in each site it is difficult to assess the coverage by outreach workers. However, even with regular contact with street-based FSW, and coverage of venues through visits by outreach workers, increased IT access has caused major changes in the forms of sex work and created a rapidly expanding group of FSW who work through mobile phone, chat rooms, and other internet-based social media. Several FSW informants mentioned that, while they had “retired” from street or venue-based work, they continued to work using mobile phone contact with regular customers. These women had become involved in the NQ project while still working in venues, or through personal contact with friends in the project, however an increasing number of younger women, who no longer work in venues or on the streets, are essentially invisible, and present enormous challenges to outreach services.

“After the project ends in June there should be more support for livelihoods. Income is the key factor that determines why women stay in sex work, but currently we can only provide livelihood support for women who have household registration in HCMC. We need to find a way to help all women. The social security policy needs to change,” Mr. Le Van Quy, Vice-President, sub-DSVP HCMC

FSW informants in all 3 implementation sites identified difficulties related to issue of ID cards and household registration documents as being one of their greatest concerns. Not only does lack of ID or household registration documents prevent access to health care services and insurance, enrolment in vocational courses, and housing rental, but it is also a barrier to school enrolment for their children. Service providers also mentioned ID cards and household registration as a key area of the support they provided to FSW. While this challenge remains, benefits to FSW from increased provision of services and increased awareness and understanding among service providers will remain limited. This issue is of course not confined to FSW, and is an important national problem that affects many disadvantaged groups. DSVP alone is not able to address the issue as it involves other ministries, in particular the MOPS and MOJ.

Finding alternative work, and vocational training is another important area of concern for FSW, mentioned by most informants interviewed. While not an activity supported directly under NQ, links with other agencies and organizations opened up opportunities for

“Our needs for vocational training are totally different from what ‘experts’ or local authorities think we should have.”

Ms. Thuy, Leader, VNSW Ha Noi

FSW in WrW clubs to find work in other areas, or enrol or apply for training courses, such as that offered by the sub-DSVP or the L’Oréal Foundation. As will be discussed below, there is an issue regarding the extent to which enrolment in sub-DSVP vocational training is voluntary, or conditional upon leaving sex work. Enrolment in vocational training also requires women to have local household registration documents, which many FSW do not possess. In any case, FSW were critical of the appropriateness of vocational training offered, much of which women considered unrealistic. DSVP is aware of these challenges, but unable to do much at present. However, it is important that should any future vocational or livelihood programs be developed, this must be done in consultation with FSW and respond to their needs.

“They offered us training in basket weaving, but how much money can I make from that?”

FSW, HCMC

During interviews, FSW informants were also asked whether they had personal experience of GBV within the last 3 years. Of the total of 17 women interviewed, 8 stated that they had experienced some form of GBV. Types of GBV included being hit or abused by clients, hit by partners, suspected HIV infection from a partner and conflict with a fellow-worker. None of these incidents were reported to police or other authorities. Reasons given were fear of being arrested and fined by police, in the case of GBV by clients, or fear of reprisal by family members, in the case of GBV by partners.

Overall, the number of FSW who have benefited directly from involvement in WrW club activities represents a relatively small proportion of the total number of women estimated to be engaged in sex work; and those who have benefited are largely limited to the 3 implementation sites, and tend to be FSW who are already

seeking to leave the profession, such as older women and street-based sex workers. Benefits for younger, venue-based FSW are mainly related to HIV and STI prevention. In addition, with major changes occurring in the forms of sex work, through greatly increased mobile phone, internet and social media access, there is likely to be an expanding group of FSW that will present challenges to outreach. Future projects in this area need to explore ways in which to approach younger, venue-based FSW, as well as the rapidly expanding group of mobile phone, internet and social media-based FSW, who are difficult to access through conventional outreach approaches.

WrW club communication and capacity building

All three WrW Clubs have the capacity to implement actions to address their own priorities. Each club has a well-defined management structure, and all clubs engage in regular activity planning, which may be on a weekly, monthly quarterly or annual basis, according to the location. All clubs arrange meetings in order to identify members' priorities in preparation for dialogues with local authorities. Over the period 2015-16 all activities planned in the Club's annual plans were implemented, including dialogues with duty bearers, communication events, outreach activities and referral activities. However, at present all three clubs rely on support from sub-DSVP for reporting and convening of consultation meetings involving other agencies.

“Previously FSW did not dare to speak out in public, but since the dialogues started in 2015 we feel confident to stand in front of authorities and speak out,” FSW, HCMC

In general, club leaders consist of women who have benefited from previous group experience, in particular HIV and AIDS prevention, care and support networks, and have a high capacity for outreach, planning and management, as well as strong networks among local service providers especially in the health sector. Leaders have benefited from the training and experience provided under CVN support and are able to apply their skills and knowledge to benefit members. For example, in HCMC, club leaders are quite proactive in organizing club events and in identifying new benefit schemes for their members. Further, in the same way that WrW members benefited from previous experience in HIV and AIDS activities, WrW club capacity building activities supported by CVN has benefited implementation of activities supported by other agencies or donors. This can be seen clearly in HCMC and Quang Ninh, where club leaders contribute to project activities implemented by the PAC and the Provincial Health Offices, the ILO sex worker project and initiatives such as the L'Oréal Foundation's training program.

“I used to work in a karaoke bar and met WrW club members when they came to do activities there. I started attending meetings right away. Now I do outreach activities myself,” FSW Can Tho

Capacity building activities for members included communication sessions intended to increase knowledge and awareness of specific issues, as well as workshops designed to develop skills. During the period 2015-16 a total of 27 communication sessions were conducted by the WrW clubs for 375 FSWs on topics including: vulnerabilities of FSW, signs of GBV, how to avoid GBV; GBV responses; and HIV and AIDS prevention. Key capacity building activities for skills development mainly consisted of training of leaders in leadership and facilitation skills and advocacy. Club board members were provided with coaching on planning and were trained in leadership and facilitation skills to carry out clubs' activities including advocacy. Activities included two 2-day advanced training workshops on leadership skills provided to 20 club members in Can Tho and 22 in Quang Ninh, a 2-day training workshop on facilitation skills focusing on skills to facilitate discussion on GBV against FSW for 6 core members of the 3 clubs and 7 (5 male and 2 female) DSVP staff. Leaders also participated in site visits, for example a visit to Hue with DSVP included 3 representatives of WrW clubs. During the visit the group met with a group of 15 FSW, resulting in establishment of a WrW club in Hue that connected with VNSW and participates in events organized by the Network.

Stakeholder dialogues

A key project activity was the organization of quarterly dialogues between WrW club members and local duty bearers including service providers. As well as WrW members and sub-DSVP representatives, participants included police officers, and legal aid providers or lawyers. The frequency of dialogues and numbers of FSW that attended varied somewhat within and between provinces, as did the representation from duty bearers. Even so, for both sides, the opportunity to meet was greatly appreciated.

“The main reason for the change of attitude of the police was the dialogues that were organized by sub-DSVP when the project first started. The quarterly dialogues were based on FSW needs and united FSW to participate in the dialogue. It helped the police understand the needs of the target group – they didn't hide their identities, and the police could see their real needs,” WrW Leader, Quang Ninh

Topics discussed in dialogues were based on issues identified in WrW club meetings, and included, among others, GBV and residential registration, IDs, and implementation of the government decree on providing dedicated loans for FSW. **For WrW club members, the dialogues provided an opportunity to express their opinions and needs in a neutral setting, and to meet duty bearers face-to-face.** For many duty bearers, it was the first time they had heard directly from FSW about their lives and experience of violence, stigma and discrimination. In the course of dialogues, WrW members also had an opportunity to speak personally with duty bearers, and several informants mentioned that they had obtained the telephone

numbers of police with an invitation to call for assistance should the need arise. The establishment of links on a personal basis, seems to have been central to the success of this activity.

“This project has helped change the attitudes and behavior of police towards FSW,”

Ms. Pham Thi Hong Huong, Legal Aid staff HCMC

As a result of these quarterly dialogues, FSW involved in project activities have achieved a much-improved platform for expressing their needs to local authorities, with potential for input into local planning for service provision and, to a lesser extent, policy formulation.

Networking and linkages

Networking and establishment of linkages with other groups and agencies is a key component of the NQ model that complements and strengthens the WrW clubs, as well as the capacity building component. Networking with local authorities, in particular sub-DSVP and legal aid and health, has built on the quarterly dialogues, which were a major factor in increasing WrW club links with local authorities.

Horizontal networking has also taken place with other CBOs, either through contact with existing CBO networks, or through previous involvement of WrW club leaders in other groups, for example in HCMC, where strong CBO networks have been developed under the government’s HIV and AIDS program in the province. WrW in HCMC has linked with other 6 CBOs; WrW club in Quang Ninh has linked to other 3 CBOs; and WrW in Can Tho has linked with 11 CBOs. WrW board members have joined activities organized by other CBOs, invited them to the WrW club activities or shared WrW club activities with members of other CBOs. These links, in particular those with other self-help groups, have benefits in regard to provision of referral services for members, such as sexual and reproductive health (SRH), voluntary counselling and testing (VCT), as well as opening additional opportunities for WrW members through participation in activities organized by other groups.

Vertically, WrW linked with VNSW; representatives of VNSW network were invited to different activities such as reflection workshops, WrW clubs’ vision development workshop and training workshops held by the project for sharing experiences and strengthening links. In the period 2015-16 leaders of 2 WrW clubs (QN and HCMC) were appointed to the management board of the VNSW. The development of linkages between the WrW clubs and VNSW benefited VNSW’s national expansion plan, with the cooperation with VNSW resulting in an increase in the number of women’s groups supported by the project from 4 to 21 over the period 2015-16. Under NQ a small grant was provided to VNSW to support, jointly with ILO, GBV training – the topic identified by VNSW as a priority – for members to enable the network to undertake more effective advocacy on this issue. Following the training,

VNSW developed an action plan to build capacity for its members to prevent and respond to violence against FSWs. The collaboration with VNSW subsequently developed into a rather significant activity, which reached a lot of additional direct beneficiaries.

“NQ has influenced national policy by providing a model for effective provincial partnerships... this may be the best contribution of NQ to the VNSW,” Ms. Thuy,
Leader VNSW

In summary, as a result of the NQ project, FSW involved in project activities have achieved a much improved platform for expressing their needs to local authorities, with potential for input into local planning for service provision and, to a lesser extent, policy formulation. The platform comprises three interlinked components: strong WrW clubs that build women’s confidence and enable issues to be identified; convening of regular dialogues with local duty bearers that provide an opportunity for FSW to raise identified issues with duty bearers and establish personal contacts; and linkage of the WrW groups horizontally and vertically with other CBOs and the VNSW.

Outcome 2: Department of Social Vice Prevention (DSVP) recognises, utilises and supports female sex worker collective voice and action

In response to the 2012 Law on the Handling of Administrative Sanctions DSVP needed to adopt a very different approach within the organisation and the learning of new skills to adapt to the changed situation. That is, DSVP needed to shift to a HR or “rights-based” approach, one that accepts women’s decision to engage in sex work, and ensures that any risks to their physical and mental health are minimized, and that FSW enjoy the same access to services as others in society. In contrast with the past, personnel dealing with FSW at the national and local level needed to take a much more participatory approach, and also make linkages with service providers and local authorities.

Accordingly, NQ Project Outcome 2 complements Outcome 1 through activities that support improvement of the capacity of DSVP to respond to FSW needs, listen to FSW and use their experiences to inform policy decision-making, and make linkages between FSW, service providers and authorities. Activities implemented under this outcome include training workshops for DSVP personnel on the causes and impact of GBV and discrimination against FSW, facilitation skills to provide DSVP personnel with alternative approaches to working with FSWs and local authorities, and study visits. The training used participatory methods by applying Social Analysis and Action (SAA) tools, which can be used to enable participants to reflect on their own gender beliefs, biases and attitudes in meetings, workshops and dialogues. Through the application of reflection tools DSVP personnel, police and local authorities learned

that that people can share perceptions on issues and so understanding one other and find solutions.

As a result, **trained DSVP staff provided support to WrW clubs in facilitation of regular meetings** where they collected information on needs, requests and feedback from FSWs and took action. Key issues raised by FSWs included their health situation, difficulties in accessing public administrative services such as requests for ID cards, household registration, and school enrolment for their children. Where possible DSVP staff facilitated referrals to the relevant services. CVN also worked closely with provincial DSVP for the preparation of regular dialogues among duty bearers. The support provided on facilitation flow and discussion tools enabled FSW to gain skills and confidence in facilitation of discussions where expressed their opinions on issues that concerned them, and local authorities could respond.

“If we get into trouble we can contact the sub-DSVP... they don’t bully us, and the guys are nice.”

FSW, Can Tho

By using the dialogue tools, both DSVP staff and WrW club members increased their understanding about GBV issues faced by FSW. DSVP staff were then able to provide more specific support for WrW clubs and FSW, for example accompanying club members to access services such as public administrative services where FSW often face challenges because of discrimination. DSVP staff requested service providers and government officers respond to the needs of club members and as a result, 23 cases (mainly on household registration and ID card application) were supported fully and the issues resolved.

“One important benefit of the NQ project has been capacity building of staff in the system. This was essential, as without the necessary knowledge, including human rights and various agreements, staff would not be able to understand their [new] role. Also staff gained skills in the approaches to management of FSW and those at risk of becoming sex workers,” Mr. Nguyen Xuan Lap, President DSVP Ha Noi

In parallel with NQ project activities, DSVP also initiated projects of its own that provide considerable benefit to FSW. These include medical insurance and small “start-up” grants to FSW who leave sex work, to enable them to set up businesses, or undergo training, for example as hairdressers or manicurists. Joint participation in study visits by DSVP personnel and WrW club members was another approach that helped create a sense of shared awareness and understanding of the situation of FSW and action that is needed to address various issues. As mentioned above, 3 national level and 3 provincial level DSVP staff participated in the study visit to Hue and shared their experience of the NQ project model with DSVP and FSW.

“Government agencies are still struggling to adapt to the change from the old policy that sex work is a social evil that needs to be punished and abolished. Sex work exists in all societies and we need to adopt proper views and actions that are in line with the international context and human rights,” Mr. Nguyen Xuan Lap, President DSVP

WrW club members also had an important opportunity to raise their voices at higher levels during the consultation process for the draft National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020. NQ supported WrW members to attend consultation workshops organized by provincial DSVP where DSVP staff effectively facilitated discussion to collect comments, feedback and recommendations from FSWs. A total of 30 FSWs participated in this activity. Inputs from these meetings, such as highlighting the importance of respecting human rights, reducing stigma and discrimination against sex workers, were used by DSVP in drafting the National Plan. Feedback from FSW in the WrW Clubs, through contact with DSVP in various activities, as well as direct participation of FSW to share their stories in national level workshops, during 2015 resulted in inclusion of the issue of response to GBV as an action point in the National Action Plan, as one of three core activities in Part 3, Section 3 of the Plan: “c) Develop and implement activities to prevent HIV and to prevent and respond to GBV against SW.” A target was set of, by 2020, 50% of provinces implementing activities to prevent GBV against SW. Objectives include i) improve capacity of SW self-help groups to do outreach to prevent GBV; ii) organize policy dialogue between self-help groups and policy makers at different levels; and iii) training and workshops for all stakeholders to improve responsibility to address GBV among SWs (*National Action Plan on Sex Work, p.9*).

“The [DSVP] project provides free medical insurance for women, but it’s conditional on ‘turning good’. I’ve heard some women say they would rather pay for insurance themselves rather than be insulted,” FSW, Can Tho

While there has been an enormous change of approach in DSVP, there remain some issues that need to be addressed. These include the capacity of DSVP personnel to make use of the tools and materials developed by CVN, as well as the tendency

“Thanks to this project we now have increased technical capacity, which can be applied to implementation of the Government’s model.”

Mr Hoa, President of sub-DSVP,

for staff to view NQ as a “project” rather than as a departmental priority. Also, the beneficiaries of capacity-building activities were limited mainly to DSVP staff in senior management and in the 3 project implementation sites. Pending the drafting

and approval by the National Assembly of the new law on sex work, there is also an apparent conflict within DSVP in regard to policy. Currently sex work remains illegal, and while DSVP personnel are generally very sympathetic to the situation and needs of individual FSW, the official policy is that women must be encouraged to “turn good”, leave the profession and take up other “respectable” occupations. Reports from some informants indicate that access to some services may even be made conditional on ceasing involvement in sex work. The degree to which this attitude is held, or promoted, by sub-DSVP personnel varies within and between provinces, but it appears to be fairly widespread especially outside NQ project sites. As such, it serves to maintain the stigmatization of FSW.

“Training on approach skills has been most beneficial to sub-DSVP staff. We already had technical capacity, but lacked experience and skills in working with vulnerable groups. For example, staff had to learn that they need to dress casually, not wearing government ID cards and uniforms, and develop listening and consultation skills, and pay attention to body language,” Mr. Binh, Deputy-Director, sub-DSVP, Quang Ninh

In summary, these activities have together contributed to increased recognition, utilization and support by DSVP of FSW collective voice and action. This is reflected at the national level by incorporation by MOLISA (DSVP) of the NQ project into the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020, as one of three key reference models.⁷

At the local level capacity of DSVP to respond to FSW’s needs has greatly improved. Sub-DVSP is highly supportive, providing various types of assistance for WrW club activities, service referrals, provincial dialogues, and liaison with other relevant agencies, including health, legal aid and police. FSW informants strongly agreed that DSVP had changed in regard to awareness and responsiveness to their needs. DSVP staff also stated that, as a result of various project activities, they had greatly increased their awareness of FSW needs, as well as issues they face, such as GBV and difficulties resulting from lack of ID cards or household registration documents. DSVP in all 3 provinces is highly supportive in regard to facilitating liaison and making linkages between service providers and relevant local authorities and assisting FSW with referrals for services.

Outcome 3: Police, local authorities, legal service providers at national and local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards female sex workers

Outcome 3 complements the previous two outcomes through activities that support improvement of the attitudes and behaviour of police and legal service providers

⁷ The other models comprise ILO’s project on improvement of working conditions of sex workers, and assistance to sex workers through social centers at district level.

towards FSW. While DSVP holds overall responsibility for management of the issue of sex workers, the police and the legal system, as the agencies responsible for law enforcement, represent to FSW the actual face of the law. As

“If I see a policeman, I will run from him. I would climb a tree to hide from the police.”

FSW, Can Tho

such, despite the change in the law, there remain deeply entrenched attitudes on both sides, with women remembering well the treatment they or their friends received previously at the hands of the police and the punishments handed them by the legal system. There is cause for this continued mistrust, as FSW informants reported that police continue to mistreat FSW in many areas.

“From the perspective of the police, we can do only prevention and control. We need collaboration with other agencies, as sex workers are scared of the police,”

Policeman, HCMC

For this reason the NQ project supported activities to improve the response of police to the needs of FSW, and promote supportive practise of legal aid service providers towards FSW. Key activities comprised training police and local authorities on

“Sometimes we speak quite harshly with sex workers because we want them to change their occupation. Its not a crime, but it is still a social evil, and criminals profit from sex work activities... we scare them so that they won’t do sex work again.”

Policeman, HCMC (recently transferred to this district from another area, and did not attend the guidelines workshop)

GBV and related policies, development of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) for police and legal service providers, inclusion of police and legal service providers in dialogues with WrW club members, and participation of police and legal service providers in the national conferences jointly organized by DSVP, SCDI, and CVN, to launch the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020.

“Police who participated in this project have a different attitude, approach to FSW. But it is still very uncomfortable for police and FSW to contact one another, mainly due to the FSW’s fear of the police,” Policeman HCMC

One-day training workshops on GBV related legal frameworks for police and local authorities were conducted in HCMC, Can Tho and Quang Ninh in the period 2014-15. WrW club leaders also participated in these workshops. Police also participated in the regular quarterly dialogues. As a result, attending police officers recognized that they should be accountable for responding to violence reported by FSW, and in quarterly dialogues, police officers provided suggestions and guidance for FSW to report incidences of violence. WrW club members in all 3 provinces were provided

with names and phone numbers of police in charge of some communes. Subsequently FSW reported changes in police attitude when they sought help, for example WrW club leaders in Quang Ninh and Can Tho called the police when their members experienced difficulties with administrative procedures in obtaining their IDs or child birth certificates. In the course of these meetings, 6 positive role models were identified, comprising policemen who demonstrate positive attitudes and behaviours towards FSW. These positive role models were invited to participate in developing and piloting the SOP.

“The main reason for the change of attitude of the police was the dialogues that were organized by sub-DSVP when the project first started. The quarterly dialogues were based on FSW needs and united FSW to participate in the dialogue. It helped the police understand the needs of the target group – they didn’t hide their identities, and the police could see their real need,” WrW Leader, Quang Ninh.

The police SOP was originally intended to provide police with an understanding of the root causes of discrimination and violence against FSW, setting out specific enforceable instructions for police when working with FSW. However, police pointed out that they already have a clear set of protocols governing their behavior, which cannot be easily modified, so they suggested that instead of a formal SOP, the manual be recast as a “Reference Handbook on Working Principles and Attitudes Towards Female Sex Workers”, with the same aim of changing police attitudes and behaviour. A draft was developed based on three consultation meetings with police, DSVP and FSW, and was then circulated for further comments. The document provides police with an understanding of the causes of discrimination and violence against FSW and makes specific recommendations for improving the skills of police when working with FSW. Instead of piloting the SOP as intended, in 2017 the Reference Handbook was disseminated among the police and followed-up with sharing events. Unfortunately, distribution of the Police Reference Handbook close to the end of the project means that opportunities for its use in capacity building are considerably reduced, so there is a risk that it may not be utilized as fully as was intended.

“Even though the police no longer make us clean the toilets, they still use bad language with us and are impolite,” FSW, HCMC

The SOP for legal service providers was drafted by a core team, consisting of representatives of the HCMC Lawyers Association (under the Vietnam Lawyers Association), Tran Cao Lawyer Office in Can Tho city and the Quang Ninh Legal Aid

Centre (under Quang Ninh Provincial Department of Justice). The legal SOP was then piloted by three legal service providers in delivering legal advice and support services to FSWs. Following distribution of the SOP by soft copy, FSW reported that they received friendly and supportive services, and as a result, in the 12 months 2015-16, 88 cases brought forward by FSW were supported (23 from the clubs and 65 cases from the dialogue sessions). However, significantly, most of these cases concerned matters such as household registration and ID card, with no GBV cases reported. Possible reasons for this situation are discussed further later in this report.

“The awareness of local authorities [regarding needs and rights of FSW] has changed significantly, and they now have much more open attitudes. FSW have also changed; they know their rights and they know where to go,” Ms. Pham This

Hong Huong, Legal Aid staff HCMC

Also under Outcome 3, CVN planned originally to organize a national dialogue to showcase good practices in providing service and support to FSW by target duty bearers, including local authorities, police officers, and legal aid service providers, and to advocate for changes to policy and practice at national level. However, due to advocacy success in influencing the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016-2020, it was decided instead include a session to facilitate dialogue between FSW and duty bearers at national level in the two national launch conferences for the Plan jointly organized by DSVP, SCDI, and CVN.

“I can confirm that the NQ project changed awareness of police at local level, and that police attitudes have improved,” Mr. Nguyen Xuan Lap, President DSVP Ha Noi

Nevertheless, even in project sites, where there has been opportunity for FSW to meet face to face with police and obtaining telephone numbers of police with an invitation to call directly, FSW still harbor fears of going directly to police in case of GBV, theft or other more serious incidents. In such cases, FSW said, the police base any action on evidence, and since sex work is still illegal the FSW are reluctant to involve the police in GBV that occurs in the workplace, as it would mean revealing their occupation. Similarly, FSW are reluctant to go to the police in regard to GBV committed by a partner, through fear of the resulting consequences for themselves or for the partner. In general, FSW are more likely to contact police in case of personal or administrative issues, such as requests for issue of new ID cards, and household registration. In more serious cases, such as those that involve other people in potentially criminal activities or accusations, such as GBV, FSW are less likely to report matters to the police. Informants reported that, in the case of GBV perpetrated by clients, they would have to disclose the fact that they were engaged in sex work, and thus be arrested and forced to pay the administration fee. In the

case of GBV involving a partner, FSW were afraid of repercussions from the partner's family or friends.

“No-one wants to call the police... If the police come then it will all be over, I would get caught and have to pay the fine. It's better to get the bouncers to help,” FSW,
Quang Ninh

Legal services in all 3 implementation sites are supportive of FSW, at least those who are involved in WrW clubs, or introduced by them. It is difficult to assess the extent to which this support extends to other FSW outside the project. Legal aid providers have provided contact numbers to WrW club leaders and members met in the course of dialogues, and invited them to contact them at any time they feel in need of legal support. In reality, support provided appears largely to consist of assistance with preparation of applications for ID cards, household registration and other similar issues that require completion of application forms and presentation of documents. While legal aid providers are prepared to assist in other matters, such as GBV cases, it seems that FSW have been reluctant to contact them on these issues, for similar reasons to those given for not involving the police.

“After the dialogue the police gave us their numbers, so we could call and talk to them...it's not the same in every case, or with every cop, but the situation has improved,” FGD with FSW, HCMC

In regard to other service providers and local authorities there have been mixed benefits. Health authorities in the NQ project sites have generally positive attitudes towards FSW, which is not surprising in view of the fact that, in addition to recent participation of provincial and ward level health personnel in project activities, prior to joining the WrW clubs quite a few members were closely involved in HIV and AIDS and STI prevention and care activities. For local authorities, there has been less impact on attitudes and behaviour towards FSW. For example, in Can Tho FSW informants complained that they have been negatively treated when applying for services such as document certification, and purchase of health insurance cards from the ward level People's Committees.

In summary, the NQ project has resulted in changes of attitude among individual police, however this does not yet extend to the institutional level. It is not possible to generalize for all FSW, or for all regions, whether, as a result of NQ project activities, police, local authorities, or legal service providers at national and local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW. Based on reports by FSW in the 3 provinces, while fear of the police remains, and there are reports of mistreatment, in general the attitudes of police have changed

considerably. Whether this is due to project activities or simply the change in the law, closing 05 Centers and replacing punitive action with administrative sanctions, is difficult to determine; based on the reports of FSW interviewed, it seems very likely that it was the impact of activities such as quarterly dialogues, which permitted face-to-face contact between police and FSW in a neutral setting, that changed police attitudes. Greater investment in capacity building of the police and legal services agencies, including involvement of the Ministry of Public Security (MOPS) and Ministry of Justice (MOJ) as key partners in the project, would have helped address these issues

Effectiveness of project strategies and tools in influencing the achievement of results

Several factors are responsible for achievement of the results, however central to the success of the NQ project to date has been the project strategy consisting of three linked outcomes:

- WrW clubs provided FSW with a “safe”, neutral space where they can relax, converse with friends, seek advice or support, learn about their rights, issues or services that are important for their well-being, express their opinions and needs, as well provide leaders who can represent them in consultations with government agencies or other CBOs;
- Partnership with DSVP, as the key responsible government agency, helped ensure that FSW were recognised and supported, and their needs and opinions taken seriously. Importantly, the project provided DSVP with an opportunity to increase its organizational capacity in meeting the challenge of the changed legal environment related to sex work, through training in relevant technical skills and knowledge; and
- Engagement with police and legal agencies, responsible for law enforcement, through raising awareness on the legal situation, rights and entitlements of FSW to access services, has improved positive attitudes and behaviour of their personnel towards FSW.

All three elements described above are essential to the success of the project, however informants, including FSW, DSVP and other duty-bearers, indicated that it was the quarterly dialogues that played the key role. The organization of regular dialogues, permitting face-to-face contact between local authorities and FSW was extremely effective in creating awareness and understanding on both sides, and established an enabling environment for other activities to take place.

Effectiveness of NQ in supporting changes against the three domains of CARE's Women's Empowerment Framework⁸

CARE views women's empowerment as the sum total of changes in regard to i) Agency, that is, a woman's own aspirations and capabilities; ii) Structure, which is the environment that surrounds and conditions a woman's choices; and iii) Relations, referring to the power relations through which a woman negotiates her path. It is valuable to reflect here briefly on the effectiveness of the NQ project in these three areas.

Agency

For FSW involved closely in project activities there have been significant changes, including increased self-esteem and self-confidence, awareness of rights, especially legal rights, increased learning opportunities, such as access to information on health care and HIV & STI prevention, and ID card replacement, household registration and other legal processes. For some women there has been increased access to vocational courses and loans for setting up small businesses, such as tools for hairdressing or a manicure salon. Benefits from group membership, range from friendship and opportunity to share experiences and empathy from other members, to participation in group training activities and skills building, representation, leadership and outreach activities in support of other FSW. Though difficult to assess, it is likely that there are also positive health outcomes. Other changes, such as increases in household assets or decrease in personal expenditure could not be measured.

Structure

In implementation sites channels are now available for communication between FSW and local authorities through which they can express their needs, air grievances, obtain consultation or advice on personal matters, and obtain information and other support. Some structural changes are formal, such as provision of loans for FSW through DSVP, to enable establishment of small businesses, access to legal aid and other services, and the regular dialogues with local authorities, which are highly beneficial to both FSW and service providers. Other structural changes are more informal, for example obtaining telephone numbers of DSVP, legal aid or police, for use in case urgent assistance is required.

Relations

Project activities have increased FSW's awareness of their rights and responsibilities in relation to local authorities, as well as of group relationships, and the advantages of collective action in discourse and negotiation with local authorities in regard to needs. Similarly, changes have occurred in the way local authorities relate to FSW, as WrW clubs provide an important point of contact that was previously lacking. In this regard, the regular dialogues with local authorities, in particular, have been highly

⁸ In 2016 this was further evolved to become the Gender Equality Framework.

beneficial to both FSW and service providers. Women have also gained considerable benefits in terms of mutual support, empathy and emotional support through WrW club activities, including practical support in the form of learning new skills and knowledge from other women.

However, it must be emphasized that the changes described here concern only the project implementation areas. However it is possible that FSW in other districts, or other provinces may have benefited through contact and sharing among local authorities. Wider benefits can also be expected as DSVP implements the National Program on FSW period 2016-2020, with the NQ as one of the reference models.

3.2 Relevance

Relevance refers to the extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries' requirement, country needs, global priorities and partners' and donors' policies". As we have seen, the NQ project was initiated in the context of the significant changes that occurred in the situation regarding SW that followed Viet Nam's shift in 2012 from a punitive to an "administrative sanction" approach. For DSVP, this resulted in an important organizational change involving adoption of a HR or "rights-based" approach.

Considerable encouragement and support for the change to a human rights based approach to sex work in Viet Nam has long been given by international organizations, in particular the UN system, as well as CSOs, including CARE, Plan and local organizations such as SCDI and VNSW.

"The NQ project is in tune with the government's program and international trends. It creates enormous opportunities for FSW to share their experience and information and contribute to harm reduction services."

Mr. Nguyen Xuan Lap, President DSVP, Ha Noi

However, VNSW, as the key local organization working with SW, is hampered by lack of official registration, limiting its operations and autonomy. In general, all CSO activities face the challenges of coverage and continuity in funding, making scale-up and sustainability very difficult.

"For vocational training, we first need verification that a FSW has turned good, which means a check of the records for violations and so on," Ms. Thanh, Vocational Staff, DOLISA Can Tho

For these reasons, the NQ project was highly relevant and very timely, as the strategy addressed the situation and complemented the needs and actions of other partners. In particular, it provided DSVP with a model that could be implemented as a local response to the changed situation. Inclusion of NQ as a reference model in the National Program on FSW period 2016-2020 means there is a strong possibility that it will be replicated in other provinces.

As the agency responsible for management of SW, DSVP was the partner of choice for implementation of the project. Engagement with DSVP as the key partner ensures that project activities are consistent with official government policy, and receive endorsement from government, at national as well as provincial level. This has benefits in terms of enabling cooperation with other government agencies, such as those in the health, justice and law enforcement sectors, as well as promoting sustainability of the outcomes. As mentioned earlier, in Section 3.1.2, there are also several important challenges, both within the agency and outside it. Of these, the most important is probably that, despite the shift from a punitive approach to one of administrative sanctions, sex work remains illegal and DSVP has a mandate to prevent prostitution. The adoption of a HR approach thus creates a potential conflict of interest within DSVP, as well as putting the agency at odds with other government agencies, for example the Women’s Union, which maintains strong opposition even to recognition of sex work as being “work”. Interestingly, the evaluation team found little, if any, evidence of opposition by FSW or DSVP to the HR policy; on the contrary, DSVP staff appear to be strongly supportive, and FSW themselves appreciated the DSVP support for the WrW clubs.

However, institutional change takes time and DSVP faces other challenges. One of these is the capacity building of staff agency-wide, and while generally the agency has shifted considerably towards adoption of a HR approach, there are many DSVP staff, in provinces not involved in NQ project activities, and even some within implementation sites, who maintain the old approach. Another, related, challenge is that policies are inconsistent, for example in DOLISA and other provincial-level agencies there remains a commitment to encouraging FSW to “turn good” and cease sex work (see Section 3.1.2 above). While FSW are generally appreciative of the support from sub-DSVP for WrW clubs, this appreciation does not extend, to making benefits such as health insurance or registration in vocational training courses, provisional on giving up sex work.

“We are very willing to support verification of applications for vocational training of FSW who have turned good,” Policeman, Can Tho

In the course of implementation it has become apparent that increased awareness and understanding, on the one hand, among local authorities of the needs of FSW, and, on the other, among FSW themselves of available services and their rights to access them, is not, in itself sufficient to increase their utilization of those services. A range of other factors affect utilization of services, including possession of ID cards, household registration documents, birth certificates, fear of revealing to authorities the nature of their work, self-stigmatization, transportation costs to home provinces for migrant workers, and opportunity costs resulting from loss of working days. Of these factors, issues related to ID cards and household registration were mentioned

repeatedly by FSW for which the relevant agencies are the MOPS and the MOJ, and engagement of these agencies as additional partners in the project could increase effectiveness. At the local level, increased engagement from the project's beginning with People's Committees in the project activities would have helped address this issue.

Capacity building of partners, duty bearers and female sex workers was relevant to their needs, and the context. The NQ project involved activities to increase the awareness and skills of local authorities, including DSVP, health, legal aid and police, regarding approaches to working with FSW, as well as specific areas of need such as GBV. An important feature of the technical training for government personnel was the new concept of "participatory approaches". FSW received a range of training related to available services and their rights to access them, as well as specific areas such as HIV and STI prevention, GBV prevention, outreach, negotiation and leadership skills. This complementary approach to capacity building among partners, duty-bearers and FSW greatly increased the efficacy of activities.

While relevant to the situation that existed at the time the project commenced, it is important to bear in mind that the sex work situation is changing and the self-help group approach, at least in its present form, may be less effective in future. Currently the NQ project has a relatively narrow focus on a small group of FSW engaged in street-based and venue-based sex work, but with changes to more phone-based or online sex work, especially among younger women who are likely to more tech-savvy, the NQ model may not continue to be as effective.

3.3 Efficiency

Efficiency is defined by OECD as "A measure of how economically resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted to results". Assessment of results (outputs, outcomes) achieved relative to the investment is difficult to assess and apart from the simple relationship between inputs and outputs, requires consideration of several factors, including initial effort required to effect institutional change, and unforeseen challenges encountered in implementation. Such as detailed analysis was beyond the scope of this evaluation, however a recent assessment of the effectiveness and cost affordability of the NQ model was undertaken by CVN in early 2016 as part of a rapid assessment of the project (CVN 2016). That assessment is taken as the basis for comments here, supplemented with the evaluation team's own observations.

The cost of implementation over the 4 years of the NQ project to April 2017 has amounted to about AUD 1,367,973 (see Table 7). According to the NQ Rapid Assessment Report of 2016, CARE's management cost was approximately 34%, DSVP is 21% and 15 % for the three provinces. The percentage of the total budget allocated to different activities was i) project monitoring and management 37.2%; ii) WrW club operation 22.9%; iii) Advocacy and policy dialogue 10.4%; iv) professional training and technical assistance: 17.5%; v) awareness raising for legal aid centres

and police 7.1%; and vi) material development and technical tools 5%. Project management and tracking/monitoring accounted for the highest proportion of costs. Main costs at provincial level were for two activities: WrW Club operation (41%); and project management (29%). Based on CARE’s cost norms, the assessment team estimated that each province would need to allocate approximately AUD 20,000 to implement the project model, to ensure a club size of 40 core members and access to over 300 FSW.

Table 7: NQ project annual expenditure

Year	Actual expenditure	
	USD	AUD
2017 (to April)	143,494.85	190,059
2016	265,897.95	352,183
2015	342,620.26	453,802
2014	280,807.15	371,930
Total	1,032,820.21	1,367,973.79

It is clear from these figures that the initial investment in NQ has been relatively high in relation to immediate results, with substantial resources of funds and personnel required across the three main outcome areas. The selection of three implementation sites in provinces located in different regions in the country, some considerable from the CVN office in Ha Noi, meant that support costs were relatively high. Selection of these sites was made on the basis of a number of factors, including the number of FSW and range of settings in which they work, existing activities and support networks, interest and capacity of local government personnel, and established presence of CVN (at the time the project was initiated CVN had personnel based in both Can Tho and HCMC).

Assessment of the efficiency of the WrW club model depends on factors such as number of members attending meetings, the number of FSW reached through outreach activities, running costs, which differ between provinces, format and function of the clubs, which also differs between the 3 sites, and the possibility of replication by government in additional sites within provinces, or in other provinces. The cost of the WrW clubs varies somewhat between implementation provinces. One major budget line is rental cost of premises: where space for meetings and an office is rented, as in HCMC and Quang Ninh, this constitutes a significant proportion of budget. In comparison, at Can Tho the WrW is based at premises provided rent-free by DSVP. Where clubs pay members an attendance allowance (see section 3.1.1

above), to cover transport and incidentals, membership tends to be higher and more regular, however this also increases substantially the overall cost of running the club, and cost savings obtained through low rent may be offset by increased transport costs for members, resulting in lower attendance, especially for FSW with lower incomes. Apart from the issue of sustainability post-NQ project, this also raises a question of long-term efficiency, after achievement of the main benefits of improved relations with, and attitudinal change amongst local authorities.

An additional factor, which needs to be taken into consideration in estimation of cost-effectiveness of the project, is the contribution WrW club activities make in regard to outreach activities, where they can generate considerable added value. This can be seen, in relation to cross-sectoral activities, such as in the area of HIV and STI prevention and treatment, where outreach can result in large reductions in medical costs through prevention of new infections and timely diagnosis.

Challenges faced in project implementation included changes in CVN personnel and management structure, with 2 office restructures during the project, and time-consuming government approval processes. CVN restructuring included the closure of branch offices in Can Tho and a decrease in the number of staff in HCMC, which meant an increased burden on Ha Noi-based staff to maintain the required level of project monitoring. However, of these, the government approval process appears to have had greater impact on the project, as it delayed the planned project start in 2013 until late 2014. The resulting delay in some interventions, such as the guideline for police, may have hindered the efficiency of project. These also need to be taken into consideration when looking at efficiency.

In summary, based solely on the number of direct beneficiaries and impact to date, the project has achieved relatively low efficiency compared to the investment. However, in the long-term, much will depend on the extent to which WrW club activities are sustained, the number of additional provinces in they can be replicated by DSVP and/or VNSW in other provinces, and the degree to which DSVP can maintain capacity building the HR approach among its own personnel, and extend this to include personnel from other agencies. With likely replication of the NQ model by DSVP under the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020, especially with additional support from VNSW, the cost efficiency of the model will improve, particularly as the initial challenges of acceptance and institutional change have been overcome. Linkages with activities implemented by other agencies, such as the MOH, will add additional value to those of the NQ project.

3.4 Impact

Impact refers to the positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. As foreshadowed in the ToR, at this early stage project impact is difficult to trace and document, however

there are a number of emerging impacts and trends that can be attributed to NQ, or where a significant contribution by CVN and partners can be verified.

At the national level, NQ has resulted in development of a rights-based model with proven effectiveness, and recognition at the national level, which can be adapted for replication in other sites. The NQ project has influenced development of the National Action Plan on Prostitution, providing a model that can be replicated in other provinces throughout the country – this may not have been intended at the time NQ was designed, but the NQ project was certainly timely in this regard.

At the provincial level, the NQ project has resulted in increased self-esteem, confidence, awareness of rights and laws, including especially GBV, amongst FSW in the three implementation sites. FSW involved in project activities have also benefited from increased access to health, legal, and vocational services.

“What I like most about the [WrW] club is that it protects women’s rights, it’s comfortable and friendly, and I don’t feel like an outsider, and there are good things around to learn. We can’t stay in this underground world forever,” Street-based FSW HCMC

The project has had an important impact on stakeholders within implementing provinces, in particular institutional changes within DSVP in the management of FSW, involving a major shift in approach to that of a supporting role, accompanied by increased capacity in the area of technical skills such as participatory approaches and facilitation and their application in working with FSW, linkages and referrals to relevant services. DSVP personnel have also gained an increased awareness of GBV. These changes have also occurred, though to a much more limited extent, among other stakeholders, such as police and legal aid providers.

3.5 Sustainability

Sustainability refers to the continuation of benefits from a development intervention after major development assistance has been completed. In relation to the NQ project sustainability depends on a range of factors, some positive that will increase the likelihood benefits will continue, and some negative that will present challenges after the end of support in June 2017.

Positive factors include the commitment of DSVP at national level to support the model under the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020. Inclusion of NQ in the Plan means that, in addition to allocation of funding, DSVP personnel have a mandate to continue support in the three existing sites, as well as to replicate activities. This commitment is accompanied by strong support voiced for the NQ model by local stakeholders, including FSW themselves, at provincial level, and the NQ model is consistent with the objectives of activities supported by a range of other local agencies, for example vocational activities, HIV

and AIDS/STIs. DSVP commitment also opens avenues for accessing budgets available from local authorities such as the People's Committees in the three provinces. **The significant impact on the sustainability is that** the People's Committee in Can Tho province approved 12 billion Vietnam Dong (550.000 USD) for 4 year plan to implement the NQ model cross the city. Quang Ninh and Ho Chi Minh city also committed to sustain the model with their own funding. At the national level, the model has strong support from VNSW, which opens a channel for ongoing technical support for WrW clubs after the end of CVN support, and will help expand the model to other provinces. VNSW support should also facilitate links with donor organizations that may be able to supplement DSVP and other government funding.

An additional factor in sustainability is the Advocacy Strategy for Improving the Legal and Policy Environment for the Rights and Health of Sex Workers in Vietnam led by UNFPA. The strategy provides a framework for activities that bring together key UN agencies and NGOs with a commitment to advocate for legislative and policy reform to ensure effective HIV responses and protection of sex workers against human rights violations. CVN participated in the development process for the Advocacy Strategy during 2016, which led to a stronger focus on strengthening the capacity of VNSW in the Strategy (still in draft format). While this policy commitment is likely to be one of the NQ project's most lasting impacts, its success is dependent on on-going funding support for the planned activities, and this remains a big question, with cuts in support from the US government to UNFPA and programs such as PEPFAR, as well as overall reduction of donor support to Viet Nam since the country achieved middle-income status.

“Even though it started only 4 years ago it feels like we have come a long way, especially in HIV prevention and emotional support. If it ended now it would be sad, because we have put in so much hard work,”

WrW member, Can Tho

Other negative factors that present challenges for sustainability include the lack of specific budgets for some activities, attitudes of some sub-DSVP personnel and duty-bearers, a lack of experienced resource persons, and changes in the sex work situation. While there is strong support expressed by DSVP for WrW club activities, it is not clear whether this is the case for other components of the model, for example the quarterly dialogues. Also, there is a tendency among some sub-DSVP staff to consider NQ activities as a “project” rather than as capacity building for institutional change, so with the end of the project the enthusiasm for adoption of new approaches may wane. This is a concern, as despite the progress made, not all DSVP staff have benefited fully: not all DSVP personnel understand the HR concept; and some staff continue to hold the view that their job is to encourage FSW to leave the occupation.

“I feel passionate that, if at all possible, this model should be replicated, because the project has helped change the attitudes and behavior of the police towards FSW... the police now realize that even though FSW break the law they are no longer seen in the same way, as criminals,” Ms. Pham This Hong Huong, Legal Aid staff
HCMC

Such challenges will be compounded by the lack of experienced resource persons within DSVP with skill in conducting training, and even the capacity of DSVP to use tools and materials provided doesn't yet meet expectations. To date CVN has provided resource persons for training on issues such as GBV, participatory approaches, facilitation and awareness-raising, including use of the SOP for legal aid and police handbook. This continuation of training is critical, as staff turnover will eventually mean loss of personnel trained by CVN, with resulting loss of capacity in areas such as “friendly approaches” with FSW, and GBV. In addition to these challenges, as mentioned in Section 3.2 above, it needs to be remembered that the sex work situation is changing, and with changes to more phone-based or online sex work, the NQ model may not continue to be as effective.

Several measures have already been initiated in order to address these negative factors. The first is to identify or secure on-going funding for activities. Provinces have indicated on-going funding support, but as yet do not appear to have prepared detailed plans and budgets. HCMC indicated that provincial budget is available for on-going support of WrW, although information on possible funding level was not available. In Can Tho, DSVP indicated that on completion of the project continuation of support will involve reduction of costs. While DSVP did not specify which budget lines will be affected, it is likely that this will involve reduction of the transport allowance paid to members for participation in meetings.

In regard to the issue of on-going technical support, CVN has prepared for DSVP a resource package comprising all key documents, including handbooks and other tools. However, it is unclear whether the provinces, or DSVP itself, have capacity to provide resource persons for GBV and other training.

WrW clubs in both HCM and Can Tho already have developed clear work plans for the future, after project completion. In HCMC, the plan has been shared and commented on by members. In Can Tho, there is plan but it seems only a few members are aware of it. In Quang Ninh the plan is still under development.

“In order to support development of the Law on Sex Work, DSVP needs the support of CVN in replication of the model and implementation of activities, together with promotion of knowledge and awareness local level, and the WrW network. This will contribute to the understanding of the National Assembly people engaged in development of the Law, and encourage institutionalization of the policy,” Mr. Lap, Director DSVP

As an additional key stakeholder in this area, it is important that VNSW has a role in helping to ensure future continuity of WrW activities, especially linking WrW clubs with service providers. While VNSW was apparently involved in the project design phase, under the umbrella of the Centre for Supporting Community Development Initiatives (SCDI), VNSW was not initially included as a key partner in the project. However the organization did become more closely involved later, with implementation of a small grants scheme and other activities. As VNSW is not officially registered in Viet Nam, their formal inclusion may have presented challenges at the start of the project, however, as the national organization that most clearly represents the interests of sex workers, their involvement is crucial in terms of future replication, expansion and sustainability of the core activities, in particular the WrW clubs. In retrospect, more consideration could have been given initially to inclusion of VNSW, possibly in the form of membership of a project steering committee, however VNSW should certainly be involved as a key partner in future activities.

4. CONCLUSION

Overall, the NQ project successfully achieved its main objective of empowering FSW to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable access to opportunities and services. 1210 FSW directly involved in the NQ project have gained increased self-esteem, confidence, awareness of rights and laws, including especially GBV. FSW involved in project activities have also benefited from increased access to health, legal, and vocational services. Many more FSW have already benefited indirectly from the project, as a result of sharing of the model through various networks, especially VNSW, and also through the capacity building within DSVP. This number can be expected to increase steadily with future replication of the model in other provinces.

However, FSW who have benefited directly from the project are largely limited to the 3 implementation sites, and tend to be FSW who are already seeking to leave the profession, such as older women and street-based sex workers, and represent only a relatively small proportion of the total number of women estimated to be engaged in sex work. Benefits for younger, venue-based FSW in the project sites

were narrower, and mainly related to HIV and STI prevention, areas that were not primary objectives of NQ. With major changes occurring in the forms of sex work through greatly increased mobile phone, internet and social media access, there is likely to be an expanding group of FSW that will present challenges to outreach.

The NQ project contributed to important institutional changes within DSVP, including a major shift of attitude among sub-DSVP staff towards FSW, greater awareness of FSW needs, and adoption of a more supportive approach. DSVP staff gained increased technical knowledge and understanding of key issues, such as GBV, and skills, such as participatory approaches and facilitation skills. They are now taking an increased role in linkage and referral to various services. While DSVP staff in project implementation sites have been the direct beneficiaries of most of these changes, the engagement with DSVP at the national level means that the experience and the lessons from the NQ project have been absorbed to some degree by the agency as a whole. At the national level, the project has made an important contribution to the National Action Plan on Prostitution Prevention and Control 2016 – 2020, through adoption of the NQ project as one of three reference models.

The project design was strong, and the strategy, consisting of the three linked outcomes (empowerment of FSW through establishment of WrW clubs; partnership with DSVP; and engagement with police and legal agencies), was effective in supporting FSW to learn about their rights, providing a platform where they are able to share opinions and information on needs and have these recognized, and improving the attitudes and behavior of law enforcement agencies. The planned project duration of 4 years (2013-2017) would probably have been appropriate had inception commenced on time in 2013. However delayed commencement of activities, until late 2014, meant that some key activities, such as handbook for police, and SOP for legal aid, together with related launch workshops, were implemented late in the project, leaving little time for consolidation of these activities. Technical support from CVN for a longer period following the launch of these materials would have strengthened their impact, and increased sustainability.

The choice of DSVP as the main implementing partner, which we understand to have been discussed at some length within CVN, seems to have been vindicated. As the key government agency responsible for the issue of sex work, DSVP is the logical choice for a partner in a project that involves the types of sustainable institutional changes that were the objectives of this project. The timing of this partnership, which coincided with the change that occurred in relation to the legal situation concerning sex workers, with a shift from punitive to administrative sanctions under the 2012 Law on the Handling of Administrative Sanctions, meant that the project provided DSVP with a concrete approach for managing, and scaling up, the subsequent important institutional changes and practices.

An additional key stakeholder in this area is VNSW. While VNSW was involved in the project design phase, under the umbrella of SCDI, VNSW was not initially included as a key partner in the project. The organization did become more closely

involved later in the project, with implementation of a small grants scheme and other activities. As VNSW is not officially registered in Viet Nam, their formal inclusion may have presented challenges at the start of the project, however, as the national organization that most clearly represents the interests of sex workers, their involvement is crucial in terms of replication, expansion and sustainability of the core activities, in particular the WrW clubs. For this reason, in retrospect, more consideration should have been given to inclusion of VNSW initially, possibly in the form of membership of a project steering committee, or even as an implementing partner, and may have enhanced oversight, and the effectiveness and efficiency of the project in achieving its objectives, as well as strengthening the sustainability of the model and the capacity of VNSW itself. The failure to engage VNSW in a way that significantly strengthens their capacity over time is a lost opportunity of the project.

Overall, Outcome 3 has seen less progress than the other two outcomes. While there has been good progress made regarding on police attitude and behaviour among individual personnel directly involved in the project, as yet this hasn't extended to others within the same police station, much less the organization as a whole. In part this may be due to the delayed implementation of the guidelines for police and related activities. Involvement of the MOPS as a partner from the beginning of the project may have also helped promote more widespread awareness and changes in attitude among police. Similarly, project impact on other local authorities, in particular the People's Committees, has been small, and might have been improved through their involvement at an early stage in implementation.

Lack of ID or household registration documents is a key factor in preventing access of FSW and their families to a range of important services. Solutions to this problem must be sought at the national level, and extend beyond the scope of responsibilities of MOLISA, involving the MOPS, MOJ and possibly other government agencies as well. Based on the successful engagement with DSVP, additional engagement with MOPS and MOJ might be considered in future projects of this kind.

Serious concerns remain regarding the sustainability of WrW clubs following the end of CVN support. While DSVP is committed to the model, and funding is available to support core activities, there is a risk that dependence on sub-DSVP support, and lack of strong internal management within the clubs, will weaken the autonomy of the clubs and possibly lead to decreased support from members. On-going mentoring support from VNSW would help reduce this risk, however the precarious situation regarding international development funding support means that there is little prospect of support from these sources for VNSW, as well as the policy-level activities planned under the UNFPA advocacy strategy, or for DSVP in implementation of the national plan.

5. LESSONS LEARNED

Key lessons learned from the NQ project include:

- A focus on the involvement of beneficiaries – FSW – in claiming their human rights, through respect and expression of their needs, and support for the structures and relations that enable them to be received and discussed with duty-bearers has resulted in benefits for all stakeholders;
- Partnership with DSVP, as the key government duty-bearer for FSW, has paid significant dividends in regard to the magnitude of the impact of activities and sustainability of outcomes;
- Planning of projects addressing the needs socially marginalized populations such as FSW needs to include a long-term strategy that includes agencies that will outlast the project duration, and transfer of knowledge and skills to enable continuity once project support ends;
- Support for self-help groups, such as WrW clubs, requires attention to development of the skills and strong management structures that will enable autonomy and provide an on-going platform for members that can engage constructively with other agencies and organizations without losing independence;
- Increased awareness and understanding amongst FSW and duty-bearers of the needs of FSW, available services and their rights to access them, is not, in itself sufficient to increase their utilization of those services;
- One size doesn't fit all: the situation regarding FSW differs in every province, and is also changing constantly; while the basic NQ project model is sound, an important feature is its flexibility. In future replication of the NQ model, care needs to be taken to ensure that it is not implemented in a formulaic way, but can be adapted to fit the needs of each specific situation.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 General recommendations

- In addition to MOLISA's DSVP, as well as VNSW, future projects of this type should involve as partners other key agencies, in particular the MOPS and MOJ. At the local level, involvement of People's Committees is also needed. Oversight for project implementation should be provided through a project steering committee comprising representatives of all partners;
- Exploration is needed of ways in which to approach younger, venue-based FSW, as well as the rapidly expanding group of mobile phone, internet and social media-based FSW, who are difficult to access through conventional outreach approaches.

6.2 Recommendations for Government

- MOLISA (DSVP) should consider working more closely at the national level with the MOPS and MOJ in order to address the problems related to issue of replacement ID cards and household registration documents, and generally reduce the administrative barriers that prevent access of socially marginalized populations to services;
- DSVP should follow up or reinforce the adoption of guidelines for police and for legal aid providers. Given the little remaining time of the NQ project it will not be possible to implement the capacity building activities that would ensure that all police and legal aid providers in the project sites are fully aware of these tools and familiar with their contents. For this reason DSVP needs to provide on-going support for this important part of the process;
- DSVP should consider organization of specific events under their annual workplan and budget that include opportunities, at national and provincial level, for public consultation and dialogues on the rights of FSW and issues related to them.

6.3 Recommendations for CARE

- CVN should consider ways in which it can continue to play a role at the national level in advocacy with MOLISA (DSVP), MOPS, MOJ, and other key agencies in order to address the problems faced by FSW and other socially marginalized groups related to ID cards and household registration documents;
- CVN should explore avenues for providing on-going support to sustaining and replication of the NQ model, through serving as a capacity-building resource for DSVP and VNSW, as well as support for implementation of the UNFPA-led Advocacy Strategy;
- In the remaining time of the project, CVN staff should work closely with sub-DSVP and WrW clubs in all 3 provinces to ensure that each site has a clear plan for continuation of activities;
- One important challenge in setting of targets and for the evaluation of the NQ project is the lack of reliable estimates of the number of FSW, disaggregated by province, and also the forms of sex work they are engaged in. While this is difficult, there are other agencies, in particular the MOH, which have the means at their disposal to undertake such estimates, and may already have calculated numbers of sex workers in relation to HIV and AIDS and STI programs.⁹ In feasibility studies and planning for future projects with

⁹ Estimates of the number of sex workers are used as the basis for sampling in surveys such as the Integrated Biological and Behavioural Surveillance (IBBS) surveys conducted by the National Institute of Hygiene and Epidemiology (NIHE). The Round 3 survey, published by the Ministry of Health (MOH) in 2014, covers SW in two of the NQ sites (Can Tho and HCMC).

FSW, CVN should explore ways to work more closely with the MOH in order to access such information;

7. REFERENCES

Advocacy Strategy: Improving the Legal and Policy Environment for the Rights and Health of Sex Workers in Viet Nam. UNFPA, December 2016

Annual Performance Report 2014-15 Nâng Quyền (NQ) – “Women’s Empowerment” Project

Annual Performance Report 2015-16 Nâng Quyền (NQ) – “Women’s Empowerment” Project

Australian Council for International Development (ACFID) *Principles and Guidelines for ethical research and evaluation in development* (updated April 2016)

Baseline Survey for Nâng Quyền (NQ) Project Synthesis Report, January 2016

CA Guidance – Assessing Evaluation Reports

CA Evaluation Policy

CARE Women’s Empowerment Framework <http://www.care.org/our-work/womens-empowerment/gender-integration/womens-empowerment-framework>

Comparison: Content of the Vietnam’s National Programs on Sex Work Prevention, CARE International Office in Vietnam, Ha Noi, (undated).

EMERGE (Enhancing Migrant Urban Women’s Rights and Gender Equity Programme), Regional Baseline *Survey Report: Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar and Vietnam* (undated)

Meeting Report: Information Sharing on Sex Work in Viet Nam, Green One UN House, 17 March 2016.

NQ Exit Strategy document (undated)

NQ Project - M&E Plan – Revised August 2015

Nâng Quyền (Empowerment) Initiative Design Narrative (undated)

National Action Plan on Sex Work, MOLISA, Ha Noi, 2015.

NQ’s Rapid Assessment Report: *Strengthening accessibility to social services for female sex workers*. CARE International Office in Vietnam, Ha Noi, June 2016.

Position paper: Principles and Approaches to Guide CARE Vietnam’s Interventions to Promote Sex Workers’ Rights. CARE International Office in Vietnam, Ha Noi, (undated).

ANNEX: GUIDELINES

In-depth Interview Guideline - FSW

1. Brief introduction:

- Introduce interviewers, explain purpose of interview, and use of information
- We hope to have an open discussion here. All of the information that you share will be confidential. We would like to request your permission to record digitally. Our notes and recording will be kept secure and we will not share personal details or personal views with anyone else. This is for Evaluation Team members' use only, to ensure an accurate record, and will not be shared outside the Team, and will be destroyed on completion of the work. Is that okay?
- Participation in the interview is **voluntary**. You don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with and are free to stop the interview at any time should you wish to. After the interview, you can tell us if you do not want us to use what you have said. You do not have to give a reason why. If you decide not to participate, we will not use any of the information you have given us unless you tell us you want us to. If there is anything you tell us that you do not want us to mention in the report, tell us and we will keep this confidential. Do you understand? Is this OK?
- If you have any **complaints** about the interview you can tell us. If you don't feel comfortable sharing your concerns with us, you or someone representing you can make contact with the Country Director of CARE in Viet Nam. Is this clear?
- If you want to debrief after the interview, you can chat with CVN staff, or other counselling/support service providers [Giang will provide a list of service providers here for each province]
- Do you understand what we have told you, do you have any questions, or any concerns, or would you like further explanation on anything? Can we start the interview now?

2. General:

- Name (assumed name is OK)
- Age
- Which province are you from originally?
- Ethnicity
- Education
- Family (marital status, children)
- Supporting parents or other family members?
- Involvement in sex work: type (street or venue-based), length of time, sideline or fulltime occupation, experience with SW elsewhere in country or other countries

3. General Situation

- How would you describe the situation regarding venue-based work/street work at present?
- Can you make good money? Is it safe? What are the biggest risks you face?

4. NQ Project

- Are you familiar with the NQ project?
- How have you been involved in the project?
- Over the last 2 years or so, have there have been any important changes in policies (laws, law enforcement), access to services (health, legal), or attitudes of police or service providers? Give examples? Do you think these are the result of the NQ project? If not, what caused them?

5. [Project Objective: Were FSW empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable opportunities and services?]

- Do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Examples?
- As a result of project activities, how much are you able to be involved in the process of changing policies, and attitudes of government agencies or service providers? Can you give examples?

6. [Output 1: Have FSW achieved a strong platform for collective voice and action?]

- Do you regularly attend WrW meetings, and if so how often? If don't attend regularly, why not?
- Why do you attend (what benefits are there for you)?
- Have you received any training through WrW club activities? If so, what, and was it useful to you?
- Have you ever spoken up in WrW meetings? What other ways have you contributed to the club?
- Does the club make an annual plan, and does it keep to the plan?
- Have you ever represented the club in meetings with the network, or with authorities? How do you feel when speaking or being representative of club in meetings?

7. [Output 2: Does DSVP make linkages between FSW, service providers, and authorities?]

- Do DSVP or other authorities attend WrW meetings, or provide support in other ways?
- Has DSVP ever consulted the WrW club, or shared plans or policies?
- How do you feel when being shared plans or policy information or provided support? Is it useful?

8. [Output 3: Do police, local authorities, legal service providers at national & local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW?]

- Have police attitudes towards you, and other club members improved?
- Have you or other WrW members made any police reports in the last 2 years? If so can you explain the cases? Did the police respond, and was the response satisfactory? What kind of issues were reported to the police? Are there any issues that you don't feel comfortable reporting to the police?
- In the last 2 years, have you or other members experienced GBV and can you describe these cases? What was the nature of the GBV (in an intimate relationship, by a client or employer, police, in the community etc)? Were you able to do anything about it? If so, what was done? If not, why not? Would additional support (such as health, legal and counseling) help FSW to act, and if so what type of support? How would this be different to current practice/experience with various services?
- Do you feel that FSW have equal access to legal services compared to others in the community? Has this changed in the last 2 years? For what kind of issues do FSW most commonly seek legal advice?
- Have WrW members and other FSW experienced changes in their access to legal services and advice in the last two years? Why have there been changes and what differences this has this made to them?
- For those FSW who did access to legal services and advice in the last three years, how were you treated by the legal aid service provider?
- Do the legal service providers respond to WrW club members' needs? How about other FSW? Has this changed in the last 2 years? If so, why?

9. [General]

- Overall, do you think that the NQ activities were consistent with what needs to be done in order to improve your life, access to services and treatment by authorities? If not, what things SHOULD be done, or COULD have been done?
- In what ways do you think the operation of the WrW club could be improved?
- Will WrW Club members continue to meet? Did the WrW clubs meet the expectations of FSW? If there was to be a similar project working with FSW in Vietnam in the future, what would you advise CARE to keep or to change in the project?
- Is there anything else that concerns you regarding your access to services, or treatment by the authorities, any aspect of the project activities, or other things that you would like to comment on?

10. [Close of interview]

- Thank you for giving us your time today
- [Remind women that they can debrief with CVN staff or service providers if any topics were distressing]

Focus Group Discussion Guidelines - FSW

Duration: each FGD will be of approximately 90 minutes in length.

Participants: Maximum of 8 women; to be selected and invited by CVN project staff based on i) participation in a representative range of project activities; ii) reflect key differences and perspectives (for example education, health status, age, ethnicity, access to training or meeting venues).

Setting: if possible meeting to be held in a neutral setting, where participants will feel relaxed and free to speak openly, without disturbance from outsiders (e.g. other project staff, visitors, passers-by or officials).

Seating arrangements: chairs arranged in a circle (can be around a meeting table if necessary), or u-shape, with moderator and note-taker at one end;

Equipment/supplies: refreshments (drink and snack) for each participant; audio recorder (to be provided by Evaluation Team)

Roles and responsibilities of Evaluation Team members: each FGD will require 1 moderator and 1 note-taker. Moderator can be either Nga or CVN staff; SB will take notes; additional CVN staff to translate for SB if Nga is already occupied (Note: Nga will be moderator in Can Tho and HCM city. CVN staff will translate)

1. Brief introduction:

- Evaluation Team members introduction
- Purpose and use of information
- We hope to have an open discussion here. All of the information that you share will be confidential. We would like to request your permission to record digitally. Our notes and recording will be kept secure and we will not share personal details or personal views with anyone else. This is for Evaluation Team members' use only, to ensure an accurate record, and will not be shared outside the Team, and will be destroyed on completion of the work. Is that okay?
- Because you will be sharing your thoughts and experiences together in a group, other people in the discussion will know what each person has said. So that other people do not find out about what people in this group said, please do not talk about the details of this discussion outside the room once the discussion has finished. In this group you should feel comfortable to speak openly. Is that clear?
- Participation in the group discussion is **voluntary**. You don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with and are free to leave the group at any time should you wish to. After the discussion, you can tell us if you do not want us to use what you have said. You do not have to give a reason why. If you decide not to participate, we will not use any of the information you have given us unless you tell us you want us to. If there is anything you tell us that you do not want us to mention in the report, tell us and we will keep this confidential. Do you understand? Is this OK?

- If you have any **complaints** about the discussion you can tell us. If you don't feel comfortable sharing your concerns with us, you or someone representing you can make contact with the Country Director of CARE in Viet Nam. Is this clear?
- If you want to debrief after the FDG, you can chat with CVN staff, or other counselling/support service providers [Giang will provide a list of service providers here for each province]
- Do you understand what we have told you, do you have any questions, or any concerns, or would you like further explanation on anything? Can we start the discussion now?

2. Self-Introduction of Participants

- Go around the group, each person to briefly introduce herself

3. General situation

- How would you describe the situation regarding bar work (or other venues such as massage parlours and hairdressers)/street work and your workplace at present?
- Can you make good money? Is it safe? What are the biggest risks you face?

4. [Output 1: Have FSW achieved a strong platform for collective voice and action?]

- How have you been involved in the WrW club? How long for?
- What do you think about the WrW club? What kind of activities have you attended?
- What are the benefits of WrW meetings? Why do women attend?
- What about women who do not attend WrW, or only rarely attend? What do you feel are the reasons why they don't attend?
- Do WrW club activities provide useful training for members? Can you give examples?
- Do women speak up in WrW meetings? Is it always the same few? Are there reasons why women do not speak up? Are there other ways in which women can contribute to the club?
- How you see the club has been changed from the 1st year to present?
- What have been the main achievements of the club, in 2016? And in 2017? What else is planned for the rest of 2017?
- How was the Club management board was selected and how has it worked?
- Have members ever represented the club in meetings with the network, or with authorities? How was the experience? Do you feel that authorities were prepared to listen and act on suggestions made?
- Have there ever been disagreements among club members, and how were these resolved? Was there any lasting impact?
- In what ways do you think the operation of the WrW club could be improved?
- Do you think that WrW activities will continue after completion of the project? If not, why not?

5. [Project Objective: Were FSW empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable opportunities and services?]

- In the last three years, do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Can you give examples? If yes, why have these changes come about?
- As a result of project activities, how much are you able to be involved in the process of changing policies, and attitudes of government agencies or service providers? Can you give examples?

6. [Output 2: Does DSVP make linkages between FSW, service providers, and authorities?]

- How would you describe the relationship between DSVP and the WrW club?
- Do DSVP or other authorities attend WrW meetings, or provide support in other ways? Please provide examples. How do you feel about having DSVP actively involved in WrW Club activities?
- Has DSVP ever consulted the WrW club, or shared their own plans or policies with WrW Club members? If yes, what was the outcome?

7. [Output 3: Do police, local authorities, legal service providers at national & local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW?]

- Have members made any police reports in the last 2 years, if so can you explain the cases? Did the police respond, and was the response satisfactory? What kind of issues were reported to the police? Are there any issues that FSW don't feel comfortable reporting to the police?
- In the last 2 years, have any members experienced GBV and can you describe these cases? What was the nature of the GBV (in an intimate relationship, by a client or employer, police, in the community etc)? Were they able to do anything about it? If so, what was done? If not, why not? Would additional support (such as health, legal and counselling) help FSW to act, and if so what type of support? How would this be different to current practice/experience with various services?
- Do you feel that FSW have equal access to legal services compared to others in the community? Has this changed in the last 2 years? For what kind of issues do FSW most commonly seek legal advice?
- Have WrW members and other FSW experienced changes in their access to legal services and advice in the last two years? Why have there been changes and what differences this has this made to them?
- For those FSW who did access to legal services and advice in the last three years, how were you treated by the legal aid service provider? Do the legal service providers respond to WrW club members' needs? How about other FSW? Has this changed in the last 2 years? If so, why?

8. NQ Project [General & Overall Impact]

- To what extent has NQ been successful, and what do you consider to be the project's most important achievements?
- Over the last 2 years or so, have there have been any important changes in policies (laws, law enforcement), access to services (health, legal), or attitudes of police or service providers? Give examples?
- Do you think these changes in policies are the result of the NQ project? If not, what caused them?

9. General

- Will WrW Club members continue to meet? Did the WrW clubs meet the expectations of FSW? If there was to be a similar project working with FSW in Vietnam in the future, what would you advise CARE to keep or to change in the project compared to NQ?
- Is there anything else that concerns you regarding your access to services, or treatment by the authorities, any aspect of the project activities, any other questions, or things that you would like to comment on?

10. Close of interview

- Thank you for giving us your time today
- Remind women that they can debrief with CVN staff or service providers if any topics were distressing.

In-depth Interview Guideline – Provincial Level Stakeholders

1. Brief introduction

- Evaluation Team members introduction
- Purpose and use of information
- We hope to have an open discussion here. All of the information that you share will be confidential. We would like to request your permission to record digitally. Our notes and recording will be kept secure and we will not share personal details or personal views with anyone else. This is for Evaluation Team members' use only, to ensure an accurate record, and will not be shared outside the Team, and will be destroyed on completion of the work. Is that okay?
- Participation in the interview is **voluntary**. You don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with and are free to stop the interview at any time should you wish to. After the interview you can tell us if you do not want us to use what you have said. You do not have to give a reason why. If you decide not to participate, we will not use any of the information you have given us unless you tell us you want us to. If there is anything you tell us that you do not want us to mention in the report, tell us and we will keep this confidential. Do you understand? Is this OK?
- If you have any **complaints** about the interview you can tell us. If you don't feel comfortable sharing your concerns with us, you or someone representing you can make contact with the Country Director of CARE in Viet Nam. Is this clear?
- If you want to debrief after the interview, you can chat with CVN staff, or other counseling/support service providers [Giang will provide a list of service providers here for each province]

2. General

- Name
- Age
- Gender
- Position/agency/responsibilities
- Length of time in job and length of time in present post

3. NQ Project

- Are you familiar with the NQ project?
- How have you been involved in the project?
- What do you consider to be the project's most important achievements? What hasn't worked so well? In what ways do you think the project has not been successful, and what are the reasons behind this?

- Over the last 2 years or so, have there have been any important changes in policies (laws, law enforcement), access to services (health, legal), or attitudes of police or service providers? Give examples? Why have these changes come about? What caused them?
- What is the likelihood of continuation and long-term benefits of the project initiatives (including, but not limited to, the We Are Women Clubs)?
- What are the positive and negative factors determining sustainability of supported initiatives?
- To what extent have these factors been addressed, and have these measures been effective?

4. [Project Objective: Were FSW empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable opportunities and services?]

- Do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Examples?
- Do you feel that, as a result of project activities, FSW are better able to influence government policies and decisions that affect their lives? Examples?
- Were linkages and dialogue between FSW networks and policy makers established and operational at local level? Can you give any examples? What were the outcomes of these linkages/dialogues?
- Have there been any new or amended government policies & programs that respond to the needs of FSWs? If yes, how did these changes come about?
- Has there been any increase in FSW seeking legal advice or making use of other services, such as health services? If yes, why did these changes come about?

5. [Output 1: Have FSW achieved a strong platform for collective voice and action?]

- Are regular quarterly dialogues held between FSWs, DSVP and other authorities, and how many people represented the FSW?? If regular meetings were not held, what were the challenges encountered to prevent this happening?
- Have you personally attended any WrW meetings, and if so how often? If don't attend regularly, why not?
- [For DVSP and Legal Aid providers] Do you think participation in WrW meetings has benefited you or your colleagues in terms of increased understanding of the needs of FSW? Does it benefit the FSW themselves? If so, in what ways?
- [For DVSP and Legal Aid providers] Does the WrW club have an activities plan and how does it work? Have FSW ever represented the club(s) in meetings with the network, or with authorities? What do you think of their representation in terms of their confidence, contribution?

6. [Output 2: Does DSVP make linkages between FSW, service providers, and authorities?]

- Have any agreements been signed between DSVP legal service providers to support WrW clubs?
- Do WrW Club leaders and members in each province participate in quarterly dialogue meetings with authorities, and if so how many?
- Does DSVP or other authorities attend WrW meetings, or provide support in other ways? If so, can you give details?
- Has DSVP ever consulted the WrW club(s), or shared plans or policies? If so, can you give details?
- Have any DSVP staff received training on GBV?
- Have any DSVP staff received training on facilitation skills? How do staff feel about this training?
- Have any presentations been made by service providers at WrW Club meetings, invited by DSVP, and if so how many, and on what topics?
- Has DSVP referred any FSW to service providers and authorities? Are these referrals documented?

7. [Output 3: Do police, local authorities, legal service providers at national & local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW?]

- Have police attitudes towards FSW changed? If so, in what ways have they changed?
- [For police] Has your attitude towards FSW changed? If so, in what ways has your attitude changed? What caused your attitude to change?
- Have police reports been made by FSW in the last 2 years and what was the subject of the reports? Did the police respond to any reports made, and do you feel that the response was satisfactory?
- Do you feel that FSW have equal access to legal services compared to others in the community?
- Do you feel that legal service providers respond to the needs of FSW? If not, what could be done to improve this service?
- Have Standard Operating Procedures for legal aid service providers been piloted in this province? Is the SOP for legal aid service providers and guidelines for police actually being used? Has anything changed as a result? If so, why? If not, why not? What is the likelihood of the SOP being used in the future?
- How many cases have been recorded of legal service providers responding to FSW needs? What kind of cases are they responding to? What kinds of cases are they NOT responding to? Why?
- Have police participated in project activities (such as quarterly provincial dialogues, annual national dialogues, training on responding to FSW needs, Code of Conduct pilot) and, if so,

how many? How did they participate? What were the outcomes? Have guidelines for police been implemented?

- What dialogues have taken place between duty bearers (i.e. police, legal aid, health agencies)?
- What challenges have you experienced in working to address GBV against SW?

8. [General]

- In what ways do you think the operation of the WrW club(s) could be improved?
- Do you think that WrW activities will continue after completion of the project? If not, why not? How it should look like after project implementation?
- Overall, do you think that the NQ activities were consistent with what needs to be done in order to improve the lives of FSW, their access to services, and treatment by authorities? If not, what things SHOULD be done, or COULD have been done?
- Are there any other aspects of the project, or access of FSW to services, or treatment by the authorities, or the situation in general that you would like to comment on?

9. [Close of interview]

- Thank you for giving us your time today

Focus Group Discussion Guidelines – Provincial Level Stakeholders

Duration: each FGD will be of approximately 90 minutes in length.

Participants: Maximum of 8 participants

Setting: if possible meeting to be held in a neutral setting, where participants will feel relaxed and free to speak openly, without disturbance from outsiders.

Seating arrangements: chairs arranged in a circle (can be around a meeting table if necessary), or u-shape, with moderator and note-taker at one end;

Equipment/supplies: refreshments (drink and snack) for each participant; audio recorder (to be provided by Evaluation Team)

Roles and responsibilities of Evaluation Team members: each FGD will require 1 moderator and 1 note-taker. Moderator can be either Nga or CVN staff; SB will take notes; additional CVN staff to translate for SB if Nga is already occupied.

1. Brief introduction:

- Evaluation Team members introduction
- Purpose and use of information
- We hope to have an open discussion here. All of the information that you share will be confidential. We would like to request your permission to record digitally. Our notes and recording will be kept secure and we will not share personal details or personal views with anyone else. This is for Evaluation Team members' use only, to ensure an accurate record, and will not be shared outside the Team, and will be destroyed on completion of the work. Is that okay?
- Because you will be sharing your thoughts and experiences together in a group, other people in the discussion will know what each person has said. So that other people do not find out about what people in this group said, please do not talk about the details of this discussion outside the room once the discussion has finished. In this group you should feel comfortable to speak openly. Is that clear?
- Participation in the group discussion is **voluntary**. You don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with and are free to leave the group at any time should you wish to. After the discussion, you can tell us if you do not want us to use what you have said. You do not have to give a reason why. If you decide not to participate, we will not use any of the information you have given us unless you tell us you want us to. If there is anything you tell us that you do not want us to mention in the report, tell us and we will keep this confidential. Do you understand? Is this OK?
- If you have any **complaints** about the discussion you can tell us. If you don't feel comfortable sharing your concerns with us, you or someone representing you can make contact with the Country Director of CARE in Viet Nam. Is this clear?

- If you want to debrief after the FDG, you can chat with CVN staff, or other counseling/support service providers [Giang will provide a list of service providers here for each province]
- Do you understand what we have told you, do you have any questions, or any concerns, or would you like further explanation on anything? Can we start the discussion now?

2. Self-Introduction of Participants

- Go around the group, ask each person to briefly introduce themselves

3. General Situation

- What is the general situation regarding sex work in the province at present? How are FSW regarded by provincial authorities?
- What is the current official policy regarding FSW in the province? Are all agencies in agreement on policy (or the interpretation of policies), or are there conflicts between agencies?
- Does allocation of budget to provide health, legal and other services for FSW pose challenges for the province? If so, what are they?

4. NQ Project [General & Overall Impact]

- To what extent has NQ been successful, and what do you consider to be the project's most important achievements?
- Over the last 2 years or so, have there have been any important changes in local policies (laws, law enforcement), access to services (health, legal), or attitudes of police or service providers? Give examples?
- How has the NQ has contributed to the change of these policies? Are these changes in policies are the result of the NQ project? If not, what caused them?

5. [Project Objective: Were FSW empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable opportunities and services?]

- Do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Can you give examples?
- Do you feel that, as a result of project activities, FSW are better able talk and raise their voices to influence government policies and others about the issues they face/ or their lives (for example through WrW or other means)? Can you give examples?

6. [Output 1: Have FSW achieved a strong platform for collective voice and action?]

- What are the benefits of WrW meetings? Why do women attend?
- What about women who do not attend WrW, or only rarely attend? What do you feel are the reasons why they don't attend?
- Have you met WrW members in the role of representing the club in meetings with authorities? Do you feel that authorities were prepared to listen and act on suggestions made?

7. [Output 2: Does DSVP make linkages between FSW, service providers, and authorities?]

- How would you describe the relationship between DSVP and the WrW club?
- Do DSVP or other authorities attend WrW meetings, or provide support in other ways?

- Has DSVP ever consulted the WrW club, or shared plans or policies?
- How has the DSVP supported WrW activities?
- How would you describe the relationship between other agencies and the WrW club? How have other agencies supported WrW activities?

8. [Output 3: Do police, local authorities, legal service providers at national & local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW?]

- After three years involvement in NQ project, have you experienced changes in the way you view women sex workers? And if you have, in what ways?
- What, if any, changes have happened in the practices of your organisation in providing services or treatment of female sex workers? Describe the changes and explain how these changes have taken place.
- Have police attitudes towards club members improved? How about FSW in general?
- Have members made any police reports in the last 2 years? If so, did the police respond, and was the response satisfactory?
- In the last 2 years, have any members of WrW clubs reported cases of GBV? If so, what was done? If not, why not? Would additional support encourage FSW to report GBV, and if so what type of support?
- Do you feel that FSW have equal access to legal services compared to others in the community?
- Have WrW members sought legal advice in the last 2 years? If they felt it necessary to seek legal advice, are there ways in which they could do so?
- Do you feel that legal service providers respond to WrW club members' needs? How about other FSW? If not, what could be done to improve this service?

9. General

- In what ways do you think the operation of the WrW club could be improved?
- Do you think that WrW activities will continue after completion of the project? If not, why not?
- Overall, do you think that the NQ activities were consistent with what needs to be done in order to improve the situation, access to services and treatment of FSW by authorities? If not, what things SHOULD be done, or COULD have been done?
- Is there anything else that concerns you regarding provision of services to FSW, access of FSW to services, or treatment by the authorities, any aspect of the project activities, or other things that you would like to comment on?

10. Close FGD

- Thank you for giving us your time today

In-depth Interview Guideline – National Level Government Stakeholders

- 1. Brief introduction:** interviewers, purpose, use of information & confidentiality, don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with, request permission to record digitally. Do you have any questions or would you like further explanation on anything?
- 2. General:**
 - Name
 - Gender
 - Position/agency/responsibilities
 - Length of time in job and length of time in present post
- 3. NQ Project: [General & Overall Impact]**
 - Are you familiar with the NQ project? [If necessary provide brief outline of key outcomes and activities]
 - How have you been involved in the project?
 - To what extent has NQ been successful, and what do you consider to be the project's most important achievements? In what ways do you think the project has not been successful, and what are the reasons behind this?
 - In the last three years, do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Can you give examples? If yes, why have these changes come about?
- 4. [Relevance]**
 - How relevant are the project strategies to the policy and legislative context of Vietnam?
 - What is the relevance and value added of the different project strategies and methodologies?
 - Do you feel that the agencies involved in the project were those that were most appropriate, and able to achieve the project's objectives? If not, what other agencies should, or could, have been involved?
 - What is the relevance of the approaches to building the capacity of partners, duty bearers and female sex workers?
 - How do the NQ activities respond to needs of SWs and sex work issues in VN currently?
- 5. [Effectiveness]**
 - Do you feel that the project has resulted in changes in the way FSW are able to bring issues or concerns to the attention of government agencies? Can you give examples, if any?
 - Does DSVP make linkages between FSW, service providers, and authorities?

- Are regular quarterly dialogues held between FSWs, DSVP and other authorities? If regular meetings are not held, what are the challenges that prevent this happening? Do you think participation of government stakeholders has had benefits in terms of increased understanding of the needs of FSW? Has it benefited the FSW themselves? If so, in what ways?
- Do police, local authorities, legal service providers at national & local levels demonstrate improved positive attitudes and behaviour towards FSW?
- How do police treat sex workers in Quang Ninh, Can Tho and Ho Chi Minh City? Has this changed over the last 3-years? If so, why?
- NQ also developed guidelines for the police; do you know if these are being implemented?
- Have police reports been made by FSW in the last 2 years and did the police respond to any reports made? Do you feel that the response was satisfactory?
- Do you feel that FSW have equal access to legal services compared to others in the community? If so, do you feel that sex workers are using these services and, if not, what are the challenges?
- How do legal service providers respond to the needs of FSW? What could be done to improve this service?
- Have Standard Operating Procedures for legal aid service providers been piloted in the target province? If so, has the way that legal aid service providers changed as a result? If so, what has changed? Why has this change happened?
- Has the capacity of DSVP in respond to FSW issues changed? In what ways?
- The intended outcome of the NQ project was that FSW are empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable access to opportunities & services. The basic strategy of the NQ project to achieve this outcome consisted of three components:
 1. Provide FSW with a strong platform for collective voice through establishment of WrW clubs;
 2. Promote recognition, utilization and support by DSVP for FSW collective voice and action; and
 3. Improve positive attitudes towards FSW among police, local authorities and legal service providers
- To what extent do you feel that this strategy achieved the planned results? Were the right agencies involved? What other agencies could have been involved to increase the effectiveness of the project?
- How effective has NQ been in supporting changes in regard to women's empowerment?

6. [Efficiency]

- Given the level of investment in the project, do you feel that the results achieved have been worthwhile? What other approaches, if any, do you think would have been more efficient in achieving these results?

- Is the We Are Women Club model the most cost-effective way to improve access to services? What other ways do you feel might be a more effective use of resources?

7. [Sustainability]

- What is the likelihood of continuation and long-term benefits of the project initiatives (including, but not limited to, the We Are Women Clubs and attitudes and practices of duty bearers)?
- What are the positive and negative factors determining sustainability of supported initiatives?
- To what extent have these factors been addressed, and have these measures been effective?

8. [Project Objective: Were FSW empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable opportunities and services?]

- Do you feel that there has been a change in how government agencies (specify which ones if necessary) respond to the needs of FSW? Examples? Why have these changes come about?
- What role do FSW play in influencing government policies and decisions on sex work? Examples? Has this changed over the last 3-years? What has brought about these changes?
- Were linkages and dialogue between FSW networks and policy makers established and operational at local level? Can you give any examples?
- Have there been any new or amended government policies & programs that respond to the needs of FSWs? Examples? Why have these changes come about?
- Has there been any increase in FSW seeking legal advice or making use of other services, such as health services? If yes, why have these changes occurred? In what ways, if any, did the NQ project contribute to these changes?
- How the WrW will be implemented through National Action Plan on Sex Work?

9. [General]

- Overall, do you think that the NQ activities were consistent with what needs to be done in order to improve the lives of FSW, their access to services, and treatment by authorities? If not, what things COULD have been done, or SHOULD be done?
- Are there any other aspects of the project, or access of FSW to services, or treatment by the authorities, or the situation in general that you would like to comment on?

10. [Close of interview]

- Thank you for giving us your time today

In-depth Interview Guideline – National Level Stakeholders (Non-Government)

- 1. Brief introduction:** interviewers, purpose, use of information & confidentiality, don't have to answer questions that feel are intrusive or not comfortable with, request permission to record digitally. Do you have any questions or would you like further explanation on anything?
- 2. General:**
 - Name
 - Gender
 - Position/agency/responsibilities
 - Length of time in job and length of time in present post
- 3. NQ Project Background**
 - The intended outcome of the NQ project was that FSW are empowered to influence policies and decisions that affect their lives and have equitable access to opportunities & services. The basic strategy of the NQ project to achieve this outcome consisted of three components:
 1. Provide FSW with a strong platform for collective voice through establishment of WrW clubs;
 2. Promote recognition, utilization and support by DSVP for FSW collective voice and action; and
 3. Improve positive attitudes towards FSW among police, local authorities and legal service providers
- 4. Opinion on strategy and effectiveness in relation to what other agencies are doing**
 - What do you think of the strategy used in the NQ project?
 - Do you think there are other strategies that would be more effective in achieving the desired outcomes?
 - Do you think that the partners involved in this project are appropriate? Are there additional partners that you feel should have been involved? Why do you think they should have been involved, and what additional benefits would they have brought?
- 5. Future actions**
 - What steps should be taken to further promote access to services for FSW, and ensure that they contribute to future policy formulation?