



The Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA): Empowering Girls to Learn and Lead

Final Evaluation Report for CARE USA

USAID Annual Program Statement No. M/OAA/GRO/EGAS-08-108

December 16, 2011

Miske Witt & Associates Inc.
3490 Lexington Avenue North #320
Saint Paul, MN 55126 USA
www.miskewitt.com



Acknowledgments

Miske Witt & Associates would like to thank CARE USA for the opportunity to conduct the summative evaluation of the USAID-funded PTLA and ITSPLEY projects. We are particularly grateful to the CARE US team from the Gender and Empowerment Unit – Doris Bartel, Joyce Adolwa, Virginia Kintz, and Esker Copeland – for their insights and support throughout the process; to the CARE staff from the country offices and field offices in Bangladesh, Egypt, Honduras, India, Kenya, Malawi, Tanzania, and Yemen who worked diligently to organize and support the data collection and analysis; and to the girls, boys, women, and men of the communities with whom we met, whose participation and contributions to the study were invaluable.

The Miske Witt & Associates team included Dr. Shirley Miske and Dr. Gerald Boardman, Co-Coordinator; Ms. Kathy Bakkenist, Project Manager, and Ms. Sarah Koehler, Project Assistant; Ms. Lisa Burton and Dr. Alisa Potter, data analysts and authors of the two cross-site reports (PTLA and ITSPLEY, respectively); country coordinators and lead evaluators Dr. Sharon Beatty (Yemen), Dr. Gerald Boardman (Malawi and Tanzania), Dr. Heidi Eschenbacher (Bangladesh), Dr. Lynn Evans (Honduras), Ms. Patti McLaughlin (Egypt), Dr. Hilda Omae (Kenya), and Dr. Greg Sales (India). The research associates included Aditi Arur, Brenda Martinez, Theresia Mkenda, Huria Mohammed Al-Eryani, Teresa Muchiri, Neveen Mustafa, Stella Ndau, and Shika Zannatul Ferdous. Dr. Joan DeJaeghere and Ms. Suzanne Miric also contributed to the evaluation reports.

This report is made possible by the support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The contents are the responsibility of CARE and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments.....	1
List of Tables	3
Acronyms.....	4
Executive Summary	5
Section 1: Background.....	11
Section 2: Country Context	14
Section 3: Methodology.....	16
Section 4: Opportunities to Practice Leadership Skills.....	20
Section 5: Leadership Knowledge and Skills	25
Section 6: Supportive Relations	32
Section 7: Enabling Environment	35
Section 8: Program Results.....	48
Section 9: Data Quality and Program Efficiency	55
Section 10: Recommendations and Conclusions	56
Resources.....	62
Annex A: Girls' Leadership Index (GLI)	65
Annex B: Gender Equity Index (GEI).....	66
Annex C: Evaluation Site Selection by Country	67
Annex D: Perceptions on Change in Ability to Express Opinions and Ideas	70
Annex E: Perceptions on Change in Self-confidence	71
Annex F: Perceptions on Leadership Development through PTLA.....	72

List of Tables

Table 1: Reliability Scores on GLI and GEI Scales for Each Data Collection Period	18
Table 2: Sample Size Distributions by Qualitative Data Collection Instrument for Each Country.....	19
Table 3: Sample Size Distributions by Quantitative Data Collection Instrument for Each Country.....	20
Table 4: Girls' and Boys' Participation in Activities	21
Table 5: Measures of Leadership on GLI	29
Table 6: Measures of Equality of Rights for Girls on the GEI.....	36
Table 7: Measures of Equality of Rights for Boys on the GEI	37
Table 8: Measures of Gendered Social Norms for Girls on the GEI.....	39
Table 9: Measures of Gendered Social Norms for Boys on the GEI.....	40
Table 10: List of PTLA Partnering Organizations by Country.....	44
Table 11: Percentage of Girls Responding Favorably (i.e., often or always) to the Leadership Item	49
Table 12: Percentage of Girls Demonstrating Positive Change from Baseline to Present in Yemen	50

Acronyms

BOT	Board of Trustees
CDA	Community Development Associations
EFA	Education for All
GEI	Gender Equity Index
GLI	Girls' Leadership Index
IAQPE	Improving Access to Quality Primary Education Project
ITSPLY	Innovation through Sport: Promoting Leaders, Empowering Youth
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MWAI	Miske Witt & Associates Inc.
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
PTA	Parent-Teacher Association
PTLA	Power to Lead Alliance
SMC	School Management Committee
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

Executive Summary

Background

The Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA) was funded by USAID for implementation in six countries: Egypt, Honduras, India, Malawi, Tanzania, and Yemen over the course of three years. The project, which began in September 2008 and ended in September 2011, focused on 10- to 14-year-old girls as the target population. The primary goal of PTLA was to promote girl leaders in vulnerable communities. Three objectives were formulated to address this goal:

Objective 1: Cultivate opportunities for girls to practice their leadership skills

Objective 2: Create partnerships to promote girls' leadership

Objective 3: Enhance knowledge to implement and promote girls' leadership programs

PTLA is rooted in CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework, which asserts that three interactive dimensions of empowerment—agency, relation change, and structural change—must be present in girls' leadership programming. As such, these three components served as a guiding framework in this evaluation, along with the core PTLA objectives.

Methodology

A five-person evaluation team visited sites in each of the six PTLA countries. Three sites were randomly selected in each country from which to collect data (except in Yemen, which selected four). In countries where quantitative baseline data were available (i.e., Honduras, Malawi, and Yemen), only active participants were involved in data collection. For all other countries, data were collected both from active participants and from a comparison group of youth not active in PTLA activities.

Data collection strategies included focus groups, semi-structured interviews, activity observations, and the administration of the Girls' Leadership Index (GLI) and the Girls' Equity Index (GEI). Based on a previous study, 24 items from the GLI were used to create a leadership scale; 15 items from the GEI were used to form a scale on equality of rights, and 11 GEI items were used to measure gendered social norms.

Opportunities to Practice Leadership Skills

PTLA provided multiple and diverse opportunities for girls to practice leadership skills. These varied widely, but generally fell into 12 categories: sports, health, arts and drama, debate, music, youth council and boards, life skills groups, academic clubs, scouts, awareness campaigns, environment work, and classroom support. Sports, arts, and drama are consistently the strongest areas of involvement across countries for both girls and boys. Although levels of engagement differed by type of activity and site, staff from many countries observed higher involvement and enthusiasm from girls than boys.

The most common barrier noted by girls in every country related to community attitudes and norms. Community members', parents', and youth's perceptions of gender roles tended to restrict girls' involvement initially. Views that girls would be unsafe or unfit in certain situations challenged their participation. In most cases there was evidence of overcoming the community attitude barrier through actions taken by support personnel and youth.

Leadership Knowledge and Skills

Five leadership competencies were addressed through the PTLA work: *confidence, voice and assertion, decision making and action, organization, and vision and ability to motivate others*. Additionally, the Yemen program includes *conflict management* and *group dynamics* as core skills.

- **Voice** was an area of strong perceived growth among girls and boys across all countries. Some examples for practicing this competency include sharing opinions and ideas with teachers, classmates, family members, and authorities.
- **Confidence** was another strong area of development for girls and boys. Some examples of this skill include sharing poetry with classmates and at competitions, overcoming shyness to speak in public, volunteering for tasks and standing in front of others, and feeling confident to answer teachers' questions.
- **Decision making** was not observed in girls' examples as frequently as voice and confidence. Generally, discussion around decision making was limited to making decisions about the activities in which to participate.
- **Organization** was typically observed through civic action. Other examples of organization include planning public events; organizing community activities; gathering friends to practice; organizing time to complete homework; and organizing to complete teachers' tasks.

- **Vision and motivating others** was most frequently associated with personal and family dreams for the future. Very few responses were given about the actions required to make the dream a reality. Other examples of vision include feeling optimism about plans for the future; expressing aspirations for one's career; and envisioning family, educated children, good jobs, and home.
- **Conflict management** was a competency specific to Yemen's PTLA programming. Girls in Yemen appeared to make the greatest gains on this skill compared with the other areas, with 75% of girls showing a positive change in their perceived ability to get others to agree on a solution in order to solve a problem. Girls in other countries also gave examples of conflict management related to calming people down if they were about to fight.
- **Group dynamics** is another competency specific to Yemen. Of girls in Yemen who completed the GLI, 64% demonstrated a positive change in their perceived ability to cooperate with others to achieve goals. A common theme related to conflict resolution outside of Yemen was girls' focus on inclusion in activities.

General leadership development was assessed through a scale on the GLI, which was administered in five out of six countries in its original form. Yemen administered an adapted version of the instrument. Except for Malawi, all countries showed a statistically significant difference between the active participant group and the comparison group, with the active group scoring higher. To complement the quantitative data, the focus groups revealed that a majority of the girls felt they were either developing as leaders or already successful as leaders. Boys perceived their leadership development similarly.

Supportive Relations

Girls in all six countries identified diverse relationships developed through PTLA. These included teachers, coaches, mentors, peer leaders, family members, community leaders, and peers. Most frequently, girls cited relationships with peers, family members, and community mentors as the most influential on their leadership development. Relationships between boys and girls were also reported to improve, though this is still an area for growth. Individuals from every country identified encouragement as the biggest support factor for girls' leadership development. This was most often related to parents' or community mentors' encouragement for participating in school or CARE activities.

Key relationships with peers and community mentors in particular were a result of involvement in social networks. These occurred through various clubs and groups in which girls and boys were involved. Efforts across countries were made to get boys and girls to interact positively within these social networks, but this has been met with varying success.

Enabling Environment

The recognition of girls' rights within a community is an important factor in creating an enabling environment. Results from the Gender Equity Index (GEI) show statistically significant higher recognition of equality of rights for active girls in five countries and for active boys in four countries, over the girls and boys in comparison groups. In terms of the gendered social norms scale, active girls and boys showed statistically significant higher recognition than the comparison groups in four out of five countries. Yemen did not collect data on the GEI and thus was not included in these analyses.

Data from focus groups revealed that discrepancies exist between boys' attitudes toward equal rights and their behavior. While a majority of the boys in focus groups agreed that girls have the same right as boys to express opinions and the right to be educated, girls reported conflicting behaviors and statements from boys that did not support equal rights for girls. Data from all PTLA countries revealed women's consistently positive attitudes toward girls, and their support for and encouragement of their daughters to attend school. Perceptions of men's attitudes toward girls varied more. While there seemed to be some positive changes in men's beliefs, some comments indicated a persistence of negative behavior toward girls. Overall, it appears that community attitudes toward girls have changed. Even though attitudes may have already been changing prior to PTLA, programming in these communities has supported this shift in thinking and action

Every PTLA country demonstrated work with partner organizations, but each approached it in a different way. In Yemen and Tanzania, partnership opportunities were limited by the absence of formal partners such as NGOs in Yemen, which led to the decision to utilize community groups (e.g., Mothers Councils and Fathers Councils in Yemen and informal community groups in Tanzania) within the project communities. In other countries like Honduras, multiple NGOs were available to utilize as partner agencies. Partner organizations appeared to provide a variety of different supports; but recruitment, training, material provisions, and oversight were the most frequently cited forms of involvement. Limited funding was a recurring theme that prevented NGOs from continuing their partnership and involvement.

Most structural changes were related to community social norms. Individuals in each country discussed the changing perception of girls' roles. There was an attitudinal shift toward greater acceptance of girls' rights, but few new policies were noted in support of girls except in Honduras. Yemen and Malawi also are exceptions; there Mothers and Fathers Councils and Mothers Groups are mandated by law to operate. While these groups requested and need more oversight and training, their potential as a support structure is great.

Program Results

As assessed through the GLI, all countries attained or were close to attaining the 70% target of possessing leadership skills and competencies. All countries also met or were close to meeting the 50% target on one of the self-confidence items. Girls in all countries except Honduras also met the 70% target of taking leadership action. Yemen is a unique case in that girls were tracked from baseline to the end of the project. Although the GLI instrument used different GLI items than other countries, Yemen also met the target of 50% of girls having improved self-confidence. The 70% targets for leadership skills and competencies and for leadership action in homes, schools, or communities were not met; but it is notable that over 50% improved in these areas as well.

Each country achieved the target of establishing at least two partnerships as specified in Objective 2 to promote girls' leadership. Knowledge development related to girls' leadership programming as called for in Objective 3, was met through this evaluation as well as through reports, publications, and supplemental materials.

Recommendations and Conclusions

Several promising practices arose across PTLA sites and supported each of the three categories in CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework: individual change, structural change, and relational change. In terms of individual change, the diversity of activities across and within countries contributed to the success of the program and its participants. With regard to relational change, the use of community groups was observed positively to support program goals. While time-consuming, capacity building of community members fosters a greater likelihood of sustainability. Related to structural change, a promising practice was the intentional preparation of communities through awareness raising and through trainings on girls' rights.

Key recommendations are based on the lessons learned across PTLA countries. These emerged around three categories: scale-up and replication; sustainability; and social messaging.

With regard to scale-up and replication, three key lessons emerged. Infrastructure development is a critical component of girls' leadership programming. It is recommended that PTLA be implemented in communities where there is an existing infrastructure, or in places where CARE can contribute to its development. Program coordination was challenged by high staff turnover, low funding, and the ambiguity of a new program. A small team of personnel familiar with PTLA should be commissioned to compile a user-friendly manual for future program administration and operation. There is a strong desire for expansion of program opportunities beyond the current population. Many youth and support personnel expressed interest in having the program expand to include 15- to 18-year-olds. These areas should be considered in potential scale-up plans in order to widen the scope of impact.

Solid partnerships are critical to program sustainability. Existing community structures should be considered when selecting implementation sites. These range from informal community groups, to NGOs, to government agencies. Training is an important element of capacity building. While this requires substantial resources, the investment is worthwhile. It is suggested that training manuals and protocols be developed for existing and new staff.

With regard to social messaging, while some growth was noted in boys' attitudes toward girls, it is clear that bias still exists. Community attitudes are embedded in the structure of society and will not change overnight. It is recommended that boys and gendered social norms remain a key focus of the PTLA work in order to continue efforts directed at shifting attitudes. Many parents were hesitant to allow their daughters to participate in programs due to cultural inappropriateness or safety concerns. Developing trust between parents, program staff, and youth was critical for gaining girls' involvement in activities. Attention should continue to be given to strategies for gaining the full support of parents in the initiative.

Overall, the evaluation team in each of the six countries found strong potential for PTLA to impact girls' leadership development and influence shifts in community attitudes. However, just as change was starting to occur in each community, program funding came to an end. Desire to continue this work is high among support personnel, youth, families, and community leaders. In order to effect genuine, long-lasting change, the findings identified in this report should be drawn upon to build the next phase of the program.

Section 1: Background

Since the 1990 World Conference on Education for All (EFA) in Jomtien, Thailand, governments around the world have emphasized the importance of achieving universal primary education and eliminating gender disparities at the primary and secondary school levels. This was followed by an international commitment to the EFA Dakar Framework for Action in 2000, and by a pledge from 189 nations that same year to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) to reduce poverty around the world by 2015. These international commitments have ensured that basic education, gender equality, and girls' and women's empowerment have remained high programming priorities on the international agenda. While many girls' education programs address issues of gender and education inequalities, to date few have featured leadership development as a priority.

The development of leadership skills is important to help girls express their opinions and ideas, to take action on issues of personal importance, to make healthy decisions, and to work toward future dreams and goals. Girls' acquisition and application of leadership skills constitute an important component of their overall development as individuals, and they contribute to the overall goals of EFA and the MDGs. CARE US recognized this in 2007 when, building on programming its country offices had already developed to enhance girls' leadership skills, it launched the "Power Within" initiative in 2008, which in turn led to the creation of the Power to Lead Alliance.

PTLA Initiative

The Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA) was funded by USAID for implementation in six countries: Egypt, Honduras, India, Malawi, Tanzania, and Yemen over the course of three years. All countries had existing projects or activities in girls' education and/or girls' empowerment, which provided a foundation for PTLA. The primary goal of PTLA was to promote girl leaders in vulnerable communities. Accordingly, three objectives were devised:

Objective 1: Cultivate opportunities for girls to practice their leadership skills

Objective 2: Create partnerships to promote girls' leadership

Objective 3: Enhance knowledge to implement and promote girls' leadership programs

The project began in September 2008 and ended in September 2011. It focused on 10- to 14-year-old girls, and it also included participation from older and younger girls, as well as boys. During the first year of the project, CARE country offices developed the curriculum frameworks, hired and trained staff, selected sites, and

collected baseline data. In most cases the leadership programs were implemented during the second and third years, except in some instances where programs began late due to extenuating circumstances. This was the case in Malawi and at one site in Yemen.

CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework

CARE's work in girls' leadership is based on its Gender Empowerment Framework, which is grounded in the field of gender and empowerment studies in development, especially from Deepa Narayan's (2001, 2005) work on specific elements of empowerment that can be assessed. From Kabeer's (1999a, 1999b) and Narayan's work, CARE developed its framework, which asserts that three interactive dimensions of empowerment – agency, supportive relations, and structures – must be addressed in programming to sustain transformative outcomes for the well-being of girls, boys, and women (CARE USA 2006a, 2006b in Miske, Meagher, & DeJaeghere, 2010).

Agency. Individual change or agency is evident when poor women become agents of their own development, are able to analyze their own lives, make their own decisions, and take their own actions. Women (and men) gain agency by gaining skills, knowledge, confidence, and experience.

Relational change. Through relational change, women form new relations with other social actors, build relationships, form coalitions, and develop mutual support. As a result, they are able to negotiate, be agents of change, alter structures, and so realize their rights and attain livelihood security.

Structural change. Structural change involves women – individually and collectively – challenging the routines, conventions, laws, family forms, kinship structures, and taken-for-granted behaviors that shape their lives (i.e., the “social order,” accepted forms of power, and how these are perpetuated).

CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework



<p><u>Individual change (Agency):</u> Poor women become <i>agents</i> of their own development, able to analyze their own lives, make their own decisions and take their own actions. Women (and men) <i>gain agency</i> by gaining skills, knowledge, confidence, experience.</p>	<p>and</p>	<p><u>Structure change:</u> Women, individually and collectively, challenge the routines, conventions, laws, family forms, kinship structures and taken-for-granted behaviors that shape their lives – the ‘social order,’ accepted forms of power and how these are perpetuated.</p>
<p>and</p>	<p><u>Relation change:</u> Women form new relations with other social actors, build relationships, form coalitions and develop mutual support in order to negotiate, be agents of change, alter structures, and so realize rights and livelihood security.</p>	<p>and</p>

Evaluation Questions

On September 28, 2011, CARE USA contracted with Miske Witt & Associates Inc. (MWAI), St. Paul, Minnesota USA to conduct a summative evaluation of the PTLA project in the six countries. MWAI was simultaneously contracted to complete a summative evaluation of the ITSPLEY program in four countries, two of which overlap with PTLA. This report conveys the findings related to PTLA’s overall goal of promoting girl leaders in vulnerable communities. This will be addressed by responding to three questions related to the project’s key strategic objectives.

- (1) To what extent have opportunities been cultivated for girls to practice their leadership skills?
- (2) To what extent have partnerships been created to promote girls’ leadership?
- (3) To what extent has knowledge on implementing and promoting girls’ leadership programs been enhanced?

The project's strategic objectives also relate to CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework. In order to provide a thorough evaluation of PTLA, the three components of the framework are also addressed: agency, relational change, and structural change. This includes an assessment of girls' and boys' development of leadership knowledge and skills, the presence of supportive relationships, and the status of community attitudes and behaviors toward girls. Finally, as requested, this evaluation also reports on unique country-level outcomes, promising practices, challenges, scale-up and replication possibilities, and key recommendations.

Section 2: Country Context

Egypt

CARE Egypt implemented PTLA in four educational districts in Malawy and Abokerkas in Minia, and in 20 preparatory schools in Ahnasia and Alfashan in Beni Suef. All of the sites were marginalized communities with few teaching resources, learning materials, sports equipment, or playground space for girls. PTLA was a school-led initiative, working with 32 NGOs, 16 Board of Trustees (BOTs), and Community Development Associations (CDAs). The program served 12,405 students, including 6,754 girls and more than 5,500 boys. CARE's ITSPLEY program was also implemented in Egypt at some of the same sites as the PTLA program. The 2011 Egyptian Revolution, which led to the overthrow of President Hosni Mubarak, sparked a political environment that set the stage for young girls' and boys' leadership practice in PTLA.

Honduras

CARE Honduras implemented PTLA project activities in two municipalities in the Department of Francisco Morazon, La Cuesta and El Lolo, and in one municipality in the Department of La Paz, Guajiquiro. As the second poorest country in Central America, Honduras suffers from severe poverty. This is particularly the case for the country's rural women, where they are among the most vulnerable groups. PTLA programs were community-based, and they operated through the initiatives "Girls Establishing Their Identity and Leadership in the Community" and "Girls Leading Their Identity in the Community." Both initiatives targeted 10- to 14-year-old girls and followed the global PTLA objectives." The project worked directly with local authorities and sought to create strategic partnerships with other organizations in the area.

India

CARE India implemented PTLA in 245 villages in Uttar Pradesh, one of India's poorest states. The female literacy rate in Uttar Pradesh is shockingly low, at around only 40%. All sites offered the program to girls, and 60 sites offered the program to boys as well. A total of 6,188 girls and 1,026 boys were involved in the collectives formed as part of the program. India's PTLA sites were religiously diverse, with the program operating in both Hindu and Muslim communities. Within the Hindu communities, issues related to the caste system were prevalent, while the Muslim communities were characterized by extreme poverty and limited education opportunities for girls.

Malawi

CARE Malawi implemented PTLA in 134 communities in two districts, Kasungu and Dowa. These are located in north central Malawi and are spread across 10 education zones. PTLA in Malawi is both school- and community-led. It works in conjunction with school associations such as School Management Committees (SMCs) and Parent-Teacher Associations (PTAs), as well as with the community through Mothers Groups. All of the sites were in marginalized communities with minimal resources, infrastructure, and materials. Overcrowding in schools was common; and there was a shortage of teachers, especially females. The focus of the project was to provide diverse extracurricular activities for girls, to establish and strengthen social networks of girls, and to enhance girls' participation in civic action. The program targeted 17,433 10- to 14-year-old girls. Malawi's foreign currency and fuel crisis exacerbated the challenges of implementing PTLA in its large number of sites.

Tanzania

CARE Tanzania implemented PTLA in 17 primary schools. The schools are located in 15 villages in three wards: Bugarama, Bulanhulu, and Lunguya. PTLA is school-led, working through school associations such as SMCs and PTAs. The PTLA program operates in conjunction with the ITSPLEY program, which provided an opportunity to examine the synergy between projects. All of the sites were in marginalized communities with minimal resources, infrastructure, and materials. Overcrowding was a common issue, as well as a shortage of teachers. CARE's ITSPLEY program was also implemented in Tanzania at the same sites as PTLA.

Yemen

CARE Yemen implemented PTLA in four village clusters in three districts. All three districts are located in the Hajjah governorate, which is considered one of the poorest governorates of Yemen. Communities were selected based on their need, as demonstrated by the level of poverty within the district, lack of educational infrastructure, lack of alternative sources of support, and low levels of educational attainment by boys and girls. Due to the recent civil unrest, these areas have been inundated with refugees from conflict areas, which created a challenging environment for program implementation. The program engaged in intensive community preparation, and leadership training of girls and boys. It then, with communities, set up small learning centers or 'libraries' in the communities, and trained girls to serve as 'librarians', thus creating spaces for them to develop leadership skills outside the home. It also created summer centers, student councils, sports teams, an assistant teacher program, and school groups to further leadership opportunities. The program served 12,088 beneficiaries, including 3,867 girls; 3,519 boys; 1,913 women; and 2,789 men.

Section 3: Methodology

MWAI evaluation co-coordinators designed an evaluation approach specific to the cross-site summative evaluation of PTLA and a complementary project, namely, Innovation through Sport: Promoting Leaders, Empowering Youth (ITSPLEY). The design included a country coordinator for each country, who traveled to the country to lead the evaluation team; a national research associate, who conducted research alongside the lead evaluator; an interpreter; and two data collectors (enumerators). CARE country staff assisted with such logistics as contacting sites ahead of time to let local staff know the needs of the evaluation team and physically finding the sites.

Due to civil unrest in Yemen, the country coordinator selected was an expatriate researcher already residing in the country, who was assisted by a national evaluation team consisting of personnel similar to the other countries.

The US-based MWAI team country coordinators met for two days in St. Paul, Minnesota on October 4 and 5, 2011 to draft instruments and to develop plans for data collection, analysis, and report writing in collaboration with the CARE US team. Country visits ranging from seven to 12 days were launched on October 22 and concluded on November 26, 2011.

Country	Country Coordinator	Dates
Egypt	Patti McLaughlin	November 14–26, 2011
Honduras	Lynn Evans	October 27–November 5, 2011
India	Greg Sales	November 6–16, 2011
Malawi	Jerry Boardman	November 4–14, 2011
Tanzania	Jerry Boardman	October 21–November 5, 2011
Yemen	Sharon Beatty	November 5–28, 2011

Although there were variations, a typical country visit included the following: (1) preparatory conversations or e-mail exchanges in advance of the visit, including the request for reports, and for randomized selection of sites, as requested by CARE US in Atlanta; (2) a meeting with the CARE country office staff on arrival in the country and a meeting with the field office staff, if they were located outside the capital city; (3) data collection during one- to two-day site visits; (4) subsequent to the site visits, translation and drafting summaries of qualitative data, as well as entry, checking, and cleaning quantitative data; and (5) a final meeting with CARE staff to discuss the data collection process.

Following the country visit, each country coordinator submitted the data to the MWAI team data analysts. The first data analyst then entered the quantitative data into Excel spreadsheets and SPSS software. A second data analyst entered the qualitative data into NVIVO software, coding the data according to themes that matched the interview and focus group discussion questions. The data analysts then returned the data to the lead evaluators to draft a report specific to each country.

The MWAI team of US-based country coordinators reconvened in St. Paul, Minnesota on November 28 to 30, 2011 to share findings and lessons learned across sites. This meeting also included virtual communication with the lead evaluators in Yemen and Kenya.

Data Collection Strategies and Instruments

The five-person MWAI evaluation teams collected on-site data in the six PTLA countries: Egypt, Honduras, India, Malawi, Tanzania, and Yemen. The teams visited three sites in each country, with the exception of Yemen, where the team visited four sites. At least one of the two leaders of each team (i.e., country coordinator/lead evaluator or research associate) was able to speak the official or national language of the country.

In Honduras, Malawi, and Yemen, only active participants were included in data collection, since quantitative baseline data were available from these countries. Analysts compared evaluation data from active participants with baseline data (Honduras, Malawi, and Yemen), with comparison girls and boys from the same site as active girls and boys (Egypt, India), or with a comparison site (Tanzania). For the purposes of this report, girls and boys who participated in PTLA activities are referred to as "active" and baseline, and comparison group data are referred to as the comparison group.

Data collection strategies included focus groups, semi-structured interviews, activity observations, and the administration of the Girls' Leadership Index (GLI) and the Girls' Equity Index (GEI). The research associate typically conducted focus group interviews with girls and boys active in PTLA programming and with comparison groups of girls and boys not active in PTLA, where specified. The country coordinators and research associates conducted the activity observations together. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with active girls (two or three in each country), PTLA support personnel, staff and management of partner organizations, and community leaders.

Enumerators administered the 24 questions of the GLI to girls in all five countries, except Yemen, and also to boys in Malawi. In order to increase participants' understanding of the GLI and GEI questions, questions were both printed on an answer sheet and read aloud in all sites. Enumerators also administered the GEI to girls and boys in all countries except Yemen. In Yemen, the version of the GLI with 73 questions, which had been previously adapted to fit the cultural context of the country, was also used for this evaluation in order to maintain consistency.

DeJaeghere and Krause (2011) conducted a factor analysis on baseline GLI and GEI data and identified one unique factor in the GLI (leadership) and three unique factors in the GEI (equality of rights, gendered social norms, and gendered responsibility). Only the items that loaded on these factors were included in the versions of the GLI and GEI administered for the PTLA evaluation in all countries except Yemen. (See Annex A and Annex B for lists of items by factor.) The reliability of each scale is quite good. Table 1 shows the comparison of reliability scores between the 2009 data collection and the 2011 data collection using Cronbach's alpha. (Due to consistently low reliability for the gendered responsibility scale, it was not included in this evaluation.)

Table 1: Reliability Scores on GLI and GEI Scales for Each Data Collection Period

Scale	2009	2011
Leadership	.89	.82
Equality of rights	.96	.65
Gendered social norms	.74	.80
Gendered responsibility	.39	.49

Sampling

CARE Country Office staff randomly selected sites in each country in collaboration with the evaluators. Details about site selection can be found in Annex C. In some sites, students for the focus groups were selected randomly; at other sites, teachers and facilitators helped select the girls and boys for the focus groups. In Yemen, girls who had participated in the baseline also participated in data collection for the summative evaluation. From the active girls who participated in the focus groups, one or more of the particularly active girls was selected from each site for the semi-structured interviews. See Tables 2 and 3 for sample size distributions by the respective qualitative and quantitative data collection instruments.

Table 2: Sample Size Distributions by Qualitative Data Collection Instrument for Each Country

	Qualitative Instruments										
	Active Girls	Comp. Girls	Active Boys	Comp. Boys	Girl Success Story	Activity Observed	Support Person	Comm. Leader	Partner Staff	Reflection	CO Staff
Country	7a	7b	7c	7d	7e	7f	7g	7h	7i	7j	7k
Egypt	21	14	19	22	2	6	16	9	13	-	2
Honduras	23	-	18	-	3	2	8	5	4	1	4
India	24	23	16	14	3	3	5	3	2	6	3
Malawi	24	-	23	-	3	3	8	17	5	3	4
Tanzania	14	6	16	8	3	2	5	15	3	2	7
Yemen	40	-	26	-	4	3	24	33	1	1	1
<i>Total</i>	146	43	118	44	18	19	66	82	28	13	21

Table 3: Sample Size Distributions by Quantitative Data Collection Instrument for Each Country

Country	Quantitative Instruments							
	GLI				GEI			
	Active Girls	Comp. Girls	Active Boys	Comp. Boys	Active Girls	Comp. Girls	Active Boys	Comp. Boys
Egypt	100	50	-	-	49	25	51	25
Honduras	113	168	-	-	63	52	58	55
India	71	49	-	-	74	49	26	120
Malawi	129	162	137	170	72	176	73	187
Tanzania	84	44	-	-	49	24	47	24
Yemen ¹	110	208 ²	-	-	-	-	-	-
<i>Total</i>	607	681	137	170	307	326	255	411

¹Yemen administered an adapted version of the GLI.

²Yemen was the only country in which girls were tracked from baseline to final.

Section 4: Opportunities to Practice Leadership Skills

Types of activities

Availability of diverse extra-curricular activities for girls is deemed essential for strong leadership development. Girls must have opportunities outside of school classes to develop their social skills, intellect, and leadership through organized activities. PTLA provided the setting for girls and boys to practice their leadership skills. These varied widely across country, but largely fell into the 12 categories identified in Table 4.¹

¹ These categories were identified through the data collection process and may not be an exhaustive list.

Table 4: Girls' and Boys' Participation in Activities

Activity	Egypt		Honduras		India		Malawi		Tanzania		Yemen	
	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B	G	B
Sports	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X
Health			X		X						X	X
Arts/Drama	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Debate							X	X	X	X		
Music	X	X	X				X	X	X	X		
Youth council/boards	X	X	X				X	X	X	X	X	X
Life skills groups (includes health)							X	X	X	X	X	X
Academic clubs				X			X	X				
Scouts							X		X	X		
Awareness campaigns	X	X	X		X		X	X	X	X	X	X
Environment work	X	X	X		X							
Classroom support	X	X					X	X	X	X	X	

The activities (not listed in any particular order) ranged from music, art, and drama, to debate, health, and sports. Activities also included participation in youth councils, parliaments, or boards; life skills groups; academic clubs; scouts; awareness campaigns; environment work; and classroom support. Based on the data collected, sports, arts, and drama are consistently the strongest areas of involvement across countries for both boys and girls. Awareness campaigns also tended to be popular in each country, with more girls involved than boys. Many of these activities incorporate social network and/or civic action components. Girls developed social networks naturally through the group nature of all of these activities. Girls clearly felt safe within these environments, as evidenced by their high levels of engagement. They spoke about their own development as leaders in these activities, as well as about the development of their peers. In addition, some of these activities had a civic action component that compelled girls to take action in the community. This level of involvement deepened organizational and decision-making skills that were not apparent in some of the other recreation-based areas.

Level of engagement

Levels of engagement differed by type of activity, site, and in some cases gender. These data were collected through focus group interviews in which girls and boys reported on their involvement in various activities and through observation of activities.

- In Malawi and Tanzania, girls and boys tended to demonstrate higher engagement for the extra-curricular activities, particularly sports and traditional games. Boys and girls were both involved, but in the case of Malawi there appeared to be higher involvement from girls; boys only entered the program in 2011.
- In Egypt, girls and boys showed high involvement in sports-based activities, but they also seemed to have particularly high engagement in leadership and group problem-solving activities.
- Data from India showed discrepancies between girls' and boys' engagement levels. While girls reported enthusiastically about their involvement and seemed to demonstrate greater initiative in evaluation activities, boys were more reserved and did not participate in the evaluation activities to the same extent as girls.
- Girls in three out of four sites in Yemen were involved in multiple leadership activities and took advantage of these opportunities by participating in many different ways. In comparison, girls in the fourth site tended to be involved in only one activity, which could be a result of the fact that their project only began in 2011.
- Girls and boys in Honduras engaged at high levels in the activities observed (drama and traditional dancing). Both girls and boys spoke enthusiastically about their engagement in a number of other club activities. They especially enjoyed playing soccer. However, in terms of civic action activities, girls tended to show higher involvement than boys.

While the range of activities varied by country, site, and gender, both boys and girls reported a high degree of enthusiasm for the activities. In general, girls and boys were eager to discuss the ways in which they had been involved in leadership groups. Level of engagement spans the spectrum, from basic participation in an activity to organizing and decision-making roles for that activity. Basic participation was evident throughout the activities listed in Table 4, but leadership roles were less apparent. Some exceptions include Yemen, where girls discussed their positions in various

groups; and, in Honduras, where girls described their involvement in planning and executing events in the community.

Barriers to participation

The most common barrier to girls' participation in activities noted in every country related to community attitudes and norms. Community members', parents', and youth's perceptions of gender roles tended to restrict girls' involvement initially. The belief that girls would be unsafe or unfit in certain situations challenged their participation.

- In Yemen, playing sports was viewed as shameful to girls, and they were discouraged from participating in activities where boys or men would be present.
- In India, Egypt, and Honduras, some parents were reluctant to let their daughters participate in activities. Organizers countered this resistance with targeted advocacy efforts such as home visits to encourage permission to attend.
- In Malawi and Tanzania, the barrier was related mostly to peer discouragement. Non-participating youth occasionally tried to dissuade participating girls from being involved in activities.

In most cases there was evidence of overcoming the community attitude barrier through actions taken by support personnel and youth. Some examples of this include efforts in Honduras to build trust between parents, mentors, and girls, which was established through theater presentations about the goals of the groups, as well as through visits between staff and parents. In India, participation usually was gained as a result of a family member advocating for the girl to participate. Occasionally this meant a home visit to encourage parents to grant permission to attend. In Yemen, evidence suggests that girls acted as their own advocates by speaking to their parents about false rumors concerning their involvement in activities.

Other barriers mentioned less frequently included practical problems, such as difficult access to the training centers, as was noted in one site in Yemen and in Honduras. In one case in Egypt, boys complained that teachers gave selection preference to relatives for program participation and asked for a fairer process for selecting students to participate. Boys in Malawi lamented the limited space in classes and low teacher availability. They requested increased access to the clubs in order to increase participation.

PTLA Success Story – Yemen



Jamilah is 16 years old and finished eighth grade. Her village, Dhahoor Ashemmal, is poor. Girls' workload is traditionally very heavy, and most girls drop out of school before fourth grade. Jamilah used to go to school in the morning, and in the afternoon do household chores like fetching water, collecting wood, and looking after sheep. In the evening, she used to do her homework. But since PTLA was introduced about one year ago, Jamilah's life has changed.

"Before the [PTLA] project started, I was in the seventh grade. When the project started, I joined the summer center. I participated in different activities including, sewing, the Holy Quran, drawing, writing stories, hand writing, and self-confidence training. The project made a change in me. When there was any event in the school and I had to present something, I used to get scared and confused. I learned in the project how to be confident. I became able to present things smoothly in public. I used to hate going to school. But the project helped me to like going to school. I like to go and read books and stories [at the library established by the PTLA project]. Also, at home I started to practice different activities, like reading poetry, and drawing. I wrote a short story about girls' education. I presented it to the teacher, and then I read it to my classmates. I also wrote a poem about home called "Yemen." I read it on the graduation day of the summer course.

The establishment of a school library and other structural changes has allowed Jamilah to see herself differently. "The project was a turning point in my life because it gave me the tools to sharpen my writing talent. The library was for me like the palace where I could go and find myself. I read and write and discover the great person in myself. I hope that one day I can become a doctor. My first dream is to be a journalist, though. I like writing."

Section 5: Leadership Knowledge and Skills

CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework includes an emphasis on individual change, or agency. This is related to the first pillar in the PTLA leadership model, described as "realizing the power within." This consists of five leadership competencies for girls: *confidence, voice or assertion, decision making and action, organization, and vision and ability to motivate others*. Additionally, the Yemen program includes *conflict management* and *group dynamics* as core skills. These core competencies were established with a focus on girls, but evidence shows growth in these areas among boys as well. Program staff in each country were able to describe these competencies, which shows how their understanding of country program goals aligned with the overall goal of PTLA. In some cases (e.g., Tanzania and India), even program participants themselves outlined these goals.

Voice

A girl who has found her voice is comfortable sharing her thoughts and ideas with others, and knows she has the right to do so. (CARE, 2011, p. 19)

In general, girls and boys across countries appeared to have grown most in their ability to share their thoughts and ideas with others (i.e., voice). Some examples of voice given across countries were sharing opinions and ideas with teachers, classmates, family members, and authorities. In addition, some participants mentioned speaking more frequently in class. One girl in Egypt proclaimed, "Before, I was afraid of the teachers. But now I can share my ideas, and I can even ask the teacher to explain points."

A solid majority of girls from active sites in four countries (all but Malawi and Tanzania) said in focus groups that they noticed a big difference in terms of "finding their voice" through PTLA activities. In Malawi, participants did not have a clear understanding of the leadership skills, thus attribution was difficult. Tanzania also implemented ITSPLEY, as did Egypt, thus making attribution difficult there. Girls in these countries also indicated higher levels of voice than active boys. Active site participants from Egypt, India, and Tanzania reported stronger perceptions of having developed their voice than those from the comparison sites in those countries. Comparison group boys showed even lower levels of voice than the active group boys. In general, active site boys tended to show higher levels of voice than comparison site boys, but in general they were lower than active site girls. (See Annex D.)

Self-confidence

A confident girl is aware of her opinions, goals and abilities, and acts to assert herself in order to influence and change her life and world. (CARE, 2011, p. 19)

Girls and boys at active sites exhibited a strong sense of self-confidence. In all six countries the focus group data revealed that a majority of girls who had participated in PTLA activities grew in self-confidence. Where comparison group data were available, girls and boys from active sites indicated higher levels of confidence. In general, girls also reported higher levels of confidence than boys. (See Annex E.) They demonstrated this skill through sharing poetry with classmates and at competitions, overcoming shyness to speak in public, volunteering for tasks and standing in front of others, and feeling confident to answer teachers' questions. One girl in Malawi said, "I am able to stand in front of a class and speak confidently about the plans and activities that we plan for the club." Another girl in Tanzania said, "I am confident with what I do, the way I talk, the way I play and even the way I study . . . I just believe in my abilities that I can perform better."

Decision Making

A girl who demonstrates sound decision-making understands that her own decisions matter for herself, for her future, and often, for others. (CARE, 2011)

Decision making is the ability to make good choices about things that matter in one's own life and that affect others' lives as well. Examples of decision making given by girls in focus groups include querying others' views and formulating one's own opinion before making a decision; deciding on those projects in which to participate; and publishing a school magazine. However, decision-making competencies were less apparent than voice and self-confidence for active girls across all countries. Generally discussion around decision making was limited to making decisions about participation in activities. This is an important first step for girls in realizing their own agency, but decision making in leadership involves much more. The challenges of making decisions in a patriarchal context are highlighted by data from Egypt, where boys from the comparison group disagreed that girls have the right to make their own decisions. One comparison group boy claimed, "[Boys] are confident and can implement a decision. Girls cannot." In contrast, one girl from the active site said, "Before I used to follow others' advice without thinking, now I question them and find my own thoughts."

Organization

A girl with organization skills is able to organize herself and her actions in order to accomplish a goal, and to take an idea and put it into reality. (CARE, 2011)

Organization involves pondering and ordering one's priorities in order to achieve one's goals. Organization competencies in PTLA frequently were observed through activities related to civic action, such as, girls in Tanzania lobbying to influence adults' ideas at community meetings, and girls in India confronting the families of several girls on the illegal practice of early marriage. Girls discussed these skills indirectly as they gave examples of their activities, which included planning public events by identifying problems and completing a civic activity to address the problem; organizing community events and activities; organizing time to complete homework; and organizing to complete teachers' tasks. However, girls did not seem to recognize the importance of their organizational skills to the success of an activity. For example, girls in Egypt did not recognize that their organizational skills had contributed to the success of their civic action project, even though they were equally as involved as the boys. In contrast, active boys were quick to say they had organized public events. Similarly, in Honduras girls gave examples of organizing events in the community, but again they did not equate their actions with the skills of organization.

Vision and motivating others

A girl with a strong and clear vision and who is able to motivate others brings people together to accomplish a task. (CARE, 2011)

Vision involves having a clear idea of action needed to accomplish a task. In this evaluation it was most frequently associated with personal and family dreams for the future. One girl in Malawi said, "I would like to be a nurse. I would like to work at Madisi Hospital so that I could help my community and also act as a role model for young girls." Many active girls from across the six countries similarly shared their career aspirations and hopes for providing for their family, but they did not describe a plan for achieving those dreams. Having the dream is the first step to realizing it, but the next step is for girls to recognize their own power to make that dream a reality. Other examples of vision girls provided included feeling optimistic about plans for the future; expressing aspirations for her own career and for her family's future; and envisioning family, educated children, good jobs, and home.

Yemen added two related leadership competencies to the five core skills of PTLA: group dynamics and conflict management.

Group Dynamics

Group dynamics is defined as the ability of an individual to work with others in a group setting. In Yemen, 64% of the girls who completed the baseline and final GLI demonstrated a positive change in their perceived ability to cooperate with others to achieve goals. This was complemented by their collective discussion in focus groups about cooperation and working together.

Group dynamic skills were also apparent in other countries, despite less of a focus on this area. A common theme related to group dynamics outside of Yemen was girls' focus on inclusion in activities. For example, in Malawi one girl discussed allowing everyone to speak her mind in the group. In Egypt a girl shared her efforts to involve younger members of the group in expressing themselves. Other examples also included helping other girls share their ideas in a group; allowing others to speak in group settings; managing multiple roles within one group; and respecting others' opinions.

Conflict Management

Conflict management is defined as the ability of an individual to manage problems or disputes. Girls in Yemen appeared to make the greatest gains on conflict management compared to the other leadership competencies. Items on Yemen's adapted GLI showed that 75% of girls had a positive change in their perceived ability to get others to agree on a solution in order to solve a problem. This finding is supported by their comments about helping others solve conflicts at home and school, and particularly by their examples of speaking to their parents in such a way that they could solve problems without exacerbating the conflict. Girls in other countries also gave examples of conflict management related to calming people down if they were about to fight. Some mentioned solving problems without violence. Other examples included addressing family or school problems by taking action; visiting parents to get permission for other girls to attend activities; addressing unfair or unjust issues in the community; speaking to individuals about resolving problems; and solving school problems through the class council.

Overall leadership development

This section examines girls' and boys' leadership development through their own self-reporting in focus group discussions and through their performance on the GLI, which captured girls' overall development in leadership skills. A scale item on leadership was created from the GLI, which was administered to five out of the six countries in its

revised form, as suggested in DeJaeghere and Krause (2011). Yemen administered an adapted version of the instrument, as described above (see “Methodology”).

Egypt, Honduras, India, and Tanzania showed statistically significant differences in GLI scores between the comparison and active groups, with girls from active groups consistently scoring higher at the completion of PTLA. Malawi is the only country with no difference noted for girls, and a negative difference between baseline and final data collections for boys (i.e., boys’ leadership). Table 5 shows group means for each country. The mean score is based on a four-point response option of 1=rarely, 2=sometimes, 3=often, and 4=always (e.g., a mean of 3 is equated with a response of “often”).

Girls from the active groups scored higher than girls from the comparison groups of students (i.e., there was a positive statistically significant difference between the comparison and active groups) in every country except Malawi. In Malawi, there was no difference between the groups of girls. The intervention there began much later than in other countries and partner organizations did not teach the five leadership competencies as forthrightly as in some countries (e.g., India and Tanzania). Boys in the comparison group in Malawi scored higher on the leadership scale than boys in the active group. This is not surprising: as participants gained knowledge about leadership skills they were more objective about their strengths; with minimal knowledge they tended to overrate themselves, a common phenomenon in assessments such as this.

Table 5: Measures of Leadership on GLI

Country	Sample Size		Mean		Standard Deviation		Significant Difference (p-value)
	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	
Egypt (girls)	50	100	3.07	3.33	.315	.309	YES; p < .001***
India (girls)	49	71	2.10	3.62	.46	.29	YES; p < .001***
Tanzania (girls)	44	84	2.80	2.90	.23	.28	YES; p = .037**
Honduras (girls)	168	113	2.78	3.08	.414	.341	YES; p < .001***
Malawi (girls)	162	129	2.85	2.88	.37	.39	NO
Malawi (boys)	170	137	3.08	2.88	.38	.37	YES (neg.); p < .001**

*=small effect size; **=medium effect size; ***=large effect size (based on Cohen’s d)

An analysis of the focus group discussion data underscores the findings from the GLI. A majority of active girls who participated in focus groups in all six countries felt that they were either developing as leaders or already successful as leaders. (See Annex F.) Where comparison group data were available in India and Egypt, active site girls revealed higher perceptions of themselves as leaders than girls from the comparison sites.

As demonstrated through focus groups, active boys perceived their leadership development similar to active girls, with the exception of Tanzania and Yemen. In Tanzania, a greater percentage of boys than girls thought they were successful as leaders; in Yemen, the opposite was true. Active site boys had a much stronger sense of leadership development than comparison site boys—a majority of boys from the comparison sites felt they had not developed much as a leader.

Out of the six countries in the evaluation, girls in Yemen appeared to have the strongest perceptions of being successful leaders. Approximately 78% of girls in the Yemen focus groups stated that they felt successful as leaders. The next highest percentage was Malawi with 38.1%. While a high percentage of Yemeni girls perceived that they were successful leaders, they had difficulty providing examples of their leadership. Their perceptions seemed to be based on learning to take some control over their lives. One of the girls said, “We were unable to write or read, but we became more confident and we convinced our families to send us back to school.” This level of assertiveness was not in evidence prior to PTLA.

We were unable to write or read, but we became more confident, and we convinced our families to send us back to school. (A girl from Yemen)

In summary, both qualitative (focus group discussions) and quantitative (GLI) evidence from each of the countries supports the claim that girls and boys possess new leadership competencies and have had opportunities to practice them through participation in formal and informal PTLA programming. In general, girls referenced voice and confidence most frequently. Decision making, vision, and organization also were apparent in some of the girls’ examples, but these skills were less well developed or were not self-identifiable. These competencies may represent more developed forms of leadership gained through experience. Once girls have strong voice and confidence, other competencies may develop further. Conflict management and group dynamics were evident, particularly in Yemen, which would be expected given their focus on these two additional areas. Yemen’s experience in this area suggests future programming in all countries could include these two critical leadership competencies.

PTLA Success Story – India



At 14, Deepika is a tall, slender, impeccably groomed girl with long brown hair, sparkling intense eyes, a broad smile, and immense enthusiasm. When she talks, she uses her entire body to express herself – she waves her arms, leans forward, and opens her eyes wide. Deepika joined the local girls' collective as the program was just beginning three years ago, after being encouraged by a program volunteer.

But Deepika comes from a challenging home situation. As she describes her life outside of the program, her voice cracks. It is the only indication she gives of being vulnerable. She tells how her father is dead and her mother is sick. She explains that she is the youngest of four girls and the only one remaining at home. Her older sisters have married and moved away. As a result, she is required to carry an exceptionally heavy workload at home. In the morning she attends school. After school, she goes home and does all of the housework – cleaning, cooking, caring for her mother, gardening. (She smiled as she mentioned the gardening, which is a new skill she learned as part of the program.)

When she first started participating in the program, Deepika reports that she was often questioned by neighbors about why she was out and what she was doing. As villagers became more aware of the program, the questioning stopped. Deepika now knows more about her rights, and her personal confidence has improved. She can list all of the topics she has learned about, including the importance of cleanliness – personal, household, and community cleanliness. She also talks about playing volleyball (her favorite sport), badminton, gardening, planting, and learning about banks and the services they provide. Deepika also believes the village has benefited from the program. Women are more lenient about girls and boys playing together, men are more willing to support their daughters attending school, and boys treat girls better – allowing them to join in sports and teasing them less.

Section 6: Supportive Relations

Central to CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework are the strategic relationships that women and girls build. This component gives rise to the second pillar of PTLA's leadership model, "Gaining Legitimacy," which recognizes the importance of girls building relationships with others. Research demonstrates that strong family, peer, and community relationships contribute to the development of leadership skills.

The evaluation assessed supportive relations by identifying key supportive relationships and the presence of social networks for girls.

Supportive relationships

Girls in all six countries developed varied relationships with diverse groups of individuals through PTLA. These included teachers, coaches, mentors, peer leaders, family members, community leaders, and peers. Girls most frequently cited relationships with peers, family members, and community mentors as the most influential on their leadership development. Importantly, friendly relationships between girls and boys appeared to be present to a greater extent in active sites than comparison sites. For example, in Honduras girls and boys were observed interacting positively with one another in various activities. In India, both boys and girls commented on improved relationships with each other. This was also evident in Malawi and Tanzania. Egypt and Yemen have fewer examples of interactions between boys and girls, likely due to the cultural norms around male and female interactions in Muslim countries.

Encouragement from parents, teachers, peer leaders, and peers emerged as the most important factor that supported girls' leadership development, as these statements reveal:

My mother trusts me and she knows who I am and she encourages me to go to meetings and trainings. She says that I am going to become someone in life and I know that I am going to be a big enterprise manager. (Girl in Honduras)

One teacher encouraged me and convinced me to accept the position of speaker. I thought that I could not do it, but now I feel capable . . . One of [my friends] told me that if I managed to lead a scout group, I will also manage to lead a parliament. (Girl in Tanzania)

Using my personal relations with them [parents] and using their trust in me, I was able to convince them [to let their daughters participate], and this also built good relations between the students and myself. (Peer leader in Egypt)

Often, encouragement was also equated with parents supporting girls by placing priority on their education over household chores. In several instances, individuals discussed the importance of encouraging girls to participate in school or CARE activities. At times this occurred when parents, often mothers, encouraged daughters to attend meetings. At other times this occurred when community mentors encouraged parents to let their daughters participate in activities or attend school. Encouragement was also offered as a way to support girls' positive attitudes about themselves. For example, in Honduras and Malawi, community mentors tried to motivate girls to use their leadership skills, believe in themselves, and dream about a positive future.

Other forms of support included provision of resources and training, though these were cited less frequently. In most cases it was noted that CARE provided the resources, but in some instances communities offered materials. One strong example of the community's role in providing resources was in Yemen, where community members donated land to be used as a football field, helped establish a library and theater, and provided a microphone. In Honduras, community members supported projects by buying things the youth had made to raise funds. In this way, the youth were able to purchase materials for their group.

Social Networks

Many of the key relationships noted above, particularly peers and community mentors, resulted from girls' involvement in social networks. These took shape through various clubs in each of the countries upon which PTLA work was built. One significant example is the case of Egypt, where girls-only social networks were developed. Girls met and identified different topics to talk about in safe places, where they did not have to be afraid of boys watching. In several of these meetings, girls were observed expressing themselves freely for the first time in their lives. While there is potential for building on this model, the evaluator noted that communities lack mentors who can talk to girls in these settings. Providing mentors could strengthen the activity considerably.

Other social network clubs were mentioned in Honduras and Malawi. Mentors in Honduras said that they work hard to involve boys and girls together in various clubs. The dance mentor said that more boys had joined the club recently, bringing the total to eight boys and 12 girls. Honduran mentors described limited success in getting boys to be supportive of girls in various activities. In Malawi, girls talked about the girls' club, debate club, girls "speak-out" clubs, and Mothers Groups. All of these provide opportunities for girls to be supported in their leadership development by building relationships. Again, it was mentioned that more work needed to be done with boys and men to get them to support girls and women. Another effort in Egypt drew on modern

technology to create a Facebook network, where youth can be connected with others from neighboring or distant communities. This was the only description in the evaluation of an attempt to build social networks virtually, but is an area that could be built upon as information technology opportunities spread to villages around the world.

PTLA Success Story – Malawi



Sophie lives with her grandmother. A shy girl, Sophie has faced many hardships and responsibilities in her short life. The firstborn of four children, Sophie's father died when she was six. Her mother remarried, but Sophie's new stepfather did not treat her well. So Sophie went to live with her grandmother and cousins, two of whom are orphans. Overwhelmed with household chores such as preparing breakfast, dish washing, drawing water, and sweeping, Sophie began to miss school, dropping out for weeks or even a month at a time.

Since joining the CARE program last year, Sophie's life and future goals have changed dramatically. She began regularly attending school, and participates in activities every Wednesday. She has learned to speak up and defend herself from teasing by peers; she can recite or read poems in front of people; and she has received support from her Mothers Group in negotiating a fairer division of household responsibilities with her grandmother.

"My granny would ask me not to go to school but to stay at home and do household chores together with my young cousin. Seeing that I was missing out at school, I reported this to one of my mentors [in the Mothers Group]. These women talked to my grandmother. Since then, my grandmother is the first one to wake me in the morning. If I wake up late, she allows me to go directly to school without doing chores. At home I used to be rude to my grandmother, but now I am good."

Sophie is also happier at school. "Since boys were allowed to join the CARE program, the relationship between girls and boys is better. We work together, study together, and perform activities together. [Also] when I was elected leader in Standard 7, older girls would give me problems. They would tease me and make insults. I reported this to the headmaster, who dealt with the girls. I would like to be well educated like my aunt. My wish is to someday become a nurse, and earn money to help my grandmother, mother, and younger brothers and sisters."

Section 7: Enabling Environment

The third component of CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework focuses on structural change, or the creation of an enabling environment. This includes efforts to change procedures, laws, and practices in ways that better support girls' and women's empowerment, which in turn affect their leadership development. The third pillar of the PTLA leadership model relies on an enabling environment, "Taking Action." In order for girls to practice their leadership skills through civic engagement activities, safe public spaces need to be available to them. This includes community members' acceptance of girls' role in civic action. The PTLA evaluation assessed the formation of an enabling environment in two ways: attitudes toward gender equality and structural change (including organizational partnerships, structures and policies), and inclusion of marginalized youth.

Attitudes toward Gender Equality

CARE's theory of change highlights the importance of girls' rights being upheld in order for them to develop as leaders and to develop leadership skills. Without recognition of girls' rights from all members of a community, girls' leadership potential is stifled. Therefore, this evaluation assessed the levels of community attitudes and behaviors toward girls regarding their rights in society as measured through the GEI.

Gender Equity Index

The GEI comprises items measuring three constructs: equality of rights, gendered social norms, and gendered responsibility.² Tables 6 and 7 show results across five countries on girls' and boys' views on equality of rights. Most of the items that comprise this scale capture attitudes about equal rights between women/girls and men/boys (DeJaeghere & Krause, 2011). The mean score represents a score based on a dichotomous response of 0=disagree and 1=agree. Therefore, the score can be converted to a percentage to represent the mean percentage of items to which the respondent agreed. For example, a mean score of .75 (or 75%) can be interpreted as the mean percentage of items in the scale on which respondents agreed. There were 15 items in this scale.

Several observations are noted in the GEI results for girls.

- In all five countries there are statistically significant differences between girls in the active and comparison groups on equality of rights. Girls from the active

² Gendered responsibility is not included in this report due to its low reliability score.

group agreed with a higher percentage of items measuring perceptions of equality of rights.

- The difference between groups was the greatest in Malawi. Girls in the active group agreed with 78% of the items, in contrast to girls in the comparison group who agreed with only 10% of the items on the scale.
- Girls from active sites in Egypt, India, Tanzania, and Honduras agreed to more than 80% of the items on the scale measuring equality of rights. Honduras and India were the highest at 94%.

Table 6: Measures of Equality of Rights for Girls on the GEI

Country	Sample Size		Mean		Standard Deviation		Significant Difference (p-value)
	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	
Egypt	25	49	.73	.82	.13	.13	YES; p = .005***
India	49	74	.84	.94	.19	.12	YES; p < .001**
Tanzania	24	49	.72	.89	.17	.11	YES; p < .001***
Honduras	52	63	.86	.94	.13	.06	YES; p < .001***
Malawi	176	72	.1	.78	.15	.17	YES; p < .001***

*=small effect size; **=medium effect size; ***=large effect size (based on Cohen's d)

Several observations are noted in the following results for boys.

- In four out of five countries there are statistically significant differences between boys in the active and comparison groups on equality of rights. Boys from the active group agreed with a higher percentage of items measuring perceptions of equality of rights. Tanzania was the only country with no difference between groups of boys.
- The difference between groups was greatest in Malawi. Boys in the active group agreed with 77% of the items, in contrast to boys in the comparison group who only agreed with 9% of the items on the scale.
- Boys from active sites in Egypt, India, Tanzania, and Honduras agreed to more than 80% of the items on the scale measuring equality of rights. India was the highest at 97%.

Table 7: Measures of Equality of Rights for Boys on the GEI

Country	Sample Size		Mean % of Agreed Items		Standard Deviation		Significant Difference (p-value)
	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	
Egypt	25	51	.67	.80	.10	.12	YES; p < .001***
Tanzania	24	47	.76	.83	.19	.14	NO
Honduras	55	58	.87	.93	.13	.09	YES; p = .001***
India	120	26	.83	.97	.11	.05	YES; p < .001***
Malawi	187	73	.09	.77	.14	.16	YES; p < .001***

*=small effect size; **=medium effect size; ***=large effect size (based on Cohen's d)

Tables 8 and 9 show results across five countries on girls' and boys' views of gendered social norms. Items on this scale include social norms across different spheres of life: relationships, social behavior in private and public, and schooling. The responses do not necessarily reflect one's attitudes about issues, but rather an underlying belief about norms between men and women (DeJaeghere & Krause, 2011). The mean score represents a score based on a dichotomous response of 0=agree and 1=disagree. These items were reverse coded to reflect the desirable response. The score can be converted to a percentage and interpreted similarly to the equality of rights scale. There were 11 items in this scale.

Several observations are noted in the following results for girls:

- In four out of five countries, there are statistically significant differences between girls in the active groups and girls in the comparison groups on gendered social norms. Girls from the active group agreed with a higher percentage of items on this scale.
- The difference between groups was the greatest in India. Girls in the active group agreed to 46% of the items, in contrast to girls in the comparison group who only agreed to 12% of the items on the scale.
- Girls from active sites in Tanzania, Honduras, and Malawi agreed to more than 65% of the items on the scale measuring equality of rights. Honduras was the highest at 90%.

PTLA Success Story – Egypt



Senaa, age 14, sat in the front row of the focus group, wore glasses, and looked the facilitators straight in the eye. She was not shy to answer the many questions and always answered with a smile. Senaa has participated in the program for about one year. She said that before the program, she stayed at home to cook and do chores to help her mother. She rarely got out. She said that staying home is normal for girls in her village. One of her favorite things about being in the program was getting out of the house and feeling like she was part of a larger community.

Senaa said that she learned in this program that she has courage. Through ITSPLEY, she discovered that it is not too scary to speak in front of people. Now, she actually enjoys public speaking. She has spoken in competitions and regularly speaks up in the class. Senaa shared that, in the past, or before being part of a core extra-curricular activity group, she really had no opinions about anything. She followed what her parents told her and mostly believed anything she heard from an adult. Since her family is in the medical profession, she always thought that she would be a nurse, maybe a doctor; however after this program, she has more dreams. She wants to study at the Faculty of Media at the university, become a famous announcer, get on a plane, and see how people in other countries are really living. She also wants to make enough money one day to send her mother to the Haj. She said that for the first time in her life, she is really excited about what a person can do and be in society.

Senaa said that many people have been supportive of her. Her teachers, mentors, mother, and CARE staff have supported her participation in a documentary of the program. She remembered that at first her brothers objected to her participating, but when she and her mother took the taxi to make the documentary, even they were proud of her, and now she feels proud of herself. The documentary was called the “Barrier of Silence” and she was one of the people interviewed. Before the program, boys and girls were never allowed to be together, but during the activities they often worked together in groups. Now, she feels that the boys in her group are like brothers. But still, in the village she cannot talk to the boys, or express her opinion because she will get beaten.

Table 8: Measures of Gendered Social Norms for Girls on the GEI

Country	Sample Size		Mean		Standard Deviation		Significant Difference (p-value)
	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	
Egypt	25	49	.47	.43	.13	.19	NO
India	49	74	.12	.46	.23	.25	YES; p < .001***
Tanzania	24	49	.63	.73	.15	.02	YES; p = .013***
Honduras	52	63	.68	.90	.21	.08	YES; p < .001***
Malawi	176	72	.52	.65	.24	.22	YES; p < .001**

*=small effect size; **=medium effect size; ***=large effect size (based on Cohen's d)

Several observations are noted in the following results for boys on gendered social norms:

- In four out of five countries there are statistically significant positive differences between boys in the active groups and boys in the comparison groups on gendered social norms. Boys from the active groups in Egypt, Tanzania, Honduras, and Malawi responded favorably to a higher percentage of items on this scale than boys from the comparison groups.
- In India there was a statistically significant negative difference between boys in the active groups and boys in the comparison groups on gendered social norms. Boys from the comparison group responded favorably to a higher percentage of items on this scale than boys from the active groups. This could be due to boys in the active groups having a more nuanced understanding of the meanings conveyed by these items.
- Boys from active sites in Tanzania, Honduras, and Malawi agreed to more than 60% of the items on the scale measuring equality of rights. Honduras was the highest at 78%.

Table 9: Measures of Gendered Social Norms for Boys on the GEI

Country	Sample Size		Mean % of Agreed Items		Standard Deviation		Significant Difference (p-value)
	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	Comparison	Active	
Egypt	25	51	.36	.49	.20	.198	YES; p = .009**
Tanzania	24	47	.48	.67	.26	.24	YES; p = .003***
Honduras	55	58	.65	.78	.18	.24	YES; p < .003***
India	120	26	.37	.11	.19	.18	YES (neg.); p < .001***
Malawi	187	73	.51	.60	.28	.26	YES; p < .001*

*=small effect size; **=medium effect size; ***=large effect size (based on Cohen's d)

The scores indicate favorable attitudes and beliefs for a majority of girls and boys participating in PTLA. In general, girls and boys from PTLA sites had stronger perceptions of equality of rights and understanding of gendered social norms than girls and boys from comparison sites; and the difference between groups is notable. Assigning identification numbers and tracking respondents over time would make it possible actually to measure change in participants.

Boys' Attitudes and Behavior toward Girls

Data from focus groups reveal the discrepancies that exist between attitudes or beliefs and behavior. This would be expected, as behavior change takes more time and practice. A solid majority of boys in focus groups agreed that girls have the same right as boys to express opinions, and they have the right to be educated. However, girls' statements did not always align with boys' responses. One girl in Egypt said, "I can express my ideas, but there is still no opportunity to express them because no one is interested in them." This statement suggests that while she is developing leadership skills, without the space in which to express herself, these leadership skills cannot be practiced.

Some girls in Tanzania and Malawi commented on increased opportunities to interact with boys. Girls said that they felt free to talk with boys, whereas before they were not allowed even to sit next to them. In Yemen, attitudes appeared to be changing as well. After PTLA began, girls said that boys began treating them with more respect. One girl stated, "My brothers do not shout at me, they treat me gently, and do not beat

me.” A community leader in India also noted that boys and girls seemed more comfortable with each other.

Although boys express favorable attitudes related to girls’ rights, their actions do not always align with their words. In Malawi, girls observed that boys who participated in the *gule wamkulu* ritual became rude because they felt superior to girls in their male-only role. Girls in Malawi and Yemen also noted that some boys were jealous of girls’ participation in PTLA, despite efforts taken by the project to avert such jealousies. Some boys in Malawi threatened to beat girls for participating, but this changed once boys were allowed to join the activities. Girls in Honduras said boys did not support them in playing football. One girl said, “They say we’re not for playing football because we’re girls and we make so many mistakes because we are weak.” One community leader in Honduras noted, “In school, [boys and girls] work together. But out of school they are not very different. [Boys] play jokes and aren’t always respectful.” Some change is evident in boys’ behavior, but more needs to be done.

Women’s Attitudes and Behavior toward Girls

In all PTLA countries, women have very positive attitudes toward girls. In many cases this surfaced in regard to girls’ rights to an education. While women formerly believed that girls were best suited for housework and other chores, there is evidence that this attitude is changing. In Yemen, mothers now encourage their daughters’ education, whereas before they did not think their daughters should attend school with boys. Similarly in Egypt, mothers began encouraging daughters to participate in CARE activities once they saw the value of the program. In Malawi the Mothers Groups have been active in re-enrolling girls who have dropped out of school due to pregnancy or early marriage. Despite being in their early development, Malawi’s Mothers Groups are viewed as being effective in bringing about attitudinal change in the community by working with the chief, parents, and teachers.

Another emerging theme across countries was the recognition that the empowerment of girls is empowering for girls’ mothers as well. In Yemen, some mothers of girls in the PTLA program began attending literacy classes. In Honduras, a community leader explained that girls often share lessons with their mothers after CARE trainings; and another community leader observed that greater communication related to girls’ development has created greater trust. Women’s pride in their educated daughters was mentioned in Yemen, Honduras, and Malawi. One girl in Honduras said it well: “[Women] always support us in each project that we decide to do. It does not matter; whatever we do, women at the community are very proud of girls.”

Men's Attitudes and Behaviors toward Girls

Perceptions of men's attitudes toward girls were more variable and less consistent than perceptions of women's attitudes. Men's attitudes and beliefs reportedly became more positive, but there were comments about men's negative comments as well. A theme in Yemen and India was men's increased value of girls' education. Girls in Yemen commented that men used to prevent their daughters from attending school, but now they supported it. Several men stated that they wanted their daughters to become teachers or doctors. However, one man suggested that education for girls is only important for her to learn her religion and to know how to raise children. In India, community leaders thought that fathers valued education more than they used to and were likely to encourage their daughters to attend school. They commented that some fathers had even spoken up against injustices regarding their daughters' role in school.

Men's encouragement of girls' involvement in extra-curricular activities, such as sport and drama, was a theme in Honduras and Egypt. However, this attitude was not unanimous; a girl in Honduras said that men still say, "football is for men, not women!" Similarly, even though men's attitudes were changing regarding girls' education in Yemen, some men had a negative perception of education due to the introduction of sports for girls. One father had even withdrawn his daughter from school so that she would not participate in sports.

The development of trust appeared to be a theme in most of the countries. This was often demonstrated through more open lines of communication between fathers and daughters, such as in Tanzania, where girls noted that fathers and daughters were having more conversations, or in Malawi, where some girls now feel comfortable asking fathers for pocket money. This was also evident in Yemen, where girls were given more freedom to go to and from school on their own. In Egypt, girls claimed that men have started to consider their opinions as valuable.

Overall, it appears that community attitudes toward girls have changed. Even though attitudes already may have been changing prior to PTLA, programming in these communities has supported a shift in thinking and action. There is still room for growth, but it is clear from both quantitative and qualitative data that program participants, support staff, and community leaders think that progress has been made. Cause and effect is difficult to determine in social environments, but positive changes have definitely been noted in individuals and communities.

PTLA Success Story – Tanzania



Sekelaga is a middle child in a family of four children. Her mother is a shopkeeper, and her father works in the gold mines. Fourteen-year-old Sekelaga used to go to school just to please her parents and teachers. She lacked confidence, and did not have any clear goals or expectations about her future.

After joining the CARE program, Sekelaga practiced developing leadership skills and became more self confident. She acted as a leader at school, and led a scouts group. Her confidence in her ability to express herself and make decisions increased, and she went on to become the speaker of the “Girls’ Parliament” in her ward after a teacher encouraged her to take the position.

“I thought that I could not do it, but now I feel capable. Most of my friends are always encouraging me in my leadership activities. One of them told me that if I managed to lead a scout’s group, I will also manage to lead the parliament. Now I can speak loudly and confidently. I can talk with the government leaders who visit us,” said Sekelaga.

“The attitude of the community towards girls is changing. We are now valued and respected more. Before, we couldn’t sit next to boys even when we were in class. But now, we interact freely. Some boys have even encouraged me to work harder and they say that I can do it! The tendency of adult men to convince young girls to have sexual relations is also decreasing.”

“I also remember that one day a woman came to our shop and told my father that I led the parliament very well. My father congratulated me and told me to work harder. When we were celebrating the ‘SIKU YA MTOTO WA AFRIKA’ (African Child Day), one lady congratulated me and told me she had never seen a child who could express herself so well. I felt so good! I now have high expectations. My plan is to study hard so that in the future I can become a real parliament speaker of Tanzania!”

Structural Change

Organizational Partnerships

Every CARE country office implementing PTLA organized its work and activities through partner organizations, but each approached it in a different way. To some extent, partnership opportunities were constrained by the presence of groups within the project communities. For example, in Yemen no formal local institutions were in place as partners, because no local NGOs existed in the communities where the project was implemented. Instead, CARE relied on a web of community support by developing networks with Mothers Councils and Fathers Councils, student and class councils, and community libraries, along with the establishment of local NGOs in three communities to implement PTLA. Similarly, in Tanzania, CARE worked directly with schools and informal community groups rather than with other NGOs. In other countries, such as Honduras, there were many NGOs, which fostered a rich environment of partnership opportunities. In Honduras, the partner organizations were highly involved in supporting PTLA efforts. Egypt, India, and Malawi all had two primary partner NGOs with whom they worked, with Malawi also relying heavily on community groups (i.e., Mothers Groups). Table 10 shows a list of partnering organizations within each country.

Table 10: List of PTLA Partnering Organizations by Country

Egypt	Honduras	India	Malawi	Tanzania	Yemen
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jesuit and Freres Organization (Minia) • Youth Association for Development and Environment (Beni Suef) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ferema • FAO and Caritas • UNICEF (Football for Life) • CARE Cuenta • CARE Formadas • Peace Corps • CARE HOGASA • Local government 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SWARG • Sarvodaya Ashram 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School Management Committees • Parent-Teacher Associations • Mothers Groups • Primary education advisor • Creative Community Center for Mobilization • Forum for African Women Educationalists in Malawi 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School Management Committees • Parent-Teacher Associations • Informal community groups • Ward education coordinator 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mothers Councils and Fathers Councils • Student and class councils • Community libraries • Three local NGOs established

Partner organizations provided a variety of different supports. Recruitment, training, material provisions, and oversight were the most frequently cited forms of involvement. Local partners, such as SMCs in Malawi and local government employees in Honduras, commented on the great need for additional training and materials in order to be more effective. Desire to be involved in the project appeared strong, but limited

knowledge and resources prevented some from being involved to their full capacity. Limited funding was another recurring theme that prevented NGOs from continuing their partnership and involvement.

Each PTLA country created and strengthened relationships with partner organizations in order to foster opportunities for girls' leadership development in the communities. Communities with the greatest network of partners appeared to have a strong chance for sustainability. Support and involvement from community members or groups also contributed to the likelihood of a program's continuance. In Egypt, the CDAs and local partners were instrumental in creating a cadre of dedicated mentors and volunteers who helped build an effective program. However, in some cases, one key person seemed to be responsible for most of the project's operation. In one community in Tanzania, the project was highly dependent on one person, and it would have failed had she left the community. This highlights the value of CARE country offices building partnerships with other organizations, and with community groups in particular, to increase the likelihood of ongoing development.

Changes in Structures and Social Norms

Changes in policies and structures were largely related to community social norms. Individuals in each country described the changing perception of girls' roles. Some examples include the following:

- In Egypt, more places are open for girls to play sports.
- In Honduras, more women appear to be participating in organizations that were once dominated by men.
- In India, one community leader noted that girls are able to move around villages more easily now. In the past girls would have been stopped and questioned.
- In Malawi, greater attention is being paid to girls' right to an education, with Mothers Groups working to ensure that girls are enrolled in schools.
- In Tanzania, the village chairperson advocated for equal division of chores between girls and boys in the home.
- In Yemen, more priority is being given to girls completing their homework than to doing household chores.

Each of these examples demonstrates a shift toward greater acceptance of girls' rights. This shift in attitude is an important complement to other policy or structural

changes in the communities. One community leader reported that in 2000 Honduras established national laws to protect women and children. This included girls' rights to an education, food, and protection from physical and sexual abuse. These were largely the result of the passage of the 1989 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. While these laws have been in place for more than a decade, changes are now beginning to transpire, with more girls and women participating in activities outside the home.

Mothers Groups or Mothers Councils and Fathers Councils are another important policy structure to support girls. The establishment of these groups is mandated by law in Malawi and Yemen. However, in both cases they need further development to function at the highest level. Individuals in Malawi cited the need for more oversight, training, and materials to develop the Mothers Groups. In Yemen, while Mothers Councils in PTLA communities did not exist until the start of the program, they now use advocacy efforts to work toward returning school dropouts back to the classroom.

PTLA Success Story – Honduras



“My name is Linda Alvarez-Estrada, and I’m an architect and community organizer. I’m also the Secretary of Potable Water with the local municipality. My role is an educational one. I teach youth about leadership roles, what leadership is, and how they can become leaders.

The local community is very supportive of the CARE project. Local authorities support the Youth Team and the soccer team. Many community volunteers work with the soccer team, and the team has built a good reputation in the surrounding area. There are health campaigns and community clean-up days, Health Brigades which bring doctors to the community, and Happy Afternoon activities in which dance competitions are held. Girls are regularly involved in all of these activities, including soccer.

There has been a big change in attitudes toward girls in the community. Not too long ago, this community was closed. Girls stayed at home with their mothers. Now, mothers and girls attend activities together. Many mothers let girls play soccer, and they come to watch. Mothers also go with girls to the theater, and they provide support and help with activities. Boys’ and men’s attitudes have changed too. Boys are conscious that girls have some rights. Men know the laws have changed and they are more afraid and more respectful of women.”

Section 8: Program Results

PTLA Results Framework

Life of Program Results – Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA)

Results	Method	Reporting Frequency
Objective One: Cultivate opportunities for girls to practice their leadership skills		
70% of girls have enhanced skills and competencies	Girls' Leadership Index	Baseline and Final
50% of girls have improved self-concept and self-confidence	Girls' Leadership Index	Baseline and Final
70% of groups of girls report undertaking leadership actions in their homes, schools, or communities	Girls' Leadership Index	Baseline and Final
Communities ensure safe social and physical environment for girls' leadership activities	Structural Environment for Girls	Baseline and Final
Communities demonstrate support for girls' education and leadership development	Structural Environment for Girls	Baseline and Final
Objective Two: Create partnerships to promote girls' leadership		
At least five global partnerships ³ established to promote girls' leadership	Quarterly Report Updates	Quarterly
At least two partnerships established at country office level to promote girls' leadership	Quarterly Report Updates	Quarterly
Objective Three: Improve knowledge to implement and promote girls' leadership programs		
A synthesis report on cross-cultural barriers to girls' leadership is produced following baseline study	Quarterly Report Updates	Quarterly
Based on the experience of the six countries, a synthesis report on approaches to girls' leadership published and disseminated	Quarterly Report Updates	Quarterly
A global synthesis workshop for best practices is held	Quarterly Report Updates	Quarterly

The overall goal of PTLA was to promote girl leaders in vulnerable communities. Three strategic objectives were associated with achieving this goal:

1. Cultivate opportunities for girls to practice their leadership skills

³ These could be between INGOs, corporate houses, foundations, research institutions, or media.

2. Create partnerships to promote girls' leadership
3. Enhance knowledge to implement and promote girls' leadership programs

Objective 1: Individual items from the GLI were used to assess attainment of three indicators under Objective 1. The first and second indicators require “*enhanced* skills and competencies” and “*improved* self-concept and self-confidence.” Since baseline data collection in most countries was not structured to track respondents (i.e., identification numbers were not assigned to active participants), this evaluation could not assess individual change among girls and boys. Rather, these illustrative indicators are assessed based on the percentage of girls who report having a particular skill or competency. The third indicator requires a raw percentage of girls reporting leadership actions, which was directly assessed through the GLI. Table 11 depicts the current percentage of girls reporting positive measures of the related skills.

Table 11: Percentage of Girls Responding Favorably (i.e., often or always) to the Leadership Item

Country	Indicator 1: Skills and competencies (Target is 70%)			Indicator 2: Self-concept and self-confidence (Target is 50%)		Indicator 3: Leadership action in homes, schools, or communities (Target is 70%)
	Voice	Decision making	Organization	Confidence 1	Confidence 2	Vision/ motivating others
Egypt	75%	84%	81%	72%	89%	75%
Honduras	60.2%	84.1%	81.4%	74.3%	25.7%	31%
India	95.8%	94.4%	93%	94.4%	88.7%	87.3%
Malawi	72.7%	72.9%	66.7%	50%	25.6%	71.3%
Tanzania	67.9%	63.1%	81%	48.8%	45.2%	83.3%

Items

- Voice: I do not hesitate to let others know my opinions.
- Decision making: I recognize that I have control over my own actions.
- Organization: I can help organize others to help accomplish a task.
- Confidence 1: I am aware of my strengths and weaknesses, and feel comfortable within my abilities and limitations.
- Confidence 2: If someone treats me unfairly, I take action against it.
- Vision: I realize that things I say and do sometimes encourage others to work together.

Based on the results from Table 11, all countries perform very well against a 70% target of possessing skills and competencies. Though not measured as improvement, all countries meet or are close to meeting the 50% target on the first items about self-confidence. Only Egypt and India meet the 50% target for external confidence. For the third indicator, all countries except for Honduras met the 70% target of taking leadership action.

Individual GLI items were selected as measures based on their relative alignment with the indicator. For example, items measuring voice, decision making, and organization were used to assess girls' leadership skills and competencies. Two items measuring confidence were used to assess self-concept and self-confidence. The second item revealed lower percentages; in part, because it required a demonstration of action rather than reporting on self-perception. Leadership action in homes, schools, or communities was more difficult to determine, but ultimately it was decided that the measure of motivating others (i.e., encouraging others to work together) best suited this indicator. These data should be interpreted with caution, but they provide an overall sense for girls' attainment on these three indicators.

Yemen offers a unique situation in that the girls who participated in the program were assigned identification numbers for the baseline study, and 104 of them were able to be tracked and administered the 73-question GLI instrument again at the end of the project. Thus, the data from Yemen answer the indicator questions better than in the other countries, and the percentage of positive change can be reported. While change technically cannot be attributed to PTLA alone (since no control group was used in the data collection), the lead evaluator noted that it is difficult to identify any other reason for change besides PTLA for these positive changes. Ministry of Education policy was not noticeably different, no other projects were active in the communities, the economic situation was unchanged, and, when asked, community members could not attribute the change to any other factor. The only possible other factor was the hiring of female teachers – an intervention that was implemented to increase girls' enrollment rather than to improve girls' leadership. Table 12 reports on the percentage of positive change Yemeni girls reported from the baseline to the final evaluation.

Table 12: Percentage of Girls Demonstrating Positive Change from Baseline to Present in Yemen

	Skills and competencies (Target is 70%)			Self-concept and self-confidence (Target is 50%)		Leadership action in homes, schools, or communities (Target is 70%)
	Voice	Decision making	Organi- zation	Confidence 1	Confidence 2	Group dynamics
Yemen	53.3%	67%	56.1%	58.7%	53.3%	54.7%

Items

Voice:	When I have an idea or opinion I am able to express it at school.
Decision making:	I make decisions that I believe I can implement.
Organization:	I am good at organizing time to do my chores for the family.
Confidence 1:	I feel confident that when I don't understand something at school I am not shy about asking questions.
Confidence 2:	I feel confident that when someone treats me unfairly that I will say something or take action.
Group dynamics:	When we are in a group, my friends prefer me to take a leadership role.

Based on the results from Table 12, Yemen met the target for 50% of girls having improved self-confidence. The 70% target for leadership skills and competencies and for leadership action in homes, schools, or communities was not met; but it is notable that over 50% improved in these areas as well. Given the nature of the environment, greater than 50% improvement in any of these areas should be considered a resounding success, especially given the short period of time in which this change occurred.

Individual GLI items from Yemen were selected for this analysis based on their relative alignment with the indicator, but also on the basis of their relative alignment with the items selected from the analysis done in the other countries. Similar to the countries in Table 11, items measuring voice, decision making, and organization were used to assess skill development in girls. Distinctive from the other countries, however, is that both of Yemen's GLI items assessing confidence require action. Also, the item that best fits the category of leadership action for Yemen was a measure of group dynamics.

The fourth and fifth illustrative indicators under Objective 1 require that "communities ensure a safe social and physical environment for girls' leadership activities" and that "communities demonstrate support for girls' education and leadership." Results discussed in Section 6 above indicate that this was achieved through the development of significant supportive relationships and from strong leadership support from multiple members of communities who promoted girls' leadership development.

Objective 2: This evaluation addressed the second indicator under Objective 2, which requires "at least two partnerships established at country office level to promote girls' leadership." Table 10 (Section 7) shows that this target has been met. Every country reported partnerships with at least two organizations or groups. In the case of

Yemen and Tanzania, these partnerships were based at the community level; however, in all cases CARE partnered with another group to implement program activities.

Objective 3: Objective 3 requires a broad look at knowledge development related to girls' leadership programming. The intent of this evaluation is to contribute to the overall knowledge in this area, and to provide supplemental material to the synthesis reports mentioned as key indicators. Within local community contexts, this objective was also achieved to an extent. For example, training and awareness-building activities within communities built understanding among program staff about ways in which leadership development efforts should be executed.

Country-level Results and Outcomes

In addition to the results noted from the three PTLA strategic objectives, each country also reported on results that went beyond the original objectives of the evaluation and enhanced the effectiveness of the project. This section of the report highlights some of the results and outcomes observed within individual countries.

In Egypt, girls' participation in the civic arena appeared to improve; some girls even competed for student union president and vice president. Relationships between boys and girls also appear to have been strengthened, as was documented in a special study. Teachers' and mentors' skills and knowledge were said to have improved through program implementation, and CDAs developed stronger links with schools through the support of sports activities.

In Honduras, three specific country-level results were noted. First, a group of youth who previously had drawn insulting figures and symbols on the walls began to participate in painting groups, which enabled them to use their creativity for positive activities by drawing mural paintings to promote nature conservation. Children also began to sell their paintings, embroidery, and bakery products in order to support other children and help them to learn those skills. This demonstrated important decision-making skills and initiative in improving their living conditions and social environment. Ten- to 14-year-old girls also participated in forums with leaders at the municipal level, where they shared their desire to improve education, health, and family financial situations.

In India, boys' increased engagement with girls was an unexpected result. While still in the beginning stages, staff observed that interactions between boys and girls began to occur more frequently after one year into the program. The boys became interested in learning stitching, rolling chapattis, and helping with household chores, which are traditionally female activities and responsibilities. Some boys participated in

stitching competitions and discussed their intent to disrupt the social norms associated with these activities. It is important to note that most of these boys were young, making it easier for them to interact with girls and not be ridiculed. This same behavior was not noted with the older boys, suggesting that if boys learn at a young age to cross the gender barriers, this could set a precedent for more enduring change in their attitudes toward girls.

In Malawi, the use of Mothers Groups was a key intervention. Strong potential exists in the development of these groups. While many are not currently functioning at high levels, they offer a structure on which future work can be built. Another result is that a framework for development is emerging. There is still much room for growth, but steps have been taken to foster a supportive environment for girls' leadership work.

In Tanzania, two areas were noted as country-specific results. First, girls began applying leadership skills in their families in order to influence decisions. This was demonstrated as they encouraged younger siblings to attend school and talked to parents about joining the village savings and loan program in order to get money for school fees. Second, girls appeared to be influencing others in village forums and in ward development committees. They negotiated for representation on these committees, and they have used that opportunity to request schools to provide official time for students to participate in sports activities.

In Yemen, more than 12,000 beneficiaries were reached during the cycle of the project. Perhaps the most unexpected finding was the general acceptance by boys of their sisters attending school. They mentioned doing homework together and helping each other. While still far to go, community attitudes appeared to be changing, with more girls participating in extracurricular activities than ever before.

Cross-cutting Themes

Three cross-cutting themes were assessed during the PTLA evaluation. While these are addressed throughout this report, a brief summary is provided regarding each of the three areas: serving marginalized youth, role of boys and men, and community mentors.

Serving Marginalized Youth

PTLA targeted marginalized youth through their selection of communities in which to implement the project. Selected communities were among the poorest, most underserved, and most isolated in each country. The project sought to include all members of the communities in order to build awareness of girls' rights. A strong focus

in working with marginalized youth was helping them return to school to complete their education. In Tanzania, staff in one community worked to identify marginalized women to serve as mentors to program participants. Other staff commented that they had lobbied the government to contribute to the development of a hostel at the secondary school to assist marginalized youth with boarding issues. In many countries, such as Tanzania, Yemen, India, and Malawi, advocacy efforts on the part of youth and parent groups increased the participation of marginalized girls in PTLA activities, as well as attendance at school.

The inclusion of marginalized youth in program activities was strongly noted in the PTLA program in India. In order to reach out to Muslim girls, CARE associated with the schools and madrasas close to Muslim communities. Impressive progress was observed in the ways in which girls from different castes began to interact with one another. The cultural context does not support upper caste groups eating or playing with girls from Dalit and other scheduled caste groups; however, over time it was noted that these groups of girls began interacting more, and at times they even visited each other's homes.

Role of Boys and Men

Boys were involved in PTLA activities to some extent in every country. As discussed in Section 8 ("Enabling Environment"), boys clearly recognized that girls have rights within their communities. However, it was unclear whether these thoughts were expressed because they were the "right" answer, or whether boys truly believed them. While some girls' comments indicate changes in their relationships with boys, other girls' comments illustrate boys' persisting views of girls' inferiority. Overall, the structured, measured inclusion of boys in PTLA activities was critical to bringing about attitudinal and behavioral changes. Comments were made by program staff across multiple sites that boys should have been included in program activities earlier.

Men were involved in PTLA activities in their roles as community leaders, supportive local government officials, and teachers. And while fathers' perceptions about their daughters' involvement in activities appeared to be changing, they did not appear to participate in activities to the same extent that mothers did across countries. If greater awareness-raising is directed at fathers in these communities, this could strengthen the work even further, since their attitudes have a great impact on girls' abilities to be involved in leadership development programs.

Community Mentors

Community mentors were identified as an integral component of PTLA in every country. As discussed above in Section 7 (“Supportive Relations”), community mentors played a critical role in the development of girls’ and boys’ leadership knowledge and skills. They were frequently mentioned in focus groups as the people most supportive of girls’ and boys’ leadership development. However, it is uncertain whether these relationships will continue following termination of PTLA. This is an important area to consider, since long-lasting relationships can hold the greatest impact for girls.

Section 9: Data Quality and Program Efficiency

Data Quality

Country offices were responsible for collecting data to support monitoring of the results framework. For the final evaluation, these data were assessed in five categories: reliability, validity, timeliness, accuracy, and integrity. In terms of reliability, there appeared to be consistent data collection over the course of the project. Program staff in Malawi and Egypt conducted spot checks at field sites in order to check for consistency in data. Staff in India and Tanzania also triangulated their data to ensure its reliability and to look for discrepancies. In Yemen, the evaluation team noted some aberrations in terms of incomplete attendance lists and some incorrect names, but they suggested that the data may have been saved elsewhere since the project has already closed. In any case, the data were not produced for the evaluation team.

Attendance and enrollment data were deemed to be valid measures in all countries, since the data correspond with an actual observation. In this case, reliability of the data is a bigger concern than validity. However, some concern exists with the validity of the GLI and GEI, since there is the possibility of students answering the items in socially desirable ways. In addition, it is also possible that as students mature in their understanding of leadership, they become more objective in their ratings, causing their scores to go down over time.

For all PTLA countries, data appeared to be collected and reported in a timely manner. Malawi and Tanzania provided specific information about which data were collected and when. Related to accuracy, staff in India, Malawi, and Tanzania reported processes that involved several cross-checks on data using more than one individual to verify the data. Evaluation staff in Yemen noted some inconsistencies in the quantitative data, but they reported that there was good correspondence with activities and the findings from the field. In all countries, program staff who replied to this question believed that data reported have high integrity and can be trusted.

Program Efficiency

Any project of PTLA's magnitude requires substantial resource allocation for initial implementation. All PTLA communities seemed to experience immense need for greater resources and materials, given that they are among the most marginalized and among the poorest villages in each country. Overall perceptions of the PTLA programs suggest that the same results could not have been achieved with fewer resources. Indeed, country offices appeared to maximize their given resources to the greatest extent possible. Implementation of any project requires large resource investments at the beginning, and greater efficiency often occurs over time.

Staff in Malawi, Tanzania, and Egypt mentioned the need for more infrastructure to support the PTLA program goals. It was suggested that communities could provide labor if the funding was given for the materials. Yemen offers a powerful counter-example to the infrastructure dilemma. Dubai Cares' "Improving Access to Quality Primary Education" (IAQPE) project was a partner to PTLA, and it met infrastructure needs by building schools in the communities. The evaluation team deemed that the program results would not have been as profound without the support of IAQPE. Communities often came together to support the goals of the project by volunteering land, labor, or time. In general, it appears that efficiency was as high as it could be in each of these communities. Additional resources and more time are needed in order to improve upon efficiency and build sustainability.

Perhaps the most obvious deterrent to efficiency was the three-year funding limit to the project. Evaluators reported that just as promising results had begun to appear, the program was required to close down. It is a testimony to the success of the project that the changes described herein were sustained and were able to be documented after the program had closed.

Section 10: Recommendations and Conclusions

Promising Practices

Several promising practices arose as common threads across PTLA sites in various countries. These are deemed to be important components of girls' leadership programming because of their observed impact on girls and on the rest of the community. The best practices outlined in each country generally support one of the three categories in CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework: agency, relational change, and structural change.

1. *Agency*: Individual change occurs as girls gain leadership knowledge and skills. Each country highlighted unique program activities that appeared to promote the development of girls' sense of agency. Clearly, no activity can have the same impact universally, but the program choice should differ depending on each country's context. Sports activities, theater and art groups, debate clubs, scouting, and civic action opportunities were among the most popular types of activities found across countries. However, as identified by the evaluation teams in Yemen and Egypt, girls and boys responded best when they were given voice in the types of activities in which they could be involved. While this practice increases the complexity of program planning, it appears to have the widest and deepest impact on girls' leadership development.
2. *Relational change*: The development of supportive relationships is critical to girls' leadership development. Staff in many countries noted the importance of parent participation, as well as the use of community mentors. Peer and community mentor relationships were among the most developed through the program and were referenced most often by girls. One promising practice in several countries was the use of existing community groups to promote and support PTLA goals. For example, involvement from Mothers Groups in Malawi and Mothers Councils and Fathers Councils in Yemen advanced the work around girls' leadership development. Additionally, in Tanzania the project was implemented primarily through informal school and community groups rather than through local CBOs or NGOs. While this took more effort at the beginning stages, it increased capacity building of teachers and community members and created a more sustainable environment.
3. *Structural change*: The establishment of an enabling environment is critical to the success of a girls' leadership program. While new policies or laws supporting girls' rights tend to develop slowly, favorable community attitudes are the first step in creating an environment conducive to these changes. Communities with more positive attitudes toward girls tended to prioritize program activities, which naturally opened up opportunities in which girls were able to practice their leadership skills and build confidence. One promising practice was the intentional preparation of communities through discussions, awareness-raising activities, and trainings on human rights. Change in this area focused on family and village units.

The use of CARE's conceptual framework on Gender and Empowerment as a guiding structure for programmatic development in education and leadership for girls and youth cannot be underestimated. It should in itself be viewed as a very promising practice, including the critical nature of the interrelationship of all three elements – agency, supportive relations, and structures in an enabling environment.

In addition, it appears that the focus on five (or, in Yemen, seven) categories of leadership also has promise. This is vividly illustrated through the case of Yemen. The authors of Yemen's baseline study challenged these four assumptions or "environmental pre-conditions" of the PTLA: (1) Extracurricular activities, social networks, and civic action are present in the community in order to form the basis on which CARE may build girls' leadership; (2) Girls' leadership, as a concept, is a non-threatening concept that is understood and supported by the community; (3) Promoting girls' leadership does not put girls themselves at risk; and (4) CARE has the ability and resources to provide promised safe spaces for girls to "practice leadership skills". The serious misgivings of those who conducted the baseline study are understandable: they had observed family members beat several girls in front of them and the girls' peers as punishment for being away from home and from their chores for too long a time. Through PTLA, CARE Yemen addressed each of these concerns—creating safe spaces for girls to practice leadership skills; creating activities and opportunities to develop social networks where they had not existed; including all family members in the activities; and presenting girls' "leadership competencies" in non-threatening ways so that not only were girls no longer put at risk, but over 50% of the 104 girls also were able to claim that they had developed leadership knowledge and skills, had increased in self-confidence, and had opportunities to take leadership actions. This is truly remarkable, and deserves to be given every consideration for being developed on a much larger scale.

Challenges

Several challenges confronted staff in each of the countries. Many were universal across sites, and some were context specific. In general, one common issue was the lack of infrastructure in place in the communities. This included limited availability of buildings or other spaces where groups could convene. Another issue, particularly for the Muslim countries, was the conservative gender norms within family and village cultures, which led to some community members' resistance to girls' involvement in extracurricular activities, particularly when the activities promoted girls' leadership development. Also, the fuel crisis in Malawi made site visits difficult and decreased the efficient use of resources. A final challenge noted across many countries was the lack of specialized teachers available for the program. Due to high mobility of teachers in some countries, it was difficult to maintain consistency. Much time was devoted to recruitment and training because of constant staff turnover.

Monitoring and evaluation of girls' leadership development in order to be able to document change over time is also a challenge that requires and deserves additional attention. In terms of data collection and analysis, instruments for measuring girls'

leadership in international contexts require much more attention and careful development. In particular, the validity of the GLI and GEI have not yet been determined. Further research should be conducted on these tools to understand if the items measure the intended constructs. Some triangulation was conducted in this evaluation through focus group and interview data, but no definitive conclusions can be made. This merits careful attention and further resources to be devoted to the careful development of quantitative as well as qualitative instruments.

Key Recommendations

Each community's experience in PTLA led to many valuable lessons which can benefit future programming. Each lesson learned aligns with an area of recommendation. These emerged around three different categories: scale-up and replication; sustainability; and social messaging. Each is addressed below to provide a fuller picture of suggested next steps.

(1) Scale-up and replication

Infrastructure development is a critical aspect of successful girls' leadership programming. Availability of facilities, resources, and materials contributes to the ability of staff to execute activities and achieve positive results. Even though these require substantial financial resources, the program can operate most efficiently when infrastructure has been developed from the beginning. It is suggested that PTLA should either be implemented in communities where there is an existing infrastructure or in places where CARE can contribute to infrastructure development, such as, with the IAQPE Dubai Cares program in Yemen.

In many sites program coordination was challenged by limited cohesion among the various people involved. This occurred as a result of high staff turnover, low funding, and the ambiguity of a new program. In the case of scale-up or replication, the creation of user-friendly guides for use across communities is essential for building consistency. A small team of personnel familiar with PTLA should be commissioned to compile these manuals. The challenge in such a large, multi-country initiative is to develop a framework that is broad enough to encompass multiple contexts, but specific enough to provide guidance on program operation. It may also be beneficial to have country-specific teams contribute to the contextualization of the framework and guides. This proved valuable in Yemen, where teams adapted interventions and assessment instruments based on the cultural environment of the communities in which implementation occurred.

There appears to be great desire for expansion of participation opportunities beyond the currently defined population. Many youth and support personnel expressed interest in the program expanding to include 15- to 18-year-olds. In addition, suggestions were made to create linkages with non-formal education programs to encourage participation of the most marginalized youth. It is recommended that these areas be considered in potential scale-up plans in order to widen the scope of impact.

(2) Sustainability

Program sustainability relies on solid partnerships with various community entities. Since each community differs in structure, every site demonstrates a slightly different model for building partnership opportunities. It is recommended that existing community structures be considered when selecting implementation sites. The range of considerations should include the Ministry of Education, CDAs, local and international NGOs, schools and universities, government agencies, and local community groups. In particular, community leaders are an important consideration. For example, in Malawi, where there are strong traditional beliefs and customs, it is necessary to involve the village chiefs in program decisions in order to effect change to the greatest extent.

Consistent and thorough training processes promote long-term sustainability through capacity-building. While these efforts require many resources in the initiation phase, they are critical to the success of a program. It is recommended that training manuals and protocols be developed for existing and new staff, as in partner schools where the teachers whose work is pivotal to the program are often deployed to other schools, districts, or regions of a country. Given high rates of turnover, program efficiency will be improved with a clear training system in place. In addition, potential for sustainability is increased when all partner staff have the knowledge and skills to implement the program effectively. Considerable attention should be focused on this area for greatest impact.

(3) Social messaging

Community attitudes are embedded in the socio-cultural and political milieus of society. Changing these perceptions requires extensive work that cannot be completed over the course of a few short years. Behavior change may take even longer. In particular, changes in the attitudes of boys and men are critical to effecting institutional change. While some boys claimed to have favorable attitudes towards girls' rights, as indicated through focus groups and the GEI, girls continued to give examples of mistreatment. Progress has been made, but more effort should be targeted at social messaging for men and boys. In particular, it may be beneficial for PTLA to target young boys who are more likely to be open to progressive thinking and who will influence the future of their communities.

Parental hesitation over allowing girls to participate in programs was identified earlier as a key barrier. Many parents did not think it was culturally appropriate for girls to be involved, nor they did not think it was safe for girls to participate. In each country it became important to develop trust with parents and to enlist their support in program activities. In some cases, mothers began attending with their children. It is recommended that attention continue to be given to strategies for convincing parents about the program's value for their girls. Mass media is a potential option for spreading this message, and it could also act as a leadership opportunity for girls to build awareness and interest.

Conclusion

The three components of CARE's Gender Empowerment Framework are a powerful model for girls' empowerment. Related to agency or individual change, girls' acquisition of leadership knowledge and skills appears to have been the area of strongest impact across PTLA countries. Girls expressed solid growth in the five identified leadership competencies, particularly in contrast with girls in comparison groups. With regard to the relational change component, supportive relationships were also developed and nurtured through PTLA programming. It appeared that the strongest relationships were formed with peers and community mentors through program activities. Since it is unclear whether or not those relationships will continue beyond the program, there is a need to foster additional relationships to sustain the impact beyond involvement in one particular project. Related to the structural change component, the enabling environment was the least developed area in the program. Community attitudes are changing, but slowly; therefore, this is an important area in which to focus ongoing efforts. If girls do not have the space in which to practice their leadership skills, their empowerment is hindered.

Overall, the evaluation team in each of the six countries found strong potential for PTLA to impact girls' leadership development and influence shifts in community attitudes. However, just as change was starting to occur in each community, program funding came to an end. Desire to continue this work is high among support personnel, youth, families, and community leaders. In order to effect genuine, long-lasting change, the findings identified in this report should be drawn upon to build the next phase of the program.

Resources

CARE Annual Reports, Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA), Cooperative Agreement No. EDH-A-00-08-000014-00, CARE USA: Atlanta, October 2008 – September 2009 & October 2010 – September 2011.

CARE Annual Country Reports, Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA): India, Yemen, Honduras, Malawi; Egypt & Tanzania, CA No. EDH-A-00-08-000014-00, CARE USA: Atlanta, October 2008 – September 2009 & October 2010 – September 2011.

CARE Quarterly Reports, Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA), CA No. EDH-A-00-08-000014-00, CARE USA: Atlanta, October 2008 to March 2011.

CARE USA. 2006a. Summary report. Paper presented at the PCTFI Cohort One Workshop, December 4–5, in Cairo, Egypt.

CARE USA. 2006b. *The courage to change: Confronting the limits and unleashing the potential of CARE's programming for women. Synthesis report: Phase 2.* Atlanta, GA, USA: CARE International Strategic Impact Inquiry on Women's Empowerment.

Case Studies, Creative Center for Community Mobilization (CRECCOM), Malawi: Kasungu & Lilongwe, November 2011.

Common Items Administrator's Guide: Child Items, Prepared by Minnesota Education Consortium for CARE Basic and Girls' Education Unit and Country Offices, Minnesota, September 2010.

Common Items Administrator's Guide: Teacher Items, Prepared by Minnesota Education Consortium for CARE Basic and Girls' Education Unit and Country Offices, Minnesota, September 2010.

Common Items Training of Trainers Guide: Children's Items, Developed by Minnesota International Development Education Consortium for CARE Basic and Girls Education Unit and Country Offices, Minnesota, September 2010.

Common Items Training of Trainers Guide: Teachers Items, Developed by Minnesota International Development Education Consortium for CARE Basic and Girls Education Unit and Country Offices, Minnesota, September 2010.

- Engendering Empowerment: Education and Equality, e-Conference, Baric, S., & Tembo, N. United Nations Girls' Education Initiative: New York, May 2010.
- Kabeer, N. 1999a. Resources, agency, achievements: Reflections on the measurement of women's empowerment. In *Gender, poverty and well-being*, ed. S. Razavi, 27–55. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Kabeer, N. 1999b. The conditions and consequences of choice: Reflections on the measurement of women's empowerment. UNRISD discussion paper no. 108, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, Geneva.
- Mid-Term Evaluation for PTLA and ITSPLEY Project in Minia, Beni Suef and Qena, CARE Egypt, May 2011.
- Miske, S., Meagher, M., & DeJaeghere, J. 2010. Gender mainstreaming in education at the level of field operations: the case of CARE USA's indicator framework. *Compare* 40 (441–458).
- Narayan, D. 2001. 'Consultations with the poor' from a health perspective. *Development* 44, no. 1: 15–21.
- Narayan, D., ed. 2005. *Measuring empowerment: Cross-disciplinary perspectives*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- PCTFI Adult and Child Common Items Data Entry and Cleaning Guide, Developed by Minnesota International Development Education Consortium for CARE Basic and Girls Education Unit and Country Offices, Minnesota, September 2010.
- Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA) – End of Project Report, Forum for African Educationists in Malawi (FAWEMA), Malawi: Lilongwe, P.O. Box, 30886, November 2011.
- Power to Lead Alliance (PTLA) – Unlocking the Potential, Power Point Presentation, CARE Malawi, Lilongwe, November 2011.
- PTLA Baselines Reports: Egypt, Tanzania, Egypt, India, Malawi, and Yemen, CARE USA, Atlanta, 2009-2010.
- PTLA Baseline Tools: Boys' Girls' Equity Index (GEI), August 2009 & Monitoring and Evaluation Tools Final, CARE Atlanta, June 2009.
- PTLA Stories from the Field: Tanzania, Egypt, India, Malawi, and Yemen, CARE USA, Atlanta, 2009-2011.

Quarterly Report, Creative Center for Community Mobilization (CRECCOM), Malawi: Kasungu, March to July 2011.

Report on Girls' Leadership Index and the Gender Equity Index: An Analysis of the Indices Using Data from Three Countries, Prepared for CARE USA Basic and Girls' Education Unit by Joan DeJaeghere and Brooke Krause, MWAI, University of Minnesota, May 2011.

The Power to Lead Alliance: Empowering Girls to Learn and Read, Bouchie, S., Global Development Alliance Secretariat, USAID Annual Program Statement No. M/OAA/GRO/ EGAS-08-108, July 2008.

The Power to Lead: A Leadership Model for Adolescent Girls, Baric, S., CARE USA, Atlanta, 2011.

The Power to Lead Alliance, Program Results, CA No. EDH-A-00-08-000014-00, CARE Atlanta, 2009.

Annex A: Girls' Leadership Index (GLI)

Included are the 24 items with the highest loadings on the leadership dimension from the baseline study.

No. (coding)	Survey Question
1 (vamo_1)	I realize that things I say and do sometimes encourages others to work together.
2 (vamo_2)	When a task to accomplish is clear, I like being part of a group to get it done.
3 (vamo_3)	I recognize that what motivates some people is different from what motivates others.
4 (vamo_4)	I enjoy gathering people together to make things happen.
5 (vamo_5)	I am comfortable when people look to me for advice and guidance about things.
6 (v_1)	While my experiences and ideas may be different from others, I know that I can bring useful ideas to a discussion.
7 (v_2)	I do not hesitate to let others know my opinions.
8 (v_3)	I am not shy to ask questions about things that I do not understand.
9 (v_5)	I am comfortable putting my thoughts into words.
10 (v_6)	In a group setting, I expect the opportunity to share my thoughts.
11 (dm_1)	There are times when decisions I make can influence others.
12 (dm_2)	I recognize that I have control over my own actions.
13 (dm_3)	I try to consider things from different perspectives before making a decision.
14 (dm_4)	I try to anticipate the consequences of possible actions, and make decisions based on those consequences.
15 (dm_5)	I see that things I choose to do today can impact my life in the future.
16 (c_1)	When I have made up my mind about something, I take actions that demonstrate commitment to that point of view.
17 (c_2)	If someone does not understand an explanation that I am giving, I don't give up but try to find a different way of saying what is on my mind.
18 (c_3)	I am aware of my strengths and weaknesses, and feel comfortable working within my abilities and limitations.
19 (c_4)	In school, I am willing to be called on by my teacher to answer questions.
20 (c_5)	I do not hesitate to speak or respond to adults in appropriate situations.
21 (c_6)	If someone treats me unfairly, I take action against it.
22 (o_2)	There are times that I realize that it will take a lot of work to make my ideas a reality, but I am willing to consider how to see them through.
23 (o_3)	I recognize that planning ahead can often help things go as I want them to go.
24 (o_5)	I can help organize others to help accomplish a task.

Annex B: Gender Equity Index (GEI)

Included are the 29 items with the highest loadings on the following dimensions from the baseline study: Equality of Rights, Gendered Social Norms, and Attitudes about Gendered Responsibility.

Equality of Rights

1 (cgdr_3)	The presence of a father is very important in the life of the child, even if the parents are divorced.
2 (e_3)	Girls have the same right as boys to be educated.
3 (wl_1)	Women have the same right as men to work outside the house.
4 (wl_2)	A woman could be a President or Prime Minister and be as good as a man.
5 (wl_3)	Women should have equal access to leadership positions at the village, district, and state government level.
6 (wl_4)	Women can be engineers or scientists like men.
7 (wl_5)	A woman has the same right as a man to work outside the village.
8 (wl_6)	Girls have the same rights as boys to express their opinions.
9 (lsn_1)	Boys should ask their parents for permission to go outside just like girls.
10 (lsn_2)	There should be places where girls can practice social, cultural, and sports activities, just like there are places for boys.
11 (lsn_4)	Girls have the right to select their female friends just as boys select their male friends.
12 (ehsb_1)	It is necessary for a boy to have a male friend to talk with about his problems.
13 (v_1)	If I see a man beating his wife, I should try to stop him.
14 (v_2)	I respect and appreciate the man who walks away from a fight.
15 (v_8)	If I see a boy teasing a girl, I should stop him.

Gendered Social Norms

16 (lsn_3)	Boys are better than girls in sports.
17 (ehsb_3)	To be a man, you need to be tough. If a boy tells his friends he is afraid, he will look weak.
18 (v_4)	If someone insults me, I have to defend my reputation by fighting.
19 (v_5)	A woman should bear her husband's violence in order to keep her family together.
20 (v_6)	I think it is acceptable that a husband beats his wife if she disobeyed him.
21 (v_7)	Violence is a natural reaction for men – it is something they cannot control.
22 (v_9)	If a woman insulted her husband, he has all the right to beat her.
23 (e_1)	Boys have more opportunities than girls to go to university.
24 (e_2)	When the family cannot afford to educate all children, only boys should go to school.
25 (e_4)	A man should be better educated than his wife.
26 (e_5)	Boys are more intelligent than girls.

Attitudes about Gendered Responsibility

27 (cgdr_2)	Changing diapers, giving the kids a bath, and feeding the kids are the mother's responsibility.
28 (cgdr_6)	A girl should obey her brother even if he is younger than she is.
29 (cgdr_7)	It is the father's responsibility to provide money for the family.

Annex C: Evaluation Site Selection by Country

Egypt

Site	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
District: Bani Mossa Village – Minia District School Site: Bani Mossa Prep School (ITSPLEY & PTLA)	418 students – 198 girls and 220 boys	Infrastructure needs; shortage of female teachers; weak administrative and board of trustee capacity	Rural
District: Ahnasia Village – Beni Suef Governorate School Site: Qay Prep School (ITSPLEY & PTLA)	933 students – 333 girls and 600 boys	Infrastructure needs; shortage of female teachers; weak administrative and board of trustee capacity	Rural

Honduras

Site (Community-Based)	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
El Lolo, Department of Francisco Morazon (PTLA implemented)	Community-based clubs drew participants from El Lolo community	Dangerous community due to drug gangs and crime	Peri-urban community near Tegucigalpa
La Cuesta, Department of Francisco Morazon (PTLA implemented)	Community-based clubs drew participants from La Cuesta community	Dangerous community due to drug gangs and crime	Peri-urban community near Tegucigalpa
Guajiquiro, Department of La Paz (PTLA implemented)	Community-based clubs drew participants from Guajiquiro Central and surrounding communities	Agrarian, subsistence living	Remote rural, marginalized community in mountainous region 4.5 hours from Tegucigalpa

India

Site	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
Sounpur	22 active girls; 15 active boys	The village has a total population of 1,230; males constitute 63% of the population; the minority population is over 36%; the economy is mainly agrarian with the major crops being wheat, rice, sugarcane, pulse, and mustard	43 km from Balrampur
Ichchhapur	28 active girls; 0 active boys	The village has a total population of 2,000; males constitute 52% of the population; the minority population is over 36%; the economy is mainly agrarian with the major crops being wheat, rice, sugarcane, pulse, and mustard	39 km from Bahraich
Laluhi	25 active girls; 16 active boys	The village has a total population of 5,000; males constitute 60% of the population; the minority population is over 10%; the economy is mainly agrarian with the major crops being wheat, rice, sugarcane, pulse, and mustard	35 km from Bahraich

Malawi

Site	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
Kalolo F.P., Kalolo zone, Kasungu district (PTLA implemented)	Standard 1-8 enrollment of 1,429 (743 girls and 686 boys); 4-8 enrollment of 743 (402 girls and 341 boys); 12 qualified teachers in school and two volunteers	Overcrowding; infrastructure needs; four temporary classrooms; two shifts; shortage of teachers	Rural; marginalized community near a village
Chang'ombe F.P., Kalolo zone, Kasungu district (PTLA implemented)	401 students, 194 girls and 207 boys; seven teachers (new junior primary opened four kilometers away, otherwise enrollment would be greater)	Overcrowding; infrastructure needs – head teacher office is grass hut; two female teachers – one is head teacher's wife and the other a trainee	Remote rural; scattered housing; marginalized community; agrarian – subsistence living
Chimungu F.P., Chimungu zone, Dowa district (PTLA implemented)	Standard 1-8 enrollment of 1,482 (784 girls and 698 boys); 14 teachers (five females, nine males)	Overcrowding; infrastructure needs; shortage of teachers	Rural; marginalized community with scattered housing about 20 minutes by vehicle from a major center

Tanzania

Site	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
Kakola A Primary, Bugarama Ward (ITSPLEY & PTLA)	1732 students – 833 girls and 849 boys; 12 teachers and two volunteers	Overcrowding; infrastructure needs; shortage of teachers	Rural; marginalized community near a village
Ndalilo Primary, Lunguya Ward (ITSPLEY & PTLA)	513 students, 284 girls and 229 boys; seven teachers	Overcrowding; infrastructure needs; shortage of teachers	Rural; 18 kilometers from health services; scattered housing; agrarian; marginalized
Nyambula Primary, Ngogwa Ward (non-participants)	320 students – 152 girls and 168 boys; nine teachers	Similar in size to Ndalilo prior to implementation of projects at Ndalilo	Rural; marginalized community with scattered housing

Yemen

Site	Participants	Site Description	Site Location
Algaroob village with five beneficiary villages	Male and female students, mothers, fathers, teachers	New but overcrowded co-educational school, with shortage of teachers	Rural; poor marginalized communities
Attein village with 10 beneficiary villages	Male and female students, mothers, fathers, teachers	New but overcrowded girls' school, with shortage of teachers	Rural; poor marginalized communities
Dir Alhissy village with numerous beneficiary villages	Male and female students, mothers, fathers, teachers, community NGO	Extremely overcrowded girls' school	Large village with satellite villages; poor; marginalized; near a large town
Dhahoor Ashemmal village with six beneficiary villages	Male and female students, mothers, fathers, teachers, community NGO	Older and overcrowded co-educational school	Rural; poor marginalized communities

Annex D: Perceptions on Change in Ability to Express Opinions and Ideas

Active Girls	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	22		9.1%	90.9%
Honduras	22		9.1%	90.9%
India	23		26.1%	73.9%
Malawi	14		57.1%	42.9%
Tanzania	14		100%	
Yemen	33	3%	15.2%	81.8%

Comparison Girls	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	8	25%	37.5%	37.5%
India	11	81.2%		18.8%
Tanzania	6	100%		

Active Boys	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	16	6.3%	18.7%	75%
Honduras	14		35.7%	64.3%
India	22	22.7%	40.9%	36.4%
Malawi	23	43.5%	13%	43.5%
Tanzania	16	6.3%	37.5%	56.2%
Yemen	25	4%	44%	52%

Comparison Boys	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	24	25%	29.2%	45.8
India	8	100%		
Tanzania	16	100%		

Annex E: Perceptions on Change in Self-confidence

Active Girls	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	22	31.8%	13.6%	54.5%
Honduras	26		11.5%	82.5%
India	23			100%
Malawi	6			100%
Tanzania	14		35.7%	64.3%
Yemen	33	3%	6%	91%

Comparison Girls	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	8	12.5%	50%	37.5%
India	12	75%	8.3%	16.7%

Active Boys	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	16	12.5%	6.2%	81.3%
Honduras	12		100%	
India	22	13.6%	13.6%	72.8%
Malawi	23	34.8%	56.5%	8.7%
Tanzania	16		31.3%	68.7%
Yemen	25		32%	68%

Comparison Boys	Sample size	I haven't changed much at all.	I've changed some but I still need to work on it.	I've noticed a big difference.
Egypt	24	8.3%	50%	41.7%
India	8	100%		
Tanzania	16	100%		

Annex F: Perceptions on Leadership Development through PTLA

Active Girls	Sample size	I haven't developed much at all.	I am developing as a leader.	I feel successful as a leader.
Egypt	27		63%	37%
Honduras	23		82.6%	17.3%
India	23		95.7%	4.3%
Malawi	21	28.6%	33.3%	38.1%
Tanzania	14		78.6%	21.4%
Yemen	33	6.1%	15.2%	78.8%

Comparison Girls	Sample size	I haven't developed much at all.	I am developing as a leader.	I feel successful as a leader.
Egypt	14	7.1%	78.6%	14.2%
India	22	68.2%	31.8%	
Tanzania	6*			

*Girls appeared not to understand the question.

Active Boys	Sample size	I haven't developed much at all.	I am developing as a leader.	I feel successful as a leader.
Egypt	19	10.5%	42.1%	47.4%
Honduras	18		100%	
India	16	6.3%	93.7%	
Malawi	23	30.4%	34.8%	34.8%
Tanzania	16	16.7%	25%	68.8%
Yemen	25	4%	36%	60%

Comparison Boys	Sample size	I haven't developed much at all.	I am developing as a leader.	I feel successful as a leader.
Egypt	21	85.7%	14.3%	
India	8	100%		
Tanzania	16	87.5%	12.5%	